

American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842

CONSTITUENT OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF LEARNED SOCIETIES
AND THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF ORIENTALISTS

ABSTRACTS

OF
COMMUNICATIONS
PRESENTED

AT THE

TWO HUNDRED AND FIFTEENTH

MEETING

PHILADELPHIA

MARCH 18TH–21ST 2005

(Includes Program Changes)



©American Oriental Society 2005
New Haven CT and Ann Arbor MI

A. Ancient Near East I: AOS/NACAL: Linguistics. MAYNARD P. MAIDMAN,
York University, Chair (1:30 p.m.–4:30 p.m.) *Ballroom AB*

1. PETER DANIELS, New York City

Alphabets and Encyclopedias

Principally on the treatment of Writing in the *Encyclopédie* of Diderot and D'Alembert [because I've signed up to translate those articles for the Ann Arbor-based Encyclopédie translation project], but perhaps also with notes on the editing of encyclopedias, such as *The worlds writing systems*, edited by Peter T. Daniels and William Bright, and the upcoming *Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics* 2nd Edition (to be published in print in late 2005 by Elsevier), Writing Systems Section

2. REBECCA HASSELBACH, Cambridge, MA

Preservation and Loss of ʔ₁₋₅ in Sargonic Akkadian

The state of preservation of the original Proto-Semitic gutturals /ʔ/, /h/, /ħ/, ʕ/, and /ġ/ in Sargonic Akkadian is one of the major problems regarding early Akkadian phonology.

Most scholars agree that we can distinguish at least two sets of phonemes in Sargonic Akkadian that were still kept apart, /ʔ/ and /h/ on the one hand, and /ħ/, ʕ/, and /ġ/ on the other (Gelb 1961:19; von Soden 1995: §188a), although there is no consensus regarding the extent of preservation of individual members of these groups.

The uncertainties regarding the state of preservation of ʔ₁₋₅ in Sargonic Akkadian is caused by the absence of adequate signs for /ʔ/, /h/, /ħ/, ʕ/, and /ġ/ in the writing. The status of the individual phonemes can nevertheless be deduced by three basic orthographic reflections: 1. absence or presence of *a > e* in the environment of ʔ₃₋₅, 2. the use of CVG signs such as M^Á and Æ^M, and 3. the use of specific vowel signs for individual gutturals, such as A for /ʔa/ and /ʕa/ and É for /ħa/.

Furthermore, there are significant differences in the representation of gutturals in different text genres and geographical areas, which have not been sufficiently noted so far. The investigation of these different text corpora and genres sheds light on the otherwise seemingly random orthographic representation of guttural phonemes. Literary texts and formulaic expressions do not reflect either vowel raising or the loss of gutturals. Texts from southern Babylonia usually preserve gutturals in all environments, with only rare exceptions, while texts from the Diyala region show a clear confusion of signs originally used for distinct phonemes and clear evidence for the change of *a > e*, indicating at least a partial loss of these phonemes.

3. JOHN HUEHNERGARD and NA'AMA PAT-EL, Harvard University

Cleft Sentences in Semitic Languages

In a number of Semitic languages it is possible to find a pronominal form of the series with initial PS* δ attached to an interrogative. This pronoun seems to be redundant, where it appears to have the same syntactic function as the interrogative pronoun. The Biblical Hebrew pattern exhibits a number of interesting features: the subject is always 1st or 2nd person. Second; Heb. *zē* Arab. *dā* are the only demonstratives

possible in this construction; although there are negated interrogative clauses, there are no negative interrogative clauses with Heb. $z\varepsilon$ Arab. $\underline{d}\bar{a}$.

The insertion of a demonstrative after an interrogative has been noticed by various scholars and grammarians. Most of the grammars see the demonstrative as a “strengthening particle”. Some scholars pointed to the possibility of a cleft pattern here (Joüon, Goldenberg), but still maintained that $z\varepsilon/\underline{d}\bar{a}$ is a demonstrative. While most grammarians and scholars agree on the emphasizing nature of these patterns, the syntax has remained for the most part obscure and unexplained.

In the languages under investigation, forms of the $*\delta$ series of pronouns function, or functioned historically, as determinative-relative markers. Thus, and on the basis of comparative data, we suggest that the function of $z\varepsilon$ and $\underline{d}\bar{a}$ in the Hebrew and Arabic patterns is, originally, a relative pronoun, rather than a demonstrative. This means that these patterns are actually cleft sentences of the Indo-European type, which was so far believed to be extremely rare in Semitic languages. With the replacement of $z\bar{v}$ by $\text{ʔ}\check{a}\check{s}\varepsilon r$ (or $\check{s}\varepsilon$) in Hebrew, and of $\underline{d}\bar{v}$ by $allad\bar{i}$ in most forms of Arabic, the $*\delta$ -pronouns in the old clefting pattern became frozen vestiges, and were subject to reinterpretation synchronically as containing a demonstrative element.

4. JOHN A. COOK, University of Wisconsin – Madison

Typology and the Biblical Hebrew Verb

The century-and-a-half-old question whether the Biblical Hebrew verb forms express predominantly tense or aspect remains without a consensus answer. Arguments based on linguistic typology have recently been advanced in order to argue that the Biblical Hebrew verbal system is not aspectual. These arguments center on the use of the *yiqtol* or Imperfect verb form compared with the prototypical meanings/functions of Imperfective aspectual verb forms in other languages. In this paper I examine these arguments and demonstrate that they are faulty, both in their use of linguistic typology and in their analysis of the Biblical Hebrew verbal forms. I then present an aspectual analysis of the Biblical Hebrew verbal system from the perspective of diachronic typology. Through this approach, those data that have formed the basis of the typological arguments against an aspectual analysis are accounted for within an aspectual model.

5. JOHN HUEHNERGARD, Harvard University

Hebrew Verbs I–*w* / *y* and a Proto-Semitic Sound Rule

It is well known that most Hebrew verbs I–*y* derive from earlier roots I–*w*. The latter exhibit several distinct paradigms in the prefix-conjugation and related forms (imperative, infinitive construct). In stative verbs such as $*y\check{a}\check{s}en$ “to sleep” (cf. Arabic *wasina*), the original *w* of the root tended to shift to *y* following the prefix-vowel *i*, i.e., $*yiwsan > *yiysan > y\check{i}\check{s}an$. A number of active verbs with theme-vowels *a–i*, such as $y\check{a}lad$ “to bear”, lacked the *w* in such forms already at the Proto-Semitic stage: $*ya-lid \rightarrow *yilid > yeled$ (imperative $*lid > led$; infin. cst. $*lidt- > l\check{e}d\check{e}t$). Comparative evidence suggests the existence at the Proto-Semitic stage of still another group, namely, verbs with theme-vowels *a–u* in which the *w* was retained in the prefix-conjugation, as in Ethiopic $y\check{e}wg\check{e}r$ “let him throw”. In this paper it will be proposed that this last group is attested in Hebrew in verbs such as $yosar$ “to form”, which exhibit doubling of the middle radical in some prefix-conjugations forms, as in

yīṣṣrēhu, ^ʔ*εṣṣorkā*. In most of these the second radical is *ṣ* or *s*, i.e., a dental sibilant. It is likely that the doubled *ṣṣ*, etc., is the result of a simple assimilation of *w* to this following dental radical, i.e., **yawṣur* > **yaṣṣur* → *yīṣṣor*, in accordance with a Proto-Semitic sound rule *wD* > *DD*, where *D* is a dental consonant, a rule seen, for example, in Akkadian *ittabal* < **yawtabal* “he has carried” and Arabic *yattaḥidu* < **yawtaḥidu* “it is united”.

6. DAVID TESTEN, Reston, Virginia

Some Anomalous Broken Plural Formations and the Prehistory of Arabic

A small set of Arabic “broken plural” stems are found to be anomalous in that they have shapes which are unexpected in light of their corresponding singular stems. It is suggested that the eccentricities of these plurals are not arbitrary flukes but rather indirect reflections of aspects of the historically underlying proto-forms which have been lost by their singular-number counterparts. An internal reconstruction based on such a plural shape thus provides us with clues to both the original shape of the word and the prehistorical developments which have reshaped the singular form.

