

# American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842

CONSTITUENT OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF LEARNED SOCIETIES  
AND THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF ORIENTALISTS

## ABSTRACTS

of the

TWO HUNDRED AND TWELFTH

MEETING

Houston

March 22<sup>nd</sup>–25<sup>th</sup> 2002

(Includes Program Changes)



- ALAN KAYE, California State University, Fullerton

The Career of Carleton T. Hodge as Orientalist and Linguist

The career of the long-time member of the American Oriental Society will be presented in a special tribute to his work over a period of over half a century. Having studied with such scholars as E. A. Speiser, Giorgio Della Vida, and W. Norman Brown at the University of Pennsylvania, his Ph. D. dissertation on Hausa was supervised by another great Orientalist and linguist, Zellig S. Harris. Hodge's career at the Dept. of State is summarized, followed by his many distinguished teaching years at Indiana University. A discussion of his numerous publications is the core of the presentation.

- PETER T. DANIELS, Independent Scholar, New York, New York

An Old New Approach to the History of Language Families: Kienast's *Historische semitische Sprachwissenschaft*

"*Stammbaum*" vs. "*Wellentheorie*" is a well-known dichotomy in models for the development of related languages. In a *Stammbaum*, speech communities split and languages diverge without further significant contact. In *Wellentheorie*, changes originate here and there in an extensive speech community and spread out. Burkhart Kienast employs a third model in his new volume: a "pool" of Common Semitic-speakers from time to time sent out waves of Semitic-speakers, each bringing a more developed variety into the written record. The five visible stages are East Semitic, Ethiopic, Canaanite, Aramaic, and Arabic. In this scheme, East Semitic is closest to, though not identical with, Proto-Semitic; and no special explanation needs to be found for the "survival" of "archaic" features in, say, Arabic. Kienast's Semitic, therefore, like Gelb's, is Akkadian-like, as opposed to Brockelmann's or Moscati's Semitic, which is Arabic-like.

A striking coincidence is that a very similar model for the development of the Romance languages was recently (and independently) put forth by Giuliano Bonfante, taking up an old suggestion by Gustav Gröber): he reckons that the languages that developed from the earliest Roman colonies (e.g., Sardinian) exhibit the most archaic features, those that developed from the latest (e.g., Romanian) appear most innovative, and Italian, which never left the home region, can be simultaneously the most archaic and the most advanced language. The parallel suggests that a Common Semitic population might have somewhere persisted, a problem not addressed by Kienast.

Another model of language development, R. M. W. Dixon's "punctuated equilibrium," with intermingling, mutually interacting languages, does not evidently apply.

This paper will present Kienast's model and site it within historical and Semitic linguistics and will consider whether it, however seductive, can be at all persuasive.

- HERRMANN JUNGRAITHMAYR, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-Universität Frankfurt am Main

*P̄i-el* / *parras* in Central African Hamitosemitic / Afroasiatic?

Some of the ca. 150 Chadic languages mainly spoken in Nigeria, Cameroons, and Chad display verbal forms that remind us—morphologically and/or semantically—of corresponding forms in Semitic, i.e., *P̄i-el* in Hebrew, *fa<sup>c</sup>ala* in Arabic, and *-parras* in Akkadian. On the one hand, it is the plural-intensive aspect of *fa<sup>c</sup>ala* that we encounter, e.g., in Mokilko: *d̄iikiđá/dookéđe* vs. *d̄ikkiđá/dokkiđe* 'to divide'. On the other hand, Migama *surđe* (perfective aspect) vs. *soróđđá* (imperfective aspect) may well represent Old Semitic *-prus* vs. *-parras*; although radical gemination in Chadic does not occur in R<sub>2</sub> but (by shift from R<sub>2</sub> to R<sub>3</sub> ?) in R<sub>3</sub>!

Thus, like in Semitic, both principal functions of the *P̄i-el/fa<sup>c</sup>al/-parras* forms are reflected also in Chadic languages, i. e., the plural-intensity marker as well as to aspect marking function.

- DAVID TESTEN, Macalester College

The Role of Kassite in the Development of Middle Babylonian

Discussions of the MB period of Babylonian history have made a point of downplaying the linguistic ramifications of the advent of the Kassite dynasty. To be sure, no texts written in the native language (or languages) of the newcomers have been found—the attested Kassite data being limited to two brief bilingual lists, a scattered handful of glosses, and a number of personal names—and Akkadian retained its position as the language of literary production and bureaucratic administration. Nevertheless, an examination of the small amount of Kassite material available suggests that the roots of certain details of the lexical development of Babylonian in this period might lie in contact between Babylonians and Kassites. The phenomena in question, it will be posited, are the products not of simple borrowing but rather of more complex processes by which native Babylonian lexical material was reassessed and redeployed in the light of what appear to have been Kassite linguistic structures.

- RUTH I. MESERVE, Indiana University

Bird Identification and *Materia Medica* in Inner Asia

Tracing and verifying the use of *materia medica* recorded in both historical and modern Inner Asian literary sources can be fraught with problems. A specific ailment may be difficult to track in the historical record which often ignored the history of disease, preferring instead to concentrate on the political, military, or economic events of a given time. Misidentification of various flora and fauna used in medical treatment may also lead to difficulties. A Central Asian tale of smallpox prevention and cure serves as an example.

- DENIS SINOR, Indiana University

On Iron in Pre-Modern Inner Asia

Ever since prehistoric times, local production of iron and of smelting is well documented throughout Inner Asia. Yet, in historic times, and well into the pre-modern period, none of the peoples of the region was able to satisfy the perennial need for good quality arms. The paper wishes to examine how this situation is reflected in historical legends, how it influenced the nation-forming processes and the social position of blacksmiths. In comparison with the sedentary civilizations surrounding it, the evidence reveals the quite surprising technical backwardness of the peoples of Inner Asia.

- ILYA S. YAKUBOVICH, University of Chicago

Sogdian Documents on the Arab Conquest of Sogdia

Forty years after the first publications of the Sogdian document 1.I. found on Mount Mugh, many problems of its reading and interpretation still remain unsolved. Using the recent Iranological literature, in particular the Sogdian concordance by B. Gharib, I have tried to clarify difficult words and passages of this letter written to Dēwāštīč (†723 C.E.), the ruler of the Central Asian principality of Panjikent, by a sympathetic Arab official and to put forward new arguments regarding the purpose of the letter, its date and its historical context.

The study of Arab conquests in Central Asia was frequently based on a romantic presumption that the local rulers at the time of the conquest ought to be divided into Arab hirelings and ardent fighters for the liberation of their country. This attitude, partly inspired by Firdousi's "Shahnameh", can be illustrated by the statement of O. Smirnova (*Ocherki po istorii Sogda*, Moscow, 1970, p. 213): "There is no *communis opinio* about the party headed by Dēwāštīč, whether it was the anti-Arab party or that of Arab partisans." As a matter of fact, it could be neither. Individual rulers could shift their external allegiances depending on political circumstances and for many of them Arab

invaders were of secondary relevance in comparison with the neighbouring potentates. I shall argue that the cornerstone of the policy of Dēwāštīc was his opposition to Ghūrak the king of Samarkand.

- DANIEL PRIOR, Indiana University

Kirghiz Heroic Poetry in the Twilight Age

This paper evaluates the recent stages of the Kirghiz epic tradition in terms of theoretical and methodological innovations introduced by members of the London Seminar on Epic. The comparativist Arthur Hatto has suggested the mnemonic-structural importance of certain high points of plot called “epic moments,” and John D. Smith has observed in the structure of an Indian epic that the oral bard narrates epic moments at the critical nodes when characters enact and fulfil the “contracts” that move the plot.

Epic moments and narrative contracts existed in mid-nineteenth century Kirghiz epic poetry, but during the sixty years beginning with the Northern Kirghiz submission to the Czar and ending with the formation of Soviet Kirghizia (1863–1922), they disappeared from use. Other structural elements, including cyclic allusions and scenic set-pieces, persisted and flourished. Changes in the mnemonic devices used by epic bards in the process of oral composition-in-performance signal adaptation by the bards to the changing artistic needs of an audience entering a new social environment. The Twilight Age was that period, 1863–1922, when the Kirghiz epic tradition was undergoing the most fundamental changes. My field research in Kirghizstan, including recordings of epic bards, suggests that despite the recent renewal of interest in epic poetry among the Kirghiz, the narrative tradition is going through another Twilight Age with structural features similar to the last one.

- KEVIN VAN BLADEL, Yale University

Abū Maʿshar’s Sources for the Arabic Hermes Legend

When a medieval scholar read an Arabic treatise attributed to Hermes, he understood it to be a part of an ancient wisdom transmitted from long ago. To his knowledge, the Hermes who authored the text could be one of three different individuals, each of them a great sage of the remote past. The first founded the sciences before the great Flood; the second, a Babylonian, lived after the Flood; and the third lived in Roman Egypt. All three of them discovered and revealed mysteries of physical nature and spirit. The histories of science in medieval Arabic give an especially prominent place to the first Hermes, the antediluvian prophet of science, identified with the Quranic Idris.

The earliest known version of the legends of three Hermeses in Arabic is attributed to the astrologer Abū Maʿshar. Did he invent these stories himself or did he receive an older tradition? This communication proves that Abū Maʿshar was relying on pre-Islamic traditions for his composite account and identifies his sources for the first time: a now-lost Greek chronicle, a Zoroastrian tradition on the history of science, and the philosopher al-Kindī.

- GLEN M. COOPER, Brigham Young University

Numbers, Prognosis, and Healing in Græco-Islamic Medicine

In Hippocratic medicine, numbers played a significant role in charting the course of certain febrile illnesses, and in formulating prognoses. The most comprehensive tool available to the Hippocratic physician was the critical days. Using this tool, a physician could know when to expect certain symptoms, and whether or not the patient would recover, on the basis of particular signs observed on particular days of the illness, counted from its putative beginning. Galen elevated what had been merely a practical rule to the status of scientific theory, in his treatise “On the Critical Days” (*De diebus decretoriis*; *kitāb ʿayyām al-buḥrān*), by discussing the supposed lunisolar astronomical basis of the days. This treatise was translated into Arabic by Ḥunayn b. Isḥāq, and is extant in only five known manuscripts, four complete and one incomplete, from which I am preparing a critical edition

and a comparative Græco-Arabic study. It is unclear at this point, however, what role the theory of the critical days played in Islamic medicine, especially when considering how few manuscripts have survived as compared to other Galenic texts.

In this paper, I will present findings from a short text ascribed to Qusṭā b. Lūqā, recently acquired from Iran, as well as discuss the relevant portions of al-Rāzī’s “Doubts about Galen” (*al-shukūk ‘alā Jālīmūs*) and the Canon of Ibn Sīnā in an attempt to determine the role which the critical days played in Islamic medical prognosis. This is part of an effort to understand the complete history of the theory, from ancient Greek to the immediately pre-modern period. There is almost no secondary scholarship on this topic, so what I will contribute is new.

- ROBERT MORRISON, Whitman College

*Uṣūl* (Hypotheses) in Islamic Astronomy

Quṭb al-Dīn al-Shīrāzī (d. 1311 C. E.) worked during a period of creative ferment in Islamic astronomy and was one of the first Islamic astronomers to propose alternatives to Ptolemy’s (fl. 125–150) theories. Himself a student of the great Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī (d. 1274), Shīrāzī attracted talented students including Nizām al-Dīn al-Nīsābūrī (d. 1329) and Kamāl al-Dīn al-Fārisī (d. 1320). While Shīrāzī’s astronomy texts represent an important stage in the history of astronomy, their complexity has precluded any textual editions.

My talk will present the results of my work on a relatively simple chapter of Shīrāzī’s *al-Tuhfa al-shāhiyya*. In this chapter, Shīrāzī summarizes and analyzes the different basic hypotheses (*uṣūl*) which he and other Islamic astronomers used to explain a planets observed motions. This chapter is important because in it Shīrāzī reflects on the theories of earlier astronomers such as Ṭūsī and al-‘Urḍī (d. 1266). A more precise understanding of Shīrāzī’s *uṣūl* will also help scholars approach Shīrāzī’s own theoretical innovations which he expounds in later chapters of *al-Tuhfa al-shāhiyya*. The available secondary literature on Shīrāzī’s astronomy, while excellent, is extremely limited.

On a broader level, we may compare the role of *uṣūl* in astronomy with their role in mathematics and in Islamic law.

- AHMED H. AL-RAHIM, Yale University

Conception and Assent in the Avicennan Tradition

The terms *taṣawwur* (conception) and *taṣdīq* (assent) have a long complex history in Arabic/Islamic philosophy and theology. Their importance for epistemology is reflected in the wide treatment they received in medieval Arabic philosophical and theological literature. My paper examines three issues: (a) the Aristotelian background to these two terms; (b) their treatment within the Arabic philosophical tradition (especially the Avicennan); and (c) an examination of their treatment by al-‘Allāma al-Hillī (d. 726/1325) in his *Marāṣid at-tadqīq wa-maqāṣid at-taḥqīq*, a hitherto unstudied work which I am editing for the first time, and its relationship to the Avicennan tradition which came before.

- JON MCGINNIS, University of Missouri, St. Louis

Fixing Motion: A Study of Ibn Sīnā’s Definition of Motion

The ancient and medieval science of physics was a study of motion. Aristotle defined motion as the *entelecheia* of potential *qua* potential, and this definition of motion informed virtually all subsequent discussions of physics. Unfortunately, a key term in the definition is ambiguous. The Greek *entelecheia* can be taken in either a static or a kinetic sense. In the static sense *entelecheia* means “actuality,” while in the kinetic sense it mean either “actualization” or “actualizing”. The difficulty is exacerbated in that both senses have philosophical problems. For if one takes *entelecheia* in the static sense, it is difficult to explain how the definition would describe a process and yet motion

is clearly a process. On the other hand, if one takes *entelecheia* in the kinetic sense, then one is defining motion by a mere synonym and as such the definition becomes vacuous.

Ibn Sīnā was very well aware of this problem concerning the proper definition of motion. He flatly denied that a synonym can provide a scientifically adequate definition. Thus, he attempted to explain the kinetic concept of motion in wholly static terms. He approached this task by identifying motion with the intermediate states of actuality (*ḥudūd*) of the mobile and distinguishing between first and second perfections.

