American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842

CONSTITUENT OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF LEARNED SOCIETIES AND THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF ORIENTALISTS

ABSTRACTS

of the

TWO HUNDRED AND THIRTEENTH

MEETING

Nashville

April 4th–7th 2003

(Includes Program Changes)
PROGRAM OF THE 213TH MEETING

CHANGES AND CORRECTIONS

Papers Withdrawn

1. HERRMANN JUNGRAITHMAYR, Frankfurt University
   Pronominal Gender Distinction in Southwestern Afroasiatic/Hamito-Semitic (Chadic)

29. CLEMENCY WILLIAMS, Brown University
   A Glimpse into the Transmission of Astronomical Ideas from Mesopotamia through Greece into India: Brahmagupta’s Khainḍakhādyaka and the ‘Valana’

59. DAVID WARBURTON, University of Aarhus
   Work

109. HAMAD M. BIN SERAY, United Arab Emirates University
   Christianity in the Arabian Gulf Region

Title Corrections

24. NIGHT QUEEN PANKAJ, Banaras Hindu University
   The Status of Women as Gleaned from the Arthaśāstra of Kauṭilya

26. LUDO ROCHER, University of Pennsylvania
   Commentators at Work: Systematizing the Dharmaśāstra Texts

50. COELI FITZPATRICK, Grand Valley State University
   The ‘Six Non-Naturals’ in Medieval Arabic Medicine

51. MARY BROCKINGTON, University of Edinburgh
   The Rāmāyaṇa, the Harivaṃśa, and the Mahābhārata

Other Corrections

Business Meeting times should be: 11:00 a.m.–11:45 a.m.*

Correct Monday April 6th to Monday April 7th in the Summary and the Program.
Pronominal Gender Distinction in Southwestern Afroasiatic/Hamito-Semitic (Chadic)

Personal pronouns and pronominal systems belong to the most conservative properties of Afroasiatic (AA) languages. One of their characteristic features is the gender-distinctive manifestation of the 2\textsuperscript{nd} and 3\textsuperscript{rd} persons; eg., Arabic Sg. 2\textsuperscript{nd} m. \textit{anta}, f. \textit{anti}, 3\textsuperscript{rd} m. \textit{huwa}, f. \textit{hiya}, Pl. 2\textsuperscript{nd} m. \textit{antum}, f. \textit{antunna}, 3\textsuperscript{rd} m. \textit{hum(u)}, f. \textit{hunna}. In Chadic, i.e., the approximately 150 languages of southwestern AA, this kind of gender-distinctive representation of pronouns is restricted to the singular person positions only. Thus, e.g., Hausa has Sg. 2\textsuperscript{nd} m. \textit{kai}, f. \textit{kee}, 3\textsuperscript{rd} m. \textit{shii}, f. \textit{itu}; in Kulere (Ron) Sg. 2\textsuperscript{nd} m. is \textit{y-ab}, f. \textit{y-iky}, 3\textsuperscript{rd} m. \textit{y-ish}, f. \textit{y-it}.

It has been demonstrated in various publications that the original heritage of the AA languages has undergone enormous transformational processes in the course of the past four to five millenia since the AA-Chadic languages have penetrated into the Central Sudan south of the Sahara. Thus, also the morphology of pronouns has been strongly affected by the intensive contacts with non-AA-speaking communities. The internal structure of the personal pronouns—including the absolute sets, the subject affixes in the different tenses, the object as well as the possessive affixes—has undergone remarkable changes in the individual languages. One of the main objectives of the present paper is to show to what extent Chadic languages have been able to preserve the original patterning and lexical material inherited from the common AA linguistic history.

Typology of Sumerian Compound Verbs

It is difficult to give a satisfactory definition of Sumerian compound verbs from a morpho-syntactic point of view. At this stage of research, therefore, instead of trying to make a clear-cut distinction between compound verb and simple verb constructions, this paper will focus on the variety of compound verb constructions. Several different patterns will be examined. These will range from the prototypical šu-ši “to receive” to the far less prototypical, indeed almost ditransitive, igi-gar “to look at.”

A Text in Najdi Arabic from Jabal Tuweiq

Phonological and grammatical characteristics as well as certain stylistic factors will be examined as an authentic text from Jabal Tuweiq, Saudi Arabia, is examined (originally recorded on tape in the field in 2000). The text will be presented in transcription with an accompanying translation, and will also be played.

A Masculine Derivational Formant in Early Semitic?

Reflexes of the Semitic derivational suffix *-(a)t- are used throughout the Semitic languages to form secondary feminine nouns and adjectives (e.g., Akkadian \textit{rabi:-t-}, Arabic \textit{kabi:r-at-}, Hebrew \textit{g dol-ä ‘big-f.’}). It is suggested that another formant, albeit of considerably more restricted scope, served the opposite function, the creation of secondary masculine stems. While the element in question is most clearly visible in Arabic, it has left enough traces scattered throughout the remaining languages to allow us to speculate that it is legitimate to reconstruct this suffix for the Proto-Semitic ancestral language.
Christopher Woods, University of Chicago

The Element -re and the Organization of Erim-huš

The lexical list Erim-huš = anantu (MSL XVII) is a semantically organized series, similar in this respect to An-ta-gal₂ = ṣaqû, in which Sumero-Akkadian pairs of synonyms and antonyms are arranged in semantic fields of three, rarely more, pairs that are often set off between ruled lines. In no fewer than fifteen of these subsections, the last element of the triplet ends with the form (a-)ri-a. To my knowledge, an explanation of this form has not been offered, although the citations in the dictionaries appear to suggest that it belongs to the lexical content of its particular lexical entry. In this communication I will argue that the element (a-)ri-a plays no role in modifying the semantics of the accompanying lexeme, but is rather an organizational feature of Erim-huš and is to be counted among similar elements of this class in lexical lists, e.g., SU, MIN. I will also argue that this element is to be connected with the Sumerian demonstrative -re and that an iconic or metaphorical relationship exists between the essential semantics of the two. Further, such an understanding of this element clarifies the problem of the obscure Sumerian verbal post-position -re.

A.J. Ferrara, University Museum, University of Pennsylvania

Bending Gender in Babylon: Inanna, Femme Fatale, the Maelstrom, and Myth Noir

... an intricate tale of frustrated ambition, divine cunning, ungrateful infidelity, morbid jealousy and tender sisterly love. ...¹

Thus did S. N. Kramer succinctly characterize the Sumerian mythic composition “Inanna’s Descent” more than thirty years ago, based upon his plot-character analysis of the events and actants. His analysis was couched in the form of a dilemma identified by him as touching on the originary circumstances of the composition: how the ancient scribes attempted to reconcile Dumuzi’s banishment to the netherworld with Inanna’s otherwise professed love for him, his divinization and presumed immortality. Although the terms of Kramer’s posed dilemma and his proposed answer might not withstand critical scrutiny today, his trenchant précis of the composition still holds good. His characterization had another, perhaps unintended effect—it captured almost perfectly, a particular genre of film that was popular in the 30’s through the 50’s—film noir. One of the main characters of film noir movies is that of the femme fatale who, by her consistent actions from film to film, approaches the nature of a Proppian function. Inanna’s apparent androcentricity as a dimension of her divine personality fits well with the femme fatale character of noir films. The term “noir” is adopted and adapted here to advance for consideration a notion of “myth noir” as this pertains to the femme fatale Inanna and her paradoxical nature.² Feminist and gender studies generally and feminist film criticism specifically have been most productive for new ways of approaching texts both in the narrower and the wider postmodern sense of the term and have profound hermeneutic implications. This paper combines some critical insights of postmodern, feminist and filmic criticism for a novel look at the parallels afforded by the femme fatale of noir films, the androcentric Inanna of mythic and hymnic compositions, and modified Proppian functions.

The exceptional quality of the Sumerian literary debate Bird and Fish—the fact that Fish violates the formal limits of the debate genre and violently attacks Bird’s nest—seems to have played a significant role in Vanstiphout’s (1992, 348) efforts to formulate a theory of genre for the debates and, in more general terms, Mesopotamian literature. In order to evaluate Fish’s transgression of the debate genre itself and the role of such a transgression in the history of the genre, a micro-structural analysis (Michalowski 1996) of the crucial section of the debate will be undertaken and the formal devices and their role in the history of the genre explicated.


The phrase ˇsiptu ul yattun (or yuttun alongside other dialectical variants) occurs in Akkadian incantations from pre-Sargonic times on through the first millennium. Despite its longevity and its relative frequency in incantations, it has received only cursory study in Assyriological literature. Though even the cursory treatments have proven useful in my own study, I will attempt in this paper to examine this phrase within a contextually broader framework in order to delineate the phrase’s distinctiveness as a legitimating formula, its development during its long career of usage, its probable cultural background, and finally its setting among other emphatic ritual negations. The implications of the study are several: it confirms our understanding of incantation composition in the later periods, it contributes data for interpreting the socio-religious function of incantations for both priest and patient, and it demonstrates the privative rather than the creative power of the word in Mesopotamian thought.

Tzvi Abusch, Brandeis University

The Promise to Praise God in Šuilla Prayers

This paper discusses some aspect of praise in prayers addressed to anthropomorphized divinities, focusing particularly on the promise of praise in the Akkadian šuilla prayers. After some introductory remarks on the function of the hymnic address, I will turn to the concluding promise to praise the god. The content of the praise is usually not stated. By comparing similar texts, I try to establish the precise form that the praise takes. Finally, I shall attempt to determine both the significance of the promise and the social context of the imagery.

Jacob Lauinger, University of Chicago

Anzū at Alalakh

A number of tablet fragments from Alalakh, modern Tell Atchana, were excavated by Sir Leonard Woolley and remain unpublished in the Antakya museum. In the course of photographing these tablets prior to the Amuq Valley Regional Project’s resumption of excavations at Alalakh in the summer of 2003, I identified one as a fragment of Tablet III of the Akkadian Anzū myth. This fragment, AM 11000, with 14 lines preserved, duplicates a passage previously known from only one exemplar from Sherikhan (H. W. F. Saggs, Archiv für Orientforschung 33 (1986) 1–29). I will discuss philological features of the fragment and examine the historical and cultural contexts which produced it. I will consider how the presence of Anzū at Alalakh broadens our understanding of this
Bronze Age regional capital and gives concrete evidence for the presence of a scribal school at the site. Finally, I will discuss AM 11000 from the perspective of the other exemplars of the Anzu myth known from throughout the ancient Near East.

- Benjamin Studevent-Hickman, Harvard University
  
  Language, Speech, and the Death of Anzu
  
  Scholars both ancient and modern have credited Nimurtu with the defeat of Anzu in the Standard Babylonian version of bin šar dadmé. However, a closer look at the scribe’s use of language, the story’s emphasis on the power of speech, and the larger theological and literary context of the myth reveals that Anzu, himself, is ultimately responsible for his own death.

- J. Michael Farmer, Brigham Young University
  
  “A Person of the State Composed a Poem”: Protest Poems in the Records of the States South of Mt. Hua
  
  The notion that song lyrics and poetry express the innermost feelings of human beings is both ancient and hallowed. Believing this concept, rulers collected lyric compositions in order to gauge public sentiment. Many of these anonymous verses survive in literary anthologies, out of their original context. This paper will examine several poems from the Later Han period as contained in the fourth-century gazetteer of the southwest, Chang Qu’s Huayang guo zhi [Records of the States South of Mt. Hua]. First, I will discuss the practice of including verse in historical writing. Next, the individual poems in the Huayang guo zhi will be examined, along with Chang Qu’s efforts to reconstruct an historical context for the verses. Finally, the function of these poems in Chang’s historical narrative will be analyzed, with the aim of elucidating the role of verse in and as history.

- Thomas Lavallee, Southern Illinois University at Edwardsville
  
  Wildly Chanting in the Suburbs: Representation of Pleasure in the Poetry of the Orchid Pavilion Gathering
  
  The Orchid Pavilion gathering held on April 22, 353 A.D. has been remembered by literati in East Asia for more than sixteen hundred years because of the famous calligraphic artistry Wang Xizhi employed to write his “Lanting xu,” a prose preface to a collection of forty-one poems composed on that occasion. The preface has been studied quite thoroughly, yet the poems have been neglected through the years. Perhaps they are not read because they are not held in high esteem by traditional literary critics. Poetry of this era has been described as possessing far too much philosophical verbiage of the qingtan or “Pure Conversation” variety. However, there is a great deal to be learned from this collection of poems once we step away from these negative evaluations. In this paper, I will survey the verse composed at the Orchid Pavilion gathering paying close attention to the recurrent imagery, ideas and word play found throughout the set. It is my intention to augment the portrayal of the gathering as found in the prose preface in order to uncover a more complete picture of the occasion.

- Sujane Wu, Swarthmore College
  
  Did Lu Yun (262–303) Really Shed Tears for Others?—A Comparative reading of his “Four Poems of Presentation and Reply on Behalf of Gu Yanxian and His Wife”
  
  Among Western Jin writers, Lu Yun was the most prolific poet in writing zengda [presentation and reply] poems. Under this category, one set of Lu Yun’s four poems written on behalf of a husband and his wife presents three features in terms of Chinese poetic subgenre, which will be first discussed in this paper. With regard to Lu’s emotion and motivation for writing these poems, this paper will also reveal the true feeling behind them by examining whether they were simply written for others or actually written for Lu Yun himself. Predominate is the theme of separation between a husband
and a wife in *gushi* [Old Style Poetry] and *yuefu* [Music Bureau Poetry] genres. The comparison of Lu’s presentation and reply poems and the same category of poems written by Qin Jia and Xu Shu, a husband and his wife, in the Later Han period will further illuminate the changes in love and expectations due to the separation of a husband from his wife.

**Meow Hui Goh, University of Wisconsin-Madison**

The Quest for “Harmony”—One Aspect in the Invention of Tonal Prosody in 5th Century China

The invention of Chinese tonal prosody in the fifth century presented many complex questions to the study of Chinese literary history. While the topic is multi-faceted and can be approached in different ways, this paper will focus on the following two questions: What were Shen Yue’s (441–513) and Wang Rong’s (468–494) literary concerns when they used tonal prosody to create the first regulated verse in Chinese history? How did they create the tonal patterns in their poems?

The most important studies that have been done on the topic are distinctively varied in their perspective, methodology, and conclusion. However, they mostly rely on *Bunkyo* *hifuron*, a ninth century source from Japan, and do not attempt to find new answers in the sources from the Six Dynasties. These studies are also less interested in tracing the literary concerns that had led to the invention. In order to fill in the gap, this paper offers to decipher Shen’s and Wang’s literary thoughts from the records from the Qi (479–502) and Liang (502–557) and their own poems, and by referring to their predecessors.

The thesis that this paper proposes is: Shen’s and Wang’s prosodic movement was deeply rooted in a Chinese literary tradition that stressed that literary works should infiltrate a sense of “harmony” through their sound effects. It was, at the same time, the continuation of a literary trend since the Han (206 B.C.–220) to promote the refinement of poetic language and style, and strongly motivated by an urgency prevailing the literary scene in the Southern Dynasties to innovate [Chinese]. In order to revise the widely accepted belief that there were huge discrepancies between Shen’s and Wang’s prosodic theory and their works, this paper will also demonstrate that the prosodic principles that they proposed were carried through successfully in their poems.

**Suh-Jen Yang, University of Washington**

The Poetic Features of Inscription Writings in the Six Dynasties

This paper will remedy a misconception that inscriptions lack literary merit and reveal the poetic features of inscriptions composed in the Six Dynasties. Here are my main points:

The earliest memorial inscriptions, or *ming*, from the Zhou times, were rhymed using four characters expressing merit or admonition. This changed in the Western Han: a prose section was added before the rhyming text of the *ming*. This new section serves as a narrative of the life of the deceased, while the *ming* treats praise or grief for the deceased in lyric form. The inscription has evolved into an ornate lyric.

The tetrasyllabic convention of the *Odes* gradually lost its vogue during the Wei, Jin and Six Dynasties periods. However, it enjoyed new popularity in ritual ceremony works, ritual offering (*shidian*) poems, and in inscriptions. In the wake of the popularity of poetry, other literary genres were influenced and became “lyricized,” as in the examples of the preface and *ming* section of the tomb inscription.
Some scholars argue that only the ming section appears prominently. But new archeological evidence contradicts prevalent notions and has proven that both preface and ming appear together. Only the writing consistent with the belles lettres style are included in the Wenxuan compilation. The prefaces are omitted as in the case of “The inscription of Mrs. Liu.”

Strong poetic features common to the lyric emerge in the “Dhuta monastery inscription” by Wang Jianqi in the Wenxuan. Full of allusions, this work of “Buddhist parallel prose” contains outstanding poetic description that appears in both the preface and the ming sections.

Poetic elements especially permeate the writing of Yu Xin, a renowned inscription writer of the Northern Dynasty, who employed natural scenes to express grief in inscription text.

The poetic features of the traditional Odes style—tetrasyllable form and expressive, sometimes lyrical voice—find new expression in the memorial inscription, and personal expression is heard in both preface and ming.

David Prager Branner, University of Maryland

Crypto-phonograms in Chinese and the Ideography Debate†

Baron Peter von Boodberg’s (1903–1972) most influential contribution to scholarship at large seems to have been his opposition to the term “ideograph” (“ideogram”). The rationale for repudiating this traditional concept is well understood: writing can represent language per se only glottographically—phonetically or by arbitrary association with speech sounds—and never by meaning alone, because semantic representations are never language-specific. I. J. Gelb, in his seminal book on writing systems, followed Boodberg, and much of the scholarly world has followed Gelb.

Less well known is Boodberg’s suspicion of compound semantographs (hueyyih “syssemantic” graphs), many of which he believed contained occult phonetic elements, unrecognized as such because their polyvalency is not documented in traditional sources. An example of this (what we may call) “crypto-phonogram” principle is the graph [[]] “name” MENG, in which Boodberg claims the upper element [[]] “night”, usually ZAK, has the phonetic value usually associated with [[]] “night” ’MENG.

Syssemantographs are described by the first century Shuowen thus: [[]] “[one] juxtaposes representative elements and combines their meanings, in order to make evident what is indicated.” In other words, the syssemantographic class is defined as the juxtaposition of graphs for their meanings alone, without phonetic content. That makes the syssemantograph a kind of ideographic structure. No wonder Boodberg, opposed as he was to the ideograph, sought to reinterpret this class in phonetic terms. It is a fact that what appear to be compound semantographs are much more common in Chinese than in other extant early writing systems (Sumerian, Mayan, Egyptian, Linear B). Are they in fact compound semantographs, or are they crypto-phonograms? First century Chinese, at any rate, accepted the ideographic principle of hueyyih character composition just as they resisted the full phoneticizaton of their script.

† Chinese characters originally in this abstract cannot be reproduced. The missing Chinese is represented by []).
Below are a few examples of phonetically doubtful syssemantographs. Modern Chinese is given in italics, with an early Chinese transcription in boldface capitals.

Ideography has been discredited as the means by which whole Chinese characters represent whole Chinese morphemes. But unless the crypto-phonogrammatic hypothesis can be more fully corroborated, it would seem that ideography is still useful in explaining some internal character structures.

Ahmad Atif Ahmad, Harvard University

The Interrelatedness of Law and Legal Theory in Islam: A Study of the Genre of Takhrīj al-Furūʿ ʿalā ʿal-Uṣūl

This paper introduces for the first time to an English-speaking audience the Islamic juristic genre of takhrīj al-furūʿ ʿalā al-ʿusūl by discussing six books that represent that genre,* spanning all four schools of sunni law and belonging to the age of maturity of Islamic legal thinking.