7. ALAN S. KAYE, California State University, Fullerton

Vocalism in Arabic and the History of the Language

What do the vowels in colloquial Arabic dialects tell us about the history of Arabic? In some cases, it seems quite clear that one can derive a colloquial Arabic form from a Classical Arabic (CA) prototype; e.g., Lebanese (L.) *ḥimmēm* < **ḥammām* ‘bath’. The ^ʔ*imāla* (vowel raising) of the final vowel has triggered V1 to assimilate from *a* > *i*. In other cases, one can see dissimilation at work; e.g., from **CA ḥulw* ‘candy’, one understands the development of L. *ḥilw*. Similarly, L. *ḥilim* ‘dream’ points to CA **ḥilm* as its etymon with first, a dissimilation of V1 from *u* > *i*, followed by its vowel harmonic V2 = *i* as anaptyctic vowel. One cannot derive the L. from from CA *ḥilm*, pl. ^ʔ*aḥlām*, because that means ‘gentleness; clemency’. In yet other cases, it is much more difficult to explain developments; e.g., (1) *ḥalme* ‘breast; nipple’ < CA *ḥalama*. Note V2 > 0 and the ^ʔ*imāla* of the final vowel; (2) L. *ḥabūm* or *rāḥat il ḥabūm* < CA *rāḥat ulḥulqūm* ‘a kind of sweet made of cornstarch sugar, mastic and pistachio similar to a marshmallow’. According to Wehr (1974:202), this is Egyptian Colloquial Arabic (CA *ḥulqūm*). Further, it is not listed in J. Hinds and E. Badawi’s *A Dictionary of Egyptian Colloquial Arabic* (Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1986:221); only *ḥabūm* ‘throat; gullet’ is listed = CA *ḥulqūm* (Wehr 1974:202). It seems clear that dissimilation is at work in V1, reinforced by a natural attraction of low vowels and pharyngeal fricatives. This work looks at other examples of clearcut and difficult-to-explain developments. The latter suggest that Proto-Colloquial Arabic is different from a CA prototype.

8. ELITZUR AVRAHAM BAR-ASHER, Harvard University

The Pattern of *qtīl li* in Syriac and Babylonian Aramaic

In his famous article ‘Two “Passive” Constructions in Aramaic in the Light of Persian’, E. Kutscher, mainly dealt with one syntactic construction in East Aramaic dialects: The one which consists of the passive participle and the preposition ‘*l*’ followed by a pronominal suffix (henceforth: *qtīl li*). In this article he presented two sets of arguments which are interwoven with one another: the first is synchronic—

about the use of this pattern and its typology; the second is diachronic—concerning its origin.

Kutscher, like many other scholars, believed that synchronically this construction functions as the way to express the perfect tense. In addition, he argued that this pattern should be considered, with respect to its typology, as a possessive construction and not as a passive. The second part of the synchronic claim, the analysis that it is a possessive construction, was influenced by the parallel, both in morphology and in function, to a construction in Old Persian, which E. Benveniste had analyzed as a possessive construction. Based on this parallel, Kutscher thought that the origin of this construction was external, and was a result of the contact between the East Aramaic dialects and Old Persian.

These conclusions have been widely accepted since this article was published [For example: Polotsky (1979), Cohen (1984) and Hoberman (1989)]. However, based on an examination of different definitions of the meaning of the term ‘Possessive Construction’ in general linguistics [a formal definition (Keenan [1985]) vs. a semantic definition (Lazard [1984])], and reexamination of the proper way to describe this pattern as a part of the entire verbal system of East Aramaic, I propose to challenge the conclusion that the *qtil li* pattern in Syriac and in Babylonian Aramaic is indeed a possessive construction. Hence, I will suggest a new way to refer to the *qtil li* construction in those languages, and by this to give a counter-suggestion regarding its development.

B. Inner Asia. Linguistics, Historical Ethnography, and History. REUVEN AMITAI, Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Chair (2:00 p.m.–4:00 p.m.)
Ballroom E

9. GREGORY D. S. ANDERSON, MPI-EVA/Leipzig and University of Oregon

Natural Change, Obsolescent Change and Language Contact in Tofa and Middle Chulym

In this brief report I offer an assessment of the modern states of two critically endangered Turkic languages of Siberia, Tofa and Middle Chulym. I contrast data from recent fieldwork with previously published materials on the languages. While much is of course the same, there has been a greater than might be expected amount of changes attested in these languages in their present condition. Some of these changes are the result of ‘natural’, structurally internally-motivated changes, while others probably result from functional collapse that is frequently operative in moribund languages, while a third set clearly reflect contact influence from the dominant Russian language, to which most Tofa and Middle Chulym people have switched and which all speak more commonly than their ancestral tongue. These three kinds of changes are analyzed and extensively exemplified.

10. ILYA YAKUBOVICH, University of Chicago, and YUTAKA YOSHIDA, Kobe City University of Foreign Studies

Sogdian *Samghāṭasūtra*

The *Mahāyāna* text *Samghāṭasūtra* (SghS) is known from a Sanskrit version (7 manuscripts, some of them complete), a Khotanese version (at least 27 manuscripts, all fragmentary), three Chinese versions (T.T. 423, T.T. 424 and one apocryphal version), and a Tibetan version. G. Canevascini, *The Khotanese Samghāṭasūtra*, Wiesbaden: Reichert, 1993, is the most accessible edition of this composition, whose most striking feature is the absence of any doctrinal content. The sole purpose of its developed plot and numerous anecdotes embedded in it seems to be to convince the reader to promulgate this text. Thus SghS is perhaps the closest approximation to entertainment literature that one can find in the Buddhist Canon.

During their work in the Turfan Collection of the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin, the authors of this presentation have been able to identify several new fragments of SghS in the Sogdian language, coming from the oases of Qarashahr and Turfan. The results of our work will be published in the joint article “The Sogdian fragments of *Samghāṭa Sūtra* in the German Turfan Collection”. *Languages of Iran: Past & Present. A Volume of Iranian Studies in memoriam David Neil MacKenzie* (ed. D. Weber). Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2005 (?), pp. 239–268. The six different Sogdian manuscripts of SghS that have come to light make it the most popular Buddhist Sogdian text known at the present time. No doubt, the entertaining character of this composition, as well as generous karmic upgrades promised for reading and copying it, played an important part in its dissemination through Central Asia.

The Sogdian text of SghS does not represent a translation, but rather a free adaptation of the original composition. The “translators” apparently felt that they would not risk losing merit by slightly altering this bestseller deprived of doctrinal significance. As far as we can judge, it was considerably abridged, the astronomical numbers occurring here and there were rounded somewhat, and many idiomatic expressions of the Sogdian (Buddhist) tradition were introduced into the narration. Especially interesting are those instances where the Sogdian version has been embellished with new details, sometimes enhancing the Indian exoticism of the story. These techniques are in sharp contrast with slavish copying of Chinese expressions by Sogdian translators of doctrinal works, but find parallels in the famous Sogdian version of *Viśvāntara Jātaka*.

11. DENIS SINOR, Indiana University

Skiing in Ancient and Medieval Inner Asia

The paper will present and comment upon a selection of texts culled from Chinese, Islamic, and Western sources mentioning the use of skis.

12. REUVEN AMITAI, Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Mongol Provincial Administration: Palestine in 1260 as a Case-Study

While there has been some research into Mongol provincial administration in Western Asia, both in the imperial period and the successor states (Golden Horde, Ilkhanate and Chagataid Khanate), most of the resulting discussion has remained of a general nature with occasional examples given from various areas. On the whole it

has been difficult to go beyond the major cities and get beyond the main representative of Mongol might, variously known as *shaġna*, *daruga(chi)* or *basqaq*. Syria in 1260, however, presents the possibility of a more thorough investigation, even though the Mongols occupied the country for only about seven months. The extremely rich late Ayyubid and early Mamluk sources paid much attention to the Mongol occupation, including the Mongol governors and other administrators. At the same time, the main pro-Mongol source, Rashid al-Din's *Jami' al-tawarikh* also provides many details on this matter, and can be profitable compared to the Arabic sources. The resulting investigation shows a five tiered system: 1. Overall and military command (Ketbuqa); 2. *shaġna* (also referred to as *na'ib/nawwab*) in major cities; 3. other Mongol officials; 4. local Muslim bureaucrats who joined the service of the Mongols; and, 5. some Syrian Ayyubid princes who joined the Mongols and were given various degrees of authority, often deliberately vague. We can conclude that within a short period of time, the Mongols were able to erect a relatively sophisticated system, indicating that elsewhere where their rule lasted longer, Mongol local administration was fairly complex. At the same time, in Syria there appears to have been overlapping and perhaps conflicting authority, and potential for confusion and mismanagement; one wonders how this Mongol provincial authority further afield also suffered from this problem. Finally, there can be no doubt that Syria was envisioned by Hulegu as an integral part of the total region under his control. Palestine proper did not receive any representatives since this was still a frontier area, vis-à-vis the Franks and Egypt. Probably had the battle of 'Ayn Jalut gone differently, and the Mongols had moved into Egypt, Mongol administration would have been established also in this area.