The paper begins by placing Ibn Sīnā's discussion within its historical context. It then considers Ibn Sīnā's account of motion and to what extent his revised definition of motion addressed the philosophical difficulties inherent in defining motion in static terms. The paper concludes with the influence of Ibn Sīnā's definition on later philosophers and scientists particularly within the Latin tradition.

- TONY STREET, University of Cambridge

#### Avicenna and the Šīrāzī Questions

Avicenna (d. 1037) is perhaps the most influential logician in Islamic intellectual history. A number of philosophers living in Šīrāz in the first half of the eleventh century came across one of his early texts on logic (perhaps *al-Mūğaz aṣ-ṣağīr fī l-mantiq*, or perhaps *al-Muḥtaṣar al-awsaṭ* and, failing to understand what he was trying to do, wrote him a number of questions. Although we have lost the questions, we still have the answers (*al-Masā'il al-ğarība al-išrīniyya*), and reading them makes it clear that the Šīrāzī philosophers were confused by the same things we find confusing today. Analysing *Masā'il* will help us understand what Avicenna was doing in his logic. It will also help us understand something of the logical history of the region, because Avicenna's eastern logical tradition was clearly quite different from the the tradition of Šīrāz. Finally, since it is claimed that the logic of *an-Nağāt* comes from whichever text it was that the Šīrāzī philosophers were reading, comparison among the texts will help settle the precise ancestry of *an-Nağāt*.

- SIGNE COHEN, University of Missouri

#### Some Observations on Deciphering the Indus Valley Script

Numerous attempts have been made to decipher the Indus Valley script, but as yet nobody has been able to present a complete decipherment that has been generally accepted.

In this paper, I will not present yet another theory regarding the identity of the Indus Valley language, but rather discuss some methodological issues frequently overlooked in decipherment attempts. Scholars who have tried to decipher the Indus script have generally employed one of two methods: 1) Identifying or relating the Indus language with another known language, or 2) Linking the Indus script with other known scripts.

In this paper, I will discuss the methodological problems of these two approaches, and propose a third approach, based solely on the initial evidence of the Indus Valley materials.

- JOSHUA T. KATZ, Princeton University

#### The Riddle of the *sp(h)ij-*

The Rigvedic hapax *upaspíjam* (X.88.18c) appears in a curious passage after a series of riddling questions about the number of fires, suns, dawns, and waters: *nópaspijam vah pitaro vadāmi pṛchāmi vah kavayo vidmāne kām* 'I don't tell you this *u.*, o fathers; I ask you, o seers, so as to know.' Though often translated as something like 'verfängliche Frage' (thus, Geldner) and sometimes compared with the word *sphij-*, *sphigī-* 'hip, buttock,' *upaspíjam* is unclear as regards both meaning and morphology. In this paper, I adduce linguistic and cultural evidence from Greece that provides a new perspective on the matter and may help solve some of the difficulties.

- ASHOK AKLUJKAR, University of British Columbia

The *-indu-śekhara* Titles of Nāgeśa's Works

Among the works the great polymath Nāgeśa-bhaṭṭa or Nāgojī-bhaṭṭa (lifetime between 1670–1750 A.D.) is credited with, we find the following: *Paribhāṣendu-śekhara*, *Bṛhacchabdendu-śekhara* (and *Laghu-śabdendu-śekhara*), *Prāyaścittendu-śekhara*, *Ācārendu-śekhara*, *Kālendu-śekhara*, *Tithīndu-śekhara*, *Tīrthendu-śekhara*, *Śrāddhendū-śekhara*, and *Vyāsa-sūtrendu-śekhara*. Some of these have been published in more than one edition with more than one commentary, while some do not seem to have ever been published. The part *-indu-śekhara* in the titles of at least the first two has received much attention at the hands of commentators. My paper will attempt to determine which interpretations of the titles are likely to have been intended by Nāgeśa. It will further deal with the problem of translating the titles into English.

- MASATO KOBAYASHI, Hakuoh University

Rhythm Rules in South Asian Languages

In languages without lexical contrast in length, it is often the case that not only stress but also its rhythmic property affect segmental duration, as in the first vowels of the English pair *nātion* : *nātionāl*.

In many Indo-Aryan and Dravidian languages with length contrast, prominence in the form of syllabic weight plays a crucial role in deciding word stress. On the other hand, Mundari of the Munda family have no length contrast, and its stress placement seems to be based on the interaction between lexical stress and iambic rhythm. Old Tamil has lexical contrast in length, but the notion of a metrical unit called *acai* suggests that iambic rhythm underlies the structure of its morphemes. Even among languages with prominence-driven stress systems, rules of length alternation and metrical restrictions might be understood better in the light of phonological rhythm.

In this paper, I will first trace the historical developments of quantity-changing rules and prosodic restrictions in Indo-Aryan languages. Then I will discuss how the languages in South Asia are grouped by different rhythmic types in the theoretical framework of Hayes (1995).

- PETER M. SCHARF, Brown University

Recognizing Speech Between Sound and Meaning

Indian grammarians held that speech, when recognized by a fluent listener, is a direct cause of cognition of the object the speech form denotes. They distinguished the speech form capable of forming a relation to its denoted object from the uttered sounds which manifest it. One of the principal reasons for distinguishing the denoting speech form from sound was that the sounds, uttered in sequence over time, never coexist while in order that the speech form be able to denote, it must be a unitary item recognizable by the intellect. Two prominent scholars of the grammarians' linguistic philosophy imply that Patañjali considered the unity of the speech form to be due to the unity of its meaning. This, however, cannot be the case. To have cognition of the speech form depend upon cognition of the denoted object while cognition of the denoted object for the listener depends upon cognition of the speech form would involve circular reasoning, a fault with which Patañjali is very familiar. Moreover, under 1.1.68 Patañjali explicitly concludes that cognition of the object is preceded by the speech form itself to which the object must yield priority. The implication that Patañjali based unity of the speech form upon the unity of its meaning is due to misunderstanding the conclusion of his commentary on 1.4.109. The verse (1.356.9–10) applies to a speaker, not to a listener.

- STEPHANIE JAMISON, Harvard University

An Anagram in the *Gāthās*: *Yasna* 51.4-5

A syntactically anomalous phrase opening the verse Y. 51.5 can be shown to be the phonetically scrambled answer to questions posed in the previous verse and thus a cleverly crafted celebration of the power of Zarathustra's patron.

22. P. OKTOR SKJÆRVO, Harvard University

Smashing Urine: About *Yasna* 48.10

The second "line" of the Old Avestan (Iranian) text *Yasna* 48.10 has been interpreted variously throughout the history of Avestan studies. The line runs as follows: *kadā ajên mûthrem ahyâ madahyâ*, which, at face value, literally means "when, he used to smash, urine, of his/this, intoxication," that is, still at face value, either: "When would the urine of (t)his intoxication smash . . ." or "When would he smash the urine of (t)his intoxication . . ." The second alternative is the one usually taken as the basis for interpretations, and the reference has been assumed to be to Zarathustra's condemnation of the *haoma* (Indic *soma*). Other alternatives have been sought, notably two, according to which the form *ajên* should be analyzed as a 3<sup>rd</sup> plural form from a verb *aja-*, otherwise unknown in Avestan and other Iranian languages. Here I shall argue for the first interpretation. In India, the successful *soma* sacrifice makes Indra and other deities drunk on *soma*, causing them to urinate down upon the earth a fluid that removes infertility and revitalizes the world. In my opinion, *Yasna* 48.10 refers to the rival poet or sacrificer's inability to perform an efficient sacrifice that would have the same desired effect.

- GIORGIO BUCCELLATI, University of California, Los Angeles

The Royal Palace of Urkesh: Recent Excavations

Excavations of the service wing of the Royal Palace AP at Tell Mozan (ancient Urkesh) are all but complete, and the full floor plan of this part of the building is now clear. The formal wing, attached to the service wing and raised by about 2.5 ms above it, appears to be much larger. Here, we have begun to expose a monumental, stone paved courtyard, probably near the main entrance to the complex. Construction of the palace can now be dated to the reign of Naram-Sin. Above the palace, we are finding an important sequence of settlements from the Ur III and Old Babylonian periods. The paper will present the overall stratigraphic situation, the current architectural findings, and our special effort at conservation of the walls.

- MARILYN KELLY-BUCCELLATI, California State University, Los Angeles

Urkesh and Akkadian Royal Seals

The discovery of the seal impressions of Tar'am-Agade in the Urkesh palace brings new insights into the Akkadian royal seals and sealings from the south. The sealings of Urkesh are the only well stratified body of evidence we have for these royal seals and their use. Contextual analysis of the Urkesh sealings with comparative evidence from the south sheds new light on the nature and function of Akkadian royal seals

- TONIA SHARLACH, The University of Pennsylvania Museum

The Hubris of Amar-Sin

In contrast to the fairly abundant hymnology celebrating the other kings of the Third Dynasty of Ur, Amar-Sin stands alone in having no extant hymns associated with him. We have only one text, "Amar-Sin and Enki's Temple." This fragmentary literary text known to us from Old Babylonian

copies found at Ur is a tendentious piece whose closest parallel is “The Curse over Akkade.” “Amar-Sin and Enki’s Temple” focuses on the king’s problems encountered in rebuilding Enki’s shrine at Eridu over the course of his entire nine years of reign.

A re-examination of the status of Eridu in Ur III times and an analysis of major events in Amar-Sin’s reign is, as I will argue in this paper, central to any progress in understanding this composition.

- DANIEL E. FLEMING, New York University

Before Democracy: Collective Decision-Making in the Mari Archives

Over fifty years ago, Thorkild Jacobsen coined the term “primitive democracy” to describe the phenomenon of collective decision-making in ancient Mesopotamia. Jacobsen was surely right about the importance of decision-making by groups rather than by individual rulers for the history of human society, though we are more precisely dealing with the antecedents of democracy than an early form of democracy itself. There is now considerable new evidence for what anthropologists call “corporate” political life in ancient Syria-Mesopotamia, and it is possible to investigate this in light of new theoretical perspectives. Among the new sources of evidence, the archives from Mari offer a particularly rich and diverse testimony to the continuing viability of group decision-making in the early second millennium, especially as defined by the town.

In this paper, I will evaluate several interrelated terminologies for the corporate political forms of towns, including elders, various words for assembly, and the town by name as a collective body in action. Generally, the political importance of group decision-making has been underestimated. Mari’s letters show a variety of forms and individual traditions for town polity, with collective action prominent where cities or towns deal with outside affairs, especially waging war and making peace. Collective decision-making is not isolated from the rule of kings and may operate under a monarchy, but it appears to be based in the prior political nature of the town as such. As a political unit, the town is a collective.

- NICOLE BRISCH, University of Michigan

Sîn-idinnam Revisited: Court Literature in the Larsa Period

Innovations in the literary legitimization of Larsa kings are explored in the texts mentioning Sîn-idinnam (1849–1843 BCE). Although his reign was brief, only lasting seven years, several hymns, letter-prayers, and elaborate royal inscriptions form a substantial corpus. This literature represents a significant departure in language as well as subject matter from earlier Sumerian literary texts legitimizing kings.

- GARY BECKMAN, University of Michigan

A Small Town in Syria

The recent publication of approximately 100 cuneiform documents from Tall Munbaqa, ancient Ekalte, sheds new light on the history of the Middle Euphrates region in the Late Bronze Age. I will compare this material with that from the slightly later archives of the neighboring city of Emar to demonstrate the changes in government, economy, and population that took place as a result of the Hittite conquest of inland northern Syria in the mid-fourteenth century BCE.

- JERROLD S. COOPER, The Johns Hopkins University

A Mittani Legal Document from Umm el-Marra

The joint Johns Hopkins-University of Amsterdam expedition to the Syrian site of Umm el-Marra, situated between Aleppo and Emar, excavated a moderately well preserved legal document with a Mittani royal seal impression. The text is strikingly similar to contemporary tablets found at Tell Brak, and sheds additional, light on early Late Bronze history and legal practices.

- E. BRUCE BROOKS, University of Massachusetts, Amherst  
Lord Shāng’s Military Thought

Lord Shāng (died e0338) is said to have established Chín policies more than a century before Chín unified the other Chinese states. His thought is thus of great historical interest. Unfortunately the received Book of Lord Shāng (Shāng-jyŵn Shū, SJS) has long been regarded as dubious: it is not stylistically homogeneous, and contains anachronisms. Its formation process evidently overlaps that of the Hán Fēidǔ, and thus runs into the Hàn dynasty. Duyvetidak’s 1928 study did not produce a clear result, and Jean Levi’s 1993 summary still acknowledged unresolved problems,

In taking up SJS *ab initio*, I note that the contemporary Bamboo Annals implies a military than civil career for Lord Shāng. I thus begin by concentrating on the three military chapters, SJS 10–12. Of these, the first proves to have been overlaid by quotations from the Sūndǔ Art of War. When they are removed, a coherent text emerges which inhabits the same discourse world as the early military writings in the Gwāndǔ corpus (from Chí). The reconstructed SJS 10 is stylistically more coherent than the received version, and yields more suggestive results when Duyvendik’s (and other) vocabulary tests are applied to it. The implications of those tests for the authenticity of the other military chapters, and for the entire SJS, are briefly explored in conclusion.

- PAUL R. GOLDIN, University of Pennsylvania  
Han Fei’s Doctrine of Self-Interest

Chapter 49 of the *Han Feizi*, entitled “Wudu” (“The Five Vermin”), includes one of the earliest discussions in Chinese history of the concepts of *gong* and *si*. Influenced no doubt by the modern meanings of these terms, most translators render *gong* and *si* as “public” and “private,” respectively, but an examination of the original passage reveals the inadequacy of these translations. Han Fei (d. 233 B.C.) takes *si* to mean “acting in one’s own interest.” *Gong* is simply what opposes *si*.

“Acting in one’s own interest” is not inherently reprehensible in Han Fei’s view; but a ruler must remember why ministers propose their policies: they are concerned only with enriching themselves, and look upon the ruler as nothing more than a resource to be exploited in their quest for material aggrandizement. So the interests of the ministers and the ruler are diametrically opposed. Ministers hope for a comfortable career; a ruler must weed out the posers in his search for those rare and invaluable adjuvants who are genuinely capable of administering the state. In short, if *si* is the self-interest of the minister, *gong* is the self-interest of the ruler.