Recent debate among western scholars in the field of Islamic legal studies on whether ʿusūl al-fiqh should be seen as linked to practical rulings of Islamic law (Hallaq) or whether “a full account of the ‘function’ and the value of ʿusūl would have also to take account of the tendency to make of it a closed and independent science” (Calder)∗∗ seems of late to have gained special momentum. The scholars who attended the Alta conference in 1999∗∗∗ strongly suggested that the issue of the connection between ʿusūl al-fiqh and furūʿ al-fiqh must be studied more thoroughly in order to produce valuable results. However, in none of the treatments of the issue have the scholars concerned pointed to the genre of takhrīj al-furūʿ ʿalā al-ʿusūl as relevant.****

* These are Taṣṣīs al-Nazār by Dābbūsī (d. 1036), Takhrīj al-Furūʿ ʿalā al-ʿUsūl by al-Zanjānī (d. 1258), Miṣṭāḥ al-Wusūl ʿalā Bināʾ al-Furūʿ ʿalā al-ʿUsūl by Tīlīmīsānī (d. 1370), al-Tamhīd Fi Takhrīj al-Furūʿ ʿalā al-ʿUsūl by Iṣnawi (d. 1371), al-Qawāʿid wa-l-Fawāʾid al-Uṣūliyyah wa-ma yaṭāʾallaq bi-hā min al-ʾĀkhām al-Shārīʿyyah by ʾĪbān al-Lahuḥ (d. 1397), and al-Wusūl ʿalā Qawāʿid al-ʿUsūl by Tumurtūshī (d. after 1599.)

** Norman Calder, “al-Nawawī’s Typology of Muftıs and its Significance for a General Theory of Islamic Law” in Islamic Law and Society 3.2 June 1996, 158-61. See also Gleave (Inevitable Doubt, 2000) who views ʿusūl al-fiqh as a largely independent genre whose works were used for pedagogical purposes with the goal of honing the intellectual skills of students of law.

*** B. Weiss (ed.), Studies in Islamic Legal Theories (Brill, 2002.)

**** In fact, Wolfhart Heinrichs’ two articles on the juristic genres of al-furūq (the art of distinguishing ostensibly similar cases...
In my paper, I argue that the takhrīj al-furūʿ ala al-usūl works show at least that the jurists who authored them view usūl as foundational to the furūʿ. Added to Hallaq’s observation that usūl must have been influenced by early furūʿ, this leads us to believe that the two genres are intertwined and that the fact that some aspects of each seem to have evolved independently does not justify viewing them as “legally independent genres.”

Everett K. Rowson, University of Pennsylvania
Beyond the Letter of the Law: Islamic Monographic Literature on Sodomy

The offense of liwāṭ (sodomy, male-male anal intercourse) is dealt with extensively in premodern treatises on Islamic law, mostly as a supplement to discussions of zinā (heterosexual fornication or adultery). Ambiguities in the textual sources of the law (Qurʾān and ḥadīth), as well as an extraordinary prominence of male homoeroticism in society and secular literature, guaranteed that the lawyers would have much to say about this topic, and that they would disagree about its legal status. But discussions of sodomy ranged well beyond formal law treatises; in particular, at least seven monographs in Arabic on the subject are known, ranging from the ninth to the seventeenth century CE. After a brief consideration of the legal literature, this paper will focus on these monographs, none of which have as yet been the subject of Western scholarship, and all of which can be characterized as contributions to the “paraenetic” or hortatory literature of Islam. In their attempt to warn the reader off from the seductive pleasures of sodomy, or more broadly of homoeroticism, these treatises offer important insights into the social construction of sexuality in the societies that produced them. At the same time, they suggest ways of refining our understanding of the relationship between law and ethics generally in classical Islamic thought, serving to illustrate a distinction that can be only imperfectly elucidated by that between the English terms “crime” and “sin” but which is vividly represented by established divisions in genre within the learned tradition.

Joseph E. Lowry, University of Pennsylvania
Ibn Qutayba: An Early Witness to al-Shāfiʿī’s Legal Doctrines

The publication a decade ago of Norman Calder’s Studies in Early Muslim Jurisprudence heralded a reexamination of the nature and origins of the earliest treatises on Islamic law. Although Calder was clearly wrong about some things (the early Mālikī texts and, in this writer’s view, also the Risāla of al-Shāfiʿī [d. 820]), he was certainly right to draw attention to the many difficult literary issues raised by texts such as the Kitāb al-Umm, attributed to Shāfiʿī. A hitherto overlooked source for early evidence of Shāfiʿī’s doctrines are the writings of Ibn Qutayba (d. 889). Several of Ibn Qutayba’s books, including one of his earliest works, contain quotations or paraphrases or mention of Shāfiʿī views. These passages represent, to this writer’s knowledge, the earliest appearance of Shāfiʿī or his doctrines in an extant work other than those attributed to Shāfiʿī or his immediate students. Comparison of these quotations with corresponding passages from Shāfiʿī’s legal writings suggests, however, that Ibn Qutayba may have been working with now lost recensions of Shāfiʿī’s legal opinions. Thus, although the evidence from Ibn Qutayba improves the circumstantial case for an authentic body of doctrine originating with Shāfiʿī in the early 9th century, it also further complicates any assessment of texts such as the Kitāb al-Umm and their genesis.

Susan Spectorsky, Queens College, CUNY
Secret Marriage in Early Fiqh Texts

Although we know that early Muslim jurists were concerned with combining pious Islamic norms with local practice, we do not necessarily know how the combination worked. This is especially
true since pious Islamic norms themselves were evolving and changing as successive generations of jurists added their own thinking to a growing body of doctrine. A problem that seems to reflect the interaction of legal concerns and societal development is that of a secret marriage. All jurists agreed that a secret marriage was not valid, but it is not always clear what they meant by it. For example, Ibn Hanbal held that a valid marriage required two just witnesses, but Abu Hanifa held that a marriage was valid regardless of whether it was witnessed, as long as it was concluded openly and was not secret. Further, in a hadith reported in Malik’s Muwatta, ‘Umar b. al-Khaṭṭāb was told of a marriage that was witnessed by one man and one woman, and he said, “This is a secret marriage; had I been there, I would have stoned them.”

In his “Über Geheimhen bei den Arabern” (Globus, 1895), Goldziher said that by the end of the first century, Muslim jurists had not yet arrived at a consensus on the most significant components of a publicly established marriage as opposed to a secret one. In this paper, the examples I offer from fiqh and hadith texts show that this lack of consensus extended into the second and third centuries as well. This is because two definitions of a secret marriage seemed to operate concurrently: it meant either that a marriage had taken place without adequate witnessing, or that a marriage had not been publicly announced. These two definitions can be explained by the fact that early jurists sometimes emphasized the importance of witnesses for a normative contract and other times the importance of a wedding as a political communal act.

- CHRISTOPHER MELCHERT, Oriental Institute, Oxford

The Musnad of Ahmad ibn Hanbal

The Musnad of Ahmad ibn Hanbal (d. Baghdad, 241/855) is a massive hadith collection, several times larger than any of the Six Books. A good part of the extra length is due to its inclusion of multiple versions, whose incidence I propose to measure. To a small extent, which again I propose to measure, it was also due to Ahmad’s including hadith from transmitters who do not appear in the Six. Juynboll and others have alleged that the Musnad is swollen by the inclusion of much dubiously attested hadith concerning al-targhab wa-al-tarhab, moral exhortation. I propose to see how far this is true. Finally, estimates of how much of the Musnad goes back to Ahmad, how much only to his son Abd Allâh (d. Baghdad, 290/903), have varied from 1 percent to a third. I propose to come up with some demonstrable figure within this range. Along the way, I should be able to characterize further what the Musnad has in common with the Six Books and what sets it apart.

- STEVEN E. LINDQUIST, University of Texas at Austin

Gender at Janaka’s Court: Women in the Brhadârañyaka Upaniṣad Reconsidered

This paper examines the role(s) of women in the Brhadârañyaka Upaniṣad, specifically in the Gârgî and Maitreyi episodes of the Yajñavalkyakânda. Previous scholarship on this topic has generally taken one of two interpretive positions: (1) that the text is representative of an historical reality for women in ancient India or, (2) the opposite, that the text has no direct relevance for such reconstructions. Taking a somewhat different position, I argue that a narrative must first and foremost be analyzed as a narrative before any historical claims can be posited. Following Witzel’s (1987) and Findly’s (1985) literary considerations of women in the Brhadârañyika, I closely examine the role(s) that women play in this work and how it may fit into the larger narrative structures of the text. The narrative structures of the Yajñavalkyakânda have been most recently discussed by Brereton (1997) and Hoch (2002). However, by focusing on gender within this text, different aspects of the narrative are highlighted. After discussing the position of women, I then deal directly with the question of gender: that is, what does the inclusion of women in the text add to the discussion? Or to phrase it another way, why are they women? In the conclusion of this paper, I posit three ways that the
text itself manipulates gender suggesting to the reader that women in the Brhadāraṇīyaka, whether historical individuals or not, were anything but “representative” of women in ancient India.

- **Night Queen Pankaj, Banaras Hindu University**

  The Status of Women as Gleaned from the *Arthaśāstra* of Kautilya

  Kautilya’s *Arthaśāstra*, the *magnum opus* of about 326 BC, is a landmark in the field of scientific contribution in ancient Indian (Sanskrit) literature. It is an outstanding work on ancient Indian social system and reflects Indian values as well as social, traditional and cultural ethos which was set down by Dharmasūtras (law-books).

  In Kautilyan society, the women were loyal, considerate and dutiful. Highly educated women held honourable position in the society and in the household. They were well-versed in different languages and were active right from the domestic works to the administration and business. The female bodyguard of King Chandragupta Maurya is mentioned in the *Arthaśāstra*. Troops of women, armed with bows are also referred. Prostitutes were engaged in multi-pronged espionage activites receiving high salaries.

  The women were expected to maintain harmony in different relationships at the individual level within the family, within the community and the state. The society looked upon them not only as child-bearing machines but as co-workers in nation-building also.

  In Kautilyan society much thought and planning was done in the formation of social norms regarding marriage, divorce, family and community relationships. Besides, sūka (bride-money), anuloma (marriage with higher caste male with lower caste female) and pratiloma (vice-versa) marriages were allowed and Kautilya has rational view regarding divorce or repudiation. Stridhan (dowry) was the material guarantee for women. Kautilya is quite comprehensive on the issue of rape and adultery. Society had more compassionate attitude towards widows (vidhvā) and Kautilya permits widow re-marriage under special circumstances. Molestation, rape or any other outrageous conduct was treated as criminal offence. There is no mention of wife’s immolation on husband’s funeral pyre (sati-prathā) or bride-burning which are a menace to modern Indian society.

  There was a general rule of equal division of property between man and woman.

  What we find, Kautilya is more lenient in his treatment of woman than Aristotle and Plato. Being a great supporter of moral values, Kautilya believed that a woman was honorable in society only if they follow the right path, laid down by the ancient law books.

- **Oskar von Hinüber, Universität Freiburg**

  Royal Gender Studies: Queens and other Ladies from Ancient Gilgit

  During the past decade the number of bronzes supposed to have been cast in the Gilgit area has increased considerably. Thirteen pieces belonging to this group are inscribed giving the names of quite a few donors and persons participating in the donation. This epigraphic material is of particular importance, because some bronzes are dated providing a firm basis for the chronology of bronzes often badly missed by art historians. Moreover, an unusual number of members of the royal Bhagadatta family of the Palola or Patola Sahis of Gilgit are enumerated. Among them women are richly represented underlining their role in promoting Buddhism by donations in seventh and early eighth century Gilgit. In addition, some of these women belong either to the royal family as princesses or as queens bearing titles not found elsewhere in ancient India. This material will be discussed together with the bronzes, particularly the representation of donors at their bases, texts from colophons of the Gilgit manuscripts and occasionally also rock inscriptions along the upper Indus supplementing the epigraphic evidence. Thus these texts and pictures can be used to find traces of the mostly social history of Buddhist Gilgit not told or preserved by any ancient historian.
Ludo Rocher, University of Pennsylvania

Commentators at Work: Systematizing the Dharmaśāstra Texts

The paper deals with the Hindu law of inheritance by brothers of the deceased. Brothers may be of different kinds: they may have been born of the same mother as the deceased or of different mothers, they may have lived jointly with the deceased or they may have lived in separate households, and they may be various permutations of these four types. The paper demonstrates the ingenious and different ways in which commentators derived rules of inheritance by all possible types of brothers, solely from two verses in the Yājñavalkyasyaṃṛti:

\[
\text{sanśṛṣṭinas tu sanśṛṣṭi sodarasya tu sodaraḥ} / \\
dadyāc cāpahared amśaṃ jātaṣya ca mṛtasya ca // [2.138] \\
\text{anyodaryas tu sanśṛṣṭi nānyodaryo dhanaṃ hareṭ} / \\
\text{asaṃśṛṣṭy api cādadyāt sanśṛṣṭo nānyamātrjaḥ} // [2.139]
\]

Donald R. Davis, Jr., University of Michigan

Convention, Legislation, and Dharma in Medieval Hindu Law: A Study of Saṃvidvyatikrama

Studies of the relationship between the normative texts of the dharmaśāstra tradition and the practical law of classical and medieval India have centered on the sources of law specified in the dharma texts or on the disjunction between the rules of dharmaśāstra and the operative law encountered by early colonial jurists and administrators in India. The present study approaches the problem from a different angle through an intensive analysis of one of the eighteen titles of law, namely the “transgression of conventions” (called variously saṃvidvyatikrama and saṃayānapākarma). The role of the conventional and legislated laws of local communities, guilds, monastic orders, military groups, etc., has not been sufficiently described in the extant histories of law in India.

The Sanskrit texts, especially the medieval dharmanibandhas, relating to this title of law will be compared and examined for what they tell us about the significance of such locally, regionally, or communally established laws to the larger legal systems of medieval India. In order to substantiate the evidence from the Sanskrit texts, epigraphical evidence from various parts of India dealing with the conventional laws (saṃaya) of different groups will be adduced to demonstrate the prevalence and hitherto unnoticed significance of collectively established laws in the law of medieval India. To date, no systematic study has appeared to correlate the evidence on convention and legislation from the dharma texts and medieval inscriptions. The paper should, therefore, build upon the work of Jolly, Kane, Derrett, Rocher, Wezler, and Lariviere.

Christopher Z. Minkowski, Cornell University

Sūryadāsa’s Investigation of the Views of Foreigners

The sixteenth century author Sūrya Daivajña, (also known as Sūryadāsa or Sūryakavi,) is best known today for his poetry but also wrote several astronomical works. One of them, the Siddhāntasamhitāsārasamuccaya, offers a summary of the astronomical school of thought of his father Jñānarāja and brother Cintāmaṇi by comparing it with other positions current in the period.

The fifth of the work’s twelve chapters is devoted to an “Investigation of the Views of the Foreigners,” the Mlecchamatanirūpanya. The chapter is of interest as the earliest known attempt in a Sanskrit astronomical work at a systematic description of Arabic / Persian astronomy and astrology. Sūrya’s account includes attempts at describing Arabic versions of Aristotelian cosmology, and offers a glossary of Arabic / Persian astronomical and astrological terms. It ends with a critique of views.

In this talk I will survey the chapter’s contents and attempt to identify some of its sources. I will also attempt to place the “Investigation” in the historical context of the growing awareness among Sanskrit intellectuals in this period of “foreign” systems of knowledge.
Sūrya is best known today for his poem, the Rāmakṛṣṇavilomakāvyā, which, when read from left to right tells the story of Rāma, but when read from right to left tells the story of Kṛṣṇa. Sūrya belongs to the generation of poets among whom this two-directional genre arose. The last part of the paper will propose understanding the development of Sanskrit two-directional poetry by appeal to Sūrya’s obvious interest in Arabic / Persian knowledge systems, which were, after all, written in a script that reads from right to left.

Rosane Rocher, University of Pennsylvania

Sir William Jones in 1785: Unpublished Documents from the Althorp Archives

The spring of 1785 marked a turning point in Sir William Jones’s scholarly endeavors. One year after founding the Asiatic Society, Jones returned to Calcutta from a river journey to Banaras, recovered from a life-threatening illness and resolved to learn Sanskrit. A long, poetic “Ethick Epistle” in the mode of Alexander Pope and accompanying letters addressed to his former tutee and regular correspondent, the second Earl Spencer, were withheld from Jones’s first biographer and editor of his collected works, Lord Teignmouth, and eluded Jones’s second biographer and editor of his letters, Garland Cannon. These unpublished documents throw new light on a crucial period in Jones’s life.

Amanda Podany, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona

A Survey of Diplomatic Marriage in Mesopotamia Before the Late Bronze Age

For two periods of ancient Near Eastern history—those documented in the archives from Mari and Amarna—a great deal is known about queens as well as kings. Many princesses married into foreign dynasties as participants in diplomatic marriages arranged by their fathers (see Meier in Amarna Diplomacy, 2000 and Durand in MARI 4, 1985). The same phenomenon is attested from other periods and places throughout the ancient Near East, from the middle of the third millennium onwards. This paper surveys the evidence for diplomatic marriage in Mesopotamia prior to the Late Bronze Age, looking at the institution as much as possible from the perspective of the princesses, who played a critical role in diplomacy between states.

Steven Garfinkle, Western Washington University

Mesopotamian Merchants in an Era of State Formation, 2112–1595

This paper surveys the evidence for the organization of merchants, and their activities during the Ur III and Old Babylonian periods. Much has been written about changes in economic patterns that were associated with the political and dynastic transitions of this era. An examination of the texts involving merchants points instead to tremendous continuity at this time. Such continuity is being increasingly recognized, and suggests the value of studies that cross the boundaries of our traditional schemes of periodization.

Using archival evidence drawn from both periods, including unpublished material from Ur III Lagash and Umma, this paper highlights the independence of the merchant organizations from the central authority. Indeed, the characteristic feature of merchant activity at that time was its dependence on family rather than state connections. The results also show that the business and social position of the merchant did not undergo radical changes following the fall of the Third Dynasty of Ur. Therefore, though the state remained the largest client of the merchants, it did not play a role in determining their professional status.
• JENNIE MYERS, The Oriental Institute, University of Chicago

The Importance of Sippar as a Religious and Cultural Center for the First Dynasty of Babylon

When the First Dynasty of Babylon sought to make their own, rather insignificant city the capital of a unified nation, they felt the need to associate themselves with a culturally superior city in order to legitimate their rule. From Early Dynastic times, kings had consistently legitimated their rule by claiming control over Nippur, the religious capital of southern Babylonia. The rulers of Babylon, however, chose to align themselves with Sippar and its patron deity Šamaš. This paper seeks to demonstrate that the First Dynasty of Babylon selected Sippar not simply because it was a northern, Semitic city with a large Amorite population, but because of its reputation, from early on, as the main religious and cultural center of northern Mesopotamia.

Like Nippur, Sippar was never the center of political power during historical periods. And, like the Ekur Temple of Enlil in Nippur, the Eḫabbar Temple of Šamaš in Sippar served as a repository for royal monuments, kudurrus, legal documents, and literary compositions. But Sippar had the added distinction, according to the Sumerian King List, of having been one of the five antediluvian cities to hold kingship, and by the Old Babylonian period had become known by the epithet “the eternal city” (āl _signupim).

Because the kings of Babylon wished not only to legitimate their rule over all of Babylonia, but to elevate the god of their city, Marduk, to “king of the gods”, they naturally avoided association with Nippur, the cult-center of Enlil, head of the Babylonian pantheon. Sippar, whose patron deity was not in competition with Marduk, provided the First Dynasty of Babylon with the religious and cultural clout they required.

• GARY BECKMAN, University of Michigan

An Old Babylonian Archive from Western Iran

An archive from Chogha Gavaneh, excavated thirty years ago but only recently studied, consists of over 50 tablets, most of which are unfortunately rather fragmentary, and one cylinder seal. Paleographic analysis dates this material to the Old Babylonian period, probably to the eighteenth century BCE. All documents are written in Akkadian, with a frequency of Sumerograms comparable to that of contemporary Mesopotamian usage. The onomasticon is overwhelmingly Akkadian, and in particular is similar to that found in Babylonian texts of the same period.