C. Islamic Near East I: Qur'ān. DEVIN STEWART, Chair, Emory University
(1:30 p.m.–2:30 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

13. GABRIEL SAID REYNOLDS, Notre Dame University

Why is Abraham's Wife Laughing in Qur'ān 11:71?

In Qur'ān 11 69–83 three stories are told the visit of messengers to Abraham Abraham's futile plea to God on behalf of Lot's people and the destruction of that people as announced by the messengers This pencope is thus fully co-textual with Genesis 18–19 Nevertheless there are meaningful differences between the two versions of this pencope.

Qur'ān 11 71 reads, [Abraham's] wife rose and laughed (*dahakat*). We then gave her the good news of Isaac, and Jacob after Isaac." In the biblical text the mention of laughter (Hebrew *z h q*) — first of Abraham (Gen 17:17), and then of Sarah (18:12) — serves as an etiology for the origin of Isaac's name (Hebr *yizhaq*) In the Qur'ānic narrative this aspect disappears since the Arabic form of laughter (*d h k*) does not correspond with the Arabic form of Isaac (*ishāq*). Moreover, in the Qur'ānic account the woman laughs *before* she gets the news of a child After getting the news she does not laugh but rather laments (v. 72) describing the news as strange (*'ajīb*).

Why then does the woman laugh? The narrative connects her laughter instead to verse 70, in which the messengers refuse to eat, a fact that causes Abraham fear. Sensing his fear, the messengers reassure him that their mission (of condemnation and destruction) is not for him but rather for Lot's people. The woman laughs out of relief. This, I propose, is the solution found by the author for a reference to laughter

that seemed out of place in a new language. (Incidentally, there is reason to believe that this narrative entered into the Qurʾānic text through Syro-Aramaic, where the Isaac etiology also does not work: Syr. laughter *g h k*, Isaac, *ishāq*).

At AOS I would like to present this pencope and introduce its relation to other Qurʾānic narratives and its co-textuality with Jewish and Christian narratives. I will also discuss early Islamic commentary on this passage, focusing on the speculative nature thereof. Through this modest study, I would like to illustrate a method whereby a more fundamental understanding of the Qurʾānic text can be gained.

14. BRUCE FUDGE, New York University

The Clear and the Confounded: Imāmī and Muʿtazilī Exegesis of Qurʾān 3:7

The scholar and Qurʾānic exegete Faḍl b. al-Ḥasan al-Ṭabrisī (d. 548/1153) was an Imāmī Shīʿī with strong Muʿtazilī influences. These influences are clearly seen in matters of dogma and in the sources cited by Ṭabrisī in his Qurʾānic commentaries (*Majmaʿ al-Bayān* and *Jawāmiʿ al-Jāmiʿ*).

This paper will look at the degree to which his *tafsīr* may be properly considered Muʿtazilī *tafsīr*, and will take Q 3:7 as the point of investigation. This well-known verse appears to divide the verses of revelation into 2 categories (“clear” [*muḥkam*] and “confounded” [*mutashābih*]), and offers an enigmatic statement about the possibility and desirability of interpretation (*taʾwīl*).

Muslim commentators provided a wide variety of typologies for classifying the Qurʾānic verses according to meaning and interpretation; the first part of this paper will give a new typology of these typologies with particular attention to the history of Muʿtazilī and Imāmī approaches.

The second part of the paper will situate Ṭabrisī within the above framework, along with the two works on which he relied most heavily: *al-Tibyān fī Tafsīr al-Qurʾān* by the Imāmī al-Ṭūsī (d. 459/1067) and *al-Tahdhīb fī l-Tafsīr* by the Muʿtazilī al-Ḥākim al-Jishumī (d. 494/1101). The conclusion will address the way in which the demands of the *tafsīr* genre in its encyclopedic form seem to be at odds with narrowly doctrinal opinions on the nature of the *mutashābih* verses and on the meaning of *taʾwīl*.

15. ALFORD T. WELCH, Michigan State University

A Summary of Research on The Most Popular Lists of the Ninety Nine Names of God as they Relate to the Qurʾān

[No abstract]

D. Islamic Near East II: Qurʾān & Law. SUSAN SPECTORSKY, Queens College, CUNY (3:00 p.m.–5:00 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

16. EVERETT K. ROWSON, New York University

Straight or Gay? The Curious Exegetical History of Qurʾān 4:15–16

Qurʾān 4:15–16 has posed a number of challenges for exegetes. While clearly condemning sexual immorality, these two verses are syntactically tangled and thus ambiguous in their application; and in the penalties they prescribe they appear to conflict both with another Qurʾānic verse (24:2) and with non-Qurʾānic legislative pronouncements (the latter a problem in themselves). While most medieval commentators

understood both verses as referring to illicit heterosexual intercourse and attempted to reconcile them with the other legal material in various ways, a maverick interpretation by the fourth/tenth-century Muʿtazilite Abū Muslim al-Īṣfahānī took the first of them as referring to female homosexuality and the second to male homosexuality. This paper will outline the controversies over the meaning of these verses from the third/ninth century to the present, with particular attention to how the premodern minority view that they deal with homosexuality became the majority view in the twentieth century, with a significant impact on current controversies over Islam and homosexuality.

17. MICHAEL G. CARTER, University of Oslo

Foreign Words in the Qurʾān and the Implications for *Uṣūl al-Fiqh*

The presence of foreign words in the Qurʾān was recognised by the earliest Muslim scholars, already by Ibn ʿAbbās (d. 68/686 or later), and was accepted without concern by the 2nd/8th century exegetes and grammarians. But by the time of Abū ʿUbayda (209/824–5) it is clear that not all Muslims were happy with this, and various solutions were proposed, by al-Shāfiʿī (d. 204/820) and al-Ṭabarī (d. 310/923) amongst others. This paper will start with the seminal discussion by Kopf 1961 and then examine the early *Uṣūl* works to see whether there is a connection between the position taken and the consequences for legal theory.

18. KHALID YAHYA BLANKINSHIP, Temple University

The *Ṣulḥ* verse (Qurʾān 4:128) and its Rival Classical Interpretations

Qurʾān 4:128, the only verse in the Qurʾān to use the term *sulḥ*, meaning peace or reconciliation, refers to making peace between the two spouses in a marital disagreement. This verse quickly led to a disputed exegesis, leading to juristic disputes as well. In *al-Mudawwanah*, the verse is one basis of the Mālikī position that the wife has the right to divorce from an oppressive husband. On the other hand, in *al-Umm* attributed to al-Shāfiʿī, 4:128 is taken to mean that a wife may voluntarily give up dowry, property, or her right to the attention of her husband in order to avoid being divorced.

Each school tends to emphasize different connections to other texts. Thus, while *al-Mudawwanah* and subsequent developments in the Mālikī school bring out a connection with the two marital arbitrators mentioned in Qurʾān 4:35, *al-Umm* and the al-Shāfiʿī’s stress rather the connection with the concept of *khuk*, whereby the wife pays the husband to divorce. While *al-Mudawwanah* connects 4:128 with ḥadīths showing the wife’s right to divorce, *al-Umm* prefers to connect it with hadths on *khuk*. On the whole, the Shāfiʿī text strongly defends the complete control of the husband over the possibility of divorce, while the Mālikī text presents a much more balanced approach.

Furthermore, a careful reading of the texts appears to show that *al-Umm* is aware of the arguments of *al-Mudawwanah* and that the Shāfiʿī text reveals a more complex and detailed level of argumentation. This suggests that the later dating of *al-Umm* proposed by Zakī Mubārak and Norman Calder is in fact correct, and that the position represented in *al-Mudawwanah* on 4:128 may indeed be more archaic. This would have considerable implications for discourses about women in Islam today.