This view is noteworthy in that it does not necessarily privilege *gong* at the expense of *si*. The issue is simply one of competing interests: a shrewd minister is intent on advancing his *si* just as a shrewd ruler takes care to protect his *gong*. Han Fei consistently implies that rulers have only themselves to blame for the consequences of adopting a ruinous strategy without first considering *gong* and *si*. In later writers, by contrast, *gong* typically refers to imperial control in accordance with the universal Way, and *si* denotes those troublesome areas where *gong* has failed to take hold.

- DALLAS L. MCCURLEY, Queens College, CUNY

#### The Theatre Cart of the Qin & Han Dynasties & Its Shamanic Significance

An Eastern Han tomb at Yinan contains a mural picturing a wagon-stage supporting musicians costumed as celestials and featuring dwarf-acrobats performing on poles mounted on the wagon. This movable stage of the early Chinese appeared in the courts, the homes of the nobility, the marketplaces, and the countryside. Variouslly called *xi che* [theatre cart], *xian che* [celestial cart], or *shan che* [mountain cart], the wagon-stage most likely developed under Qin rulers, who called their own mode of transport the *shan che*, and who traced their ancestry to Huangdi—the Yellow Emperor. Huangdi’s nine-flowered cart was instrumental in defeating the demonic rebel leader and symbol of chaos, Chi You. This paper will argue that the use of ‘theatre,’ ‘celestial,’ and ‘mountain’

served to identify individual aspects of a collective conception of the performance space—a platform where performance, the spirit-realm, and the means of connecting to this magical world, merged.

- NIALL CHRISTIE, Cornell University

A *Funduq* Rental from 8<sup>th</sup>/14<sup>th</sup> Century Egypt

A currently little-used source of information for the history of the Mamluk Sultanate (647/1249–923/1517) is the archives in Cairo, which contain a number of legal documents (in Arabic) dating from the period. The documents, which record land transactions of various kinds, include detailed descriptions of the properties concerned. They also include a wealth of information on aspects of political, institutional, economic, social, religious and cultural life of the core lands of the Islamic world in this period. For the most part, they have not yet been edited or translated.

This paper concerns itself with an *ijar* (document granting permission to rent) from one of these archives, the *Wazīrat al-Awqāf* (Ministry of Endowments) in Cairo, dating from the early Mamluk period (647/1249–802/1400). The Arabic word *funduq* derives from the Greek *pandocheion*. Today the word means a hotel, and in the Middle Ages it had a similar meaning, being a hostelry where people and animals could find lodging. Throughout the Mamluk Sultanate *fanādiq* occupied a position of great importance in the Levant. They served as accommodation and storehouses for merchants, often being organised along lines of nationality, or as centres for particular trades. However, apart from some passing references in the historical literature, there is currently little information available concerning their layout and administration.

In the face of this scarcity, the document sheds an important new light on the subject, giving insight into various features of this *funduq*'s layout and administration. This paper introduces an edition and translation of the document, and so illustrates one way in which these archives may be used to complement existing sources and scholarship.

- NIKOLAI SERIKOFF, Wellcome Institute

Real and Imaginary Remedies

An integral part of Arabic medical writings is a list of remedies. Frequently they are arranged in an alphabetical order and contain information about their properties. However, it is not always clear which of these medicines have been applied to the patient and which remained “literary monuments”.

Sometimes “working” remedies are explicitly pointed to on the margins of medical manuscripts. However, it is still not clear, whether they were really “working” or were entered by manuscript owners to complete a known list of recipes. Quite frequently the label “tested” (*mujarrabāt*) is given to remedies collected from the standard well-known sources like encyclopædias by al-Anṭāki or al-Majūsī. The Arabic manuscript from the Wellcome Library for the History and Understanding of Medicine (WMS Or. 9) contains unique information about the actual efficacy of the traditional Arabic remedies. A medieval doctor, Ibn at-Tilmīdh, gives a list of remedies and *materia medica* indicating the proprieties which were actually used in his time and also those which were traditionally included because they originated in the writings of Greek medical luminaries such as Hippocrates and Galen.

The paper contains an edition and translation of the relevant passages along with a botanical analysis of the properties mentioned. It will show to what extent medieval Arabic *materia medica* was effective.

- DAGMAR RIEDEL, Indiana University

Can't Tell an Author by his Manuscript: The Example of the *Muḥāḍarāt al-udabā* Ascribed to al-Rāghib al-Iṣfahānī (d. ca. 1050)

The *Kitāb Muḥāḍarāt al-udabā wa-muḥāwarāt al-shu'arā* (approx.: “Discourses of men of letters, poetry, and eloquence”) is a major Arabic encyclopedia. The known manuscripts, imprints,

abridgments and translations indicate that the work has remained popular for nearly one thousand years. Currently different editions are in print in Arabic and Persian. Yet despite the encyclopedia's popularity, biographical information about its author al-Rāghib al-Iṣfahānī is extremely scarce and his entries in the bio-bibliographical dictionaries are few and brief.

Such a wide gap between a work's documented history of reception and an almost completely undocumented author is fairly common for medieval authors in both East and West. With regard to Middle High German literature Joachim Bumke has shown that the manuscript tradition preserves a wealth of data that explain a text's function (*Funktionstyp*) and transmission (*Überlieferungstyp*). Bumke has therefore argued that codicological data should take precedence over biographical conjectures without evidence outside the literary sources themselves: The focus on function and transmission places a work into its social context and thus substitutes conjectured author intention with functional data for its use.

In the paper I will compare the extant manuscript tradition of the *Muḥāḍarāt* with data about the encyclopedia and its author in bio-bibliographical dictionaries. These secondary sources document reception and understanding of the *Muḥāḍarāt* for a period of about 700 years, from al-Dhahabī in the 14<sup>th</sup> century to Aga Buzurg Tehrani and Sarkis at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Abridged versions of the *Muḥāḍarāt* were presented as versions of Rāghib's work so that adapting the encyclopedia to changing needs was not considered an undue appropriation of Rāghib's intellectual property. I will argue that the transmission of the *Muḥāḍarāt* reveals so a concept of authorship, in which an authoritative author allows for a flexible concept of textual stability.

- M. AMIN MAHDAVI, Institute of Ismaili Studies

#### A Computational Model of Islamic Codicology

As the process of digitisation, particularly digital library, is gaining momentum, the need for a sound computational model to describe the vast collection of Islamic manuscripts increases. The aim of this presentation is to give a progress report on one particular computational model that will cover Persian and Arabic manuscripts. The presentation will make use of diagrams to explain the flow of information in this model. However, a working copy of a system based on this model will also be available for demonstration.

- JAMES A. BELLAMY, University of Michigan

#### A Further Note on 'Īsā

In JAOS (121:1), 6, I proposed to emend the Koranic name 'Īsā to *msyy* and read *massiyā*, taking it to be *Messiā*, Greek for Messiah, without the nominative ending. I have changed my view of this problem and now think that the name derives from *al-masīh*, without the def. art., even though this goes against Arabic usage. It is precisely this anomaly, I believe, that caused the corruption.

We emend *ys* to *msy* and final *yā* to final *hā*, though mistaking *hā* for *yā* is quite rare. But its rarity should not influence our decision on 'Īsā. Good sense in textual emendation takes precedence over palaeography, so we do not have to decide between the two emendations but whether it makes more sense for Muḥammad to have gotten the name from Greek or Arabic. Obviously the better case can be made for Arabic.

An emendation involves the removal of an anomaly, which can either result from corruption or can be intended by the author to express something that normal usage could not handle. In this case the anomaly was intentional. When the prophet decided to reject *Yasū*, the usual name for Jesus, he had no alternative to *al-Masīh*. Other names like Savior, Lord, Son of God, he could not use. But he was further limited by the fact that Koranic usage does not admit the def. art. before personal names. So he omitted it, and *Masīh* was misread by a later copyist.

One problem remains: Why did the prophet reject Yasū? I will propose a tentative answer to this question, but it is too lengthy to be included in the abstract.

- TIMOTHY LUBIN, Washington and Lee University

Results of a Collation of *Atharvaśiras* Manuscripts

This paper summarizes the results of a collation of manuscripts of the Atharvaśiras(-Upaniṣad). This short work, a Vedāntic catechism teaching the *pāśūpata-vrata*, was probably composed between the eighth and eleventh centuries (based on testimonia). Extant printed versions were based on a narrow range of materials; this study includes a large number of manuscripts in several different scripts. The collation throws light on the relationship between the recensions associated with the commentaries of Nārāyaṇa and Śaṅkarānanda. Further observations will be made on the religious milieus in which the text was likely composed and transmitted.

- FREDERICK M. SMITH, University of Iowa

Suggestions Regarding the Transmission of Possession Ritual from India to China: The Evidence from Sanskrit Manuscripts

Deity and spirit possession were commonly practiced in ancient and classical South Asia. Though no major texts are devoted exclusively to descriptions of rituals of oracular possession, a number of manuscripts, most of them in Telugu script, and probably of a fairly recent date, graphically describe one such practice. In spite of the provenance of these manuscripts, the major supporting evidence for the practices are from Kashmir, in Tantric texts of approximately the 9<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> centuries CE, and in Chinese Buddhist tantric texts of the same period. The prescribed practices probably originated in the Himalayas, then spread eastward into China and southward at least as far as Andhra Pradesh in fragmentary traditions. The Chinese Buddhist Tantras, the Kashmiri tantric ritual texts, and the South Indian manuscripts all prescribe (and describe) the possession (Skt. *āveśa*) of Mahādeva (the South Indian mss. particularize this to Hanumān and Baṭukabhairava, therein called aspects of Mahādeva) by a young boy, who is placed on a yantra inscribed on the ground, and over whom a qualified ritual officiant recites certain mantras. All sources agree that the boy then gains the power to speak knowledge of the past, present, and future. This paper will examine the Sanskrit mss. and attempt to trace the transmission of this practice from the Himalayas.

- HIROKO NAGASAKI, The Japan Society for the Promotion of Science

The Metre of the *Rāmcaritmānas*

The *Rāmcaritmānas* is an Awadhi adaptation of the Ramayana story composed by the poet-saint Tulsīdās in sixteenth-century Oudh. Due to the captivating style in which Tulsīdās glorifies the acts of Rama, this work has achieved canonical status among the followers of Rama in the Hindi-speaking area. Tradition says that he started composing it in Ayodhya in 1574 and finished it in Kashi several years later. This paper first examines the metrical structures of the chapters of the *Rāmcaritmānas*, and then addresses the question of what the text tells about this tradition.

As Prakrit metre from which it derives, the metre of Hindi poetry is divided in syllabic and moraic measurement, of which, however, only the latter shows original development. A typical stanza of the *Rāmcaritmānas* consists of four *caupāīs* and one *dohā*, roughly corresponding to *kaḍavaka* and *ghattā* in Apabhraṃśa poetry. In the critical editions of the *Rāmcaritmānas*, all the metres other than these two and *sorathā* and *śloka* are simply called ‘*chanda*’ (‘meter’), a term which represents verses in general and covers syllabic as well as usual moraic metre.

A closer look at these *chanda* strophes gives a fresh insight into textual problems. Comparison of the printed editions reveals a curious regularity of the metre of the second chapter, which is not found anywhere else in the *Rāmcaritmānas*. In this chapter, exceptional stanzas composed in *caupāī*,

*harigītīkā* and *soraṭhā* are placed every twenty-five stanzas. This regularity makes a clear contrast with the metrical variety Tulsīdās demonstrates elsewhere in the *Rāmcaritmānas*, and suggests a chronological gap between the second and the other chapters.

- VIDYUT AKLUJKAR, University of British Columbia

Who was Vālmīki? Gender and Retribution in *Ānanda-rāmāyaṇa*

Three stories of Vālmīki’s previous births appear in *Ānanda-rāmāyaṇa* (Rājya-kāṇḍa sarga 14.35–156). Scholars such as Pandit Baijnath Shastri have discussed whether these have any basis in truth and how far in antiquity we may trace them. As far as I know, no scholar has tried to analyse the interpersonal drama in the stories in order to understand their significance in the Rāma literature. My paper will analyse them with reference to the treatment of gender and retribution, so as to highlight the reasons for their inclusion in the Rāma-kathā. Specifically, I will analyse the patterns of behaviour in terms of male/male and male/female contexts. I will further delineate the role the stories play in constructing the poetic personality of Vālmīki. In passing, I will discuss the issue of *karma-vipāka* and the connection between compassion and creativity.

- REBECCA J. MANRING, Indiana University

*Bālyalīlāsūtra*: Nineteenth Century Forgery, or Mere Play

Lāuḍīya Kṛṣṇadāsa’s *Bālyalīlāsūtra* (BLS) is a Sanskrit text in eight short chapters describing the childhood of the early Gauḍīya Vaiṣṇava leader Advaitācārya. Its purported date of composition is 1487, a date which would make BLS the earliest Gauḍīya hagiographical work—a very problematic assertion. The text was discovered in the late nineteenth century by the Sylheti historian Acyutacaraṇa Tattvanidhi Caudhurī and published in Kolkata in 1915 from a manuscript whose existence is attested by a number of reputable scholars, including Dineścandra Sena. A sole manuscript turned up, Caudhurī reports, in the home of a descendant of Advaitācārya and passed through several hands before it reached Caudhurī.

The text presents a new theological identity for Advaitācārya, and problems of “authenticity” for the Gauḍīya Vaiṣṇava because of its purported date of composition and provenance, but equally interesting is its philology. The language of the text is often nonstandard, and one scholar has described it as full of “*ārṣa*” usages similar to what one finds in the *Bhāgavata Purāṇa*. The author’s choice of language, as well as his versatile use of fourteen different Sanskrit meters, are features seen elsewhere in early Gauḍīya literature and signal an attempt to create a work of great significance. This paper will examine some of the linguistic peculiarities of the BLS, and will speculate a bit as to why Lāuḍīya Kṛṣṇadāsa seems to have chosen to imitate the style of one or more earlier texts, and a bit also about the possibility that for the author, *Bālyalīlāsūtra* was simply an experimental piece.