The primary concerns of the archive are agricultural. Four letters deal with foodstuffs, textiles, and agricultural equipment, while a dozen small tablets record the disbursement of a commodity, apparently seed grain. There are a large number of lists—ration lists and simple lists of names, most likely duty rosters. The majority of the personal names recorded are those of women.

A small number of place names appear in the records, but these cannot yet be identified with toponyms attested elsewhere. Similarly, the royal (?) names present on the cylinder and in the several impressions of another seal remain uncertain. Attested month names (Kīmmu, Tāmhirum, and Ṣaḥarātum) show affinities with the calendars of the Diyala region and northern Syria.

• DANIEL E. FLEMING, New York University

The 14th-Century Emar Texts and the Archives of Ekalte

At the 2002 Annual Meeting of the AOS, Gary Beckman reported on his comparison of the documents from Late Bronze Ekalte (Munbaqa) with the larger archives from nearby Emar in northwestern Syria. The Ekalte tablets appear to come from the 14th century BCE, slightly before the largely 13th-century texts from Emar. Beckman’s general review suggests a narrower comparison that he did not undertake: a small fraction of the Emar tablets comes from the 14th century as well, therefore in close proximity to the Ekalte archives in terms of both time and place. These early Emar texts are the ones that are sometimes dated by two-year eponym cycles, as found at Ekalte
and nowhere else. Both the Ekalte and the early Emar texts are characterized by scribal practices reminiscent of Old Babylonian patterns and are thus quite conservative. In my own presentation, I will pursue systematically the comparison of these two closely related sets of documents. Together, they reflect a shared Syrian scribal tradition that is only known in this form at Emar and Ekalte.

- JOHN P. NIELSEN, University of Chicago

The Arad-Sibitti Kudurru: Kin Groups and Land Alienation in Babylonia in the 10th Century B.C.

The five centuries from the 12th to the 8th century B.C. are considered a dark age in Babylonian history. The textual nadir for that period occurred in the 10th century, as only one text of any usable length survives, a monumental composition inscribed on a limestone block known as the Arad-Sibitti Kudurru (no. 9 in L. W. King’s Babylonian Boundary Stones in the British Museum). The kudurru contains copies of four legal documents, all of which concerned the family of Arad-Sibitti of the Kassite kin group, Bit-Abi-rattash, and the family of Burrusha the bow-maker. The kudurru focuses on the status of land that Arad-Sibitti possessed and attempted to transfer to Burrusha’s family as payment for legal penalties.

The author attempts to explain how the four legal decisions in the Arad-Sibitti Kudurru were related (the text itself is not explicit on this point). The author then examines the mechanics of land ownership and alienation in the Abi-rattash kin group as presented in the kudurru. It appears that a marriage was arranged between the daughter of Arad-Sibitti and the son of Burrusha in order to facilitate the transfer of land and meet requirements imposed by the Abi-rattash group. The study of this problem was informed by ethnographic evidence from a marriage tablet from the city of Nuzi dating to the 15th century B.C. The Arad-Sibitti Kudurru is the only clear example in the Babylonian cuneiform corpus of a kin group owning property collectively and the process by which such property could be alienated.

- SARAH C. MELVILLE, Clarkson University

Neo-Assyrian MI.É.GAL

It is generally agreed that the term MI.É.GAL refers to the consort of the reigning Assyrian king and that only she was privileged to use that title. In this paper we re-examine the evidence for the MI.É.GAL and determine that in addition to the consort, high-ranking secondary wives were sometimes allowed to call themselves MI.É.GAL in specific (private) contexts. We then go on to demonstrate that although there was certainly a distinction between the consort and other MI.É.GAL, the consort did not have either distinguishing regalia or any special title to mark her rank. Since other royal wives apparently had no presence in the public sphere, there was no need to differentiate publicly between them and the consort. Within the private realm, the fact that the consort was not granted special titles or other distinctions helped hinder her acquisition of power. Thus the Assyrian kings, for whom concern over internecine strife was always paramount, attempted to control the distribution of power among high-ranking royal women by effectively rendering the consort a “first among equals”, someone who could easily be replaced should the need arise.

- DEBORAH CANTRELL, Vanderbilt University

Chariots Bounding

The speed and power of the horse is underemphasized in the academic literature, resulting in misconceptions about chariots in the ancient Near East. In antiquity, war chariots were never too heavy for the horses to pull (as is commonly stated in the literature); rather, the problem was when they were in full operation they could go airborne and flip unless properly balanced and weighted. Stopping them was no easy matter. The horses took off, charged the enemy and often ran
away. The chariots ‘bounded’ behind-sometimes aloft. A crucial problem facing their users was how to steer, turn and eventually stop the ‘bounding’ chariot.

In this paper, I will review the basic—but often overlooked—devices used for slowing and stopping ancient chariots. I will show that in antiquity, cultures developed different methods to solve the problem: Egyptians depended on ‘chariot runners’ or ‘mounted scouts’ and the Greeks developed a special chariot design with ‘wings’ and a ‘spur’ operated by a ‘tiger.’ But it appears that the Assyrians had the best of all solutions: a ‘brake.’ I will investigate why the ‘brake’ was needed, identify it on Assyrian palace reliefs, and speculate on how it worked.

- I. S. GUREVICH, Institute of Oriental Studies, Academy of Sciences (St. Petersburg)

   On the Language of Pinghua (Song-Yuan Period)
   [No abstract]

- LUI SHIZHEN

   Recent Discoveries in Six Dynasties Grammar
   [No abstract]

- ZEV HANDEL, University of Washington

   Examples of Text Recitations in the Old Reading Tradition of Xingtian Township, Wuyishan County, Fujian

   In November 2002 I carried out fieldwork on the Northern Min dialect spoken in the village of Chengcun. Two elderly residents of the village had been schooled in nearby Xingtian Township during the first half of the last century, where they learned to recite texts in the local reading pronunciation. I had the opportunity to record both speakers reciting the San Zi Jing (“Three Character Classic”) and the Bai Jia Xing (“Book of a Hundred Surnames”) in this nearly forgotten reading style. Transcription and analysis of these recitations reveals differences with modern colloquial pronunciation and provides a glimpse into vanishing linguistic and cultural traditions.

- GU QIAN, Nanjing University.

   The Loss of Voicing in Obstruents in Chinese Dialects in Historical Perspective
   [No abstract]

- R. VANNESS SIMMONS, Rutgers University

   Mapping Dialect Mixture in Tongjou and Lihshoei Counties—How Dialect Geography Reveals Language History
   [No abstract]

- W. SOUTH COBLIN, University of Iowa

   Convergence Testing in Common Systems of the Yangtze Watershed
   [No abstract]
Michael G. Carter, Oslo University

Aspects of Technical Terminology in the Medieval Arab Sciences

This paper starts from the position stated some time ago by Massignon, that the study of Islam by outsiders is essentially the study of its technical terms. He had in mind the religious, particularly the mystical vocabulary, but the observer of any of the Arab sciences can usefully adopt the same approach. With an emphasis on grammatical science, this paper examines the metaphorical origins of most technical terms, the apparent lack of precision arising from their use at different linguistic levels and the degree of self-consciousness with which they were coined and codified. The emergence of the organized sciences, of books of definitions and dictionaries of technical terms will be considered as symptomatic of the increasing power of terminology. In conclusion, the paper will suggest that the entire process can be interpreted as the deliberate construction of a linguistic edifice representing every permissible concept within Islam in an explicit, and also limited, semantic framework, all this stemming, as the paper hopes to show, from the recognized need to maintain the coherence and stability of a religion dependent on constant reference to and exegesis of its foundational textual corpus.

Jon McGinnis, University of Pennsylvania

The Interface of Physics and Biology in the Philosophy of Ibn Siná, or Why A Good Biologist Knows His Physics?

In book II chapter 3 of his Physics Ibn Siná considers the question “in which of Aristotle’s so called ten categories does motion strictly speaking properly belong?” Concerning the category of substance, he says that motion only belongs to it metaphorically. By this he means that when one kind of substance changes into a different kind of substance, the change does not occur gradually; rather, argues Ibn Siná, it occurs in punctuated leaps. For example, according to Ibn Siná’s position an acorn does not become an oak gradually; rather, it becomes an oak in a series of non gradual instantaneous transformations. Or again, semen does not become a human gradually, but only through a series of discrete stages. Such a view, Ibn Siná admits, seems to be gainsaid by what one actually observes. Acorns and semen do not appear to be transformed into new substance all at once. At least that is how it appears to the layman observer. Thus, Ibn Siná’s physical thesis seems to be empirically falsified. Ibn Siná’s response to this objection is to claim that a biologist’s interpretation of the empirical data in effect trumps a mere layman’s interpretation. Consequently, one must consider a biologically informed account of embryonic development. When one turns to Ibn Siná’s biological work, Kitāb al-ḥaywān, and the sections on embryology, one sees that “good biology” requires that the embryo develop in a series of punctuated transformations. Thus, an issue in the science of physics only receives its complete and ultimate answer in the science of biology.

Dagmar Riedel, Indiana University

Adab and the Sciences: Ordo Rerum and Ordo Atrium in Two Pre-Mongol Encyclopedias

In the paper I will contrast the content and structure of two encyclopedias that originated in pre-Mongol Iran between 1000 and 1200. The Muḥādarat al-udabāʾ wa-muhāwarāt al-shwarāʾ wa-l-bulaghāʾ (Discourses of men of letters, poetry, and rhetoric) is an Arabic thesaurus by Abū al-Qāsim Ḥusayn al-Rāghib al-Isfahānī (died c. 1050). The Rāhat al-ṣudūr wa-āyat al-surūr (Comfort of hearts and miracle of delights) is a Persian miscellany of practical texts by Muḥammad Rāvandi (fl. 1180–1200).

Medieval Muslims distinguished between the Arabic sciences of the Arabic language, poetry, and Islam and the non-Arabic sciences of philosophy, mathematics and the natural sciences. The mastery of language, ethics, and piety are the dominant topics in many adab encyclopedias, easily obscuring two further characteristics of these compilations: Sciences—such as mathematics, astronomy, chemistry, and logic—are rarely included, whereas chapters about sciences—such as zoology, botany,
astronomy, and medicine—are usually covered to some extent. On the one hand, Geert Jan van Gelder has recently suggested that the difference between *adab* and *ilm* concerns the distinction between general and specialized knowledge, rejecting George Makdisi’s thesis that *adab* should be translated as humanism but following Franz Rosenthal’s observation that *adab* is a synonym of *paideia*. On the other hand, literary critics tend to equate *adab* with *belles-lettres* because of its modern Arabic usage.

The *Muhādārat* and the *RṬhat* are comprehensive compilations covering a wide range of subjects, yet their authors described them as selection and abridgement, and not as complete books containing the *omne scibile*. Both have been classified as *adab* because they are permeated with prose anecdotes and excerpts from poems and epics, and both are considered literary evidence for the social and political history of pre-Mongol Iran. Seen against the current academic approach to these encyclopedias, it is important to remember that history as an independent field of inquiry emerged in eighteenth-century Europe, whereas history was not considered an *ars* in medieval Islam. In the paper I will analyze which *res* are included into these encyclopedias to represent which *artes*. I will further argue that the contemporary *belles-lettres*-oriented approach to these encyclopedias reflects the modern western separation between the sciences and the humanities that is one of the consequences of the Scientific Revolution of the seventeenth century.

Kevin van Bladel, Yale University

The Arabic ‘Dream of Ostanes’

This presentation is a contribution to the history of the transmission of alchemical lore from Greek into Middle Persian into Arabic.

An important figure in Greek alchemical literature is Ostanes, a legendary Magus of the court of Xerxes (5th cent. BCE) who is said to have presided over the priests of Egypt. Ostanes was renowned in ancient Greek and Latin as a teacher of “magic,” the art of the Magi.

Ostanes was also known in medieval Arabic, as shown by a few manuscripts containing works attributed to him. One of these, BnF Ar. 2605 (extracts published in a problematic edition in 1893), contains a narration of a bizarre symbolic dream of Ostanes that culminates in an encounter with Hermetic lore. The heart of the dream is Ostanes’ reading of a polyglot inscription in “the Treasure-houses of Science” where the scientific superiority of Persia to the other countries is asserted but at the same time it is related that Persian scholars have had to recover their own science from foreign lands.

This dream must be related to the accounts—familiar from Middle Persian and Arabic sources—of the Sasanian Persian recovery of lost allegedly Iranian science from Greece and India. This manuscript claims to have been translated from Greek into Persian into “the language of farthest Khurasan” into Arabic.

Another account comes from an unedited Syriac alchemical text (Cambridge Mm. 6.29) relating a correspondence between an Egyptian priest and a Persian Magus. The Egyptian informs the Magus that he has found the lost books of Ostanes in Egypt and offers to return them to the Persians. Although the provenance of this Syriac text is unknown, the account must be related to the narratives already described. Altogether these texts offer strong evidence for an Iranian transmission of alchemical lore from Greek into Arabic.

Tony Street, Cambridge University

Can Syllogistic be Islamic? The case of Rāzī and Kātibī

Corbin argued that Islamic philosophy was rightly so-called because it was “a philosophy whose development, and whose modalities, are essentially linked to the religious and spiritual fact of Islam.” Corbin’s approach and his terminology have been strongly challenged by Gutas in a recent article,

While I would not myself like to defend Corbin’s approach to the subject, I think his terminology can be defended and should in fact be adopted. Gutas worries that one of the consequences of calling Arabic philosophy ‘Islamic’ is that it ‘injects an overpowering religious dimension to it which was not there…Arabic philosophy is not Islamic theology.’ Granted; but philosophy conducted in Islamic realms paid attention not merely to subjects central to Islamic theology, but also to the structuring aesthetic of its implicit conception of the divine economy.

The example I propose to consider is one which is found in the midst of the most grimly formal stretch of philosophy, the modal syllogistic. There is a significant difference between Avicenna’s modal syllogistic and the systems of the thirteenth-century logicians Fahreddin ar-Razi and Naqmadin al-Katibi. Even though Razi and Katibi construct systems which differ widely from each other, it turns out that both are motivated by a single Avicennan insight. And in the last analysis, it may be argued that the motivation derives from deeper Asharite commitments.

Coeli Fitzpatrick, Grand Valley State University

The ‘Six Non-Naturals’ in Medieval Arabic Medicine

Medieval European physicians first asked the question “what is not-natural about the six non-naturals of Galen?” in the fourteenth century. The ‘non-natural’ factors (the ambient air; food/drink; sleep/wakefulness; motion/rest; things evacuated/things retained; and passions of the soul) were held to be the causes of health or disease. On their translation into Latin, the causes became the basis of European medicine’s “six things non-natural,” a concept that was an essential component of medicine for nearly eight hundred years. The above question is a misguided one, however, which owes its existence to the mistranslation of Arabic medical writings into Latin in the Middle Ages. Because of faulty translations of key Arabic terms, medieval European physicians did not have a clear conception of how the Arabic physicians conceived of the causes. Previous scholars have undertaken recent studies of the ‘six non-naturals’, but none have thoroughly considered the Arabic sources. As such, this scholarship has been unable to address properly the changes that took place on translation from Arabic to Latin. This paper considers the “non-naturals” in the work of several of the medieval Arab physicians who adopted them from the necessary causes in Galen’s Ars parva. I discuss the Arabic reception and transformation of the causes, and how the mistranslation of terms into the Latin led to a misunderstanding of the original terminology and function of the six factors. The contributions of my study are therefore twofold; first, I correct a major philological error in the history of Arabic medicine, which has strong implications for Latin medicine as well. Second, consideration of the necessary causes in Arabic medicine provides excellent insight into the medieval Arabic relationship between philosophy and medicine.

Mary Brockington, University of Edinburgh

The Rāmāyaṇa, the Harivamśa, and the Mahābhārata

In a recent paper I examined references to the Rāmāyaṇa in the Harivamśa, concluding that the HV authors made increasing use of the Rm in the later parts of their work, relying on their audience having considerable familiarity with Vālmīki’s text, yet taking careful and subtle measures to deflect attention from the figure of Rāma himself. These allusions were consistent with a late stage in the Rm’s textual development. The HV and the MBh are considered to have a close relationship, yet the HV authors appear to have drawn directly on the Rm, ignoring or contradicting Rm material now incorporated into the MBh.
I now plan to examine a selection of the Rm-allusions in the MBh. Two extended passages occur: the Rámapákyána (MBh 3,257–76) and Bhíma’s encounter with Hanumán (3,146–50), alongside numerous briefer allusions and verbal reminiscences and some shared material including peripheral stories loosely incorporated into both works, whether by borrowing from the other or from some common source.

The Rámapákyána has been shown to have drawn freely on Válmíki’s text, but is this true of other passages, or is there any trace of the existence of versions not attributable to Válmíki? Does the MBh portrayal of Ráma reflect any particular stage in the Rm’s textual development, or is it similar to that in the HV? Alternatively, has it been adapted creatively by MBh narrators to suit their own purpose? How does the use of Ráma and his family as role-models for the Páñdava contribution to the portrayal of Yudhiṣṭhira and family themselves?

In short, what does the adaptation of this material into the MBh reveal about the purpose and skill of its tellers and their expectations of their audiences, and about the MBh’s relationship to the Rm and to the HV?

Aditya Adarkar, Montclair State University

Against the Excavative: A New Direction for Mahâbhârata Interpretation?

Recent work on the Mahâbhârata, in particular that of Alf Hiltebeitel, has called for new ways of reading the epic. Crucially, Hiltebeitel suggests the Mahâbhârata was composed “between the mid-second century B.C. and the year zero.” If this is the case, then would there be any validity left for “excavative” scholarship—that is, scholarship that attempts to distinguish strata (however defined) in the epic? Furthermore, can we preserve excavative projects and at the same time revitalize epic scholarship? Agreeing with Hiltebeitel, this communication posits that perpetuating the distinction between the “oral” and “written” components of the epic not only puts any “secondary,” “higher,” or “humanistic” criticism on a shaky grounding (since there is not even a relatively stable text to discuss) but dismisses the traditional view of the Mahâbhârata as an organic piece. Nonetheless, neither this communication nor Hiltebeitel’s work calls for reading the Mahâbhârata as an ahistorical document, but rather (à la Wendy Doniger) to bring the historical and humanistic into “complementary, not competing” relationship. To be sure, it is crucial that we understand the ways in which the epic has been understood historically, and constantly strive towards refining such understandings. But our interpretive project should not stop there. If possible, we need to be both historical and contemporary: to continue the conversation about the epic and thereby keep it alive. If every generation has remade the Mahâbhârata, we should not be afraid of remaking it for ourselves as well. At the same time, even as we should recognize this kind of relationship has important antecedents in the work of Doniger, Madeleine Biardeau, and Hans-Georg Gadamer, we can look to this kind of scholarship to open up new avenues to the interpretation of the literary particularities of the epic.

James L. Fitzgerald, University of Tennessee

The Oldest Triśṭubh of the Mahâbhârata: An Examination of the Claimed “Core” of the Epic

In work done originally as a dissertation at Harvard in the early 1970s and published in book form in 1992 (The Warrior Code of India’s Sacred Song [New York: Garland Publishing, 1992]), Mary Carroll Smith examined all the triśṭubh stanzas of the Mahâbhârata and then argued that some of those triśṭubh represented the remnants of an ancient kṣatriya epic and were the “core” of the current Mahâbhârata epic. On the basis of my own recent extraction of all the non-anuśṭubh elements of the Mahâbhârata, I shall examine the occurrence of triśṭubhs in the epic, focus upon those passages in the epic where the so-called “Sabhâ” triśṭubhs are prominent, and assess the likelihood of Smith’s arguments.
• Gary Tubb, Columbia University
  Insiders and Outsiders in the *Mahābhārata*
  [No abstract]

• Alf Hiltebeitel, George Washington University
  Kṛṣṇa and Karna in the *Mahābhārata*
  This paper will address the gap in *Mahābhārata* studies that has arisen in scholarship on Karna
  and Kṛṣṇa: the one, Karna, usually viewed as the exemplar of archaic heroism in early oral epic;
  the other, Kṛṣṇa, usually viewed as the exemplar of theological overly and late to later literary
  interpolation. The paper will argue that this gap can and should be closed by an examination of the
  interplay between these two characters as the epic portrays them.