19. SUSAN SPECTORSKY, Queens College, CUNY

Two Examples of the Use of Qurʾān Verses in Early *Fiqh* Texts

The problem of the extent of a father's authority over the marriage of his virgin daughter is not mentioned in the Qurʾān. The fact that a suitor may ask for a widow's hand in marriage before the end of her *ʿidda* is (2:235). The way these two problems are treated in second and third century *fiqh* texts illustrates the nature of the texts themselves and the status of Qurʾān verses in *fiqh* discussion. In the *Muwattaʿ*, Mālik presents the Medinese doctrine that fathers have absolute authority over the marriages of their virgin daughters, and he offers Medinese traditions to support this practice. Shaybānī's *Kitāb al-Ḥujja* and Ibn Ḥanbal's *Masāʾil* record discussion among scholars, and they refer in passing to traditions as they delve into the *ikhtilāf* this very real problem generated. Shāfiʿī agrees with Mālik's assertion of the father's authority, but his systematic concerns lead him to present more traditions, to argue the logic of the matter, and also to bring in a Qurʾān verse. It is 3:159, a noteworthy choice since Qurʾān commentators associate this verse with the progress and outcome of the battle of Uḥud-, not with marriage. In the case of a suitor asking for a widow's hand before the end of her *ʿidda*, Mālik, Shaybānī and Ibn Ḥanbal mention various phrases the suitor may use. Their treatment of this issue indicates a stock question with stock answers. No real *ikhtilāf* is generated. Nonetheless, Shāfiʿī's systematizing leads him to interpret the verse in detail, and his discussion parallels those found in Qurʾān commentary.

E. South and Southeast Asia I. (2:00 p.m.–5:15 p.m.) Cook Room

1. Linguistics. STEPHANIE W. JAMISON, University of California Los Angeles, Chair

20. SIGNE COHEN, University of Missouri

Regional Variations in the Indus Script

In this paper I will demonstrate that there are clearly discernible regional differences in the still undeciphered Indus script. I will show that certain signs and sign sequences are characteristic of Harappa, and others of Mohenjo Daro. The signs and sign sequences common in Harappa are also found throughout the larger Indus cultural area, and it is possible to regard the Harappan writing conventions as a standard adopted by numerous smaller towns. Mohenjo Daro, on the other hand, appears to be a center of innovation.

21. HARTMUT SCHARFE, University of California Los Angeles

kāraka in Pāṇini's Grammar

It is argued, against the traditional interpretation, that *kāraka* is not a technical term in Pāṇini's grammar and that the concept of "the six *kāraka*-s" is a recent development. In Pāṇini's grammar the *kāraka*-s, were many, grouped in several categories. Besides the six usually mentioned, a seventh, called "remainder," was recognized in early texts.

22. MASATO KOBAYASHI, Hakuoh University

Pāṇini and Irregular Retroflexion in Vedic Saṃhitās

Deshpande (1979) brought to our attention that retroflexion, particularly that of /n/, might not have been an established phonological alternation in the original text of the Ṛgveda. Furthermore, the Ṛgveda and the other Vedic Saṃhitās show slight but significant discrepancies on retroflexion, which might reflect parallel phonological systems that once existed. In this paper, I will first review Pāṇini's retroflexion rules in Aṣṭādhyāyī 8.3 and 8.4. Then I will compare his description with the exceptional cases of non-lexical retroflexion in Vedic Saṃhitās, taking the retroflexion rules of the Prātiśākhya into consideration. To take an example, Pāṇini tacitly assumes in his sūtra 8.4.2 that /l/ blocks the spreading of retroflexion from /r/ or /s/ to /n/, and among the Prātiśākhya, the Atharva- and the Vājasaneyi-Prātiśākhya explicitly mention /l/ as doing so. Actual examples of blocking by /l/ are found only in the Atharvaveda, for example *pralāyanam* 'bed,' suggesting that Panini was familiar with these forms.

In this way, this paper will discuss the question as to which specific cases of irregular retroflexion or failure thereof Pāṇini presumably had in mind when he composed his sutras on retroflexion. Finally, I will propose a phonological explanation on how to interpret the difference in the spreading of retroflexion among Vedic Saṃhitās.

Deshpande, Madhav M. "Genesis of Rgvedic retroflexion: A historical and sociolinguistic investigation," *Aryan and Non-Aryan in India*, Ann Arbor 1979, 235–315.

23. ASHOK AKLUJKAR, University of British Columbia

When Do *lakṣaṇaika-cakṣuṣka* and *lakṣyaika-cakṣuṣka* Apply? (Part 2)

In the first part of the present essay, about to be published in the joint issue of volumes 62–63 of the *Bulletin of the Deccan College Research Institute*, I have pointed out why a diachronic or historical explanation of the terms *lakṣaṇaika-cakṣuṣka* and *lakṣyaika-cakṣuṣka* (L1 and L2, respectively) given by Professor S. D. Joshi and followed by Professors Madhav M. Deshpande and Paul Kiparsky, among possibly others, is not tenable. The terms L1 and L2 were current in the tradition of the later Pāṇinīyas. Until recently, they were almost exclusively associated with Nāgeśa or Nāgoji-bhaṭṭa, who lived in the early eighteenth century. Without making an explicit reference to these terms but possibly basing himself on them, the late Paul Thieme credited Nāgeśa with the insight that Patañjali (not later than the second century B.C.) must historically have been the last great Pāṇinīya who could serve as an authority on what the nature of real or living Sanskrit was. Probably inspired by Thieme's view, Joshi interpreted L2 as applying to Patañjali and the Pāṇinīyas preceding him. He took the term as meaning 'those grammarians of Sanskrit who do not have to depend on grammars (*lakṣaṇa*) to determine if a particular usage (*lakṣya*) is acceptable—who were witnesses to the living phase of Sanskrit as a language and hence could decide the acceptability of a particular expression by comparing it with how people actually spoke' (my words, not Joshi's). Conversely, the L1s or *lakṣaṇaika-cakṣuṣka* grammarians in Joshi's interpretation are those Pāṇinīyas who lived after Patañjali and who must decide usage acceptability only by following the rules of grammarians, notably Pāṇini. In my article specified above, I have argued that L1 and L2 do not presuppose a historical division of phases of Sanskrit or of the Pāṇinīyas in terms of those who lived in the age of living Sanskrit and those who did not. Instead, I

have suggested that the terms stand, respectively, (a) for those who checked Pāṇini's grammar for possible over-application and (b) for those who tested the same grammar for adequacy and that the persons covered by the two terms were not historically different individuals but two personæ found among the Aṣṭādhyāyī interpreters.

Recently, Deshpande has added several occurrences of L1 and L2 to the five I had used as a part of my argument against Joshi and made a case for retaining the terms' earlier interpretation. Only a person as widely read in primary sources as Deshpande can unearth new evidence in this way. His evidence is valuable in more than one way. Yet, as I will demonstrate in my communication, it does not compel us to set aside the interpretation I put forward. When looked at closely, it in fact supports the anhistoric reading I proposed of L1 and L2.

24. PETER SCHARF, Brown University

The Articulation of *anusvāra* and *visarga*

A great deal of confusion concerning the articulation of *anusvāra* and *visarga* appears in general Sanskrit reference works and even in recent phonological articles. The distinction between the *anusvāra* and nasalized vowels, semivowels, and stops is usually obscured. Bhaskararao and Mathur (1991), for example, explicitly identify it with the velar nasal stop. The confusion concerning the articulation of *anusvāra* and *visarga* is due to genuine difficulty in characterizing their nature. Ancient Indian phonological treatises (Prātiśākhya and Śikṣā) themselves differ in their descriptions and categorizations. Recent work in the analysis of articulatory features, most notably by Halle (1995, 2000) suggests ways of circumscribing the ambiguity concerning the articulation of these sounds and of understanding the variant descriptions of ancient treatises. Conclusions are drawn based upon the features and distinctions about which ancient treatises agree. Debuccalization of stops and spirants eliminates their buccal place features and designated articulators allowing secondary articulators to become prominent. The genuine difficulty in characterizing extrabuccal features accounts for the difficulties of ancient and modern phonologists in describing these sounds. Attention given to different secondary features accounts for the differences in characterization.