- JOHN NEMEC, University of Pennsylvania

*Vyavahāra* in Somānanda’s *Śivadr̥ṣṭi*

The term *vyavahāra* appears in various genres of Sanskrit literature with shaded meanings in different contexts. In the early grammatical literature, it refers to everyday language, in legal texts, to a mercantile transaction, a contract or a lawsuit, and it can imply an activity or an occupation in the story literature Yaska’s *Nirukta* suggests “intercourse” or “a transaction”, and it refers to commerce or the placing of a bet, according to Panini

The term also appears repeatedly and in different contexts in Somānanda’s *Śivadr̥ṣṭi*. We, will suggest that for Somānanda the term employs most of the aforementioned meanings as well as another, theological one: in the opening chapter of the text, *vyavahāra* refers to Siva’s cosmic manifestation.

We will argue that Samānanda employs this multivalent term in order to develop concentric analogies. Siva stands in relation to his manifestation in a manner analogous to a man and a woman, a king and his citizens, or a merchant and his clients. These analogies in turn allow him to describe and equate Siva's activities in various domains.

While Somānanda (ca. 900–950) is credited with founding the “Recognition” (*Pratyabijna*) School of Saivism, and while his writings are the earliest on record of the prestigious Kashmiri, tantric lineage (*parampara*) that includes Utpaladeva and Abhinavagupta, his work has yet to appear in English. Nor has there been any published attempt to analyze his theology, which is widely recognized to be rather different from that of his disciples.

This presentation will add to the scholarship concerning Tantric Saivas by illustrating often ignored but highly cultivated relationship to the king. Our finding shows that Somānanda considered the everyday business of court and state illustrative of his deity's very activity, and this is important because it lays bare the overlooked practical and public interests of the Saiva tantrics.

- NIEK VELDHUIS, University of California, Berkeley

#### Babylonian Religion? The Example of Nanše and the Birds

In the Sumerian composition Nanše and the Birds, the variety of bird life is explained by an aetiological story in which the Nanše and the mythological bird Anzud play prominent roles. The question is in how far or in what sense this composition adds to our knowledge of Babylonian religion. To answer this question two opposing approaches to the study of Babylonian religion—those by A. L. Oppenheim and T. Jacobsen—will be briefly discussed in the light of the present example. Unfortunately, it will be impossible to escape the issue of the definition of religion and the daunting question: did Babylonian religion exist?

- FUMI KARAHASHI, University of Chicago

#### Fighting the Mountain

The Inanna myth “Inanna and Ebih” relates Inanna's fight and conquest of the mountain called Ebih, and thus explains her epithet kur gul-gul “destroyer of the mountain.” The male counterpart of Inanna in this activity is Ninurta, who also fights against the mountains, and bears the same epithet kur gul-gul. His activities are dealt with in “Angim” and “Lugal-e.” This paper will explore literary allusions among these three compositions, and differences and similarities in the roles played by the goddess Inanna and the god Ninurta.

- PHILIP JONES, University of Pennsylvania

#### Sacred Marriage in its Literary Context

The sacred marriage ceremony in early Mesopotamia has inspired much imaginative and innovative research. Exotic concepts such as fertility, power, gender, liminality and divine affiliation, rarely entertained elsewhere in Assyriology, have provided the basis for an array of scholarly approaches to the topic. Despite this variety, however, scholars have shared an underlying tendency to view the topic in isolation from other aspects of Old Babylonian culture. In particular, little attention has been paid to the literary status of the texts relating to sacred marriage. In formulating their accounts of the ceremony, composers drew on narrative themes, stylistic devices and poetic imagery found in the Old Babylonian literary corpus as a whole. This paper will examine which particular rhetorical features were selected and what significance such choices would have had for an ancient audience's understanding of sacred marriage.

- ALAN LENZI, Brandeis University

Secrets, Wisdom, and the Standard Babylonian Redaction of the Epic of Gilgamesh

Despite the enormous amount of critical attention focused on the Epic of Gilgamesh since the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, redaction criticism, that is, isolating and exploring the ideas motivating the creation of a particular recension of a text through the careful scrutiny of its extant language and literary form, remains an under-utilized critical tool in its study. In this paper, I will employ J. Tigay’s diachronic observations of the Epic’s textual development (*The Evolution of the Gilgamesh Epic* [Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1982]) and T. Abusch’s example of close reading—utilizing both diachronic and synchronic perspectives as exemplified in his “Ishtar’s Proposal and Gilgamesh’s Refusal: An Interpretation of *The Gilgamesh Epic*, Tablet 6, Lines 10–79” (*History of Religions* 26 [1986]: 143–187)—to uncover some of the redactional motivations behind the Standard Babylonian Epic of Gilgamesh. Specifically, I will show how the well-known wisdom orientation of the SB redaction of the Epic and its employment of language from the semantic domain of “proscribed knowledge” provide insight into the roles of Gilgamesh, Uta-Napishti, and Ea in the Epic. I will also suggest that my analysis reveals the influence of the traditional author’s sociological background on the SB redaction of the Epic.

- RALPH K. PEDERSEN, Texas A&M University

The “Ark” of Utnapishtim and the Shipbuilding Sequence of Tablet XI of the Gilgamesh Epic: A New Interpretation from the Perspective of Nautical Archaeology

The “Ark” in the flood story in the Epic of Gilgamesh has been an enigma since its first translation. Early translators of the passage had little evidence of ancient ship construction as much of this knowledge derives from the underwater excavation of shipwrecks begun only forty years ago. Thus, the nature of the Babylonian “Ark” was interpreted from the modern, western view of shipbuilding. This resulted in erroneous translations of the poem that have become engrained in the literature, and odd explanations have been invented to fit the Eurocentric view of the vessel. New translations of the text compound and propagate errors while data from archaeology and ethnography tend not to be considered.

This paper presents a reinterpretation of the “Ark’s” construction sequence. This analysis combines data from the excavation of ancient ships with ethnographic material spanning the last two millennia. Of particular import is the information concerning the sewn technique of ship construction, the major indigenous method of the Indian Ocean littoral. Specific parallels to this technique are found in the Gilgamesh text, and the passage is clarified when examined from this perspective. Thus, it is concluded that the “Ark” built by Utnapishtim was of sewn construction and, except for the large size of the vessel, typical of the region and time.

- RICHARD E. AVERBECK, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School

Text Structure, World Order, and the Gods in Sumer

“Enki and the World Order” is a long and relatively well-preserved Sumerian mythological composition. It divides naturally into four main sections. First, the author praises Enki, the god of Eridu, the god of underground waters, fertility, and productivity, whose brother, Enlil, the chief god of Sumer, commissioned him to make rulers and common people alike happy, prosperous, and secure in Sumer (lines 1–60). Second, Enki speaks in praise of himself twice, and at the end of each self-praise the Anunna gods affirm him with praise (lines 61–139). In the first self-praise, Enki tells how Enlil had given him control of the *me*’s (line 65) and the decreeing of destinies/fates (*nam-tar*; line 76). Having been given these powers and the responsibilities that they entail, the second self-praise announces his intention to travel from Eridu on his barge through Sumer and the surrounding lands decreeing the destinies, the ultimate goal being the restoration, or perhaps better, the proper

maintenance of a prosperous world order in Sumer (see lines 451–452, very near the end of the composition).

The second self-praise ends with a call to the foreign lands of Meluhha, Magan, and Dilmun to bring their goods to Enlil at Nippur, and, finally, a rather awkward reference to the uncivilized Martu nomadic herdsmen of the steppe regions (lines 131–132). Another virtually identical but contextually less awkward reference to the Martu (lines 248–249) divides Enki’s journey recounted in the third section of the composition into two parts: (1) Enki’s decree of a good destiny for Sumer and Ur in the larger context of the surrounding regions of the world (lines 192–249), (2) after which he turns his attention to the initiation, description, and maintenance of the various regions of Sumer and the resources that would make their homeland prosperous (lines 250–386). As he does this, he places one of the Anunna gods in charge of each of the twelve components this world order. The fourth and final section of the text recounts Inanna’s complaint against Enki for not placing her in charge of anything (lines 387–450).

The goal of this paper is to propose a certain interpretation of Inanna’s complaint, its significance in relation to the larger structure of the composition, the rationale and success of Enki’s response to her complaint, the overall relevance of this text for understanding the Sumerian conception of the regions and resources of their country, and its usefulness for investigations of economy, life, and religion in ancient Sumer.

- PAUL W. KROLL, University Of Colorado

What Chuang-Tzu Saw from the Hao Bridge

The famous passage on the “happiness of the fishes,” from the “Ch’iu-shui” chapter of *Chuang-tzu*, although quite brief, presents many interesting problems for discussion. One of these, whose import is more philological than philosophical, has to do with what kind of fish Chuang-tzu sees and refers to in initiating his dialogue with Hui-tzu. Numerous ichthyological identifications have been proposed through the centuries—none of them, to my mind, very convincing. A new suggestion will be offered, which begins from the assumption that the author of this passage is less concerned with zoological distinctiveness than he is with poetic precision.

- CHARLES YIM-TZE KWONG, Lingnan University

The Poetics of Chinese Philosophical Verse

Given their similar movement toward an existential truth ultimately ineffable, there is a real sense in which Chinese poetry and philosophy can be considered “sister arts” underlain by a common premise of expressive integrity. In Song times the critic Yan Yu went so far as to discuss poetry in terms of Chan Buddhism.

The basic challenge for philosophical poetry is to illuminate without stifling the vitality of art. Poetry of the *xuanyan* type, for instance, adopts an intellectual approach that attempts to make poetry the handmaid of philosophy. But where truth is experiential and assimilable only intuitively, the artistic and philosophical irony of rationalization lies in its self-discounting effect. If, given the broadly existential nature of Chinese thought, the artistic basis of Chinese philosophical verse lies in sentient experience rather than abstract intellectualization, its persuasion depends on a unison between the heart, spirit and mind, which is to say that any convincing appeal to universal truths hinges on the poet’s level of illumination. For however skillful he may be, any deficiency in intuitive understanding and lived conviction is bound to show up as a spiritual and emotive aridity, leaving a rigid mental design and a strident exposition of ready-made ideas as the only substitutes possible. Only when vitalized as living experience and heartfelt lyricism, embodied in evocative imagery and couched in reverberating language, will philosophy take an artistic validity and lend depth to personal expression.

Through examining a number of “positive” and “negative” examples, this paper will discuss both the luminosity and the pitfall of philosophical verse, which may point the way toward a certain poetics in its composition.

- TIMOTHY C. WONG, Arizona State University

“Renovation” or “Transformation”: The *Xiaoshuo* Tradition in the Early Twentieth Century

Perhaps more profoundly than other genres of Chinese literature, *xiaoshuo*—or fictionalized narrative—underwent fundamental change as Western influences took hold during the first two decades of the twentieth century. That the change is still little understood can be seen in the different translations of the word *xin*, as used by the reformer Liang Qichao (1873–1928) in his much cited call for making *xiaoshuo* an instrument of national reform—the 1902 essay “*Lun xiaoshuo yu qunzhi zhi guanxi*,” or “On the Relation of *Xiaoshuo* and the Improvement of the Masses.” In more recent times, the verb *xin*, repeated fifteen times in the space of three lines in the essay, has been rendered as “renovate” (C. T. Hsia) or “transform” (Milena Dolezelova-Velingerova), revealing a significant gap of understanding not only of this pivotal text, but of what actually happened to the *xiaoshuo* tradition as China responded to the modern West.

This communication will examine the question of whether *xiaoshuo* fiction was merely renovated, or thoroughly transformed, while China sought to adjust to new and challenging ideas at the dawn of her own modernization.

- SHAWKAT M. TOORAWA, Cornell University

*Yafirru min al-manāziri in atāhu*, or Ibn Abī Ṭāhir and (Never) Running from a Good “Fight.”

Ibn Abī Ṭāhir Ṭayfūr (d. 280/893) is now receiving the attention he deserves as an important *adīb* of the third/ninth century, especially as an anthologist and literary critic, e.g. by Arazī, Bonebakker, al-Rabdāwī, and Toorawa. The implications of his interest and investment in various genres, however, have not been satisfactorily investigated or explained. One of the features of Ibn Abī Ṭāhir and his writings is the attention he devotes to precedence, contest, and debate. This paper takes as a starting point his *Kitāb Faḍl al-ʿArab ʿala-l-ʿAjam* (On the superiority of the Arabs to the Persians); and the *Kitāb Mufākharat al-ward wa-al-narjis* (Boasting-match between the rose and the narcissus), attested also as *Kitāb Faḍl al-ward ʿala-l-narjis* (On the superiority of the rose to the narcissus), and attempts to describe Ibn Abī Ṭāhir’s stake in the *faḍl* genre. Previous scholars have used these works to speculate on Ibn Abī Ṭāhir’s *shuʿūbism* (e.g. Sellheim, Latham), and used other works in this genre to speculate on political and doctrinal tendencies (e.g. Boustany, *contra* Mattock, Schoeler). I suggest that there are plausible socio-political resonances (*pace* Heinrichs) in these kinds of works; and, drawing on other debate material, in particular an exchange between al-Sarakḥṣī and Ibn Abī Ṭāhir preserved in the *Jawāmiʿ al-ladhdhah*, and some of his own verse, I attempt further to nuance the characterization of Ibn Abī Ṭāhir.

- DEVIN STEWART, Emory University

A Religio-Political Interpretation of al-Ḥanafī’s *Maqāmāt*

For much of the later twentieth century, literary criticism has been dominated by a school which emphasizes the autonomy of the text. In reaction to the excesses of biographical and psychological criticism, critics such as Wellek and Warren championed an approach to the literary texts which looked at the text as a closed system that did not reflect in any direct way the ideologies espoused by the author or the political issues of the day. It was a fallacy, they claimed, to associate the views of the narrator with those of the author. In recent decades, critics such as Terry Eagleton and Edward Said have challenged this approach, arguing that the placement of the author in economic, social, historical, and political circumstances has important, direct, and identifiable effects on the

literary text. In this study, part of a larger work on the Arabic literary genre of *Maqāmāt*, I examine the *Maqāmāt* of the twelfth-century author al-Ḥanafī—he has not been identified exactly, but we can place the text in the last decades of the twelfth century—attempting to situate this collection of thirty episodes in its political and religious context and to determine, at least provisionally, the ideology expressed by the text. A chief element in this lies in determining the references of the main characters, which include the narrator, the rogue whom he opposes, and third, wise authority who appears in a number of the episodes. This exercise, I believe, will make it easier to analyze other texts with similar messages, but which, for various reasons, are not as obvious, particularly the related text of the *Maqāmāt* of al-Hamadhānī.