• John Brockington, University of Edinburgh
  Hanumān in the *Mahābhārata*
  Absent from the *Harivamśa*, prominent in the Vālmiki *Rāmāyaṇa* (increasingly so in later ver-
  sions) and present only to a limited extent in the *Mahābhārata*, Hanumān is a significant figure,
  both in religious and narrative terms in Sanskrit literature. As a prelude and contrast to my paper
  for the 12th World Sanskrit Conference in July, on his portrayal in the *Rāmāyaṇa*, I examine here
  Hanumān’s portrayal in the *Mahābhārata* which, I believe, has not yet been the subject of a separate
  study.

  Essentially Hanumān’s presence is restricted to two passages (both in the Ārṇyakaparvan):
  Bliīma’s encounter with him on Mount Gandhamādana and the Rāmopakhyāna. His portrayal in the
  latter is broadly in accord with that in the *Rāmāyaṇa* but is rather different in Bliīmas encounter
  with him, where his association with Indra is striking, despite the passage being based on their
  common bond as sons of Vāyu. Both passages include the boon that he will live as long as the Rāma
  story is told, showing direct dependence on a late form of the *Rāmāyaṇa*.

  In addition, there is the monkey depicted on Arjuna’s banner, unnamed elsewhere but claimed
  by Hanumān to be himself at the end of his dialogue with Bliīma. This anonymity and Hanumān’s
  absence from the CE text elsewhere (in similes or the like) has implications for the relationship
  between the *Rāmāyaṇa*, *Mahābhārata* and *Harivamśa*, especially when the sprinkling of references
  in * passages is taken into account. These implications will be examined in the context of the relative
  lateness of both Ārṇyakaparvan passages in the *Mahābhārata* textual tradition (corroborated by
  other evidence) and in the light of the reluctance by each epic’s redactors to make overt mention of
  the main figures in the other—a reluctance only gradually abandoned.

• Sally Sutherland Goldman, University of California at Berkeley
  Who’s for Dinner: Cannibalistic Urges in the *Mahābhārata*
  One of the most pronounced characteristics of the rākṣasas that haunt the *Mahābhārata* (and the
  Rāmāyaṇa) is their sexual excess, but closely juxtaposed to the libidinal is the need to devour. This
  consumption is not uncommonly manifested as a desire for human flesh, or more specifically human
  blood. Consumption can be understood as an expression of sexuality, especially excessive libidinal
  urges. The epic, however, does not limit this behavior to the demonic world of the rākṣasas, but in
  fact, makes the very imbibing of blood a central event of the main story. This paper will examine a
  number of episodes in which the real or intended consumption of blood or human flesh plays a crucial
  role with an eye towards understanding the manner of and possible rationales for the *Mahābhārata*’s
  employment of this thematic.
• **DANIEL C. SNELL**, University of Oklahoma

  The Invention of the Individual†

  This paper, to appear as a chapter in the Blackwells *Companion to the Ancient Near East*, examines the evidence for the individual differentiating the self from the group in the Ancient Near East. It will discuss the thesis of corporate personality, individual versus corporate punishment, and identity in death as seen in autobiographies and epitaphs, concluding that though humans are flexible in their self definitions, the ancient range of flexibility appears to be similar to those in later periods where the individual has also been claimed to have been invented.

• **PETER DANIELS**, New York City

  The Decipherment of the Ancient Near East

  In the concluding chapter of the *Companion*, readers are offered a survey of two centuries of decipherments—interpretations—of the ancient Near East, from Egyptomania to Orientalism and beyond, with references to general discussions.

• **KEITH Dede**, Lewis and Clark College.

  Comparatives in Qinghai Chinese

  [No abstract]

• **MICHAEL R. DROMPP**, Rhodes College

  Chinese Rhetoric and the Shaping of the Uighur Crisis (840–848)

  In 840, following the collapse of the Uighur steppe empire of Mongolia, two large groups of Uighur refugees fled to the Chinese border, presenting a serious crisis for the Tang government. While the political, diplomatic, and military aspects of this crisis have been studied in my earlier work, this paper considers a different aspect of the crisis: the ways in which rhetoric helped shape the contours of that crisis. The survival of the writings of Li Deyu, the chief minister who dominated the government of Tang Wuzong during most of this period, affords us a rare opportunity to study the language of more than 70 documents pertaining to the crisis. In them, we see familiar Chinese rhetorical techniques, particularly (1) frequent but selective reference to the past (particularly the Han era) to provide precedents for proposed actions and encourage actions, (2) the regular employment (and manipulation) of Confucian ideals in providing justification for proposed actions, (3) the use of animal imagery in discussions of foreigners and their ways, and (4) the stark contrast in language used in communication with the Uighurs compared to that used internally. While these rhetorical conventions are all well known, their use within the context of this particular crisis is instructive, as we can see from the large number of available documents just how and when rhetorical devices were developed and modified to meet the political and military needs of the moment. Li Deyu’s writings thus offer us a rare opportunity (particularly for so early a period) to examine changes in rhetorical strategies in regard to a single, specific problem. From these documents we can see what devices the Chinese considered most effective; they also allow, to a very small degree, a glimpse into the rhetoric employed by Inner Asian peoples (the Uighurs and Kyrghyz) in their dealings with the Tang court.

† Panel Abstract: *Blackwells Companion to the Ancient Near East* is a one volume guide being prepared under the editorship of Daniel Snell, to appear in 2004. A brief introduction to the scope of the project will be followed by four papers; it is hoped time will be allowed for reaction to the project, suggestions both to the papers presented and to others in preparation.
• **RON SELA, Indiana University**  
  **Rethinking Political Legitimation in 18th-Century Central Asia**

In the first half of the 18th century Central Asia was rapidly moving toward anarchy: State corruption, nomadic invasions, dwindling economic resources, and political instability fostered conditions favorable to rebellions and in 1740 even facilitated an invasion by the Persian Emperor Nadir Shah. And yet, an atmosphere of political vacuum also gives rise to the creation of new powers. This paper introduces the attempts—hitherto ignored by historical inquiry—made by various constituencies to legitimize their claim to political power in 18th-century Central Asia. We will do so by analyzing old and new political rituals and their sources of inspiration, by looking at the emergence (in literature) of the nearly-forgotten figure of Timur (Tamerlane) as a rallying point for tribal aspirations, and by illustrating the creation of new centers for political pilgrimage. These issues stand at the core of the transition of power and imperial charisma from Chinggis Khan’s descendants to the newly-created Tribal Dynasties.

We will emphasize (relying primarily on textual analysis of Persian and Turkic manuscripts) how the struggle for the throne, centered on the two ancient seats of power (Bukhara and Samarqand), continually shaped and re-shaped notions of political legitimation, nurtured by the fertile exchanges between Islam and Inner Asian traditions.

• **BARBARA KELLNER-HEINKELE, Freie Universität Berlin**  
  **Tsarina and Khan: Russian-Kazakh Correspondences of the 18th Century**

Since the break-up of the Soviet Union, historians in the newly founded republics in Central Asia have started to rediscover their national history. In the 1990s, a great number of source editions, monographs and articles were published which demonstrate the efforts of, in particular, Uzbek, Kazakh and Kyrgyz historians to develop new approaches to the past of their respective peoples.

This paper is based on a set of letters in Russian and the Turkic *lingua franca* of the steppe that are preserved in the Arkhiv Vneshney Politiki Rossiskoy Imperii in Moscow and that so far were not used by Kazakh historians. The documents show that the Russian empress considered the Kazakh tribes as proteges and even as subservient people, while the Kazakhs politely demonstrated a sense of independence. Matters treated in this correspondence concern disputes with Russia over grazing land claimed by the Kazakhs, day-to-day raids and abduction on both sides, the conditions of mutual trade, and the precarious neighborhood of Kazakhs, Bashkirs and Kalmuks in the steppe south of the Orenborg Line. The letters also give us an idea of the diplomatic etiquette practised between the two partners.

• **DENIS SINOR, Indiana University**  
  **Let Us Praise Dead Sinologists!**

The speaker intends to evoke his personal memories of deceased scholars he had the privilege of knowing personally. Depending on time, Etienne Balazs, Paul Demiéville, Gustav Haloun, Otto Franke, Marcel Granet, Erich Haenisch, Henri Maspero, Robert des Rotours, Bruno Schindler, Walter Simon will be remembered. Paul Pelliot’s memory was recalled on a previous occasion.

• **PAUL HECK, Princeton University**  
  **The Particular as Universal: Epistemological Problems in the Buyid Period**

The Buyid era has been described as both a renaissance (A. Mez) and a period of great humanism (J. Kraemer). In fact, one can see during the fourth/tenth and fifth/eleventh centuries the outlines of a serious crisis of knowledge in Islamic society at large. This crisis was the product of many factors: social, political and intellectual. A central theme, however, centers upon the relation of the
(philosophical) universal to the (Islamic) particular or communal. How does the natural order of the universe relate to the revealed order of Islam? How can the Islamic order be considered particular if it has its origins in the word of God? Is there a higher order to which all religions can be said to belong or is it the Islamic one that has a universally validity? And if the latter, how to justify that without a simple reliance on scriptural dictate?

Such questions faced the Muslim intellectuals of the Buyid period, and I would like to demonstrate the way in which they responded to them by focusing on the work of al-ʾĀmīrī (d. 381), specifically his Kitāb al-ʾīlām bi-manāqīb al-ʾislām, with reference to other works of the period including the Rasā’il ikhwān al-Ṣafī and al-Maqdisī’s Kitāb al-bad’ wa-l-tarīkh. I will argue that a key to understanding the Muslim responses to the skepticism of the day lies in understanding the varied Muslim evaluations of language—as a product of nature or a product of culture.

Another of al-ʾĀmīrī’s work (Kitāb al-amād ʿalā al-ʿabād) has already received detailed scholarly attention (E. Rowson). It is my hope to add to our understanding of al-ʾĀmīrī’s intellectual agenda by reading his Kitāb al-ʾīlām against the wider crisis of knowledge of his day and age.

• Gabriel Said Reynolds, Yale University

From A. Mingana to C. Luxenberg: Syriac Readings of the Qurʾān

In 1927 A. Mingan published a work entitled “Syriac Influence on the Style of the Kurʾān,” (Bulletin of the John Rylands Library, 1927, 77–98). Therein he catalogues much of the Syriac vocabulary in the Qurʾān while arguing that the widespread presence thereof suggested that Syriac Christianity had an important role in Islamic origins. This brief work, along with the more substantial work of A. Jeffrey (The Foreign Vocabulary of the Qurʾān, 1938), laid the foundation for further researches into the connection between the foreign vocabulary of the Qurʾān and the historical circumstances of its composition. Yet nothing significant was built upon this foundation thereafter. Nothing, that is, before the appearance of Christoph Luxenberg’s Die Syro-Aramäische Lesart des Koran (2000), a work that contributes significant new arguments for a Syriac reading of the Qurʾān. My paper, then, will be an analysis of Luxenberg’s new variation on an old theme, and a discussion of possible implications of his theory.

More specifically, I will introduce Mingana’s work as a prelude to that of Luxenberg, considering the merits of the latter’s arguments. I will also analyze a number of Luxenberg’s Syriac readings of the Qurʾān including Q 19:24, 37:11, 37:103–104 and 44:54 (and 52:20). Thereafter I will discuss questions that Luxenberg’s technique raises for the future of Qurʾānic studies: What were the circumstances by which Syriac affected Qurʾānic language? If his conclusions are valid, how would this affect the tradition of Muslim Qurʾānic exegesis? Is a critical edition of the Qurʾān now called for? What are the consequences of this reading for future exegeses of the Qurʾān. These are questions that touch not only the Luxenberg project, but also the very heart of Qurʾānic studies. They are philological, historical and religious and will hopefully led to discussion by scholars from all of these backgrounds.

• Devin Stewart, Emory University

Theoretical Prolegomena in the Islamic Sciences

Of the many general terms used to designate medieval Islamic works—sharḥ (commentary), tafsīr (exegesis) radd (refutation), ḍhayl (sequel), and so on—the two most common are kitāb ‘book’ and risālah ‘treatise’. Though common, these last two are not as simple as they appear: Kitāb, means not only ‘book’ but also ‘letter’ and ‘chapter’, and risālah means both ‘letter’ or ‘epistle’ and ‘treatise’. This study, drawing on biographical sources such as Yāqūt al-Ḥamawī’s Irshād al-ʾārīb and bibliographical sources such as the Fihrist of Ibn al-Nadīm, examines works designated by the term risālah, arguing that this label conveys in addition a third, quite distinct meaning: ‘prolegomenon’. A number of works from the ninth, tenth, and later centuries that are designated as
risālahs can be shown to be prolegomena, introductory works thematically and structurally bound to other—generally much longer—works in the various sciences. In a number of cases, the term risālah designates a theoretical prolegomenon, related to a larger work in a particular field in the same way that Ibn Khaldūn’s famous Muqaddimah is related to his history, al-Ibar. This study not only provides a better understanding of the technical term risālah, throwing light on one facet of the development of theory in the Islamic sciences, but also allows the redefinition of a number of medieval works, including al-Shāfi‘ī’s (d. 204/820) famous Risālah and several works by Abū Ja‘far al-Ṭabarī (d. 310/923), as theoretical prolegomena.

• Shafique N. Virani, Harvard University

Neoplatonism, Homologues and the Ismaili Ecclesia: The Construction of an Esoteric Hierocosmos

In the 4th/10th century, Abū ‘Abd Allāh Muhammad b. ‘Ali b. Rizām wrote a polemical treatise whose pervasive influence gave rise to a ‘black legend’ about the Ismaili Muslims. This legend incorporated a perverted description of the doctrine of the ḥudūd al-dīn, the Ismaili esoteric ecclesia. Ibn Rizām described a series of nine secret initiations that led the Ismaili neophyte into ever-increasing degrees of doctrinal depravity, culminating in a complete rejection of religion. This lurid tale was reported in the writings of a number of eminent Orientalists including Silvestre de Sacy, E. G. Browne and Joseph Von Hammer-Purgstall. It was only with the discovery of genuine Ismaili works over the course of the last century that scholars such as Wladimir Ivanow and Henry Corbin were able to give a more accurate, if less sensational, depiction of the Ismaili hierarchy. While the subject of the ḥudūd has often been touched on in scholarship of Ismaili thought, it has seldom been the main focus of attention. Paul Walker, Abbas Hamdani and Simonetta Calderini, all working primarily with Arabic sources, have provided the groundwork for exploring this organizational structure in greater depth. In this paper, drawing on largely neglected Persian works, I will argue that the Ismaili ecclesia was based on a particular understanding of Neoplatonic theories and on the perceived soteriological necessity for a homologous relationship between the physical world, the religious law and the esoteric hierocosmos.

• Pierre A. MacKay, University of Washington

Lost Pages: Evliya Çelebi’s Account of Agriboz/Negropont

There is something profoundly wrong with Evliya Çelebi’s account of Negropont. The compass directions are reversed, and there are several details which have never seemed amenable to rational interpretation. In other instances where Evliya’s alleged itinerary is impossible, it is easy to determine what sources Evliya used for his fictions, but the description of Negropont is more complex, and there is reason to think that he actually did visit the place.

There is no easy answer to the problem of reversed compass directions. The usual explanation, dependence on the text of Ashik Çelebi’s Menazir ul-Avalim does not work in this instance. One of the stranger elements, however, in Evliya’s description of the fortifications can be shown to reflect the defences constructed by the Venetian Giovan Bondumier in the years preceding the siege of 1470. This feature existed until the vandalism of the 1890s razed all traces of the mediaeval fortifications.

A further complication in the interpretation of the text appears in the vowing. Evliya’s own preserved archetype is clearly misvoweled, whereas a secondary MS offers the correct vowing. Suggestions are offered for these anomalies in the manuscript tradition.

- 24 -
The First Generations of Ašʻarīs: A Biographical Study

This paper is a critical study of the biographies of the immediate followers of Abu'l Ḥasan al-Ašʻarī (d. 324/935–6), as listed in Ibn ʿAsakir’s (d. 571/1176) Tabyūn Kādīb al-Mufrārī. It pieces together some biographical elements of these figures, thereby shedding some light on the individuals who constituted early Ašʻarism before the advent of the great representatives of this school, namely al-Baqillānī (d. 403/1013) and Ibn Fūrak (d. 406/1015). Despite the recent works of Richard Frank (1988, 1991) on al-Ašʻarī and of Daniel Gimaret on al-Ašʻarī’s second generation disciple Ibn Fūrak (1985, 1988), the history of early Ašʻarism has been neglected since Michel Allard’s work on al-Ašʻarī and his school (1965). Given that the Tabyūn is the only extant source that lists the followers of al-Ašʻarī by generations, and the fact that these figures left no extant sources, any study of them must start with this work, despite its limitations as an apologetic work (George Makdisi 1962, 1963). Thus, in this study I will compare Ibn ʿAsākir’s entries to ˇSafiʾ anti-al-Ašʻarī sources, mainly al-ˇDahabī (d. 753/1352-3 or 748/1348), since only a comparison with works that hold opposed views and uses different sources, e.g., the traditionalism of al-ˇDahabī, can allow us to assess the validity of Ibn ʿAsākir’s statements. The paper shows that only seven of the nineteen figures listed by Ibn ʿAsākir can be counted among the first generation of followers of al-Ašʻarī. These figures are distinguished by their background in asceticism, Sufism and the narration of Ḥadīth. Four of these seven figures are from Hurāsān and Transoxania and none of them are reported to have converted from either the Ḥanbalī or the Muṭazilī side, leading to the conclusion that al-Ašʻarī attracted students without already formed theological views and most importantly disciples who did not come from his opponents camps.

The Origin of the Druze

Well into the twentieth century serious scholars continued to explain the origin of the Druze in racial terms. Admittedly the Druze themselves often seemed to lend support to such theories. Unfortunately, investigation of the exact details of the beginnings of the Druze movement has remained where the great French orientalist Silvestre de Sacy had left it with his 1838 Exposé de la religion des Druzes, which is even now the standard work on the subject.

However, we are at present much better informed than he was about the Fatimid background for the activities of Hamza and those like him—former Ismaïlī dāʾīs who began to preach the divinity of al-Ḥākim in the last years of this enigmatic caliph’s reign. Also our historical sources for the key period, roughly 407 to 434h, though imperfect, are more complete. But most importantly we have access, more or less, to the epistles of the Druze founding fathers in the so-called Rasāʾil al-ḥikma. This latter material, as Silvestre de Sacy already fully realized long ago, contains, in addition to doctrine, a considerable fund of precise historical reference to many events in the evolution of the early Druze. Yet, despite a few attempts, such as that of Bryer, it has never before been used to best effect.

By a careful reconstruction of the sequence of events and close attention to who did what and when, it is possible to make sense of Druze origins. And, perhaps, to answer such awkward questions as why, despite Hamza’s clear hostility toward and castigation of al-Darāzī the Druze are called the Druze (al-Darziyya or al-Durūz).
Rebecca R. Williams, McGill University

*Tafsīr* and *Tarīkh*: A Comparative Analysis of the Works of al-Ṭabarī

Western scholars have long debated the authenticity of the classical Islamic source material and its suitability for determining the events of the life of the Prophet Muhammad (c. 570–632 CE). While many have studied either historical or exegetical sources in depth, few have made a comparison of the two genres. With this in mind, I have compared two of the works of Abū Ja'far Muḥammad b. Jarīr al-Ṭabarī (d. 923 CE), namely his *Tafsīr* and his *Tarīkh*, in an attempt to discover his views regarding the two genres, and, by extension, perhaps discover whether they are suitable as sources for the life of Muhammad. I chose two events in the life of Muhammad, the publication of his mission to the Quraysh during the Meccan period and the raid at Nakhlah during the Medinan period, and compared al-Ṭabarī’s treatment of them in his *Tarīkh* with his exegesis of the verses of the Qurʾān cited therein. By comparing the placement of *asbāb al-nuzūl* in his *Tafsīr* with the placement of the Qurʾān verses in his *Tarīkh*, it is possible to determine how al-Ṭabarī viewed the genres of History and Exegesis. Al-Ṭabarī’s success in both genres gives us a unique opportunity to discern how one of Islam’s most respected scholars viewed the writing of history versus the exegesis of the Qurʾān. The way in which al-Ṭabarī structured his writing in both works shows that, while he recognized the importance of his *Tarīkh*, he held it to a different standard, and therefore a different purpose, than his *Tafsīr*. Hence, the validity of their use as sources for the life of Muḥammad becomes problematic.