2. Lokas and Locations: The Transformative Power of Travel to Sacred Worlds. TAMARA S. J. LANAGHAN, Harvard University, Chair

This panel addresses what it means to cross borders in the South Asian religious worldview. Through an examination of different religious literary genres, each panelist addresses the nature of the worlds that are being traversed and the experience travelers have in those world. This results in three different paradigms through which the larger question of mythic border crossing might be considered: 1) the traveler is transformed in the foreign world, 2) the destination world is transformed through contact with the traveler, and 3) there is no need for transformation because the worlds are at some level the same. This has important implications for our understanding of the nature of the different types of worlds in the South Asian religious imagination and how people who traverse them are transformed.

25. NEELIMA SHUKLA BHATT, Wellesley College

Transportation and Transformation in the Hagiography of Narasinha Mehtā

The ability to span a wide variety of spaces—earthly, celestial, and virtual (dreams)—symbolizing spiritual powers has been a recurrent motif in Indic religious literature since the antiquity. This ability is inherently possessed by the celestial beings; but it is acquired by humans usually through intense asceticism or *tapas* that transforms them spiritually. A vernacular narrative about a fifteenth century devotee-poet of Gujarat, Narasinha Mehtā, incorporates the motif of crossing realms with an interesting shift in meaning. The story extols devotion or *bhakti* rather than asceticism as spiritual practice. Closely examining this narrative, the present paper will argue that with skillful reinterpretation, the motif of spanning realms is used effectively by Hindu devotional narratives of medieval north India to uphold *bhakti* as the highest religious path. This provides an example of non-discursive debates common among competing religious ideologies in South Asia.

26. KRISTIN SCHEIBLE, Bard College

Relocating the Light of the Dhamma in the Pāli *Mahāvamsa*

In the opening chapter of the Pāli *Mahāvamsa*, narrative accounts of the Buddha's three visits to the island of Lankā thrust the island into the very biography of the Buddha himself. All three visits indicate the island's perceived transformation from an outlying border region inhabited by unworthy agents (*yakkhas* and *nāgas*) to a focal and latent repository for the *dhamma* under the care and supervision of *nāgas*. In this paper, I will consider the depiction of the island in the first chapter as Nāgadīpa and Lankā. As Steven Collins explores in a provocative footnote, the popular translation of the term *dhammadīpa* as “island of *dhamma*” does not in fact reflect the light (*dīpa*) of the *dhamma* that is grammatically suggested in the text, but instead anachronistic, nationalistic overtones (Collins 1998). My contribution, following reading methods outlined by Jonathan Walters (2000), is to read the opening chapter as an explicitly rendered “wish” of the *Mahāvamsa* not to be simply incorporated into the Buddhist world, but to become the very center of it, transformed and sanctified by the authoritative visits of the Buddha.

27. TAMARA S. J. LANAGHAN, Harvard University

Finding Kashi in Kolhapur: Mirroring a North Indian Sacred City in South India

When we think of crossing borders, we generally assume that the traveler passes from a world he knows intimately into a world that is completely foreign. What happens, however, when he finds the same world? This is what the famous sage Agastya experiences when he travels to the city of Kolhapur in the southernmost district in the state of Maharashtra. Having left behind northern Kashi on the banks of the Ganga River, he finds Dakshina Kashi on the banks of the Pancaganga River. Utilizing the metaphor of the mirror as developed in A. K. Ramanuja's influential study of the intertextuality of the Indian literary traditions, this paper considers the phenomenological and ontological bases for the perceived identity between the two seemingly different Indian cities. Reading Kolhapur through the lens of Kashi leads to a theological understanding that binds together the land of India across its physical and cultural divides.

28. TIMOTHY DOBE, Harvard Divinity School
Respondent

A. Ancient Near East II: Sumerian Archæology, Art History, and Language. STEVE TINNEY, University of Pennsylvania, Chair (9:30 a.m.–12:30 p.m.)
Ballroom AB

29. SARAH J. SCOTT, University of Pennsylvania

Sign, Symbol, and Figure in Early Dynastic I Mesopotamia

The tradition of image making in early Mesopotamia is inextricably linked to that of writing. Proto-cuneiform, a system consisting of pictographic images, conveyed information through a representational picture of an object or idea, rather than through a sign for the spoken word. In conjunction with the inscribed linear pictograms of proto-cuneiform, seal-impressed (glyptic) three-dimensional figural imagery was used as an information-carrying technology. Glyptic imagery too, underwent extensive evolution, bringing significant changes in artistic perception to bear on the lives of third millennium Mesopotamians. Scholars have considered the problem of how glyptic imagery is related to the world's first writing system, proto-cuneiform, but have yet to come up with a fully-articulated solution. Unfortunately, the problem has rarely been approached from an interdisciplinary standpoint.

Through art historical, semiotic, and linguistic analyses, a unique corpus of Early Dynastic I glyptic material from the site of Ur, containing a *mixture* of words (proto-cuneiform signs) and images, has been examined.¹ This corpus represents one slice through a long trajectory in which word and image were used together during proto- and early literate Mesopotamia. The Early Dynastic I material from the Ur SIS is a unique collection of seal-impressed material; the impressions contain a mixture of proto-cuneiform signs and figural imagery. No scholar has yet examined this material from both a semiotic/linguistic and art historical standpoint, and no scholar has included the proto-cuneiform and figural impressions together in one study. Based on my dissertation research, this paper will address how proto-cuneiform signs were used in conjunction with glyptic imagery in the Ur administration during the Early Dynastic I period, and suggest that the figural imagery was in fact created and constructed to be used with the writing system.

30. JON TAYLOR, University of Birmingham, England

The Cuneiform Digital Palæography Project

This presentation will discuss progress to date and work currently underway at the Cuneiform Digital Palæography (CDP) Project, a joint research project between an inter-disciplinary team at the University of Birmingham, England, and the British Museum.

Assyriology is blessed with a rich supply of source material, witnessing continuous evolution of the cuneiform script, with numerous regional variations and much

¹ Excavated in the 1930's by the University of Pennsylvania Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology and the British Museum, this group of objects is known as the Seal Impressions Strata (SIS), the matrix into which the graves of the famous Royal Cemetery of Ur were interred. The material under discussion dates to the Early Dynastic I period, approximately 2900–2700 BCE.

mutation into local variants of the standard forms. This state of affairs means that palæography for cuneiform is not only feasible but potentially a subject of enormous value, as highlighted by studies by various scholars on specific parts of the cuneiform repertoire. Unfortunately, the existing tools for the palæography of Sumerian and Akkadian cuneiform are based on a limited and effectively outmoded corpus of hand-drawn sign forms compiled seventy-five years ago (Ch. Fossey, *Manuel d'Assyriologie* (Paris 1926)), which could obviously take no account of the very great deal of information that has come to light since then.

Cuneiform palæography is still very much in its infancy. Progress in this field to date has been restricted by the very magnitude of the data, by the limited availability of the source material in suitable format (hand copies of other hand copies of sources are inadequate), and by technological constraints. However, recent advances in technology and the active support and co-operation of curators across the world mean that the crucial task of assembling a cuneiform palæography is now feasible.

The cornerstone of the CDP Project is the construction of an online database populated with digital images of individual cuneiform signs taken directly from the original sources; wherever possible, only those sources that are capable of being dated to the reign of a particular king and at least broadly provenanced will be used.

31. NIEK VELDHUIS, University of California, Berkeley

The Digital Corpus of Cuneiform Lexical Texts

Lexical texts are of fundamental importance for the reconstruction of Sumerian vocabulary and for the history of education and scholarship in ancient Mesopotamia. The Digital Corpus of Cuneiform Lexical Texts (DCCLT) aims at the digital publication of all lexical material. DCCLT integrates composite texts, transliterations of individual tablets, and images of these tablets. Introductions to the various lexical compositions and traditions will open this field of inquiry to a more general public.

DCCLT is closely associated with the Electronic Pennsylvania Sumerian Dictionary (ePSD) and with the Cuneiform Digital Library Initiative (CDLI), using a common set of conventions for transliteration and file formatting.

The paper will discuss and demonstrate the main principles behind the organization of DCCLT.

<http://cuneiform.ucla.edu/dcclt>

32. CALE JOHNSON, University of California, Los Angeles

The Definiteness Effect in the Semitic Construct State, Relativization in Akkadian, and the Sumerian Comparanda

Recent work in linguistics has argued for a fundamental opposition between Externally Headed Relative Clauses [EHRC] such as the relative clause in English and Internally Headed Relative Clauses [IHRC], which in recent years have been investigated most thoroughly in Korean and Japanese. In previous work (Johnson 2004), I have argued that Sumerian forms IHRCs through the use of the *bi- conjugational prefix and that there are close parallels between Sumerian IHRCs and construct state genitives and relative clauses in Akkadian.