- JOSEPH E. LOWRY, University of Pennsylvania

Ibn Maṣṣūm (d. 1120/1708): A Major Literary Figure of the 11<sup>th</sup>/17<sup>th</sup>–12<sup>th</sup>/18<sup>th</sup> Centuries

For a variety of reasons, the period in Arabic literary history between (roughly) al-Suyūfī and Ṭāhā Ḥusayn—about four centuries—remains woefully understudied. This lack of attention has contributed to the development of questionable paradigms of decline. For example, a recent major survey of modern Arabic literature notes: “[W]ith the rise to power of the Ottoman Turks . . . Arabic culture generally suffered for lack of sufficient patronage. In fact, the Ottoman period marks the nadir of Arabic literature . . . there is no doubt that the period is characterized by the absence of creativity and loss of vigour . . . in short, it was the literature of an exhausted, inward-looking culture” (*Cambridge History of Arabic Literature*, volume on Modern Arabic Literature, pp. 2–3).

This paper will make a contribution to the literary history of this neglected period—with a view to challenging the paradigm of decline—by examining one of its leading figures, Ibn Maṣṣūm. Ibn Maṣṣūm’s life and career span Ottoman Arabia, the Qutb-Shāhī court at Hyderabad, the court of Awrangzeb, and Safavid Iran, thus cutting across all the major empires of the Islamic world in the 17<sup>th</sup>–18<sup>th</sup> centuries. His literary output shows him to be a sensitive interpreter of the Arabic literary tradition, as well as a highly adept participant in it. Particularly worthy of note, in the context of the received paradigm of decline, is Ibn Maṣṣūm’s sense of his place in Arabic literary history, which for him is a vibrant and developing tradition. Close attention to both the works and self-perception of figures such as Ibn Maṣṣūm will demonstrate what some have long suspected: that the paradigm of decline can and should be fundamentally reevaluated.

- R. KEVIN JAQUES, Indiana University

How to Read *Ṭabaqāt*: Their Structure, Modes of Argumentation, and Purposes

*Ṭabaqāt* are biographical dictionaries that have become central to most examinations of classical and medieval Islamic thought. Virtually every intellectual genre, which bases its prestige in the authority of the Prophet Muḥammad, has *ṭabaqāt* texts dedicated to the authoritative transmitters of its cumulative ideas. Because these texts tend to be very comprehensive, scholars use *ṭabaqāt* works to understand the history of intellectual traditions such as law, medicine, hadith, grammar, lexicography, and theology. Typically, these texts are used as sources of raw data that are incorporated into analyses of ideas, people, or schools of thought. Using *ṭabaqāt* texts in this fashion, however, fails to consider the possibility that authors may have constructed their texts for ideological reasons. This paper will argue that in order to understand *ṭabaqāt* works it is necessary to place the texts in the socio-cultural and religious contexts in which they were written. Additionally, it will be asserted that a detailed analysis of the *ṭabaqāt* genre reveals six methods of argumentation that authors used to make historical and ideological arguments. These six: secret knowledge, hypertextual associations, causative associations, evocative parenthetical references, repetition, and progression were used to build histories of intellectual development by recasting historical trends as seemingly insignificant references in each biographical citation. Only by reading *ṭabaqāt* texts on the level of the whole text—comparing each biography with regard to the six methods of argumentation—can

scholars understand the veiled ideological and historical arguments that lie behind the text. Once this is done, historians and scholars of Islam can have a clearer understanding of the data that is used and how presentations of biographies may be skewed toward certain perspectives that arise out of the historical, socio-cultural, religious, political, and environmental contexts in which the texts were composed.

- STEVEN JUDD, Southern Connecticut State University

The Theological Significance of al-Walīd's Rhyming Sermon

Among al-Walīd b. Yazīd's many poems preserved in al-Iṣfahānī's *Kitāb al-Aghānī* is an impromptu rhyming sermon al-Walīd gave at an unnamed mosque while traveling with his drinking companions. This is one of the longest pieces of al-Walīd's poetry to be preserved, yet it has not been carefully analyzed. This paper seeks to correct that oversight.

After briefly discussing the provenance of the poem, the paper focuses on its religious content. The poem exhibits a degree of theological sophistication, despite the purported circumstances of its composition. al-Walīd includes elements of Umayyad theological doctrine, sometimes explicitly and sometimes obliquely. He also resorts to clever wordplay to mock some heterodox views. The poem appears to have more substance to it than other poems emanating from al-Walīd's drunken romps.

The paper next examines what, if anything, this poem can tell us about Umayyad theology and about al-Walīd's viewpoints in particular. Should the poem be considered a serious statement of al-Walīd's (and by extension the Umayyad regime's) theological views, or should it be dismissed as mere jest? Finally, the paper addresses the related questions of the poem's authenticity, the purpose for which it was composed, and why al-Iṣfahānī chose to preserve it.

- MICHAEL G. CARTER, Oslo University

Pragmatism and Contractual Language in Early Arabic Grammar, and its Implications for Law and Theology

The pragmatism of Sībawayhi (died ca. 795) in his *Kitāb*) has already been noted in the secondary literature, and with the recent appearance of a study of pragmatics in the *uṣūl al-fiqh* it seems appropriate to revisit the topic. Although pragmatism and pragmatics are not identical, there is much in Sībawayhi's treatment of language, especially where legal expressions are involved, which maps closely on to the kind of linguistic analysis which now goes under the name of pragmatics. After reviewing the data in the *Kitāb* the paper will explore the broad consequences for law and theology in those areas where all interpretation of the divine *ḥiṭāb* is the main focus. The aim is to show that the early grammarians provided both these sciences with a coherent framework for extracting meaning, and it will be argued that this, rather than the pedagogical and normative process of merely controlling the production of correct language, is the true purpose of grammar in Islam.

- DAVID R. VISHANOFF, Emory University

In Defense of Ambiguity: The Legal Hermeneutics of Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. al-Ṭayyib al-Baqillānī (d. 403/1013)

In *al-Taqrīb wa-l-irshād*, a recently discovered early work on Islamic legal theory, the Ashʿarī theologian and Mālikī jurist Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. al-Ṭayyib al-Baqillānī (d. 403/1013) employs the Ashʿarī defense of God's eternal speech to advance the hermeneutical project of al-Shāfiʿī's *Risāla*.

al-Baqillānī constructs his interpretive theory around the ambiguity of the language of revelation. He consistently maintains that a revealed expression may be interpreted only in accordance with established Arabic usage, but if it has more than one possible literal meaning, one must suspend

interpretive judgment. For example, he argues that without additional evidence one cannot decide whether or not an imperative expresses a command; whether a command entails an obligation or a recommendation; whether an utterance means one or more than one of its possible meanings; whether an expression that could be general is intended as general or particular; or whether a particular text modifies a general text.

This systematic defense of ambiguity supports the hermeneutical vision embodied in al-Shāfiʿī's *Risāla*. Recent scholarship on the *Risāla* has studied its attempt to reconcile the law with the Qurʾān and Prophetic Sunna, but has failed to identify its key methodological tool: the systematic exploitation of the ambiguity of the Arabic language, which allows interpreters to reconcile divergent texts into a coherent legal system. al-Baḳillānī's *Taqrīb* provides the theological underpinnings for this hermeneutics of ambiguity. He argues his case for the indeterminacy of meaning by appealing to the Ashʿarī doctrine that God's speech is an eternal attribute (*maʿnā*), of which the words of revelation are a created expression (*ʿibāra*). He uses this separation between *maʿnā* and *ʿibāra* to create an interpretive space between verbal forms and the meanings they express. His work therefore represents a justification of the Shāfiʿī vision of legal theory on the basis of Ashʿarī theology.

- ELLIOT M. STERN, Philadelphia

#### Śaṅkara the Naiyāyika and Vyomaśiva

Wilhelm Halbfass suggested that Vyomaśiva, in his *Padārthadharmasāṅgrahaṭīkā*, popularly known as *Vyomavati*, seems to follow some of Śaṅkara's views. Mahendrakumār Jain, though citing inconclusive evidence, identified Vyomaśiva and Śaṅkara. I intend to demonstrate here not only that Vyomaśiva's intellectual debt to Śaṅkara is evident, but also that it is possible that Vyomaśiva was a direct student of Śaṅkara. This would put the dates of Vyomaśiva's philosophical activity some time in the first half of the 8<sup>th</sup> century CE, about 200 years earlier than the generally accepted date (10<sup>th</sup> century CE), and some 75 years later than the date proposed by Mahendrakumār Jain and Gaurīnath Śāstrī.

In three sections of *Padārthasāṅgrahaṭīkā*, Vyomaśiva closely paraphrases arguments which other authors attribute to Śaṅkara. These sections are three of the eight sections Vyomaśiva concludes with reference to his guru's work for more extensive treatment. Among the eight sections, only these three correspond in content to known testimonia to Śaṅkara, though Vyomaśiva aims an adaptation of his *avayavivāda* arguments against Sāṅkhya doctrine in a fourth (*pradhānavāda*). We may then trace an influence of Śaṅkara in this fourth section, even though we lack evidence that he himself adapted or used this argument in this context.

In addition, Vyomaśiva attributes three specific interpretations to his guru. While two of these interpretations fall outside of the content of the testimonia to Śaṅkara, and cannot be traced therein, the third of these—the explanation that an object and its state in destruction cannot coexist because of *sahānavasthānavirodhaḥ*—may be traced in one of these fragments, and constitutes a strong evidence, when taken together with the general evidence of the three sections mentioned above, for suggesting that Śaṅkara was Vyomaśiva's teacher.

- EDELTRAUD HARZER, University of Texas at Austin

#### Forgotten Methods of Knowing in the History of Indian Philosophy

Studies in Indian Epistemology usually focus on the methods of knowing as they were formalized by the Nyāya philosophers. Since the Nyāya philosophers are the best documented thinkers, our understanding of Indian philosophy is influenced by the view through their lens.

My paper concerns primarily the methods of knowing which may not have been codified by the usage of the Nyāya: specifically the methods that may have provided an additional way of proving a truth, and especially other kinds of truth than what concerned the Nyāya.

I propose to examine some early forms of reasoning, especially those of the Jains and the Sāṅkhyas. In particular I am concerned with the forms of reasoning which have been employed in a more general sense, as a kind of complementary means to the canon established by the Nyāya. Such forms of reasoning have augmented the canonical ones.

In the early scholarly literature, such as the *Carakasamhitā*, four methods of knowing are enumerated, the first three are shared by many, including the Sāṅkhya: perception, inference, testimony (so far also identical to those of the Nyāya). The fourth method, according to the Carakas, is *yukti*, commonly translated as “reasoning.” For Nyāya the fourth is comparison (*upamāna*).

*Yukti* was also applied by the Buddhists, such as Vasubandhu in his *Śrāvakahūmi*, and later on by Śāntaraksita in his *Tattvasaṃgraha* and his commentator, Kamalaśīla. Can our better understanding of the application of *yukti* by Caraka and Vasubandhu give us a clearer insight into the positions of truths they argued for? And if so, can we establish that these epistemic concerns were of metaphysical nature in a more general sense, such as issues of rebirth through the individual’s responsibility for his own life and its consequence: rebirth?

- ANDREW O. FORT, Texas Christian University

Bad (and Good) Tendencies: *Vāsanās* in the *Jīvanmuktiviveka*

The nature of the mind, and its qualities, tendencies, and transformations are repeatedly addressed in Vidyāraṇya’s *Jīvanmuktiviveka* (*JMV*, *Discerning Liberation while Living*), a syncretic (but largely Advaita Vedānta) fourteenth century work which outlines the nature of embodied liberation and teaches the path to liberation via a combination of knowledge of nonduality, yogic practice, and renunciation. My presentation will focus on the character of latent mental tendencies, or *vāsanās*, according to Vidyāraṇya. While considered in numerous places, *vāsanās* are discussed at greatest length in the second chapter, called *vāsanā-kṣāya*, or the elimination of mental tendencies. Such elimination is part of the threefold means (*sādhana*) to living liberation via eliminating *vāsanās* destroying the mind (*mano-nāśa*), and the highest goal, knowing the (nondual) truth (*tattva-jñāna*).

I will describe what Vidyāraṇya thinks a *vāsanā* is, and how it is distinct from *saṃskāras* and *vṛttis*. Vidyāraṇya defines a *vāsanā* as a subtle “subliminal” impression (*saṃskāra*) based in the mind which causes particular mental activities (or transformations, *vṛtti*) like anger, and which rises suddenly without considering past or future. It is called a *vāsanā* since it dwells in—or “perfumes”—the mind by previous repetitive experience, thus it is latent mental tendency. For Vidyāraṇya, then, a *vāsanā* seems to be a particular kind of *saṃskāra* which is associated with emotions/feelings and creates a habitual orientation in the mind toward certain virtuous or impure feelings and actions, for good or ill.

I will briefly discuss Vidyāraṇya’s comments on two kinds of *vāsanās*: good or pure (*śubha*, *śuddha*) and evil or impure (*aśubha*, *malinā*), which are related to their divine (*daiva*) or demonic (*āśura*) nature (*sampad*). He writes extensively on the types of impure *vāsanās*: those relating to the world or society (*loka*) learning (*śāstra*), and body (*deha*).

- ROBERT A. GOODING, University of Texas at Austin

Report on a New Edition of the *Jīvanmuktiviveka*

The edition was based on the collation of six manuscripts and two previous editions of the *Jīvanmuktiviveka* published by the Adyar Library and the Anandashram Sanstha. One manuscript from the Bhandarkar Institute was found to be superior to the rest, and the constituted text was largely based on that manuscript. The principles of editing and problems encountered will be discussed, as well as plans for future research.

- T. S. RUKMANI, Concordia University

*Ṛtaṃbharā-Prajñā* in Patañjali's *Yogasūtras*: Is it One or Many?