Robert P. Goldman, University of California at Berkeley

*Plus ça change…*: Ethnic Cleansing vs. Regime Change as Political and Military Strategies in the *Mahābhārata* and the *Rāmāyaṇa*

Although the two Sanskrit epics organize their central plots around very similar events, a great war directed by a warrior incarnation of Viṣṇu against a demonic king and his supporters, the strategies and the military-political goals of the victorious parties in the two poems are quite different. These differing goals, moreover are closely aligned with the differing central thematic concerns of the works.

Despite the fact that the adversaries in the *Mahābhārata* are closely linked by familial and even affectionate ties while those in the *Rāmāyaṇa* are alien and seemingly implacably hostile beings, the conflict in the former is—ironically enough—a brutal war of mutual extermination, thoroughly in keeping with the poem’s reiterated theme of “ethnic cleansing,” while the one in the latter is more in keeping with what we have come to know as “regime change.”

The present paper explores these fundamental differences between the epics and offers some observations and speculations on what may account for them.

Luis González-Reimann, University of California at Berkeley

The *Viṣṇu Sahasranāma* in Historical Context

The one thousand names of Viṣṇu recited by Bhīṣma in the *Mahābhārata* are traditionally understood to be a description of the different aspects and attributes of Viṣṇu as the Supreme God. By placing the *Viṣṇu Sahasranāma* in historical context, this paper suggests that the Thousand Names also serves another important, sectarian purpose, namely asserting Viṣṇu’s supremacy vis-à-vis other gods and various contemporary dharmas and schools of thought by making them mere aspects of Viṣṇu. Thus, the *Viṣṇu Sahasranāma* plays an important role in the vaisnāva appropriation of different traditions, including the epic story itself.

Irina Kuznetsova, University of Cambridge

Philosophy of Action: *Dharma* and *Karmayoga*

In this paper based on a detailed textual analysis of the didactic passages of the *Mahābhārata* I will examine the relationship between the ideology of *karmayoga* and the concept of *dharma*. I
will discuss how different aspects of action, such as agency, motivation and fruits are represented in the doctrines of dharma and karmayoga. Karmayoga encourages one to perceive action as a process completely external to self by means of dissociation from all mental and physical processes, which obscure one’s experience of oneself as Atman conscious of its identity with all beings and with Brahman or Krishna. From the perspective of the teachings integrated into the Bhagavadgita, a person is not an actor in as much as his experience is determined by Kala or Krishna, but at the same time he is an actor because his true self is identical to Krishna’s self and is therefore the ultimate creator of his experience. This doctrine allows a person to view himself as the pure object and the pure subject of action at the same time and to see action for what it is in the final account—an experience of self by self, whereby the Universal self and by projection the individual self identifies himself as the subject and the object, or ksetrajna and ksetra. In my paper presented at the Third Dubrovnik International Conference on the Sanskrit Epics and Puranas I argued that the discrepancies in the usage of the term dharma necessitate postulating two basic levels on which the concept of dharma operates: the mundane level and the level of Atman. In the present paper I will draw a parallel between the functioning of dharma on the level of Atman and karmayoga. Kama or personal desire is central to all pursuits associated with mundane dharma (Manusmriti 2.2–4, Mahabharata 12.161.28–33), and abandoning such desire through renouncing all separateness, including individuality, is the essence of the dharma of Atman.

- SIMON BRODBECK, University of Edinburgh

Action Without Attachment in the Mahabharata

My task in this paper is to identify Krishna Vasudeva’s idea of action without attachment, and to begin to explore some narrative effects of that idea within the Mahabharata, with particular attention to the question of whether or not particular characters act without attachment.

My reading of the Bhagavadgita yields a fully deterministic account of events and actions. Within the Mahabharata, however, the availability of Krishna’s technique of action without attachment is an important narrative fiction, as indeed it is to large fractions of the text’s audience. I use this fiction as a framework for character analysis, and, whilst acknowledging that non-attachment is only behaviourally discernable in a limited fashion, if at all, I illuminate Yudhisthira’s ambiguous conduct towards Draupadi.

My approach resembles that of G. N. Chakravarty and draws on a large corpus of philosophical work in several different academic disciplines. In my discussion of the Mahabharata I draw in particular on gender theory and on the writings of Y. V. Vassilkov, S. S. More, P. R. Hill, M. Brockington, J. L. Fitzgerald and A. Hiltebeitel.

I suggest that the socio-political projects informing the text encoded the character of Draupadi with two different soteriological symbols, prosperity (positively valued) and prakrti (negatively valued). Krishna’s philosophy softens both of these poles, however, and it is as a result of this that the text can combine, in the character of Draupadi, the role of the non-returner’s wife (Buddha’s, Mahavira’s or Yajnavalkya’s, for example) with that of the king’s. The text embeds the soteriological perspective of moksa in the context of pravritti values, and does so narratively as well as philosophically.

- EDELTRAUD HARZER, University of Texas at Austin

The Use of the First Person Imperative in the Hospitality Rites of the Mahabharata

The Mahabharata provides illustrations of hospitality, in which certain expressions became stock phrases. These phrases frequently use the first person singular imperative active (parasmaipada) of the root kri karoti or da dadati. Such expressions karavai and dadni recur in various passages while encouraging a guest to request what is on his mind, after he had been taken care of in the customary way of welcome. Hospitality and gift giving are complex transactions, providing an insight into the
patterns of social behavior as well as revealing some choices and desires of a private nature. The brahmans are the rightful recipients, even though sometimes only disguised as such. The kṣatriyas or royalty are portrayed stereotypically as the givers.

The focus of my paper is on the employment of certain grammatical expressions of the imperative, as well as on the phrases accompanying this imperative. The first person imperative is also known in the Semitic languages, for example, Hebrew and Arabic, and is called “cohortative.” Alternatively first person optative singular is sometime used in the situations of proffering a gift. The difference in mood indeed reflects also a semantic difference.

Greg Bailey, La Trobe University

*Sukacarita* in the *Sāntiparvan*: Further Reflections on Hostility between Opponents of *Pravrṭti* and *Nivrṛti*.

It is well known that the concepts of *pravrṛti* and *nivrṛti* occur repeatedly in much of the *Moksādharmaparvan* (*Mdhp*) of the *Sāntiparvan*. I have studied some of their occurrences in earlier articles and Jim Fitzgerald analysed some of these passages in detail in his 1980 dissertation. More recently John Brockington has drawn attention to them in a recent article on the structure of the *Mdhp*.

My goal in this paper is to analyse the so-called *Sukacarita* (12, 310–320) as a narrative communicating the tensions between *pravrṛti* and *nivrṛti* (See esp. 313.11), but in a way viewed primarily from the perspective of *nivrṛti*. Elsewhere in the *Mdhp* (and especially in the *Rājadharmaparvan*) both concepts and associated ideologies are employed to deconstruct each other. Here, though it is very clear that the proponents of *nivrṛti* are presenting a kind of *moksāstra* where the lifestyle associated with *pravrṛti* is given very little credence.

Most of the other sections of the *Mdhp* dealing with *pravrṛti* and *nivrṛti* employ the didactic style so dominant in this *parvan*. However, the teaching as given in the *Sukacarita* is in the form of a description of Śūka’s birth and life and, above all, the manner in which he attains *moksā*. Several of the chapters provide descriptions of landscapes and royal courts where symbols of *pravrṛti* are very successfully communicated, but amidst such descriptions are inserted some of the harshest criticisms of the teachings implied by these symbols.

The bulk of my paper is taken up with assessing the significance for the *Sukacarita* of this juxtaposition of didactic and narrative and in assessing how the multifarious teachings contained in it can be grouped under the different positions associated with *pravrṛti* and *nivrṛti*.

Vidyut Aklujkar, University of British Columbia

Debating Divinity: Strategies of Reconciliation in *Anandarāmāyaṇa*

This article is the first half of a larger paper, addressing the topic of the unity of Gods in polytheistic Hindu tradition presented in *Ananda Rāmāyaṇa* (*AR*). While exalting the Rāma avatāra of Viṣṇu as the most joyous and morally superior one, *Ananda Rāmāyaṇa* (*AR*) tries to resolve conflicts among multiple manifestations of God. The theoretical basis of non-duality or Advaita supports its attempts at conflict resolution, especially conflict among different sects of worship. Rāma and Kṛṣṇa as incarnations of Viṣṇu are regarded as essentially the same, but even Śiva and Rāma are reconciled as one and the same, as are Pārvati and Śītā by using novel myths, dialogues, stotras and frame stories. Unlike some other Vaiṣṇava texts, rather than badmouthing the Śaivas, or Śāktas, a conscious attempt is made to establish non-duality of different Gods.

In the first half of my article, I shall present the arguments of *AR* to resolve the conflict between the followers of Rāma and Kṛṣṇa. I shall give an account of a deliberately staged debate between the Rāma-worshipper and Kṛṣṇa-worshipper as found in the *AR*, and I shall argue that *AR*’s position...
presents the other side of the Bhāgavata purāṇa position on the issue. The next half of my article will be devoted to examining AR’s multiple strategies in dealing with the reconciliation between Śiva and Rāma. I shall argue in the end that these deliberate and outspoken attempts to bring together diverse religious communities under a single theistic banner may be due to a new awareness to present a united front to the pressures of Islam, and that they suggest a more liberal, more balanced and single-handed composition of the text.

• ASHOK AKLUJKAR, University of British Columbia
  Mahābhāṣya 2.3.46 and Paribhāṣendu-śekhara 62-63

  In a part of his comment on Pāṇini 2.3.46 and the Vārttikas pertaining thereto, Patañjali writes the following three sentences in succession: na cāpavāda-viṣaya utsargo bhiniviśate “A general rule does not involve itself with (become operative in) the domain of an exception rule.” pūrvam hy apavāda abhiniviśante, paścād utsargāḥ “First the exception rules involve themselves (in the derivation process), then the general rules.” prakalpya vāpavāda-viṣayaṁ tata utsargo bhiniviśate. “Or, having set aside the domain of exception rules, the general rule involves itself (in the derivation process).” In his Paribhāṣendu-śekhara, Nāgėśa treats the last two as paribhāṣās or metarules applicable, respectively, to a laksānāika-cakṣuṣka user and a laksyaika-cakṣuṣka user of the Aṣṭādhyāyī.

  Recently, I have tried to determine the meanings of the terms laksānāika-cakṣuṣka and laksyaika-cakṣuṣka in an extensive article. I do not question the need to presuppose both types of users. Nor do I doubt the meanings Nāgėśa attaches to the terms. My concern in the present paper is only to investigate if a basis for two metarules exists in Patiñjali’s sentences. Nāgėśa has seen this basis only by assigning very unusual meanings to prakalpya and tataḥ of the third sentence. I try to determine why and how Nāgėśa does so, as well as to use textual criticism to offer another explanation of the seemingly redundant three sentences.

• JOANN SCURLOCK, Elmhurst College
  Ancient Near East: The Interplay of “Magic,” “Religion,” and “Science” in Ancient Mesopotamian Medicine
  [no abstract]

• CONSTANCE A. COOK, Lehigh University
  East Asia: The Body as Sacred Space in Ancient China
  [no abstract]

• RUTH I. MESERVE, Indiana University
  Inner Asia: A Mongolian Medicinal Plant List
  A Mongolian medicinal plant list, collected by an American paleobotanist, will be used as a centerpiece for a discussion of diseases and cures. A few of the plants on this list—representing treatments for both human and animal ailments—will be singled out as examples, illustrating the problems of plant classification and choice of substitute medicinals, disease prevention, medical history (with special attention to smallpox), and even environmental degradation.

• LAWRENCE CONRAD, Asien-Afrika-Institut, Universität Hamburg
  Islamic Near East: Paradigms of Healing in Middle Eastern Medicine
  [no abstract]
**Rahul Peter Das**, Martin-Luther-Universität Halle-Wittenberg

**South and Southeast Asia: Notion of Health and Its Imbalance in Classical South Asian Medical Texts**

The notions on what constitutes health and its imbalances are culturally conditioned; similar conditions of the body need not necessarily be classified in the same manner in different cultural environments. This paper attempts to look at the relevant notions from the internal perspective of classical South Asian medical texts. It is examined whether “health” as generally understood in modern English has an equivalent concept or equivalent concepts in these texts, and how this is or these are defined.

**Erica Reiner**, Oriental Institute, University of Chicago

**The Four Winds**

A reexamination of the names of the four winds or cardinal directions and the traditions about the countries to which these directions refer.

**David P. Wright**, Brandeis University

**The Influence of the Prologue and Epilogue of Hammurabi’s Laws on the Covenant Code**

The similarities between Hammurabi’s Laws (LH) and the Covenant Collection (CC; Exod 20:22-23:19) are usually explained by CC’s dependence on long-standing oral tradition informed earlier by Mesopotamian legal tradition (see Ralf Rothenbusch, *Die kasuistische Rechtssammlung im ‘Bundesbuch’* [Munster: Ugarit-Verlag, 2000]). This paper argues that CC depends textually (in some way) upon LH. It briefly reviews the evidence (hitherto unrecognized by other scholars) of laws that run in the same or nearly the same order in the casuistic laws (unlike other cuneiform law collections): (1) limited debt servitude (laws §§117, 119; 21:2–6); (2) taking a second wife and supporting the first (148–149, 179; 21:10–11); (3) child rebellion (192–193, 195; 21:15, 17); (4) talion (196–201; 21:23–27); (5) men fighting and providing a cure (206; 21:18–19); (6) death from striking (207; 21:12–14); (7) killing one of a lower class (208; 21:20–21); (8) causing a miscarriage (209–214; 21:22–23); (9) negligence (228–240; 21:33–34); (10) a goring ox (250–252; 21:28–32, 35–36); (11) animal theft (253–265; 21:37; 22:2b–3); (12) safekeeping of animals (265–266; 22:6–8); (13) injury and death of animals (266–267; 22:9–12); and (14) animal rental (268–271; 22:13–14).

The paper argues specifically that there are also correspondences between the materials before and after the casuistic laws. Features of the prologue of LH are found in CC’s initial apodictic laws (20:22–21:1): a concentration on cultic matters, the singularity/plurality of deities, and a transitioning introduction just before the casuistic laws. Moreover, features of the epilogue of LH are found in CC’s final apodictic laws (22:17–23:19): apodictic forms, a concern for ethics and justice, dynamic deities, and a requirement of pilgrimage. Thus, the sequence of correspondences in the two collections runs from the beginning to the end of the entirety of both works. CC was probably composed in the later Neo-Assyrian period when Israel/Judah had significant contacts with Mesopotamia and when several copies of the full text of LH existed and were made in Assyria.

**Thomas Hentrich**, Kyoto University (JSPS)

**Who was Gomer, the ṣēṣēt zônûm (Hos 1,2)?**

This paper tries to identify the occupation of Hosea’s wife Gomer, characterized as ṣēṣēt zônûm in Hos 1,2. The analogous use of  qedēšah and zônah in Hos 4 and Gen 38 seems at first to confirm the theory of an ṣēṣəḥ zônah, according to H. Schulte a member of an ancient matrilineal clan that could only survive as  qedēšah within the confines of the temple. Yet, an examination of Ancient Near
Eastern marriage laws point in a different direction. The qadištum, a Babylonian temple servant, would upon marrying become an aššat qadištum. From there it would indeed be a small step to being identified as an 'ešet šeḥnūm by the subsequent editors of the Old Testament.

M. Stol in his book “Birth in Babylonia” recently pointed out the role of the qadištu as a midwife at the temple. Considering the proximity of midwives to birth and fertility rites with its negative connotation as “prostitution”, I propose that Gomer was not the supposed temple prostitute, but a simple midwife practicing at the temple. Furthermore, based on G. Beckman’s research, the “Sitz im Leben” of Hos 1 can be located in Ancient Near Eastern birth ritual texts.

- William W. Hallo, Yale University

Babylonian Antiquaries

MLC 2075 is a late copy of an Ur-Nammu brick inscription from Uruk. I published it in part in 1962 (HUCA 33:25) and 1997 (apud Frayne, RIME 3/2:70). It is one of a number of late copies of royal inscriptions and other texts that attest to the antiquarian interest in their own past displayed by later generations of Babylonians and Assyrians. These copies will be briefly considered, as will the “iconography” of the MLC tablet.

- Marilyn Kelly-Buccellati, California State University, Los Angeles

A Monumental Hurrian ābi at Urkesh

A monumental shaft has been under excavation for some three years. It has now been exposed to a depth of some 7 meters, and it still continues. The monumentality of the structure and the nature of the deposit were a major puzzle in interpreting its function. A convergence of diverse lines of evidence, philological as well as archaeological, show now that this was a shaft for conjuring the deities of the netherworld—as documented in later Hurro-Hittite texts. As a result, this is the earliest structure ever excavated that can explicitly and uniquely be identified as Hurrian.

- Giorgio Buccellati, University of California, Los Angeles

The Royal Palace of Urkesh: Recent Excavations and a Browser Edition

Work in the Royal Palace during the 2002 season continued both in the monumental courtyard of the formal wing and in the underground structure now interpreted as a Hurrian ābi. The paper will present the results of these excavations as they are embodied in a new digital publication, the Urkesh Global Record. It makes use of the browser format to present in a comprehensive way the full documentation of the entire record from an ongoing excavation.

- Oscar White Muscarella, Metropolitan Museum of Art

The Date of the Early Phrygian Destruction Level at Gordion

All scholars working on Phrygian matters concerned with chronology and historical issues have agreed for five decades that the Phrygian capital city of Gordion, where King Midas reigned, was destroyed sometime in the early 7th century B.C. In 2001 a laboratory in Heidelberg claimed that C 14 dates obtained from grain samples indicated the actual date of the destruction was sometime between 830 and 800 B.C. This date was immediately accepted by the Gordion excavation team. I argue that a review of the destruction level artifacts does not allow one to alter the early 7th century B.C. chronology.
Michael H. Porter, Casco Bay Assyriological Institute

The Digital Map of the Ancient Near East: Status and Opportunities

The Digital Map of the Ancient Near East is principally a geographical database that, when fully realized, will provide up-to-date and topographically detailed maps of the ancient Near East in the periods from the 24th through the 6th centuries B.C. (or from the Akkadian through Late Babylonian periods). These maps can not only be consulted on a PC but can also be customized with relatively inexpensive software and then printed to illustrate scholarly articles, lectures, or classes. It also allows users to search for ancient Mesopotamian sites under various ancient and modern names, to find bibliography, and to consult a potentially vast set of geographically-linked data ranging from site plans of excavations to crop distribution and average rainfall. Because the information is in digital form it can be updated easily and can be expanded to include almost any kind of information that can be linked to a geographical location, while revisions and expansions can be distributed on CD-Rom at little cost to the user.

The pilot version of the Digital Map focuses on the later Neo-Assyrian period (ca 700–600 B.C.), showing the Assyrian Empire at its widest extent. It includes all of the toponyms from the Neo-Assyrian Corpus that could be identified and located (approximately 700, many more than have appeared on any previous map), and the published paper precipitate of that pilot, the Helsinki Atlas of the Near East in the Neo-Assyrian Period (Helsinki, 2001), bears witness to the quality of printed maps the system can produce.

This paper demonstrates the current state of the Digital Map and invites the collaboration of colleagues in expanding the database to other periods.