One of the characteristic features of IHRCs is that the head of a IHRC exhibits what is known as a “definiteness effect,” a morphosyntactic restriction that prevents

the head of a IHRC from being definite. Such a definiteness effect can also be said to characterize the head noun of construct state genitives in Akkadian and Semitic languages in general in that definiteness is regularly neutralized in the construct state. This raises the possibility that, in spite of conventional interpretations of the relative clause in Akkadian as a EHRC (Deutscher 2002), it may in fact be interpreted in at least some stages of its history as a IHRC.

This paper therefore investigates the diagnostic value of the definiteness effect in identifying IHRCs in Akkadian and compares these findings to the situation in Sumerian, where IHRCs seem to be manifest. Given the Sumerian comparanda, if it can be shown that IHRCs exist in Akkadian, it immediately raises the question of whether this is a case of genetic inheritance or Mesopotamian areal influence and the balance of the paper attempts to elucidate the matter through a brief comparison with similar constructions in Middle Egyptian.

Deutscher, Guy. 2002. "The Akkadian Relative Clause in Cross-Linguistic Perspective." *ZA* 92:86–105.

Johnson, Justin Cale. 2004. "In the Eye of the Beholder: Quantificational, pragmatic and aspectual features of the *bi- verbal prefix in Sumerian." PhD dissertation, UCLA.

33. GONZALO RUBIO, Pennsylvania State University

Reading Sumerian Names, or How to Split Hairs on a Bald Head

In Assyriological scholarship, several ubiquitous Sumerian names know at least two competing transcriptions: Gilgameš vs. Bilgameš; Baba vs. Ba'u; Nidaba vs. Nisaba, etc. This paper will attempt to reassess the philological, epigraphic, and linguistic variables involved in these seemingly alternative readings. Special attention will be given to the nature of the Sumerian logo-syllabic writing interface.

34. FUMI KARAHASHI, University of Pennsylvania

Relative Clauses in Sumerian: An Experimental Syntactic Analysis

How can we design a morpho-syntactic annotation of Sumerian relative clauses? This is one of major difficulties I have faced while creating an annotation scheme for the Penn Parsed Corpus of Sumerian.

First of all, which subordinate constructions should be labeled Relative Clauses? Second, where relativization takes place, is it preferable, or indeed necessary to indicate which is the missing/deleted argument? If so, how should this be done? Third, are nouns such as *lu*₂ "man" and *nig*₂ "thing" used as relative pronouns? Or are they simply head nouns?

Addressing these questions, this paper aims to give a clear and simple syntactic analysis of the sub-category of Sumerian relative clauses with a finite (as opposed to a non-finite) verb form.

B. East Asia I: Chinese History and Religion. RICHARD VANNESS SIMMONS,
Rutgers University, Chair (9:30 a.m.–11:30 a.m.) *Flower Room*

35. DAVID W. PANKENIER, Lehigh University

Acknowledging the Other: An Astrological Paradigm Shift in Early Imperial China

In an earlier paper devoted to the characteristics of Field Allocation (*fenye*) astrology in ancient China, I described the origins and development of the system of astral-terrestrial correspondences that took shape during the first millennium BCE in China. One of the noteworthy features of the system is its unabashedly sinocentric conception and application. The Chinese world constituted the known universe and no accommodation was made in the scheme for non-Chinese. By the former Han dynasty (206 BCE–AD 8), however, some concession had to be made to political reality. Leaving no room for prognostication concerning non-Chinese peoples was an anachronistic bias that astrology could no longer afford if it was to have a claim to relevance in the imperial period. The present paper describes an innovative revision to the Field Allocation scheme that first appeared in Sima Qian’s “Treatise on Astrology” in his comprehensive history *The Grand Scribe’s Records* (ca. 100 BCE). By creative application of then prevailing *yin-yang* cosmology to the older astral-terrestrial paradigm, this latest stage in the development of planetary astrology attempted to adapt the former preoccupation with a multivalent Chinese world to the circumstances of the early empire, with its bipolar “us versus them” perspective on contemporary power relations. In addition to describing the effort to decant the ancient scheme into a new conceptual bottle, the paper offers a concrete illustration of its application by Emperor Xuan (r. 74–49 BCE) to border affairs.

36. JIA JINHUA, City University of Hong Kong

Examination of the Hongzhou-School Literature of Chinese Chan Buddhism
[Paper Withdrawn]

37. IAN CHAPMAN, Princeton University

The Birthday as Festival in Six Dynasties to Tang China

A glance at almost any post-Tang Chinese festival calendar reveals a preponderance of occasions celebrating the birthdays of gods, whether Buddhist, Daoist or otherwise. By no means fixtures of Chinese ritual life since time immemorial, festivals of this type first became widely celebrated during the Six Dynasties, as part of a major reshaping of festival life which took place during this period. While certain individual festivals of this type have been the subject of previous studies, this paper attempts a more general examination of the birthday as a category of Chinese festival.

I will begin by discussing early influential examples such as the birthdays of Sakyamuni and Laozi. Sakyamuni’s birthday is described in Six Dynasties texts as an important occasion for temple rites such as the ablution of Buddha images, and festive processions of images throughout cities. The dates of its celebration (in its two variants) are also cited frequently in Daoist scriptural sources as propitious days for ritual activity, sometimes alongside accounts of Sakyamuni’s enlightenment by Laozi. Perhaps in imitation of the occasion, Daoists also initiated commemorative birthday celebrations for the putative founder of their creed.

The second section of the paper discusses the model's adaptation in the Northern Dynasties and especially Tang to political ends in the form of festivals celebrating the birthdays of emperors. The deity birthday, a periodic public celebration of the historical individual turned deity, provided a lexicon for the promotion of dynastic interests, through the declaration of festival days in honor of emperors' birthdays. Banquets and entertainments were organized, and Buddhist and Daoist monasteries ordered to perform salvatory rites.

The paper concludes with more general reflections on the birthday festival as a form of historical commemoration and religious devotion, and the significance attached to the event of birth, making reference to anthropological models of time, calendars and ritual.

C. Islamic Near East III: Law. EVERETT K. ROWSON, New York University, Chair (9:30 a.m.–10:30 a.m.) *Ballroom D*

38. JOSEPH E. LOWRY, University of Pennsylvania

The First Islamic Legal Theory: Reconsidering Ibn al-Muqaffa's Ideas on Interpretation and Authority

Ibn al-Muqaffa' (d. 757) is remembered by historians of Islamic legal thought for his proposal, ultimately unsuccessful, that "the caliph review the different [legal] doctrines, codify and enact his own decisions in the interest of uniformity, and make this code binding on the *qāḍīs*" (Schacht, *Introduction*, 55). Ibn al-Muqaffa's proposal to make the caliph the ultimate authority in regard to legal interpretation, outlined in his *Risāla fī al-ṣaḥāba*, is certainly noteworthy, since it was manifestly not the route taken by Islamic law, or at least not by Sunni Muslims. But does his proposal follow logically from his explanation of how Islamic law ought to work? This question has not been asked in the several discussions of the *Risāla fī al-ṣaḥāba* (by Arjomand, Coulson, Crone and Hinds, Gabrieli, Goitein, J. D. Latham, and Schacht); I ask it in this paper.

As a reformer, Ibn al-Muqaffa' was obliged to explain the functioning of Islamic law, in order to demonstrate what was amiss, and also to show how the system ought ideally to operate. This makes his the earliest theoretical account of Islamic law generally, and of Islamic legal interpretation in particular. In this paper I will argue that Ibn al-Muqaffa's description of the divinely revealed law of Islam—description remarkable for its coherence and consistency—assumes the integral role, even under ideal conditions, of human interpretation in the elaboration of the law. This fundamental assumption stands in a marked and uneasy tension with his ideas about caliphal authority. That he was not able—even in his construction of a theory ostensibly aimed at enhancing caliphal authority—to imagine away the unusually individualistic character of Islamic legal interpretation shows how entrenched such individualism had become even at this early date. It is not merely a feature of the legal landscape that "he simply took for granted" (Crone and Hinds, *God's Caliph*, 86), but a basic premise of his theoretical account of Islamic law.