*Prajñā* or *Ṛtaṃbharā Prajñā* is the only standard, truth bearing state in Patañjali's *Yogasūtras* and seems to have only one kind of meaning as defined in *Yogasūtra* I. 48. If *prajñā* is the final stage of *saṃprajñāta samādhi*, then we are faced with not one but four types of *saṃprajñāta samādhis* that Patañjali describes in I. 17. If *prajñā* arises in each of these stages of *saṃprajñāta*, we will have to consider the question (1) whether the *prajñās* themselves are different or (2) is there some other way of reconciling the four types of *saṃprajñāta*. The problem gets more complex when it is combined with the rider that only *prajñā* knowledge has truth validity in the Yoga school of Patañjali. In this paper I am trying to concentrate on this truth-claim of *prajñā*.

If we understand that the four types of *prajñā* given in I. 17 are not different kinds of *prajñā* but described differently because of the *ālambana* (object of support) being different in the four stages, then we have to address ourselves to the added question of these four further being divided into six or seven types in *sūtras* I. 42 and 43. We further have the four types of *saṃprajñāta samādhi* described in a completely different manner in *Yogasūtra* III. 51. We also have to bear in mind that Patañjali himself privileges *nirvicāra saṃprajñāta samādhi* as of the highest type in I. 47. Are we then to understand that *ṛtaṃbharā prajñā* described in I. 48 coming right after I. 47, is the only true *prajñā* and others described in I. 17, are inferior to it? Or is there an universal *prajñā* to which these individual *prajñās* belong?

These are some of the questions to which answers will be sought in this paper.

To the best of my knowledge these questions, in the context of the truth validity claim of *prajñā*, have not been raised before and therefore will be of interest to Yoga scholars.

- DAVID B. GRAY, Rice University

Indian Buddhist Doxography and Social Taxonomy: An Exploration of Overlapping Discursive Fields

Doxography, or the classification of doctrines, is an activity to which there is rarely ascribed genuine social or political significance. While such taxonomies may on the surface seem rather scholastic and of little general interest, they often shed light on fundamental assumptions held by their authors. Following Bruce Lincoln, who has argued that taxonomy is not only an epistemological instrument but also an instrument for the construction of society, I will suggest that Indian Tantric Buddhist doxography is of interest in part because it does in fact have such social significance. Drawing attention to the schemas devised by several Indian Buddhist authors, I will attempt to show that Buddhists attempts to organize their doctrines, often via reference to social taxonomies, reflect a real and serious concern regarding their role in the complex social world of early medieval India. This concern, however, was not expressed in a uniform fashion, but rather in a somewhat ambivalent fashion. This is, I will argue, a result of Buddhist ambivalence regarding Indian social structure in general, as well as ambivalence with regard to the often complex relationships between Buddhist texts and practices and those of other religious communities in particular.

- VESNA A. WALLACE, University of California, Santa Barbara

A Problematic Nature of the Contemporary Mongolian Translations of Buddhist Texts

With the democratic changes that started in Mongolia at the end of 1980s, a Buddhist revival in Mongolia has undergone a steady and amazingly rapid development. There are currently 250 restored Buddhist temples and 5,000 monks in Mongolia. Among the 208 religious organizations that are currently registered at the Ministry of Justice, 110 are Buddhist organizations. The increasing popularity of Buddhism in Mongolia reflects Mongolians' efforts in developing and strengthening their national identity and pride in their own tradition and culture. Due to the growing popularity

of Buddhism in Mongolia, the need to produce the new translations of classical Buddhist texts arose. Efforts have been made to translate Buddhist texts into the contemporary Mongolian language to make the Buddhist literature accessible to the broader Buddhist audience and to the new generation of monastic and lay students of Buddhist philosophy. General Buddhist audience and young Buddhist scholars in Mongolia are often unfamiliar with technical Buddhist terminology as preserved in classical Mongolian or are completely illiterate in that language. In my paper, I will discuss the problematic nature of the translations that are prepared by contemporary Mongolian Buddhist monks and those prepared by Buddhist lay practitioners, who themselves often lack the adequate training in Buddhist philosophy and are unfamiliar with technical Buddhist terms. I will provide the specific examples that demonstrate that these translations are often not what they are claimed to be, and I will also discuss the reasons why contemporary translators have preferred certain kinds of texts rather than others. My analysis of the contemporary Mongolian translations of Buddhist texts will exemplify the doctrinal challenges and linguistic problems that the Mongolian Buddhist tradition faces after its long period of suppression.

- MARIA HEIM, California State University, Long Beach (South & Southeast Asia)

Poverty in Indian Intellectual History

This paper examines literary and theoretical treatments of poverty and the poor in Sanskrit, Maharastri Prakrit, and Pali textual histories. I consider Brahmanical as well as Buddhist and Jain materials to explore how poverty is discussed in premodern South Asia. I approach the topic through a number of different angles: as a motif in literature and poetics to invoke the experience of pity, as a matter of statecraft and ethics, and as a structural necessity in various cosmological systems in Indic religion. I am also interested in the distinction between voluntary and involuntary poverty in a religious culture that values renunciation, and in poverty's relationship to alms-giving.

- PAUL-ALAIN BEAULIEU, Harvard University

Nebuchadnezzar at Larsa: A Story of Urban Renewal, Syncretism, and Eschatology

The period of the Neo-Babylonian empire was characterized by the renewal of many temples and cult centers, some of which had lain in disrepair, while others were almost completely abandoned, for extended periods of time. Such had been the fate of the city of Larsa and the temple Ebabbar, its main sanctuary dedicated to the sun god Shamash, until during the reign of Nebuchadnezzar II (605–562 BC) extensive construction work was undertaken to restore them to their former glory. This paper will briefly discuss the sources, epigraphic and archaeological, which shed light on the renewal of the city of Larsa during this period, and then examine the building inscription of Nebuchadnezzar II commemorating the restoration of the Ebabbar temple. It will be argued that this inscription, which is deceptively short and understated, frames the renewal of Larsa within an ideological and religious context of late syncretism (Shamash = Marduk) and eschatological speculation, the resurrection of the Ebabbar temple heralding a millennial age with Marduk and Nebuchadnezzar II keeping the forces of chaos at bay.

- M. RAHIM SHAYEGAN, Harvard University

*Bardiya* and *Gaumāta*: An Early Achæmenid Enigma Reconsidered

One of the most debated episodes of early Achæmenid history concerns the events that took place in 522–521 during the few months immediately following the death of king Cambyses and preceding the rise to power of Darius I. During this brief period, the Achæmenid throne was held/seized by one or several individual(s), about whose identity our sources provide conflicting information. Thus, discord exists not only with respect to: (1) the nature of the succession itself (legitimate succession/coup-d'état); but also (2) the identity of the successor/usurper (the king's

brother Bardiya/the magus Gaumāta); (3) the number of usurpers (one magus/two magi); (4) as well as the motives and nature of Dareios' own rise to power ((second) coup-d'état/ aristocratic restoration).

Scholarship in this field is divided into two radically opposed camps: those who defend the *hypothesis of the false-Bardiya* and those who subscribe to the *hypothesis of the true-Bardiya*. The first group generally accepts the tenor of Dareios' inscription at Bisitun (DB) that depicts Cambyses' successor, the magus Gaumāta, as an usurper who seized power by pretending to be Bardiya. The second camp rejects the credibility of Dareios' *res gestae* because it is believed to be a propagandistic narrative destined to cover Dareios' own coup-d'état against the legitimate Bardiya, for the concealment of whose rule the presumed fiction of an usurper-magus was invented.

The present contribution seeks to reconcile these two opposed views through a fresh analysis of all available sources and comparison with the Iranian oral (epic) tradition. We will argue that not only the existence of both Bardiya and Gaumāta must be assumed, but also that their (hi-)story has undergone opposite changes in different traditions: on one hand a *reduction to one* in the discourse of DB, in the sense that the existence of two historical personalities has been combined into one unfit to rule, that is, Gaumāta pretending to be Bardiya; on the other hand, the rule of *two associates* has been altered in the accounts of Hellanicos of Lesbos, Herodotus, and Pompeius Trogus/Justin—all tributary to the Iranian oral tradition—into that of two brothers by embracing the mold of the Indo-European myth of the Twins.

- RICHARD N. FRYE, Harvard University

Cyrus and Darius: Really Related?

The oft disputed question of the veracity of Darius in his Behistun Inscription may be approached in another way, by questioning whether Cyrus was an Achæmenid like Darius. An examination of various inscriptions suggests that Darius may have attached Cyrus to his own genealogy to obtain legitimacy. Dynastic allegiance has been strong throughout Iranian history, and a comparison with other founders of dynasties could throw light on the action of Darius and the subsequent loss of the name Achæmenid among Iranians.

- LEO DEPUYDT, Brown University

The Day in Antiquity

The alternation of light and dark impresses itself inescapably on the senses. This alternation has naturally produced the fundamental unit of time-reckoning: the day. All the other time units are either subdivisions or multiples of the day. In any clean slate analysis of the foundations of chronology, the concept of the day deserves a place very near the beginning. As a phenomenon, the day seems almost obscured from the view by its very obviousness. One is reminded of how Augustine admitted, in his Confessions that he obviously knew what time was but if asked did not. The most elementary analysis readily reveals two properties of the day: first, the day is cyclical; second, it consists of two main parts, daylight and nighttime. Furthermore, the nature of human activity produces an imbalance between daylight and nighttime that has consequences for the chronological analysis of the day.

The aim of the investigation on which this paper reports is fourfold: first, to review past research on the day in antiquity since G. Bilfinger's seminal *Der buergerliche Tag* (1888), with special focus on the Ancient Near East; second, to formulate a comprehensive and coherent theory of the day as a chronological unit; third, to identify historical problems pertaining to the day in antiquity and especially in the Ancient Near East; and fourth, to propose a solution for two of the most controversial problems. The first is Claudius Ptolemy's use of double dates to designate celestial events occurring at night. The second is the problem of the beginning of the day. By most classical traditions,

Babylonians began the day in the morning, the Egyptians along with the Athenians in the evening, and the Romans at midnight. These traditions well illustrate how something intuitively obvious can be distorted when subjected to conscious reflection.

- S. M. LUPPERT-BARNARD, University of Chicago

Finding “Marker Dates” in Mesopotamian Documentation

Dendochronology analyzes tree-ring patterns, overlapping successively older ring patterns in order to create a chronographical chain. One of the principals of dendrochronology is that there are certain “marker dates,” or specific rings that can be correlated among a large number of trees. These “marker dates” are years when atmospheric conditions were unusual, either for good or for ill, thus causing a period of extraordinary growth or retardation. Most marker dates reflect local atmospheric conditions, but there are a few rings that would seem to mirror global developments. These are marker dates that show abnormally low levels of growth in tree rings from various continents all over the world. Four of these global marker dates fall within the timeframe of Mesopotamian history: 2345, 1628–27, 1159, and 207 BC. In this paper, I will, try to determine whether these dates can be shown to have any special significance in the Mesopotamian documentation from the relevant time periods, and whether they shed any light oil current debates about Mesopotamian chronology,

- EDEN NABY, Harvard University

Religion and Historical Record: The Process of Forgetting Assyrian History

From Abū Rayḥān Al-Bīrūnī (973–1048) to Edward Gibbon (1737–1794), and less illustrious historians in between, a confusion occurs in the historical record between what constituted Assyrian political history and its continuation on a political or cultural level after the fall of Nineveh (612 BC). Bīrūnī, one of the last historians writing in Arabic who tries to deal with the issue of political succession in the ancient Near East, also is one of the first chroniclers of Syriac Christianity as he understands it from followers of its two churches in Central Asia—the Melkite (at that time designating not the Uniate but the Syriac/Greek Orthodox) and the Nestorian church bodies. Some six hundred years later, in his *magnum opus* Edward Gibbon decries the claim that he is hearing in France of the continuity of Assyrian identity among the Nestorians. In later centuries, these questions of religion and identity, as well as the authenticity of the Assyrian political history as conveyed by Greco-Roman, Christian and Muslim historians comes into question, particularly as archeological record yields information about the Assyrian Empire.

Setting aside the incongruence between the historians’ account of Assyrian Empire political history and that being revealed by archeology in northern Iraq (with which I have dealt at MELAMMU 2001), the goal of this presentation is to examine the process that occurs as a universalist religion is introduced into ethnic or national communities. Whether it is Christianity in the first century or Islam in the seventh century, a similar attitude by theocratic ruling elites spreads a blanket of religion as the primary identity of people in the Near East. The conflict between ethnic/political identity and religious/political identity produces many casualties, not the least of which is the preservation of historical record.

In focussing on the process by which historical record is forgotten, destroyed or simply set aside, the cultural historian must search for remnants of history in both the fragments of extant historical record and in the remnants of historical memory found in religious records. In this particular case of Assyrian history, certain new materials have been uncovered, such as studies of ethnonyms from the first and second centuries in northern Iraq, as well as newly published preliminary materials from monastic collections of Syriac manuscripts which, when combined with information from the evolving church records of festivals and fasts (recorded by Bīrūnī and later), give shape to how a pagan ethnic community that evolved into a proselytizing multi-ethnic Christian Church shed its past history. The bringing under one analytic focus such disparate materials owes much to the

availability over the past ten years of manuscript editions and translations (Syriac and Armenian), and translations of epigraphic materials which supplement Arabic translations available since the nineteenth century.

- SEBASTIAN GUENTHER, University of Toronto

Muḥammad the Illiterate Prophet? An Islamic Creed in the Qurʾān and Qurʾānic Exegesis

The Prophet Muḥammad is identified in the Qurʾān as *al-nabī al-ummī* (Q 7:157, 158). Muslim consensus has come to perceive this epithet for the Prophet of Islam as indicating conclusively that he was ‘the illiterate prophet.’ This relates to the Islamic idea that Muḥammad communicated God’s revelation to humankind completely and authentically. The underlying point here is the belief that, in conveying the revelation, Muḥammad was not influenced by any knowledge that he could possibly have gained through readings in previously revealed scriptures, or from anything or anyone other than God. Since the rise of Islam, Muslims have relied on this perception in particular when stressing the outstanding place Islam and its Prophet deserve within the canon of the monotheistic religions. Thus the understanding of *al-nabī al-ummī* as the Qurʾānic notion of Muḥammad, ‘the illiterate prophet,’ has always been a major argument for Muslims in defence of Islam against those who attempted to discredit the Prophet Muḥammad and his message.