Michael G. Hasel, Southern Adventist University

A Statistical Analysis of Foreign Name Determinatives in the “Battle of Kadesh” Accounts

In 1969 J. A. Wilson published a footnote citing the “notorious carelessness” of Egyptian scribal convention in assigning determinatives to foreign names. Subsequently numerous scholars outside the field of Egyptology have assumed that the Egyptians knew very little about the people, places, and polities during the Egyptian New Kingdom (Lemche 1991) or at the minimum that they were very loose in their application (de Vaux 1978; Ahlström and Edelman 1985; Margalith 1990; Huddlestun 1990; Ahlström 1991; 1993). This study readdresses the issue from the perspective of the most widely published report of any foreign undertaking during the Egyptian New Kingdom—the ‘Battle of Kadesh.’ A statistical analysis of foreign names is conducted of the ‘Poem,’ ‘Bulletin,’ and Reliefs as they are found in both upper and lower Egypt. Questions concerning the consistency of Egyptian scribal convention will be posed of the reporting of the most celebrated historical event in the reign of Ramses II. The results of the analysis indicates that the Egyptians were remarkably consistent in their designation of these foreign entities whom they sought to control through military domination.

Joshua T. Katz, Princeton University and Institute for Advanced Study

An Old Egyptian Visual Pun

In this paper I suggest that there is a “visual pun” in Pyramid Text 527 (§1248), the description of Atum’s self-genesis and the birth of the twins Shu and Tefnut. An understanding of the hieroglyphic word play in this passage helps explain the sense of the difficult phrase ‘ıw-ıw and at the same time provides us with by far our earliest piece of evidence in Egypt for the cross-culturally unusually widespread view of marrow as part of the reproductive system.

– 32 –
What is Meki Doing in the Hurro-Hittite *Song of Release*? A Study of *wastul* (“Sin”) and Other Vocabulary Items

Scholars have seen the key action in the *Song of Release* as an attempt to issue a release of debt slaves, based on biblical parallels, but to do this they give a different meaning to the Hittite word *wastul* (KBo XXXII 15 iii 19, 20) than its ordinary meaning in other Hittite texts. Because they have translated it as ‘debt’, the *para tarnumar* in the title of the song means ‘release from debt’. In my past presentation at the 2001 AOS Meeting, I preferred to focus on the epic parallels, translating it as ‘sin’. Now I return to this issue, upon which our interpretation of the song as a whole depends. I will look at phrases in other Hittite texts which parallel those in which *wastul* appears in the *Song of Release* to prove the meaning of ‘sin’, and at the use outside of the *Song of Release* of the phrase *para tarna-*., showing that it refers the Hittite custom of exemption from *sahhan* and *luzzi* (taxes and corvée labor), often in order to better serve Hittite gods or deified dead. This fits with the otherwise opaque connection in the *Song of Release* between the image of Tessub suffering from want and his demand that the people of Ikinkalis be freed.

*Appan tarna-* is used thus by Hattusili I in his *Annals*, where he also boasts of conquering Agagali/Igigali, the only Hittite attestation outside of the *Song of Release*. Hattusili’s boast of transporting gods and temple personnel to Hattusa provides a mechanism for the importation of the original Hurrian poet whose descendants performed and translated the Middle Hittite *Song of Release*, honoring Tessub and found on temple grounds. Thus, attention to the hither-to ignored possibility of a Hittite context for the *Song of Release* elucidates the history of the text.

What the Canaanite Cuneiformists Wrote

The language that Canaanite scribes used for correspondence in cuneiform during the Late Bronze Age has been an object of scholarly attention since the discovery of the Amarna tablets over a century ago. Recently, many features of this language, ostensibly a hybrid combining the scribes’ native Canaanite with their borrowed Akkadian, have been described in Anson Rainey’s study *Canaanite in the Amarna Tablets*. In texts written in this Canaanite-Akkadian hybrid, sentences composed of Akkadian words are arranged in Canaanite syntax; Akkadian words are made to function according to the rules for their Canaanite counterparts; Akkadian words are provided with Canaanite affixes; Akkadian words and morphemes are recombined to produce otherwise nonexistent forms; and Canaanite words, besides being deployed as glosses, are used alongside Akkadian ones. These peculiar features raise questions about what kind of language this was, who used it with whom, and how they used it.

In this paper, I argue that the peculiarities exhibited by the letters the Canaanite cuneiformists wrote, together with observations about how written communication functioned in the Late Bronze Age, compel the conclusion that the Canaanite-Akkadian hybrid was not a language used for mutual communication, even in writing, by anybody. Lacking a community of users, it cannot really have been a language at all, and it is therefore invalid to analyze it as such. The mixture of Canaanite and Akkadian which we read in the tablets written by Canaanite scribes is neither a dialect of Akkadian nor a hybrid language, but an artifact of these scribes’ use of cuneiform. I argue, further, that the language underlying Canaanite communication in cuneiform was not Akkadian but Canaanite. The Canaanite scribes’ use of cuneiform produces the illusion that they were writing in Canaanite-accented Akkadian, when instead their writing can be understood as largely Akkadographic. Indeed, the Canaanite Amarna letters might almost be considered tablet-length Akkadograms, sprinkled with Canaanite words and explanatory glosses, which show that these letters were meant to be read in Canaanite.
Paul W. Kroll, University of Colorado

Notes on Rhyme and Prosody in Some of Li Po’s Poems

The finer workings of sound and meter in a few selected poems by Li Po, some little known, others more familiar, will be examined. Few if any T’ang poets were as innovative as Li Po in these matters, but analysis of such details is surprisingly often overlooked in favor of simply decoding the semantic freight of our texts. Closer attention to sound and rhythm, as well as to sense, helps us catch a glimpse of what was special about Li Po’s verse.

Ding Xiang Warner, Cornell University

The Two Voices of Wangchuan ji: Poetic Exchange between Wang Wei and Pei Di

In Wang Wei’s preface to his sequence of poems on Wangchuan, he explains that he and his friend Pei Di each has composed twenty poems on visiting the scenic sites of Wang’s estate, which comprise this collection of forty poems titled Wangchuan ji. However, despite their original inclusion as one set, the poems by Wang Wei and Pei Di are rarely printed together in modern anthologies. Likewise, in most modern critical studies and translations of the Wangchuan ji, only Wang Wei’s set of poems are considered. In the few instances where critical discussion has included Pei Di’s poems, it has generally been for the sake of contrasting Pei Di’s “inferior” command of poetic techniques to the mastery of Wang Wei, the “genius poet.” This paper argues that Pei Di’s contributions to the sequence are integral to an apprehension of the Wangchuan ji’s overall purpose and achievement, for an examination of his poems reveals that they consistently respond, in their language and thought to Wang Wei’s, and thus the pairs are intimately connected. What is required and what this paper initiates, therefore, is an analysis of both poets’ contributions in their relation to one another, as a series of paired poetic utterances if not a developing dialogue. The reward of such analysis, ultimately, is not only a better understanding of the Wangchuan ji as a discrete work of literature, but also a broader understanding of the nature of poetic exchange within the cultural practices of Tang literati.

Anna M. Shields, University of Arizona

The Yuanhe Poetic Contexts for a Mid-Tang Anthology, Poems for Imperial Perusal (Yulan shi)

Among the nine extant anthologies of Tang poetry, the Yulan shi (Poems for Imperial Perusal) presents a curiously skewed picture of mid-Tang poetry. The literatus Linghu Chu created the anthology at imperial command between 814 and 817. Unlike the more famous eighth-century anthologies Qiezhong ji, Guo xiu ji, Heyue yingling ji, and Zhongxing jianqi ji, the Yulan shi has no preface to affiliate it with a literary school. Outside of general discussions of anthologies by a few modern scholars and the scholarly annotation of Fu Xuancong, in his 1996 edition of Tang ren xuan Tang shi, the Yulan shi has been little studied. As the title suggests, the anthology is foremost a collection of poems, not poets; rather than gathering together the works of poets whose style or reputation suited the compiler, it combines poems on specific subgenres that meet narrow formal requirements. Unlike collections that preceded it, the Yulan shi collects poetry of indefinite occasion, such as frontier poems, parting poems, and boudoir laments. Equally unusual is its formal narrowness—the collection is evenly divided between regulated eight-line verse and regulated quatrains in both pentasyllabic and heptasyllabic meters. And although the collection was compiled in the Yuanhe reign period by a literatus known for his associations with the innovative poets Liu Yuxi and Bo Juyi, among others, almost all the poets in the Yulan shi date from the Dali reign period. This paper examines the unique features of the anthology in order to answer the following questions: why did a Yuanhe literatus and poet select poems from the earlier Dali reign period to present to the Xianzong emperor? what do the poetic topics of the anthology have in common? and what poetic tastes of the Yuanhe era might have influenced Linghu Chu’s narrow selection of poems and poetic topics?
Religious Metamorphism in Shang Art and Practice†

Shang religious practice appears to be founded on a belief in metamorphism, the belief in the spirit power to change from human to animal and vice-versa, from animal to human modes of existence. This cthonic belief and practice of early China are reflected in the Shang concept of the gui spirit and gui cognates that serve mostly as sacrifices in bone inscriptions, and in the artistic use of the spirit mask in royal Shang ritual imagery. The belief in metamorphism predates the codification of royal ancestor spirit worship of Late Shang times, specifically the Zu Geng and Zu Jia era yet continues as the underlying religious system of early China and eventually foundation of yin-yang cosmology and religious Daoism. Specific sacrifices reflecting religious metamorphism include those practiced by the Shang king, such as the bin, zhu and wu invoking spirit rites. Specific themes in art reflecting religious metamorphism are omnipresent, particularly in the ubiquitous use of the hunted animal mask flanked by subsidiary spirit images of feng birds, and gui and long dragons. The focus of Shang religious art is comparable to Shang divination in seeking spirit identification and spirit sanction.

One theme in Shang elite ritual art that is particularly visually conceptual is the theme of semi-human display from Early through Late Shang times. The latter is composed of an image that is part human and part animal mask, frontal and bifurcated. Further transformational properties are expressed in the representation of the displayed image with lower limbs ending in bird claws. Bird attributes are consistently used in early Chinese ritual art to signify spirit power to fly and thus by extension to spiritually metamorphose. The metamorphic properties of the displayed semi-human image in Shang ritual art are further corroborated by a cognate of gui, that of yi that refers to spirit transformation in Shang bone inscriptions. Graphic and semantic evidence indicates that yi refers to religious metamorphosis and the underlying basis of Shang belief and practice.

† Panel Abstract: Metamorphic Religion in Shang and Chu Period China

The panel proposes to introduce the little understood indigenous religion of early China, the belief in metamorphism that characterizes Late Neolithic through Warring States periods. Analyses shall focus on two time periods, the Shang and Warring States. Metamorphosis is defined as the belief in the ability of one to metamorphose from human to animal and vice versa, from animal to human. Since religious belief is intimately intertwined with sociopolitical control, manifestation of belief is often camouflaged in royal prerogative and aristocratic practice. The question of continuity of belief is addressed, with the point that from Shang to Warring States eras cultural expression varies but cthonic belief in metamorphism persists, as identified through various expressions, including survival and revival.

The first Shang period paper addresses specific evidence in Shang divination inscriptions and ritual art for religious metamorphism. Specific terminology connected with spirit identification and transformation is revealed in invocation related sacrifices, including bin, zhu, the mask-donning rite, wu and yi. Corroborative evidence is expressed in Shang ritual imagery, specifically the ubiquitous animal mask image but also displayed image of a semi-human, or frontal human represented with animal mask and bird claws. The second paper identifies pre-dynastic high ancestors and mythic heroes, Wang Hai, Hou Ji and Kui (Ku) in Shang bone inscriptions through a rigorous analysis of Shang data and explicates later historical misunderstandings. With this identification, the author than analyses the significance of the semantic origins of the graphs for Wang Hai, Hou Ji and Kui (Ku), in addition to sacrificial terminology, such as the Great Exorcism (Da Yu) that links their worship with cthonic metamorphosis.

The two Chu period papers deal with expressions of survival and revival of earlier religious metamorphism. The first paper addresses specific evidence for prefiguration of metamorphic imagery in Confucian literature, and the mythological and hermeneutical origins of this imagery. The second paper, on the other hand, addresses the relevance of sacrifice to the belief in transformation between animals, humans, and spirits in late Warring States and early Han literature.
Che-Mao Ts’ai, Institute of History and Philology, Academia Sinica
Predynastic Shang Heroes and Religious Metamorphism

Scholars have identified “Dukes” and “Kings” by name preceding the Shang dynastic line before Da Yi (Cheng Tang) (Xian Gong Xian Wang). Luo Zhenyu initiated research in his *Yinxu Shuqi Kaoshi*, followed by Wang Guowei who used bone inscriptional data in combination with the *Yinbenji* chapter of the *Shi Ji* to identify predynastic Bao Yi, Bao Bing, Bao Ding, Zhu Ren, Zhu Gui, the three Bao’s and two Shi’s, along with other personnages preceding the Shang dynastic founder, Shang Jia, such as High Ancestor Kui and Ji, Wang Hai, and Wang Heng (*Yin Buzhong suojian Xian Gong Xian Wang Kao; Xu Kao*).

The present paper is designed to continue this type of research by initially identifying the names of the predynastic “Dukes” Zhao Ming, Xiang Tu, Chang Ruo, Cao Xin as members of The Lost Royal Sons of the Bird “Clan” (Zi Xu Niao). Primary evidence is based on the initial misunderstanding of *Xun Zi* in the Cheng Xiang chapter with the passage “Qi Xuan Wang sheng Zhao Ming/ Qi Dark King gave birth to Zhao Ming.” On the basis of other data of sacrifices and ceremonies in Shang bone inscriptions, it is evident that Gao Zu Kui is Qi in later histories and Gao Zu is Wang Hai. The latter rites by comparison to those offered to Wang Heng are large in scale, for reasons of which have to do with the fact Wang Hai was the Yin people’s heroic ancestor and Wang Heng his offspring. That Wang Hai is Yin’s heroic ancestor is further corroborated by the fact that Shang Jia, the first Shang King of the dynastic line is not identified with the epithet Gao Zu/ High Ancestor. It is also evident from bone inscriptional evidence, that Ji is Ming in the *Yinbenji* and that Wang Hai is Wang Heng’s father. Further analysis of sacrificial terminology, including specific metamorphic types of rites, such as *liao* and *yu*, and the graphic history of these heroes indicate that mythical properties of Yin’s High Ancestors Wang Hai and Gui reflect religious metamorphism.

Gopal Sukhu, Queens College, CUNY
Metamorphic Imagery and Prefiguration in Early Chinese Literature

Images of creatures or things that suddenly change from one form to another feature only in certain places in the literature of the late Warring States period and the Han dynasty. For example, the Zhuangzi begins with the account of a creature that starts off as a tiny fish but ends up as a colossal bird; there is also the famous man who changes into a butterfly in a dream. In the Li Sao there is the apparent change from man to woman of the main persona. In the Nine Songs vehicles and their draught animals undergo unannounced changes in the course of shaman flights; serpents become horses and chariots become boats made of improbable materials. Some of the *Chuci* poems that date from the Han dynasty allude to transformation from mortal to winged immortal. Very often these images derive from mythological sources now lost.

There is a clear pattern in the appearance or non-appearance of metamorphic imagery. The literature associated with Daoism, the *Chuci* and other texts of southern provenance employ it often; the literature of classical Confucianism, hardly at all. In most cases such imagery adds force to polemical statements. The Daoists use it generally to attack the Confucians, while the *Chuci* writers mainly deploy it in political complaint. Social hierarchy, in theory or practice, is often at issue; both Zhuangzi and Qu Yuan see through power structures, but for different reasons. The Mencius and the Xunzi, however, may lament the inappropriate use of things or the improper behavior of persons, but persons and things in these texts are forever locked in their forms. The Confucian project is to keep form and function properly aligned.

There are, nevertheless, rare but important occurrences of metamorphic imagery in Confucian literature, and they are mainly in the commentaries on the Spring and Autumn Annals. The most interesting case is in the *Gongyang Commentary* in its Later Han version, where metamorphic imagery forms part of a rhetoric that affirms, or reaffirms, a hierarchical order that is under attack. It may also be the first instance in China of prefiguration, long associated exclusively with Christianity.
and the West. My paper will explore the mythological and hermeneutical origins of this imagery and give an account of the role it played in the transformation of Han Confucian orthodoxy.

- **Michael Puett**, Harvard University

  **Sacrifice and Transformation in Warring States and Han China**

  During the late Warring States and early Han, a series of debates concerning metamorphosis emerged. What normative relations and what normative hierarchy should exist between humans, animals, and spirits? Should the relations be based on sacrificial exchanges? If so, what forms of sacrifices should be employed? Or is it that humans, animals, and spirits are all composed of the same substance, and hence can transform into each other? If this is the case, then should sacrifices still be supported?

  This paper will be an attempt to sort out the competing practices and conceptual schemes according to which these various relations were posited. I will explore portions of the late Warring States / early Han ritual compendia as well as texts like the Huainanzi to study some of the differing ways that sacrifice was defined during this period and some of the conflicting visions that arose concerning the connections between humans and the larger world. The resulting analysis will hopefully shed light on why these debates concerning the relations between humans, animals, and spirits emerged, how they developed, and what the participants felt was at stake.

- **Jacob Lassner**, Northwestern University

  **Once Again: The Sanctification of Jerusalem in light of anti- Faḍā’il al-Quds texts**

  There are a number of medieval sources that discuss the sanctification of historic Palestine and, more particularly, that of Jerusalem. Western scholars are generally agreed that Jerusalem first achieved exulted status for Muslims during the reign of the Damascus based Umayyad caliph ‘Abd al-Malik. The reason for this has been debated since the 19th century when I. Goldziher, following an account in Yaqūbī, linked the Islamization of the Holy City to the revolt of the Zubayrids in the Hijaz. According to Yaqūbī, the Zubayrids prevented the Syrians from carrying out the rites of pilgrimage, and so, the Umayyads sought to make Jerusalem a major site for the ḥajj. That is to say, Goldziher and his followers believed that Jerusalem was sanctified to serve as a counterweight to the Haramayn, the holy cities of Mecca and Medina. A more recent analysis of various sources by the late S. D. Goitein proved convincingly that the ḥajj was not interrupted. Hence, the Islamization of Jerusalem has to be understood as resulting from other historical circumstances. This paper will review those circumstances along with a body of literature that speaks against the sanctification of Jerusalem. In particular, one has to ask why a literature denigrating the sanctity of the Holy City was created in the mirror image of those texts which extolled the virtues of the city.

- **Sandra Toenies Keating**, Providence College

  **Divine Attributes: The Šifāt of the Holy Trinity in the Writings of Abū Rā’īṭah al-Takrītī**

  The Jacobite Christian, Ḥabīb ibn Khidmah Abū Rā’īṭah al-Takrītī (c. 153/770–c. 220/835), has remained relatively unknown to scholars in the West. However, his engagement with Islamic thought emerging in the early ninth century has formed the basis for Christian apologetical writings in the Monophysite community for centuries. Among the most significant of Abī Rā’īṭah’s contributions is his use of the Islamic theory of divine attributes (šifāṭ) to show the validity of the Christian doctrine of the Trinity. Drawing on the widely accepted philosophical triad of divine attributes—life, knowledge and wisdom (with some terminological variations), he argues that Christian teaching is not only compatible with monoteism, it is a necessary corollary of monotheistic faith.
A few scholars have noted that Abū Rāʾīṭah is perhaps the first to employ a common philosophical understanding of the sifāt as a basis for Muslim-Christian theological exchange, preceding the well-known work of Yahyā ibn Ṭālib by more than a century. Further, Abū Rāʾīṭah’s dialectical approach reveals a great deal about the thought of his interlocutors during an important stage of Islamic intellectual history. Nonetheless, little attention has been given to his specific use of the term sifā and its influence on the contemporary discussion.