39. JONATHAN E. BROCKOPP, Pennsylvania State University

Early Islamic Law: a New Text

In his sixth section of his *Fihrist*, Ibn al-Nadīm mentions the works of ‘Abd Allāh b. ‘Abd al-Ḥakam (d. 214/829), including a commentary on Ibn ‘Abd al-Ḥakam’s *Major Compendium of Law* by Abū Bakr b. al-Jahm (d. 329/941), and then commentaries on both this text and a *Minor Compendium* by Abū Bakr al-Abharī (d. 375/985). Sezgin tells us that the *Minor Compendium* is lost, but recently, I found fragments of Ibn ‘Abd al-Ḥakam’s *Minor Compendium* in the ancient mosque-library of Kairouan, Tunisia. And in 1999, Şükrü Özen identified another manuscript in Istanbul containing the text of the *Minor Compendium*.

For several reasons, this text deserves our attention. First, it may have been composed as early as the late eighth century. If so, then it represents the earliest extant example of an Islamic legal handbook. Further, it is written in a style rarely found in legal texts of this period, with no dissent and very little reference to authoritative sources. Instead, it neatly summarizes the basic tenets of the law in a compact form. Finally, the combination of Ibn ‘Abd al-Ḥakam’s *Minor* and *Major Compendia* constitutes one of the few examples we have of multiple texts by a single author in this period. In this paper, I will argue that the discovery of this text requires us to reconsider several presumptions about Islamic intellectual history, particularly regarding the question of authority in religious texts. In my reading, the *Minor Compendium* seems to be a part of the nascent Mālikī tradition, yet its style is far removed from the discursive, almost Talmudic organization of the *Muwaṭṭaʿ* and other early legal texts.

40. CHRISTOPHER MELCHERT, University of Oxford

The *Muṣannaf* of Ibn Abī Shaybah

Ibn Abī Shaybah (d. 235/849) was a major Kufan hadith collector. He was hugely popular, supposedly attracting 30,000 to lectures in Baghdad. He was among the traditionists paid by al-Mutawakkil to preach against *kalām* (and in favor of the ‘Abbasids) in 234/848–9. He was regarded with some suspicion in Ḥanbali circles but features prominently in all the Six Books.

Two major hadith collections of his survive, the *Muṣannaf* and the *Musnad*. The latter comprises about 1,000 hadith reports, all going back to the Prophet, about half occurring also in the *Muṣannaf*. That is a much larger collection, comprising about 32,300 hadith reports (cf. 27,600 in Ahmad’s *Musnad*, 21,000 in ‘Abd al-Razzâq’s *Muṣannaf*), of which about 19% go back to the Prophet, 35% to Companions, and 47% to Followers (practically none to later authorities). Two-thirds of the *Muṣannaf* is Kufan at the level of Ibn Abī Shaybah’s shaykh, while 42% is Kufan at the Follower level. It seems to be, then, our best single source for the Kufan legal tradition.

Together with the *Muṣannaf* of ‘Abd al-Razzâq, the *Muṣannaf* of Ibn Abī Shaybah confirms Schacht’s thesis that hadith from later authorities than the Prophet was once predominant. It includes a long appendix exposing the errors of Abū Ḥanīfah, confirming that there was Kufan traditionalism as well as Basran, Baghdadi, &c., and that Kufan jurisprudence does not lead straight into Ḥanafism. It often signals Medinese opposition to the Kufan position; however, if one accepts Schacht’s presumption that Follower hadith is older than Companion hadith and Companion hadith older than Prophet hadith, it appears that the earliest opposition to Kufan positions was

Basran. For example, Kufan Followers advocate raising the hands to the ears, while Basran Followers, Medinese Companions, and the Prophet himself (with Medinese *isnâds*) advocate raising the hands to the chest.

D. Islamic Near East IV: Law. DAVID S. POWERS, Cornell University, Chair (11:00 a.m.–1:30 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

41. KEVIN REINHART, Dartmouth College “The *Sharʿ* of those before us”: The Authority of non-Muslim Scriptures over Muslims, and of Muslim Revelation over non-Muslims

Two points of lively controversy in the literature of *uṣūl al-fiqh* are whether non-Muslims (*kufār*) are obligated by the stipulations of revelation, and whether the obligations (*sharʿ* or *sharāʿi*) of prophetic communities that preceded Islam constitute obligations for Muslims.

The discussion was not an immediately practical one, since there is no evidence that anyone proposed to make non-Muslims fast Ramadan, for instance; nor were legists inclined to search the Torah and the Gospels for religious data. Rather, along with other hypotheticals, this problem was a way for Muslims to think about the relation of their Revelation to others and about what obliged them to act according to the Islamic *sharʿ*.

There is little scholarship on this topic of which I am aware. In this paper I work through the *uṣūl* sources of the four Sunnī *madhhabs* and lay out the various positions of these questions going back at least to Muḥammad al-Shaybānī (d. 804 c.e.) and suggest both practical and, more importantly, theological and sociological reasons for this topic and for the various positions held by scholars as late as al-Izmīrī (d. 1690). Further, I will discuss why this question is associated in the literature particularly with the Ḥanafī *madhhab*.

42. MARK WAGNER, New York University

Pious Fraud or Pragmatic Integration? The Case of the Kuḥlānī Synagogue in Ṣanʿāʾ (1933–1936)

In theory, if a non-Muslim brought a case to a Muslim judge, the judge would decide the case according to Islamic law. The work of Mark Cohen and Gideon Libson on the Cairo Genizah and the Geonic responsa literature, respectively, points to the smooth interaction between Muslim and Jewish legal systems in the premodern Islamic world. In practice, Jewish appeals to Muslim courts raised difficult questions about the independence of Muslim and non-Muslim legal systems, as well as the ontological status of non-Muslim law. Using Zaydī sources, namely *fatāwā* from the early twentieth century, I will outline the varied and conflicting solutions that Muslim jurists in Yemen devised to respond to this problem.

In 1935, Jews in Ṣanʿāʾ, then embroiled in a dispute over the leadership of the Kuḥlānī Synagogue, brought the case to the Zaydī Imām, Yaḥyā b. Muḥammad Ḥamīd al-Dīn. The Imām was forced to choose between intervening on a substantive issue of Jewish law regarding synagogues or ruling that synagogues were pious endowments (*awqāf*), an impossibility in Islamic law. A Jewish advisor of the Imām’s suggested the adoption of a legal fiction that might solve the problem. The ensuing acrimony between Muslim jurists over this legal fiction brought into sharp focus the divisions between them regarding the status of Jewish law and its relationship to Islamic law.

I will outline three solutions to the problem of Jews in Muslim courts that can be discerned in the Muslim legal documents: a pragmatic position that avoids becoming embroiled in substantive issues of Jewish law while seeking to preserve the existing social structure; a conciliatory position that sees Jewish law as a mirror-image of Islamic law; and a reformist position that views Jewish law, like Islamic law, as being in dire need of renovation.

43. DEVIN STEWART, Emory University

Al-Sayrafi's Manual of Jurisprudence: *Kitāb al-Dalā'il wa'l-ʿĀlām*

Most of the seminal works in *uṣūl al-fiqh* (Islamic jurisprudence, or legal theory and methodology), dating from the ninth and tenth centuries C.E. have been lost. A gap of at least 150 years separates the *Risālah* of Muḥammad b. Idrīs al-Shāfiʿī (d. 204/820), traditionally held to have inaugurated the genre and the next extant work, *al-Fuṣūl* by Abū Bakr al-Jassās (d. 370/980). The present paper is part of a larger project that attempts to retrieve information about some of the outstanding works in the genre from the intervening period. Drawing primarily on a fourteenth century work *al-Baḥr al-muḥīṭ* by Badr al-Dīn al-Zarkashī, I undertake a partial reconstruction of an early tenth-century work of legal theory *Kitāb al-dalā'il wa'l-ʿĀlām ʿalā uṣūl al-aḥkām* by the well-known Shāfiʿī jurist Abū Bakr al-Sayrafi (d. 330/942). Al-Zarkashī had a large library of works on legal theory and method (*uṣūl al-fiqh*) at his disposal in his personal library, and this manual of *uṣūl al-fiqh* by al-Sayrafi was one of the earliest he could cite directly (He also had in his library al-Sayrafi's commentary on al-Shāfiʿī's *Risālah*). According to al-Zarkashī, the *Kitāb al-dalā'il wa'l-ʿĀlām* was a single large volume. Because of its rarity and because later authors had garbled and misquoted al-Sayrafi's positions on a number of key questions in legal hermeneutics al-Zarkashī made a point of quoting many passages from the work *in extenso*. This allows us to form a good idea of the scope, organization and content of the original. I construct a provisional outline of the original work discuss problems with the text and attempt to situate the work in the historical development of the *uṣūl al-fiqh* genre, both within the Shāfiʿī tradition of works on the topic, and in general.