Medieval and modern scholars, however, have drawn attention to further possible meanings of the Qurʾānic term *ummī* (such as ‘Arabian,’ ‘Meccan;’ or ‘layman’ and ‘heathen’). These divergent understandings are reflected in the translations of the Qurʾān into Western languages.

This paper attempts to provide arguments for further discussion of the term *ummī*. It examines particular notions on literacy and illiteracy as evident in the Qurʾān and some early Arabic sources. The philological and historical as well as the theological and apologetic dimensions of the term *ummī* will also be addressed. The last part of the study is dedicated to the term *umma*.

In conclusion, it is hoped to provide some new insights into a complex issue that is of great significance for Muslims and for the study of Islam. These findings basically suggest that a more comprehensive appreciation of the Qurʾānic term *al-nabī al-ummī* can contribute essentially to the understanding of Muḥammad’s prophet-hood and the history of Islam.

- WALID SALEH, Middlebury College

Al-Thaʿlabī and the Transformation of Medieval Qurʾānic Exegesis

A study of the commentary of al-Thaʿlabī (d. 435 A. H.) known as *al-Kashf* reveals that it played a decisive role in the development of the genre of Quranic exegesis. A close reading of the work in comparison with what came before it and what was produced after it leaves no doubt that it was the main source for commentators in the medieval period. The innovations al-Thaʿlabī introduced and the solutions he offered to the problems facing the craft of Quranic exegesis will prove so successful that they were adopted without hesitation and resulted in a radical shift in the way commentators approached their work. I will discuss few verses as an example and show how al-Thaʿlabī managed to achieve his aims working inside a tradition that at first look was difficult to change.

- RICHARD M. FRANK, Catholic University of America

The Muʿtazilite Definition of Knowing

Knowing (*al-ilm*) is defined by the Basrian Muʿtazila as an assent, to a particular proposition and is distinct from error and from simple assent (*ʿitiqād*) to a true proposition by the mind’s complete confidence in its assent (*sukūn an-nafs fihi*). The definition derives ultimately from an etymological definition of *ᾠπιστήμη* originally proposed in Plato’s *Cratylus*. The assent’s being a knowing and not a mere belief is entailed by its occurring in one of several particular ways by virtue of which it has immunity from becoming uncertain to the knower. Under some circumstances the knower may

not immediately recall that he knows the truth of the particular proposition but he yet remains knowing. On the other hand, one may think he knows something whose actual truth is in fact not altogether clear to him. Assents and beliefs occur in a number of ways and one has to consider the origin and nature of simple belief, error, and mere opinion or surmise (*zann*).

- SANDRA TOENIES KEATING, Providence College

The Problem of *Tahrîf* in Ḥabîb ibn Ḥidmah Abû Râ'itah al-Takrîtî's *Risâlah on the Holy Trinity*

In his *Risâlah on the Holy Trinity*, the ninth century Jacobite Ḥabîb ibn Ḥidmah Abû Râ'itah al-Takrîtî takes up the task of defending the Christian doctrine of the Trinity against Muslim charges of polytheism. Central to this problem is the issue of *tahrîf*, the Qur'ânic contention that Christian scriptures have been altered to hide their continuity with the revelation to Muḥammad. A response to this accusation is implicit throughout all of Abû Râ'itah's writings. However, in this text, he refutes a specific type of *tahrîf*, that of *tabdîl*, by making clear arguments in defense of the authenticity of the Christian scriptures.

The charge of *tahrîf* was critical to the debates between Muslims and Christians in the early centuries of Islam, ultimately leading Christian apologists to move the emphasis from a scriptural to a rational defense of the faith. Forced to abandon many traditional approaches which relied on scripture, apologists including Abû Râ'itah, became more convinced of the usefulness of philosophical principles in defense of Christianity. However, Abû Râ'itah belongs to the earliest stage of Arab Christian apologetics, and remained confident of the possibility of a middle ground utilizing both scripture and philosophy.

In spite of the importance of *tahrîf* for Muslim-Christian apologetics, the topic has received little attention by modern scholars. This paper seeks to outline the understanding and response to *tahrîf* of a significant Christian writer of the ninth century, with a special interest in the implications for Arab Christian apologetics. Abû Râ'itah's keen insight into the problem and its implications, as well as his importance for the Coptic and Syrian Orthodox communities make him an ideal candidate for research, and helps to shed new light on one of the most important periods in Arab Christian apologetics.

- FRANK GRIFFEL, Yale University

Al-Ghazâlî's Initial Accusation against the *Falāsifa* in the *Tahāfut*

The *Tahāfut al-falāsifa* of al-Ghazâlî is a book of *radd* literature that was written in response to Ibn Sīnā and other eminent philosophers whose teachings are addressed in the book. The introduction of the *Tahāfut*, however, names a different group of people that neglect the ritual duties of Islam and deem themselves superior to their peers in the religious sciences. This group is set apart from the eminent philosophers who in the introduction of the *Tahāfut* are exempt from this kind of criticism.

In one passage the criticized group of the introduction is called "the masses amongst the *falāsifa*". The charge that is brought against this group is *taqlîd*, the blind emulation of authorities. The *taqlîd* of this group is founded on the teachings of the eminent philosophers. The philosophers' claim to follow an apodictical method (*burhān*) leads the group of *muqallidîn* to believe that philosophy is superior to religion. This, in turn, leads to the disregard of the revelation and to the neglect of ritual duties. In order to crush this popular attitude amongst some of his contemporaries, al-Ghazâlî turns towards some of the philosophers' teachings in the metaphysics and natural sciences. His aim is to prove that these teachings are not apodictical. This is why a refutation of the *muqallidîn*'s convictions turns into a proof of the "incoherence" of the philosophers' epistemological edifice.

The introduction of the *Tahāfut* shows that al-Ghazâlî's criticism of historical authors like Ibn Sīnā is grounded in a refutation of a group amongst his contemporaries. It also shows that the subject

of the *Tahāfut* is not just the truth or falsehood of the philosophers teachings, but rather their epistemological claim to decide crucial subjects of religious speculation apodictically (*‘an burhān*).

82. LEILA S. AL-IMAD, East Tennessee State University

The Druze Religion in the Twentieth Century: Accommodation and Change. . . The Principles of *Taqīyya* in the Modern World

The Druzes at the end of the Twentieth and the beginning of the Twenty-first Century find themselves in a political dilemma and identity crisis. Where ever they are they seem to have to practice some form of *Taqīyah* or situation selection in order to keep the status of their community intact. The principle of *Taqīyah* made minorities such as the Druzes able to live peacefully, on the whole, among at times, hostile majorities . . . No one on the other hand ever thought that *Taqīyah* would be a way of life for the druzes at the end of the Twentieth Century . . . The freedom to practice their secret religion has been curtailed . . . they are no more able to live in isolation as they did fifty or sixty years ago. They have have been forced to integrate into main stream societies in the countries they live in, whether in Israel, Jordan, Syria or Lebanon, they feel the nececity to practice a new, perhaps, form of *Taqīyah*.

Undisturbed by the political changes that took place during the early part of the Twentieth Century, the Druzes were able to remain simple agrarian societies. But, with the major political changes that took place in the Middle East since the 1940's, they were forced to abandon their close knit niches or practice *Taqīyah* . . .

This paper will explore the socio-political and economic changes that took place in the Druze communities and how this led to the practice, again, of *Taqīyah* in the Modern and Post Modern World.

• ILAI ALON, Tel Aviv University

The Role of Time in Negotiations in Arabic-Speaking Islam

The objective of this paper is to suggest that wide cultural elements influence the institution of negotiation in Arabic-speaking Islam. Among these the following should be considered:

basic beliefs, such as that in the world-to-come and reward and punishment; values, such as patience or mercy;

Issues linguistic, such as the temporal structure of Arabic, issues of style vs. substance, short-cuts (quotations, proverbs);

the importance of history, model, and precedent in the culture, and in general—

relative attitudes towards the past, present, and future, concepts that govern behaviour, such as efficiency and many others should be explored and addressed.

Such influences can be witnessed in actual negotiations: their pace, adhering to time-table or otherwise, trust-building, the use of negotiation instruments, especially third parties and tactics, identity and significance of representatives (age, e.g.), argumentation and evidence, keeping agreements and promises, as well as many other aspects of the process.

Awareness of these factors stand to spare much frustration and help facilitate reaching successful outcomes.

• JEROME K. BAUER, Washington University

Jaina Natalism and the Mythology of Maternal/Fetal Bonding

This paper examines the mythology of maternal/fetal bonding in Śvetāmbara Jaina mythological texts, such as the *Kalpa Sūtra*, *Vipāka Sūtra*, and *Triṣaṣṭiśalākāpuruṣacaritra*. Stories of *dohada*

(pregnancy whim) and Mahāvīra’s embryo transfer suggest maternal ambivalence toward pregnancy, while other tales unambiguously celebrate pregnancy and childbirth. Do these reflect the fantasies or experiences of men, women, or both? Comparison with contemporary folklore supports the thesis that one type of embryo transfer tale, with maternal focus, is an abortion obviation fantasy, perhaps characteristic of a natalist or “pro-birth” view.

The Śvetāmbara Jaina system of the six *Kalyāṇakas* (auspicious and salvific life events) is examined, with special attention to the first three: *Cyavana*, or conception, *Garbhasaṃharaṇa*, or embryo transfer, and *Janma* or birth, which represent the “natalist” side of Śvetāmbara tradition. The fusion of the first two *Kalyāṇakas* into one three month long conception serves to amplify *Cyavana* as the first (auspicious) life event. The incorporation of the *Garbhasaṃharaṇa* into the *Kalyāṇaka* system serves to underline the Jaina doctrine that life begins at conception, while its incorporation into the *Āścarya* (Wonder) system serves to encapsulate and limit a number of disturbing beliefs, practices, and experiences associated with pregnancy, miscarriage, and abortion.

In the Śvetāmbara Canon, the rejected fetus has no gender, while in modern retellings, she is female, suggesting that amniocentesis and selective female abortion is on the minds of modern Śvetāmbaras storytellers, and suggesting further that abortion, and its obviation, is what this myth has always been about. The success of this subtle use of mythology to influence behavior is perhaps evidenced in the Śvetāmbara abortion rate, inferable by the high ratio of females to males (in comparison to other religious communities, including Digambaras). Most Gujarati Jainas are women, perhaps demonstrating the power of myth in the service of doctrine.

- JARROD L. WHITAKER, University of Texas at Austin

Ritual Ontology and Metaphysics vs. Ritual Performance: An Account of Magic in the *Atharvaveda*

To understand the *Atharvaveda*, one must appreciate the theoretical debates over magic. Historically, scholars have provided two basic interpretative frameworks to understand magic. Magic is either defined as a manipulation of power or as a social act. The former ontological argument for magic (Frazer 1890, 1913; Mauss 1902–03; Levi-Strauss 1950) readily employs unspecified and undefined notions of power, as if power existed apart from specific ritual or social contexts. The latter performative argument for magic (Durkheim 1915; Malinowski 1925; O’Keefe 1982) undermines the reality of specific ritual transactions and effects, and abandons the ritual processes in favour of a social performative reality, which is more agreeable to Western modes of thinking. Both approaches have influenced interpretations of magical thought in the *Atharvaveda*.

Contemporary theoretical work on magic can further our understanding of the *Atharvaveda*. In the last few decades, various academic fields have produced valuable insights into the nature of magical practices and thought, and more importantly, have highlighted the social and performative functions of magic and its perceived power (e.g., Tambiah 1984, 1990; Marriott 1976, 1990; Horton 1993; Harrison 1995). By way of analogy, these models provide a useful bridge between the ontological and social aspects of magic and help to reconcile the two academic camps. Therefore, the most fruitful way to approach Vedic magical thought and practices is to pay close attention to the ritual metaphysics and ontological categories that underlie the magical rites and worldviews of the *Atharvaveda* and its priests. The main concern of this paper is how *Atharvaveda* magic was thought to work, that is, its internal laws and nature. To understand *Atharvaveda* magic, one must fully appreciate the importance and centrality of the various “power” terms, which are at the heart of the magico-ritual exchange and efficacy. The paper will consider the nature of the power terminology, their modes of functioning and their effects in the magico-ritual arena. At the same time, the paper will also consider their meaning and relationship to performative and social acts. Any successful theory of Vedic magic must be able to account for the specific nature and effects of the power terms that are transacted within the ritual, while also reconciling these terms with performative and social

theories. This can only be done by providing detailed and focused accounts of the various ontological categories, as found in the *Atharvaveda*.

- CHRISTOPHER Z. MINKOWSKI, Cornell University

Nilakaṇṭha and the Cosmology Problem

At this society's meeting in Baltimore I discussed the problem of inconsistency that obtains between the Purāṇic cosmology on the one hand, and the astronomers' Siddhāntic cosmology on the other, and described a 19<sup>th</sup> Century argument carried out (by Śāstris in Sanskrit) about the possibility of reconciling the conflicting models. Nilakaṇṭha Caturdhara, the 17<sup>th</sup> Century author about whom I have spoken at the last two meetings, wrote a brief work entitled the *Saurāpaurāṇīkamatasamarthana*. Here Nilakaṇṭha attempts a form of cosmological reconciliation that consists in justifying the Purāṇic model. Perhaps by now it is needless to say that Nilakaṇṭha's approach is ingenious and outlandish. I will also discuss another work known only from one fragmentary manuscript in Jaipur, which makes a special point of demolishing Nilakaṇṭha's proposals, even though it also seeks in the end to defend the Purāṇas.

- DONALD R. DAVIS, JR., Bucknell University

The Relationship of *Ācāra* and *Dharma* in the Major *Dharmaśāstra* Texts

As one of the standard sources of dharma, *ācāra* has usually been translated as "custom." However, the ambiguity of the translation "custom," i.e., whether it refers to a practice or to a norm, has made our understanding of the term *ācāra* equally ambiguous. This paper surveys the occurrences of *ācāra* in the major *dharmaśāstra* texts, as well as the *Arthaśāstra*. The survey provides a broader perspective on how the authors of *dharmaśāstra* literature understood the term *ācāra* and its relationship to *dharma*.