This paper will outline Abū Rāʾīṭah’s presentation of the divine attributes in response to Muslim questions concerning the Trinity and his application of them as an apologetical tool. In addition, it will offer an initial reconstruction of the intellectual context within which he is working and the questions of those to whom he is responding. It is hoped that this approach will provide some insights into the scholarly milieu of early ninth century Baghdad and Abū Rāʾīṭah’s participation in it.

• SIDNEY H. GRIFFITH, The Catholic University of America

The Monk and the Muslim Shaykh in Jerusalem: Early Christian Apologetics in Arabic

Sinai Arabic MS 434 (ff. 171–181), dated 1138 CE, contains a Christian apologetical text in Arabic featuring the replies of a monk to three questions posed by a Muslim Shaykh about the doctrines of the Trinity and the Incarnation. The replies, which the text says reflect ‘Melkite’ Orthodoxy, offer both what it calls ‘rational’ and ‘divine’ answers to the questions posed by the Shaykh. The monk employs quotations both from the Christian scriptures and from the Qur’ān in defending the credibility of the Christian doctrines.

This document has until now remained unpublished and unstudied. Scholars have referred to it only in passing, in the process of listing the contents of the important archive of Christian Arabic texts preserved in the monastery of St. Catherine at Mt. Sinai. The present communication gives a full account of the contents of the text, examining the apologetical arguments the author advances and highlighting the technical vocabulary. Furthermore, the study examines the historical context in Jerusalem evoked in the text, paying special attention to its ‘Melkite’ character. The present author has elsewhere argued that the ‘Melkite’ Christian community first came into historical view in the early Islamic period, professing Byzantine religious Orthodoxy in the Arabic-speaking milieu of the monastic communities of Jerusalem and the Judean desert. In this hitherto unstudied text, the opportunity is presented to observe the intellectual posture adopted by an early ‘Melkite’ apologist in his effort to defend the credibility of the central doctrines of Christianity against the religious challenges of Islam.

• IRINA TSYBINA, University of Toronto

Arabic Hollow Verbs from another Perspective: Introduction of a Third Type of Glide

The paper deals with phonological processes observed in a category of verbs in Arabic referred to as hollow verbs or hollow roots. Phonology of these verbs includes multiple peculiarities that account for behavior different from that of so-called standard verbs.

The analysis treats infixing using the theory of template morphology, in which phonological representations consist of several independent, parallel tiers, i.e., levels of representations, on which features appear. This analysis can be employed because vowels and consonants of a word can pattern independently as separate morphemes. Therefore the verb is a combination of a morpheme with root features on a consonantal tier, aspectual and voice morphemes on a vowel tier, and affixes. The standard verb in Arabic has three radical consonants, none of which are the same, and none are glides. There are deviations from this standard pattern such as that the consonants may occupy two slots, or there may be four consonantal slots, or one of the slots may be occupied by a glide. Hollow verbs are roots that have a glide as the medial consonant.

It is common that phonologically conditioned changes that certain segments undergo may interact with morphological effects. However, this paper argues for an analysis that is primarily phonological.
A literature review is provided as the foundation for this hypothesis. However, the analysis relies on a few key points that are not sufficiently emphasized in the literature. Some core arguments are introduced, for example a set of phonological principles that shape the behavior of hollow roots by providing certain environments in which glides surface differently. Another important idea is a notion of a third type of glide that could explain the peculiarities of a group of hollow verbs which includes verbs such as e.g., NWM ‘sleep’, and which is traditionally treated separately from verbs patterning as e.g., QWL ‘say’.

P. OKTOR SKJÆRVØ, Harvard University

Avestan vahma and Yasna 34.2

The Avestan word vahma is commonly rendered as prayer, praise, or similar, but its derivation is controversial: Geldner (1897) connected vahma with Old Avestan vafu and ufiia-; Bartholomae (1894) derived it from the root van “wish”; Andreas (1902) considered it a transcription error for vaxma = OInd. vakma; Humbach (1959) derived it from vas- “to shine”; and Szemerényi (1967) compared Hier. Hitt. was(a)-. Insler (1975) has “glory” (explained as hymns of glorification) and “praise.”

I would like to return to Geldner’s suggestion. The Avestan verb ufiia- has always been interpreted as “to weave” (poems) and vafu as its derivative (both from *webh- “weave”). Keeping in mind the Indo-European notion of “weaving hymns” (Greek humnon huphainein “weave a hymn” and common, though doubted, etymology of humnos from huph- “weave”), one may consider the same possibility for Avestan. A -na- derivative of the root vaf- would be Iranian *vaf-na-, which, by assimilation, might give *vafma- and then, by dissimilation, vahma-. The process of dissimilation would be similar to that proposed by Karl Hoffmann for Avestan daxma-, a kind of burial place, from a root *dhabh-, cf. Greek taphos. The cluster fn is in fact not found in Avestan.

In the light of Yasna 34.2, I would like to propose that the ancient Iranian cosmogonic myth comprises macro- and microrocomic weaving imagery and that the poet’s vahma, his woven poetry, anticipates god’s dâman, his woven créations.

HANNS-PETER SCHMIDT, University of California at Los Angeles

Zarathustra’s Eschatology

The commonly held opinion that Zarathustra taught both an individual and a collective or universal eschatology has some years ago been challenged by Jean Kellens. Since the passages previously claimed as evidence for the universal eschatology are not examined and no argument for rejecting them is presented, it is imperative to take up the question in detail.

HANS HENRICH HOCK, University of Illinois

Reflexivization in the R. gveda (and Beyond)

Sanskrit offers three different means of reflexivization: Middle voice; the possessive reflexive pronoun svā (etc.); and a “full” reflexive pronoun based on a noun (RV tanā, later ātman, once perhaps also in Rig-Veda). The middle voice is inherited from Proto-Indo-European; most scholars would reconstruct the possessive reflexive too, but Lehmman (1974, 1993) rejects the reconstruction; the full reflexive is considered an innovation by all scholars.

This paper has two purposes:

a. to show that the reflexive possessive is complementary to middle voice, marking the one constituent that cannot be expressed by middle voice, namely the nominal genitive relation

b. to demonstrate that the full reflexive (RV tanā) is a very recent innovation

– 39 –
For point a., I present two arguments. First, the nominal genitive relation is fundamentally different from that of the case relations of verbal complements (see Panini’s śaṣṭhi śeṣe). Second, there are no unambiguous Rig-Vedic examples of nominal genitive relations expressed by middle voice endings.

For point b., I examine the passages with tanū that Grassmann lists as examples of reflexive usage. Only 11 are clearly reflexive, 22 are ambiguous, and 8 are unlikely to be reflexive. Excepting a passage with possessive tanvāh, only one passage with reflexive tanū has an active verb. It occurs in Book 10 and is the first attestation of the post-Rig-Vedic “separation” between pronominal and verbal reflexivization. The remaining nine passages have middle voice verbs.

I conclude that tanū was reinterpreted in ambiguous passages as a reflexive pronoun redundantly co-indexed with the reflexive middle voice. The later “separation” between pronominal and verbal reflexivization may be attributed to a reevaluation of pronominal reflexivization as primary and verbal reflexivization as redundant, followed by the possible ellipsis of verbal reflexive marking.

• Arlo Griffiths, University of Leiden

Once Again on the Meaning of Vedic árma

There are two current interpretations of the meaning of the Vedic word árma-. While earlier interpretations by Burrow and Falk have tried to connect the word with (abandoned) sites from the Indus civilization, Humbach argued for ‘lonely or solitary or isolated place/region’, and Ram Gopal proposed very differently to render the word as ‘lake’. Mayrhofer’s Etymological Dictionary now accepts the sense ‘well’ proposed on the slender basis of an ostensible pair of cognates in Tocharian by the linguist K.T. Schmidt.

Among Indologists, another meaning, ‘abandoned resting place (of pastoral nomads)’, is now widely accepted. This meaning, which ultimately derives from explanations given in commentaries for the compound armakapāla- found in the description of the Pravargya in Black Yajurveda Śrautasūtras, has been advocated by Wilhem Rau in his 1976 book on pūr-: he there tried to collect all the attestations of the word in the basic texts, and the explanations in the commentarial literature.

The word has been drawn into various discussions relating to Indian cultural history, and a precise understanding of its meaning is therefore important. Starting from the observation that Rau’s collection of Vedic data is not complete, and neglects dissenting explanations by Kesavasvāmin on Baudhāyanaśrautasūtra, and by Dārila and Kesava, who commented on the Kauśikasūtra, the paper will review all the Vedic and post-Vedic (commentarial) textual evidence afresh.

Many of the attestations are textually corrupt or otherwise problematic, and the evidence is therefore quite ambiguous. It is hard to read the texts without a preconceived idea of how to understand the term. Nevertheless, an attempt will be made to demonstrate the likelihood of a new interpretation: ‘dry seasonal pool’.

• Stephanie W. Jamison, University of California at Los Angeles

Sanskrit Ušanā Kāvyā, Iranian Kauui Usan, and Friends

The relationship between the similarly (but not identically) named mythological figures, Indic Ušanā Kāvyā and Iranian Kauui Usan, is a vexed and much discussed one, and it has important implications for our understanding of the interrelations of temporal, priestly, and magical power in the ancient Indo-Iranian world.

Starting from the seminal study of G. Dumézil (“Entre les dieux et les démons: un sorcier (Kāvyā Ušanas, Kavi Usan),” in Mythe et épée II [1971]), which focussed on the later epic material in both traditions, this paper will also examine the earlier Vedic and Avestan evidence, and will suggest a way to reconcile the functions of the Indic and Iranian figures, rather than seeing, as Dumézil did,
a sharp split and evolution in both traditions. The recent revaluation of the term kauui in early Iranian (e.g., by P. O. Skjærvø) will also be discussed.

• **Signe Cohen**, University of Missouri

  The Riddle of *Rigveda* 10.106.5–8: Jabberwocky Revisited

  Stanzas 5–8 of *Rigveda* 10.106 have been declared unintelligible by most scholars. Almost every word is a *hapax legomenon*. Professor Ashok Aklujkar has recently suggested that these stanzas are not meant to make sense, and that they represent nonsense-verse comparable to Lewis Carroll’s “Jabberwocky”.

  In this paper, I suggest an alternative explanation. Many of the “nonsense words” in these stanzas have prefixes such as *jar-, tar-, sar*. These prefixes are also well attested among the “foreign loan words” (i.e., words of non-Indoeuropean and non-Dravidian origin) elsewhere in the *Rigveda*. In this paper, I will explore the possibility that stanzas 5–8 of this hymn could be composed in a language other than Sanskrit.

• **Edwin Floyd**, University of Pittsburgh

  „Sravah“ in the *Rigveda*: Fame or Reputation?

  Alternative glosses for Vedic „sravah“, as “fame” or “reputation”, are not really mutually exclusive. They do, however, go in different scholarly directions, as referring to (1) enduring fame spread over many generations, or (2) reputation in the here and now, spread over a geographically wide area. Typically, the study of Indo-European poetics has focused on the former—the long preservation of fame—as the original pattern. In discussing the combination of *sravó* “fame” with *nyām* “of men” found at RV 5.18.5, for example, Schmitt, *Dichtung und Dichtersprache* (1967: 96) speaks of the great deeds of heroes having receded, in the *Rig-Veda*, before the praise of gods such as Indra.

  We do not, however, need to opt for either formulation of fame to the exclusion of the other. Instead, we should operate in terms of a complex interrelationship, with fame being, so to speak, spread out in both space and time. The usage of Sanskrit *uru-* and Greek *euru-* (both meaning “wide, broad”) illustrates this. At RV 6.65.6, for example, the combination *urugāyām* “wide-striding” is used in association with the noun *sravó*. The specific fame which is referred to is contemporary, as the rṣi invokes Dawn to shine with favor on us today. The overall context, though, is a comparison of the present seer’s reputation with the fame of a past rṣi Bharadvāja. A similar balance between past and present fame is also evident in Greek passages with *euru kleos* “wide fame”, such as Pindar, *Olympian* 10.95, and we may therefore fairly confidently reconstruct this as an Indo-European pattern.

• **David B. Gray**, Rice University

  Creation Through Sacrifice: Buddhist Response to the *Puruṣasūkta* and the Transformation of Sacrificial Ideology

  In this paper I will explore several Buddhist responses to Vedic sacrificial ideology preserved in Pali and Sanskrit sources. In particular, I will look at two texts that address the *Puruṣasūkta* (*Rg Veda* 10.90) directly, the Pali *Aggañña Sutta* and the Mahāyāna *Karaṇḍavyūha Sūtra*, preserved in Sanskrit as well as Tibetan and Chinese translations. Through an examination of changing Buddhist responses to this text, I will argue that Buddhists, while dependent to a very significant degree on earlier Vedic concepts, were engaged in a process of adaptation involving the transformation of discursive categories borrowed from preexistent traditions. In this case, it involved the transformation of sacrifice (*yajñia*) into generosity (*dāna*), a value given great emphasis in Buddhist discourse. This in turn was a crucial step in the development of the Mahāyāna ideal of the bodhisattva, an ideal which, as exemplified in the *Karaṇḍavyūha Sūtra*, reveals influence from the growing theistic trends within Hinduism. In so doing I hope to make a contribution to our understanding of the development
of Buddhism in India and its complex relationships to the larger Hindu cultural context in which it was embedded, and with which it was dialogically related.

- **M.W. Waters, University of Wisconsin, Eau Claire**

  **Cyrus and Cassandane: Dynamics of a Dynastic Marriage in the Early Persian Empire**

  The understanding of early Achaemenid history has undergone significant changes in recent scholarship. In the last generation, careful examinations of Near Eastern sources have indicated that the long-held view of Darius’ and Cyrus’ shared descent from Achæmenes is erroneous. The Achaemenid dynasty was a construct of Darius, after he came to power, and was one way by which he rationalized his claim to the throne. The removal of Cyrus from Darius’ “Achaemenid line” compels several questions regarding the relationship between the two kings and their lines. This relationship thus requires a new assessment.

  If Cyrus was not an Achaemenid, what then? And what was the relationship between Cyrus and the Achaemenids? Answers to these questions, as best as they may be considered with the limited evidence, are important both in light of Cyrus’ establishment of the empire as well as Darius’ victory in the crisis of 522. This paper examines the connections between Cyrus’ and Darius’ lines from the perspective of Cyrus’ marriage to Cassandane.

  The historicity of Herodotus’ account of this marriage (II.1 and III.2) and supporting evidence is discussed (and accepted for this hypothesis), with subsequent attention to the political historical ramifications of this union. The paper builds upon an increasing body of scholarship emphasizing the unique qualities of Darius’ dynastic line (i.e., the Achaemenids) with the additional and primary focus of how the marriage of Cyrus and Cassandane may have impacted early Persian history. This political marriage gave Cyrus significant support for his early conquests in Iran and greatly enhanced the standing of the Achaemenid clan in the emerging empire.

- **Jorunn J. Buckley, Bowdoin College**

  **Against the Consensus: Early Mandæan texts**

  Almost all Mandæan texts have colophons appended at the end. By comparing and correlating the earliest Mandæan colophons (with scribes dating from ca. 200 A. C. E to the very beginnings of Islam), one may determine which types of texts are covered by the earliest colophons. On such a basis, I present a new hypothesis (against R. Macuch and K. Rudolph) on the character of early Mandæism. What emerges is evidence for previously underestimated early Mandæan religious features.

  I examine the earliest parts of colophons in eleven Mandæan documents that encompass a variety of literary genres. Presupposing fully developed mythologies and rituals, many of the texts whose colophons are examined constitute examples of esoteric teachings and ritual commentaries. These types of literature appear to demonstrate a natural development in scribal traditions that place a high value on priestly knowledge, on the mysteries of creation and on the minutiae of rituals.

  The Mandæan religion does not develop a commentary tradition as a result of late, “degenerate” diffusions from a putatively early, “pristine” form of Gnosticism unhampered by priestly speculative dimensions. Instead, the commentaries, with their exuberantly creative impetus and their kabbalistic interests in esoterica, appear as part and parcel of the Mandæan tradition from very early on. Scholarly stereotypes must be blamed for the notion that the production of Mandæan commentaries prove a degeneration of the religion. (One would hardly make such conclusions about early Christianity). Internal exegetical traditions show that early Mandæanism is in constant conversation with itself, forging ahead into ever-expanding territories of speculations. Far from being a later accretion somehow detached from the “real” religion, the commentary literature needs to be rehabilitated. Until now, facile evolutionary models have coloured the scholarly theories on Mandæanism’s “original” face.

- **– 42 –**
Rain Requests: An Analysis of the Deities’ Function in Agriculture and Irrigation in Pre-Islamic Southern Arabia

This paper aims to evaluate and explain the relationship between the deities of the south Arabian pantheon and the structures of irrigation and water allocation built by the inhabitants of the pre-Islamic city-states and towns of ancient Yemen. Relying on the synthesis of archaeological and epigraphic data, it will elucidate the role of certain deities in the rogation of the seasonal rains and their function in the construction and maintenance of manufactured structures for distributing this rain to alluvial fields.

Previous scholarship has outlined individual elements within the south Arabian cultic system. Thus, various studies have identified and connected state deities with their primary locus of influence, and archaeological data have advanced our knowledge of temples and manufactured devotional items. These investigations have provided a useful underlying structure in which to explain common beliefs and practices throughout southern Arabia. However, previous research has relied upon etymological evidence and analogy with other Near Eastern belief systems in explaining the function of individual deities. These older models of inquiry have neglected the crucial relationship between the text, with its embedded information, and its archaeological provenience. As a result, there is little understanding of the connection between deities and their function within the belief system.

This paper will employ both archaeological and philological methods in analyzing the epigraphic data relating to deities and cultic devotion. Most importantly, it will attempt to reveal the interplay between text and audience, and the association of cultic activity with text provenience. In particular, it will focus on the function of deities within the agricultural and irrigation regimes in contrast to other areas of daily life. The paper will present new results from the Oriental Institute (University of Chicago) Dhamar Plains Survey (Republic of Yemen), as well as incorporate previously published texts and archaeological sites within southern Arabia.

The Past Explains the Present: Law and Religious Freedom in Medieval China

During the entire medieval period of Chinese history, the religious practices of her people were regulated by criminal laws imposed on them by the government. Several collections of such laws are available for our analysis such as Tānglù shuòyì (The Tang Dynasty Code With Commentaries and Explanations), 653; Sōng xīngtóng (Criminal Code of the Song Dynasty), 963; and Qīngyuān tiaofa shìlèi (Laws and Regulations of the Qingyuan Era Selected According to Categories), 1202.

According to these laws, people of China did not hold the right to join the religious community (such as Daoist, Buddhist, or other) unless they obtained government permission for such action. Those who disobeyed were punished by a hundred blows from a stick. Blows were inflicted on the convert, on all members of the convert’s family, and on the leaders of the religious organization which authorized the conversion.

Religious people did not have the right to proselytize and to hold their public ceremonies without permission from the government. Punishment for this sort of crime depended on several factors such as the “political correctness” of the message which has been delivered; location where the ceremony took place (the closer to the government quarters it were, the worse was the punishment); and the amount of people who attended it. Some forms of punishment for unauthorized preaching of religious ideals involved one hundred days of detention inside the monastery, where the guilty clergy was given a task of copying several thousand pages from their own holy books; others were as severe as three hundred blows from a stick, followed by the loss of the clergy-status and permanent exile.

More analysis of the laws from the Tang and Song dynasties’ criminal codes reveals that the Chinese government never concerned itself with the issue of the religious rights of its people. At
the same time, it proves that concerns of economic and social political stability were always put above the need for individuals religious spiritual expression. This sheds the light on the modern situation, explaining the consistency with which the PRC’s officials reject human and religious rights to its citizens as one of the traits of the traditional culture rather than simply an adversity of the communist regime. The concept of religious freedom, apparently, has never been a category of the Chinese traditional ideology.