According to the texts, all *ācāra* is *dharma*, but not all behavior is *dharma*. Therefore, we must distinguish between *ācāra* and mere practice. The distinction appears to be that *ācāra* signifies a norm, i.e., an authoritatively accepted practice, restricted to a particular locality, caste, or time. Thus, I will argue that *ācāra* in the *dharmaśāstra* literature has a normative connotation, despite its etymological roots. This argument critiques and extends discussions of *ācāra* by Lingat, Jolly, Kane, Lariviere, and Glücklich.

- PATRICK OLIVELLE, University of Texas at Austin

Critical Edition of the *Mānava Dharmaśāstra*: A Progress Report

This paper will be a progress report of the critical edition of the *Mānava Dharmaśāstra* (*Manusmṛti*) that has been under preparation for the past three years. Over 50 manuscripts have been fully collated, and approximately another 50 have been partially collated to determine their value. All nine extant commentaries have been examined to determine wherever possible the root text of each commentator. Manus citations in thirteen medieval texts, including commentaries and *Nibandhas* have been identified and their variant readings noted. In this paper, I will discuss the available evidence regarding recensional differences in the manuscript tradition, the recensions used by medieval authors, and the current state of the editorial process. In addition, the paper will examine the structure of the *Mānava Dharmaśāstra* that has emerged from the editorial work, the translation, and the close reading of the text, a structure that, as far as I know, has not been identified in previous scholarship.

- THOMAS HENTRICH, McGill University

Hosea 2, 19: What's in a God's Name?

The call to erase “the names of the Baals” (Hos 2,19) constitutes the most radical indication of one religion's intention to eliminate a rival one from history, especially when considering the power that is attributed to proper names in the Ancient Near East. This study shows that the name of Baal, used in its plural form, designates Canaanite goddesses no longer appropriate to be named as adversaries of YHWH. One consequence of this (virtually successful) elimination of Canaanite traces in the Hebrew Bible is the transfer of some functions of those goddesses onto YHWH, like fertility and motherhood while others connected to sexuality were demonised and eliminated from the Israelite tradition.

While this study is based on previous research on Baal and Ashera by C. Frevel and on G. Yee's redaction history, it approaches the biblical texts with a new perspective to obtain new information about the Canaanite religion. The general assumption is whether an inversion of editorial influences in the book of Hosea leads to a more precise understanding of Canaanite elements than a simple analogy with neighbouring mythologies.

The practice of erasing the name of a leading figure whose ideology is rejected by his successors is not limited to a specific time frame and location and has occurred on numerous occasions until modern days under different disguises. If the goddesses have all but disappeared from the Hebrew Bible, texts from Kuntillat 'Ajrud and Khirbet el-Qom show a goddess being worshipped side by side with YHWH in the 8<sup>th</sup> century. This might be an indication that these goddesses played a larger role than the editors of the Bible would like us to believe. They give us the impression that Baal alone was Yahweh's adversary.

- RICHARD S. HESS, Denver Seminary

Onomastics and Culture in Cuneiform Texts from Middle Bronze Age Palestine

This study will provide a new analysis and interpretation of the personal names that have been recovered from cuneiform texts unearthed at sites from Middle Bronze Age Palestine. It will suggest possible identifications for the names in terms of their linguistic background. These will be plotted on a map of the region with the intent of observing possible cultural influences in the region as a whole and in specific areas where the evidence is available. The results may be compared with Late Bronze Age data that has been collected and studied elsewhere, as well as with other new data from Palestine during this later period. In particular, the study will consider evidence of distinctive Akkadian names in this region of expected Amorite influence. It will also seek to identify the “northern names,” i.e., those onomastica that contain linguistic elements from areas of northern Syria and Anatolia, and especially those that may be identified with Human and culturally related elements.

- DEBORAH GERBER TOR, Harvard University

The Transformation of the Jihad in the 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> Centuries: The *Mutaṭawwi'a*

In the 740s the Islamic Empire was beset by military setbacks on the one hand and internal political, tribal, and ethnic dissensions on the other. It has previously been noted that one result of this crisis was the cessation of the great, state-organized Jihad, which, in the 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> centuries, had led to the conquest of a territorial empire stretching from the Atlantic to Central Asia. It is this paper's contention, however, that the Jihad, rather than ceasing, underwent a radical transformation. A new leadership arose in the vacuum left by the withdrawal of Caliphal attention from the prime battlefield—namely, the Byzantine frontier, where Islam confronted its greatest religious rival, Christianity. This new leadership can only be described as a movement of volunteer warriors for the faith, known as *mutaṭawwi'a* (literally, “those doing good beyond what is obligatory on them

[in fighting Unbelievers]”), who, both alone and in bands or sworn brotherhoods, flocked to the borders—and particularly to the Byzantine border—in order to succor the flagging battle for the faith and continue to faithfully execute the Jihad.

This paper discusses some of the characteristics of this new breed of holy warriors—eastern Iranian, largely ascetic, profoundly Sunni, and transmitters of prophetic hadith—and the seminal influence that their movement had on all areas of Islamic society, playing a vital role in everything from the composing of the first books of Jihad and of asceticism (*zuhd*) to the formation of Caliphal policies and the crystallization of the Hanbalite movement.

- CHRISTOPHER MELCHERT, University of Oxford

#### Şūfis, Proto-Şūfis, and Other Renunciants in Ninth-Century Basra

In the ninth century CE., Basra issued a stream of leading Muslim intellectuals: Jāḥiẓ and a whole school grammarians in literature; the leading Muʿtazili theologians of the century; Abū Dāwūd al-Ṭayālīsī, ʿAlī ibn al-Madanī, Abū Dāwūd al-Sijistānī, and others in hadith; in jurisprudence, the Āl Ḥammād, who dominated Baghdadi jurisprudence for the second half of the century, while a Ḥanafī scion, Bakkār ibn Qutaybah, revitalized Egyptian Ḥanafism through his own work and, even more, through that of a student, al-Ṭaḥāwī.

I propose here to map trends in Basran piety. Rābiʿah al-ʿAdawīyah is a famous name from the beginning of the century, but she seems to belong mainly to eighth-century renunciation. Al-Muḥāsibī and Sahl al-Tustarī both left more important legacies for later Sufism, and both sought refuge in Basra from persecution elsewhere. Tustarī’s doctrine is relatively well documented and leads into the Sālīmī movement in tenth-century Basra.

After Sahl al-Tustarī and his followers, three strands of Basran renunciation seem the most interesting: 1) *şūfiyyat al-Muʿazilah*, well known but they apparently faded away at mid-century; 2) *ahl al-maḥabbah*, of whom we shall probably never know more than their provoking fierce opposition; and 3) Abū Ḥātim al-ʿAttār (d. 260’s/874–84) and his followers. Abū Ḥātim was connected with Junayd and other important Baghdadi Sufis, locally with the opposition to *ahl al-maḥabbah*, an unexpected combination. I have previously connected al-Barbahārī’s Ḥanbali activism in tenth century with the Sufi legacy in Basra through Sahl al-Tustarī, but Abū Ḥātim al-ʿAttār and his circle show that commanding the good and prohibiting evil had already become securely established in Basran Sunni circles.

- SULEIMAN A. MOURAD, Yale University

#### In Search of a Master: The Şūfis’ Misappropriation of al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī

Modern scholarship generally places al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī (d. 110/728) as the predecessor of several religious movements in Islam, among them Sufism. He is sometimes described as the great representative of early Islamic spiritualism and the founder of the science of hearts (*ʿilm al-qulūb*). The Sufis are believed to have valued his teachings and followed his exemplary conduct. Little is found, however, in the primary sources from the first three centuries of Islam that can substantiate this claim. Early Sufis had very little to say about al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī’s contribution to their movement. Whenever they refer to him, they quoted a few quasi-ascetic sayings attributed to him. The depiction of al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī in modern scholarship has been largely based on careful selectivity of some traditions ascribed to him at the expense of others, with little attention to their circumstances and historical context.

In this paper, I will show when the Sufi misappropriation of al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī started, and how he was transformed over the centuries to become one of the acclaimed cornerstones of the mystical movement in Islam. Abū Ṭālib al-Makkī (d. 386/996) was the first to argue for a prominent position for al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī in the emergence of Sufism. According to al-Makkī, al-Ḥasan was the fountain-head, who received the secrets of the mystical knowledge indirectly from the prophet Muḥammad.

Later Sufis placed al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī in their respective *silsilas* (chain of mentors-disciples); citing his name after the prophet Muḥammad and the imam ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib. Yet, the debate over al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī’s association with the Sufi movement went on, especially since many anti-Sufi Muslims rejected it categorically. The prolific Mamluk compiler al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505) felt the need to make yet another effort to settle the issue in favor of the Sufis; he was seemingly successful.

- PAUL L. HECK, Princeton University

The Study of Human Civilization (‘*umrān*) before Ibn Khaldūn

The theory of human civilization formulated by Ibn Khaldūn (the so-called father of sociology) is generally considered a methodological revolution, for the attempt to observe human society as it is rather than making “normative” claims—either religious, moral or philosophical—about how it should be. Taking his work as a revolution has, however, obscured the fact that previous treatises on political science and history expressed similar if not the same ideas about the formation of human society.

My communication, then, will introduce the precedents to Ibn Khaldūn’s ideas, drawing upon the works of such scholars as Ibn Rusta (d. ca. 910 CE), Qudāma b. Jaʿfar (d. 948), al-Fārābī (d. 950) and Saʿīd al-Andalusī (d. 1070), among others. The insights to be gained are twofold: 1) to understand more fully the continuity of this kind of “sociological” methodology in Islamic history; and 2) to gain insight into the values that inspired Ibn Khaldūn to undertake his particular approach to the study of human civilization.

It is this second point that is most enlightening. The methodology adopted by Ibn Khaldūn seems to have been most prominent in treatises on human society produced by scholars with some connection to the state (e.g. state officials or magistrates, etc.). Exploration of his predecessors, then, will suggest ways in which Ibn Khaldūn’s ideas were not simply the product of his own intellectual activity but represent the values and point of view of a particular social class, one to which Ibn Khaldūn himself belonged.

- BARBARA KELLNER-HEINKELE, Freie Universität Berlin

Cevdet Paşa as Critic of Ottoman Society

An influential statesman and prolific scholar, Cevdet Paşa (1823–1895) was a close observer of the society of his time and a strict judge of the political and scholarly elite he encountered in a career that spanned five decades. His most personal works, the *Tezâkir* (memoranda) and the *Maʿrûzât* (statements), form a rich, yet little tapped source of information about Ottoman society during the Tanzimat (reform) era. As an eye-witness and active player in the background of events, Cevdet Paşa recorded his views on issues and people, thus painting an intricate picture of the circles he had access to: the court of the sultan, the offices of the dignitaries, the reunions of scholars. Far from being only anecdotal, the texts permit to better understand the interplay of intrigues and inadequacies that impeded reform. Moreover, the autobiographical tone of the works seems to lead to the more private convictions of Cevdet Paşa.

## ABSTRACTS of Communications

- Aklujkar, Ashok, 6  
Aklujkar, Vidyut, 13  
al-Imad, Leila S., 28  
al-Rahim, Ahmed H., 4  
Alon, Ilai, 28  
Averbeck, Richard E., 15
- Bauer, Jerome K., 28  
Beaulieu, Paul-Alain, 23  
Beckman, Gary, 8  
Bellamy, James A., 11  
Brisch, Nicole, 8  
Brooks, E. Bruce, 9  
Buccellati, Giorgio, 7
- Carter, Michael G., 19  
Christie, Niall, 10  
Cohen, Signe, 5  
Cooper, Glen M., 3  
Cooper, Jerrold S., 8
- Daniels, Peter T., 1  
Davis, Jr., Donald R., 30  
Depuydt, Leo, 24
- Fleming, Daniel E., 8  
Fort, Andrew O., 21  
Frank, Richard M., 26  
Frye, Richard N., 24
- Goldin, Paul R., 9  
Goodding, Robert A., 21  
Gray, David B., 22  
Griffel, Frank, 27  
Guenther, Sebastian, 26
- Harzer, Edeltraud, 20  
Heck, Paul L., 33  
Heim, Maria, 23  
Hentrich, Thomas, 31  
Hess, Richard S., 31
- Jamison, Stephanie, 7  
Jaques, R. Kevin, 18  
Jones, Philip, 14  
Judd, Steven, 19  
Jungraithmayr, Herrmann, 1
- Karahashi, Fumi, 14  
Katz, Joshua T., 5  
Kaye, Alan, 1  
Keating, Sandra Toenies, 27  
Kellner-Heinkele, Barbara, 33  
Kelly-Buccellati, Marilyn, 7  
Kobayashi, Masato, 6  
Kroll, Paul W., 16  
Kwong, Charles Yim-Tze, 16
- Lenzi, Alan, 15  
Lowry, Joseph E., 18  
Lubin, Timothy, 12  
Luppert-Barnard, S. M., 25

Mahdavi, M. Amin, 11  
Manring, Rebecca J., 13  
Mccurley, Dallas L., 9  
McGinnis, Jon, 4  
Melchert, Christopher, 32  
Meserve, Ruth I., 2  
Minkowski, Christopher Z., 30  
Morrison, Robert, 4  
Mourad, Suleiman A., 32

Naby, Eden, 25  
Nagasaki, Hiroko, 12  
Nemec, John, 13

Olivelle, Patrick, 30

Pedersen, Ralph K., 15  
Prior, Daniel, 3

Riedel, Dagmar, 10  
Rukmani, T. S., 22

Saleh, Walid, 26  
Scharf, Peter M., 6  
Serikoff, Nikolai, 10  
Sharlach, Tonia, 7  
Shayegan, M. Rahim, 23  
Sinor, Denis, 2  
Skjærvo, P. Oktor, 7  
Smith, Frederick M., 12  
Stern, Elliot M., 20  
Stewart, Devin, 17  
Street, Tony, 5

Testen, David, 2  
Toorawa, Shawkat M., 17  
Tor, Deborah Gerber, 31

van Bladel, Kevin, 3  
Veldhuis, Niek, 14  
Vishanoff, David R., 19

Wallace, Vesna A., 22  
Whitaker, Jarrod L., 29  
Wong, Timothy C., 17

Yakubovich, Ilya S., 2