- CORNELIUS J. KILEY, Villanova University

*Mogari*, The Royal “Homage Funeral” of Ancient Japan

The death of sixth and seventh century Japanese kings was followed by a protracted funereal ritual called mogari, which had to be completed before the deceased ruler was finally interred. The most important feature of this ceremony was the presentation of “eulogies,” shinobigoto, by the major courtiers, in which they commemorated the services they and their followers had performed for the dead king, whose surviving chief consort presided over the rite. Mogari and the regime of the mogari queen, which could last for years, functioned during periods of interregnum to resolve disputes over succession, as well as to validate the positions of the courtiers in the reign to come.

This paper argues that mogari confirmed a peculiar, homage-like relationship existing between the dynasty and its servitors, a linkage inconsistent with the more bureaucratic state apparatus being completed in the late seventh century. The ritual as a whole defined a segmented court structure lacking in hierarchical centrality. The linkages celebrated by mogari recitations, “estatist” linkages between the monarchy and its retainers, were replaced by the rank-and-office structure of the new official legal codes, *ritsuryô*. The twenty-seven month long commemoration service held for Emperor Temmu (r. 672–686) was probably the most impressive royal mogari ever held, but it was also, of necessity, the last. The abrupt discontinuance of this ceremony was certainly a deliberate decision on the part of dynastic authorities, who probably wished to eliminate the concept of an interregnum regime completely. The establishment of more purely official relations between ruler and official was nonetheless an important objective.

- JULIA BRAY, University of St Andrews

*In My Beginning: Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih and the Good Word*

Of the novelty of the appearance of *adab* in *al-Andalus*, Gabriel Martinez-Gros exclaims: “...le mieux n’est il-pas de consulter... ces prologues où les auteurs s’attache... à justifier une entreprise aussi nouvelle: écrire... dans la grande majorité des cas ...des les premiers mots, celui qui parle se place sous la protection ou plutôt sous l’autorité du souverain...la figure du prince est la source, le centre et la fin” (*L’Idologie omeyyade*, Madrid 1992, p. 19). The prominence of the prince was hard-won, however. This is reflected in the case of Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih (246–328/860–940). He became a fervent supporter of the first Umayyad caliph; yet in his *Iqd*, the prince is not “the beginning, middle and end”, but one member of a triad. Indeed, praise or even mention of the institution of sultan—a divine institution, to be sure—is deferred until opening of the first book. First, in the general preamble, come praise of a gracious and just God and of the “goodly tree” of *adab*: Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih tells his readers that he who eats his share of its fruits “is heir to prophecy and follows a path of wisdom...none who hold fast to which shall go astray,” an image based on Qurʾān 14:24–25 (“...a good word is as a good tree...it gives its produce every season by the leave of its Lord”) and other allusions. Later, in Chapter 6 “On ʿilm and *adab*”, he uses parables to suggest the relationship between the divine will, *adab* and the human condition.

The *Iqd* as a whole, this paper will suggest, argues the primacy of the good word, and it is through this prism that it views the place of the prince in the human condition.
• SHAWKAT TOORAWA, Cornell University

Travel in the Medieval Islamic World: The Importance of Patronage, as Illustrated by ‘Abd al-La’tif al-Baghdadi (and others)

Travel in the medieval Arab-Islamic world has received relatively little critical and theoretical attention. Existing scholarship (Eickelman and Piscatori 1990, Hopkins 1990, Netton 1994, 1996, but see Bosworth 1998) has tended to be descriptive, and has been content with the sub-division of travel into one or more of the following five categories: scholars’ travel in search of knowledge (al-rihla fi ta’lab al-ilm); pilgrimage to Mecca; scholars’, emissaries’ or adventurers’ travels of discovery and exploration (rihla); mercantile travel; migration. This taxonomy, though useful, has excluded a widespread, important, and, to the best of my knowledge, unstudied form of travel: namely, journeying with patrons. Countless scholars traveled to patrons and many traveled with the patron too.

This paper, by looking at the travels of a number of figures, and focusing on the travels in later life of the celebrated scholar-physician ‘Abd al-La’tif al-Baghdadi (d. 629/1231), will attempt to demonstrate the importance of patron-motivated travel, and also propose a more detailed way of thinking about travel in medieval Islam.

• TAHERA QUTBUDDIN, University of Chicago

Metaphor as Manifestation: Religious Symbolism in the Poetry of two Fatimid Ṭayyibī Dāʼīs.

In my paper, “Metaphor as Manifestation: Religious Symbolism in the Poetry of two Fatimid Ṭayyibī Dāʼīs,” I will explore a new form of quasi-metaphorical religious symbolism in one of the lesser known Arabic Islamic poetic traditions. In this tradition, what seems to be at first glance metaphor turns out upon closer acquaintance not to be metaphor at all, but rather the actuality, the reality, the spiritual manifestation of the object or concept (“analogue”) of the metaphor. For example, the Fatimid Imam (or the Ṭayyibī Dāʼī) is called the Straight Path. He is not merely compared to it, but is presented as its actual manifestation. There is no hyperbole involved. This religious symbolism draws upon the Fatimid-Ṭayyibī esoteric (ta’wil) tradition, and combines it with established classical Arabic poetic motifs. It gains aesthetically from the customary usage of metaphor as a literary trope, but goes beyond into the realm of theology. This ta’wil symbolism characterizes the poetry of the tenth-century Fatimid Dā’ī al-Mu’ayyad fī al-Dīn al-Shūrāzī and the twelfth-century Ṭayyibī Dā’ī ‘Ali b. Muhammad. I believe it is what sets the Fatimid-Ṭayyibī poetic tradition apart from other poetic traditions. Although scholars have remarked upon the ta’wil tradition of the Fatimids and the Ṭayyibīs, they have not related it to the poetry produced within these traditions. In fact, this facet of metaphorical usage has not been remarked upon by scholars of the Arabic literary tradition at all. In my paper, I will discuss the major features of Fatimid-Ṭayyibī poetic symbolism, and provide illustrations from the poetry of two of their most significant poets.

• MAJD AL-MALLAH, Grand Valley State University

Doing Things with an Ode: Ibn Darrāj al-Qaṣṭalā’ī’s First Panegyric to al-Manṣūr

This paper will analyze one of the most famous poems of Ibn Darrāj al-Qaṣṭalā’ī (d. 421/1030) that praises Manṣūr b. Abī ‘Āmir (d. 392/1002). I propose to use speech act theory as a framework for reading this ode. I will argue that this ode performs the illocutionary act, to use speech act terminology, of obligating the patron to reward the poet as a symbol of establishing a mutal relationship that is based on the poet’s pledge of allegiance and the patron’s acknowledgment of obligation toward the poet. I will investigate the power of words, poetic language in particular, and their effect within the community in al-Andalus (Muslim Spain), taking into consideration speech act theory’s central idea: that words do things in communities and are forms of social action. My focus, therefore, will be on what the panegyric ode does and what effect it has on the poet and patron.
within a *proper context in the community*. I will use speech act theory as a general framework for the ritual of gift exchange, which Suzanne Stetkevych proposes to explain the complex relationship between the poet and the patron. This communal ritual, which consists of giving (the poem as a gift), receiving (the poem by the patron), and repaying (the poet), establishes specific obligations between poet and patron that allow the panegyrical ode to accomplish specific objectives. I will use works on Speech-act theory such as *How to do Things with Words* by J. L. Austin, *Toward a Speech Act Theory of Literary Discourse* by Mary Louise Pratt, and Beatrice Gruendler’s Ph.D. dissertation (Harvard 1995) entitled “The Patron’s Redemption: The Praise Poetry of Ibn al-Rūmī Dedicated to ‘Ubaydallāh b. Ẓāhir.”

**• Joël Dubois, Whitman College**

*Sāṅkara’s Brhadāranyakopaniṣad Bhāṣya in Light of Upāsana Practice*

In this paper I suggest that key sections of Śaṅkara’s *Brhadāranyakopaniṣad Bhāṣya* (BAUbh) hinge on notions closely tied to the brāhmaṇa practice of upāsana or “attending”—a connection that, to my knowledge, has so far never been addressed. I define upāsana as the ritual veneration of key natural elements accompanied by gestures of offering and recitations connecting those elements with divine forces. A central feature of upāsana practice is what I call the “first-person summary utterance;” such statements summarize the key themes that link the diverse recitations and offerings made throughout a particular act of upāsana, as well as the deities and cosmic elements venerated. In contemporary forms of twilight veneration, for example, the famous gāyatrī mantra as well as the mystical homology “that Āditya is brahman; I [myself] am that” both express the ritual’s concern with the identifying hidden links between the solar deity and the individual practitioner. Thus such utterances serve as a focal point for anyone wishing to supplement outward recitations and offerings with a single inward contemplative focus.

In BAUbh 1 Śaṅkara uses the meticulous step-by-step review entailed in successively glossing each word of the upaniṣad as an opportunity to compose his own first-person summary utterances. Specifically, he precisely labels and connects each section of the text in terms of its relevance for molding a certain vision (darśana or vidyā); and then concludes his commentary of the related sections by prescribing a first-person utterance that explicitly links all the details mentioned in those sections. While it seems unwise to posit from this type of commentary that Śaṅkara actually employed upaniṣadic texts for upāsana practice, it is nevertheless clear that his familiarity with ritual practice drives his method in making sense of that text. These sections of the BAUbh, then, call into question widespread generalizations about Śaṅkara’s indifference toward particular ritual practices.

**• Robert A. Goodding, Austin, Texas**

*Purusāpratayata: Personal Effort after the Attainment of Knowledge according to Vidyāranya*

In the Jivanmuktiviveka, Vidyaranya does not contradict the traditional Sankaran Advaita Vedanta epistemology of *śabda pramāṇa*, but he stresses the proper preparation prior to the attainment of valid knowledge, and the proper yogic discipline after that attainment in order to safeguard it. Without the proper preparation, the valid knowledge, according to Vidyaranya, “merely persists,” and can diminish once faced with powerful experiences of commenced action. Knowers of Brahman are cited who have not “done what is to be done” for they still manifest action, and therefore are not liberated. Vidyaranya emphasizes the need for personal effort in concert with the discernment gained through attainment of valid knowledge of Brahman in order to truly achieve liberation-in-life (*jīvanmukti*).
Glenn Wallis, University of Georgia

The Adikarma as ‘Primary Practice’

This paper explores the use of the term adikarma by the eleventh century Indian Buddhist teacher Advayavajra (1007–1085) in the collection of his works known as the Advayavajrasamgraha. Typically, adikarma refers to a course of training for a newly initiated practitioner. It is, in this sense, a preliminary practice that stands prior to more advanced forms of attainment. However, in the Kudrstinirghatana, the first text of the Advayavajrasamgraha, Advayavajra uses adikarma in a unique sense to denote a continuously constituted foundational practice. This paper argues that Advayavajra’s application of adikarma comprises a strategy to address two central concerns that confronted teachers in the emerging siddha milieus of his day: (1) the bridging of the perceived gap between the dominant monastic forms of Buddhism and the innovative, unconventional forms that were being propagated, and (2) the genuine acquisition of higher knowledge (vidya) and power (siddhi) within these often antinomian communities.

Timothy Lubin, Washington and Lee University

‘Saiva Upanisads’ as Upanisads and as Saiva

Regarding the group of Upanishads usually classed as Shaiva, this paper addresses two issues: (1) On what grounds have they been transmitted as Upanishads? (2) In what sense can they be called Shaiva? While the label “Upanishad” has been applied to confer authority on these works, the earliest of the group do in fact incorporate material drawn from the mantra Samhitas, the classical Upanishads, and such other shruti works as the Gopatha-Brahmana, intermingling it with other, later material. The later examples of the genre contain material (especially praise of ritual practices) found otherwise in Puranas. So far as a sectarian affiliation is concerned, many of these works, especially the oldest of them (the Atharvashiras [as Hara has observed] and Atharvashikha) must be considered Pashupata works rather than Shaiva. These works represent an effort by brahmin Pashupatas to marshal Vedic, especially Atharvavedic, mantras and to identify Rudra Pashupati as the one brahman. A particular effort in this direction by Atharvavedins can be identified in the final additions to the Atharvashiras, and in several of the Atharva-Veda-Parishishtas. Links with the Puranas will also be explored.

Ultimately, these works were absorbed by Smarta Upanishad-collectors into an ever-expanding body of Vedantic lore, culminating in collections of 108 Upanishads. The genre-defining status of the Atharvashiras, meanwhile, is exhibited in this period by its adoption by Smartas as the model for a pentad of “Atharvashirshas” dedicated to the deities called the pancayatana (Rudra/Shiva, Vishnu, Surya, Devi, and Ganapati). Likewise, Tantric movements like those devoted to Kubjika (as analyzed by Goudriaan and Schoterman) and Batukeshvara produced upanishads of their own that quoted extensively from and were modeled on the Atharvashiras.

Robert A. Yelle, Southern Illinois University

Chanting the Cosmogony: Hindu Tantric Rituals for Making Mantras Effective

My paper examines the rites for making mantras effective (siddha) prescribed in the Sanskrit texts of Hindu Tantra. An analysis of these rites, especially the rite of enveloping (sampa[a], which adds syllables to the mantra at beginning and end in forward and reverse order respectively (anulomavilomena), demonstrates that mantras are made effective by being converted into diagrams of several forms of creation: the cycle of evolution and involution of the cosmos, the process of sexual union and reproduction, the cycle of in- and out-breaths, and the path of production of speech from inside the body to the outside world. The practice of enveloping the mantra with the script of the elements (bhūtalipi) reveals that the sequence of vocables in the mantra also diagrams the transition from language to physical reality, virtually bringing into existence the material goal expressed in
the interior portion of the mantra (śādhyā). When the mantra is converted into a diagram of creation, it is believed to be more creative and effective in achieving a real-world result. Although other scholars including Gudrun Bühnemann have described Tantric rites for making mantras effective, and Frits Staal and Agehananda Bharati have noted the appearance of palindromes in Vedic and Tantric mantras, the significance of these devices in Hindu Tantra has not previously been explained. These Tantric rites find precedent in certain Vedic and Upaniṣadic practices, including the practice of appending the prāṇava (ōm) at beginning and end of every mantra, and the palindromic mantra for conception (garbāḍhāna) at Brhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 6.4.20. Tantric mantras borrow the very language of some of these earlier formulas, attempting to improve upon it and its cosmogonic power.

- Peter Scharf, Brown University
  Interpreting Upaniṣads: Saṁjñā

  Passages in ancient upaniṣads and in principal texts of major Indian philosophical schools describe liberation from the bonds of suffering and ignorance. Several statements, for example, in Brhadāraṇyakopanishad 2.4–6 address the questions of to whom ignorance and liberation belong, and whether or not consciousness persists in the state of liberation. Both traditional commentators and contemporary scholars give dramatically differing interpretations of these passages. Examples of inappropriate interpretive procedures include the importation of the technical semantics of Vyakarana into a non-technical context and the suppletion of passages with extra-contextual items in preference to contextual ones. Examination of the motivations for these interpretations and evaluation of them on straightforward philological grounds easily identify misinterpretations and brings clarity to what have been some of the major miasmas of philosophical and religious thought.

- Priyawat Kuanpooponpol, Ramkamhaeng University
  Buddhism and the Concept of Vyāvahāra in Kashmir Śaivism

  A close reading of Abhinava’s Vyārtivimarśini commentary on Utpaladeva’s Vyārti of the Pratyabhijñākārikā and vyārti sheds light on philosophical arguments in medieval Kashmir. Particularly instructive are debates on the ego and ordinary perceptions. With reference to the Vyārtivimarśini 1.3.2–5, this paper will discuss how the concept of vyāvahāra, ordinary and rational discourse, arises from the Śaivism’s arguments with Buddhists, following from the Śaivas’ explanations of perceptual errors and imaginative construction of the external world.
Index of Abstracts

Abusch, Tzvi, 3
Adarkar, Aditya, 19
Ahmad, Ahmad Atif, 7
Aklujkar, Ashok, 29
Aklujkar, Vidyut, 28
Al-Mallah, Majd, 45

Bachvarova, Mary R., 33
Bailey, Greg, 28
Beckman, Gary, 13
Branner, David Prager, 6
Bray, Julia, 44
Brockington, John, 20
Brockington, Mary, 18
Brodbeck, Simon, 27
Buccellati, Giorgio, 31
Buckley, Jorunn J., 42

Cantrell, Deborah, 14
Carter, Michael G., 16
Childs-Johnson, Elizabeth, 35
Coblin, W. South, 15
Cohen, Signe, 41
Conrad, Lawrence, 29
Cook, Constance A., 29

Daniels, II, Joseph L., 43
Daniels, Peter, 21
Das, Rahul Peter, 30
Davis, Jr., Donald R., 11
Dede, Keith, 21
Drompp, Michael R., 21
Dubois, Joël, 46

el Omari, Racha, 25
Farmer, J. Michael, 4
Ferrara, A.J., 2
Fitzgerald, James L., 19
Fitzpatrick, Coeli, 18
Fleming, Daniel E., 13
Floyd, Edwin, 41

Garfinkle, Steven, 12
Goh, Meow Hui, 5
Goldman, Robert P., 26
Goldman, Sally Sutherland, 20
González-Reimann, Luis, 26
Goodding, Robert A., 46

Gray, David B., 41
Griffith, Sidney H., 38
Griffiths, Arlo, 40
Gurevich, I. S., 15

Hallo, William W., 31
Handel, Zev, 15
Harzer, Edeltraud, 27
Hasel, Michael G., 32
Heck, Paul, 22
Hentrich, Thomas, 30
Hiltebeitel, Alf, 20
Hock, Hans Henrich, 39
Jamison, Stephanie W., 40
Johnson, Cale, 3
Jungraithmayr, Herrmann, 1
Karaghasi, Fumi, 1
Katz, Joshua T., 32
Kaye, Alan S., 1
Keating, Sandra Toenies, 37
Kellner-Heinkele, Barbara, 22
Kelly-Buccellati, Marilyn, 31
Kiley, Cornelius J., 44
Kroll, Paul W., 34
Kuanpoonpol, Priyawat, 48
Kuznetsova, Irina, 26
Lassner, Jacob, 37
Lauinger, Jacob, 3
Lavallee, Thomas, 4
Lenzi, Alan, 3
Lindquist, Steven E., 9
Lowry, Joseph E., 8
Lubin, Timothy, 47
MacKay, Pierre A., 24
McGinnis, Jon, 16
Melchert, Christopher, 9
Melville, Sarah C., 14
Meserve, Ruth L., 29
Minkowski, Christopher Z., 11
Muscarella, Oscar White, 31
Myers, Jennie, 13
Nielsen, John P., 14

Pankaj, Night Queen, 10
Podany, Amanda, 12
Porter, Michael H., 32
Puett, Michael, 37

Qian, Gu, 15
Qutbuddin, Tahera, 45
Reiner, Erica, 30
Reynolds, Gabriel Said, 23
Riedel, Dagmar, 16
Rocher, Ludo, 11
Rocher, Rosane, 12
Rowson, Everett K., 8
Scharf, Peter, 48
Schmidt, Hanns-Peter, 39
Scurlock, JoAnn, 29
Sela, Ron, 22
Shields, Anna M., 34
Shizhen, Liu, 15
Simmons, R. VanNess, 15
Sinor, Denis, 22
Skjærø, P. Oktor, 39
Snell, Daniel C., 21
Spectorsky, Susan, 8
Stewart, Devin, 23
Storch, Tanya, 43
Street, Tony, 17
Studevant-Hickman, Benjamin, 4
Sukhu, Gopal, 36
Testen, David, 1
Toorawa, Shawkat, 45
Ts'ai, Che-Mao, 36
Tsybina, Irina, 38
Tubbb, Gary, 20

van Bladel, Kevin, 17
Virani, Shafique N., 24
von Dassow, Eva, 33
von Hinüber, Oskar, 10
Walker, Paul, 25
Wallis, Glenn, 47
Warner, Ding Xiang, 34
Waters, M.W., 42
Williams, Rebecca R., 26
Woods, Christopher, 2
Wright, David P., 30
Wu, Sujane, 4
Yang, Suh-Jen, 5
Yelle, Robert A., 47