44. DAVID S. POWERS, Cornell University

Law and Sufism in the Maghrib in the 8th/14th Century

Some time during the second quarter of the 8th/ 14th century, the jurist Abū al-Faḍl al-ʿUqbānī (d. 854/1450, Tlemcen) received an inquiry about the practices and customs of persons who gathered in the Friday mosque for the performance of *dhikr* or remembrance of God. Both the question and the mufti's response are preserved in Wansharīsī's *Mi'yār*. The questioner describes the ceremony in exquisite detail, with special attention to the etiquette of forming a circle; the practices associated with *dhikr*, including *samāʿ* or audition; the communal meal provided by the shaykh; and the etiquette associated with the conclusion of the ceremony. In his response, al-ʿUqbānī addresses each of the specific issues mentioned by his interlocutor and argues that there is a *sharʿī* basis for all of them, supporting his position with copious references to Qurʾān, *ḥadīth*, and juristic authority. al-ʿUqbānī text is an impressive display of scholarly erudition that opens a window on the mind of the mufti, his art, and his method.

45. HIMMET TASKOMUR, Harvard University

How a Relative Knowledge of *Fiqh* Can Represent Universal Knowledge of the *Sharḥ*: the Madhhabology of Muḥy al-Dīn al-Kāfiyājī (879/1474)

The concept of the *Madhhab* is one of the least understood and examined aspects of Islamic legal history. In recent scholarship on Islamic legal theory, it has been argued that Islamic law was adapting itself to the changing circumstances through the continuous use of *Ijtihād*. I argue that although there had been advocates of *Ijtihād* within the Islamic legal thinking, it is problematic to assume that *Ijtihād* was a dominant paradigm. After the consolidation of schools of law, *Madhhab* was regarded a unified methodological system through which legal questions can be solved. This paper analyses the concept of *Madhhab* as understood and articulated by the Ottoman-Mamluk scholar Muḥy al-Dīn Kāfiyājī who sought to theorize the notion of *Madhhab*. His main question was how a time-bound, debated knowledge (*Ijtihādiyyah*) such as *Fiqh* represents universal and divine knowledge such as the *Sharḥ*. Kāfiyājī initially wrote a small treatise, *al-Farah wa Al-Surūr* on the concept of *Madhhab* and its implications, then wrote a commentary on it explaining further his position on a number of questions he posed. This paper analyses *al-Farah wa Al-Surūr* and its commentary *Nashāt al-ṣudūr fī sharḥ kitāb al-Farah wa al-Surūr* both of which are still in manuscript form and were not a subject of scholarly study.

E. South and Southeast Asia II: The Avesta and the Vedic Tradition. JAMES L. FITZGERALD, University of Tennessee, Chair (9:30 a.m.–12:45 p.m.) *Cook Room*

46. JARROD L. WHITAKER, University of Texas at Austin

Male Identity in Ancient India: *nár*, *vīrá*, and *śúra* in the Ṛgveda

[Paper Withdrawn]

47. STEPHANIE W. JAMISON, University of Claifornia, Los Angeles

Vasiṣṭha and the Poetics of Reference

The hymns dedicated to the god Varuṇa in the Vasiṣṭha Maṇḍala of the Rig Veda (RV VII.86–89) are justly famous for their depiction of an intensely personal relationship between the poet and the god, and as such have been compared more than once to the also apparently intensely personal Old Iranian Gāthās traditionally attributed to Zarathustra. Although the comparison is illuminating in many regards, close attention to the texts shows that the two poets achieved the effect of intimacy by very different means. In particular “Vasiṣṭha’s” virtuosic deployment of a variety of types of personal reference (in pronouns, verbs, and nominal case forms) contrasts strikingly with “Zarathustra’s” relentless pairing of 1st sg. poet / 2nd sg. god, whose rhetorical power derives from its very monotony.

48. STANLEY INSLER, Yale University

Zarathustra’s Genetic System

[No Abstract]

49. SCOTT L. HARVEY, University of Texas at Austin

What's a Mahiṣī like You Doing in a Pāda like This?

Syntactic ambiguity at RVKh V.13.5–6 (= AV Ś XX 128.10–11, ŚŚS XII.21.5–6) has led scholars to interpret the word *mahiṣī* in the first pāda of each stanza broadly as ‘wife’ or ‘consort’ rather than the more precise ‘chief wife of the king’. While later texts demand the general connotation, the narrower meaning is universal in Vedic, and close attention to compositional structure shows no need to depart from this reading here. Not only do the stanzas employ the term in its usual sense, they supply additional information about the *mahiṣī*’s structural role, both semantic and ritual, especially in relation to the *parivr̥ktā*, or ‘rejected wife’, and the *vāvātā*, or ‘favored wife’, with whom she is often paired. In this paper, I shall show that each pairing—*mahiṣī/parivr̥ktā* and *mahiṣī/vāvātā*—functions as a unified concept that is parallel to other concepts in the stanza and the hymn. Further, I shall examine these parallels in relation to the same pairings elsewhere in the Vedic corpus.

50. WALKER TRIMBLE, University of Pennsylvania

Ritual Punctuation in the Manuscripts of the University of Pennsylvania

In the library of the University of Pennsylvania’s superb Indic collection, there are a number of manuscripts of Vedic ritual sūtras. Some of those associated with the school of Āśvalāyana exhibit very unique practices of punctuation and divide individual sūtras in rather unusual ways. As the sūtra-aphorism is the most distinguishing characteristic of the Brahmanical sūtra genre, how sutras are divided is quite important. In the linguistic tradition, for instance, determining the borders of a sūtra is crucial to confining or expanding its domain of application. Here we will examine and try to decipher the function of this particular style of rule formation in the context of the genre as a whole and will expose members of the Society to the riches of this library’s collection in its natural habitat.

51. RICHARD SALOMON, University of Washington

The Indo-Greek Era of 186/5 B.C.

It has long been known that certain inscriptions from the northwestern area of the Indian subcontinent were dated in an era which must have begun sometime in or around the second century B.C., but the historical origin and the chronological value of this era have remained unknown until now. Many theories about its date and founder have been proposed, including several which attributed it to one or the other of the Indo-Greek kings, such as Menander or Eucratides. A newly discovered Buddhist reliquary inscription in Kharoṣṭhī script now provides the first direct evidence for the origin of this era. This inscription bears a triple date: (1) the regnal year 27 of the Apraca king Vijayamitra; (2) the year 73 of the era of Azes (*ayasa vaṣaye*); (3) and the year 201 of the “year of the Greeks” (*yoṇaṇa vaṣaye*). Since the era of Azes is now generally agreed to be the same as the still-current Vikrama era beginning in 58/7 B.C., the new inscription can be dated to 16 A.D., and the epoch of the “year of the Greeks” fixed as 186/5 B.C.

It is probably not coincidental that this epoch corresponds closely with the date that has been calculated by various historians on the basis of numismatic evidence and classical historical sources for the initial conquest of India by the Greek kings

of Bactria. Thus it is likely that the “year of the Greeks” was founded by one of these kings, possibly Demetrius, or perhaps rather Pantaleon and/or Agathocles, to celebrate this conquest.

The discovery of a firm chronological value for the Indo-Greek era permits a reevaluation of the other inscriptions dated in it, with important historical consequences. For example, if the date of the Dasht-e Nāwūr inscription of the time of Wima Takto, namely 279, is attributed to the Indo-Greek era, it would correspond to 94 A.D. This would confirm other recent discoveries and interpretations suggesting a date for Kaṇiṣka in the early second century A.D. and rejecting the identification of the Kaṇiṣka era with the Śaka era of 78/7 A.D.

52. JOËL DUBOIS, California State University, Sacramento

The Ritual Context for Śaṅkara’s *Adhyāsa*

At the previous two years’ meetings I have presented various textual examples that call into question widespread generalizations about Śaṅkara’s preference for describing brahman primarily in abstract, logical terms, suggesting rather that—especially in his *Taittirīyopaniṣad* and *Bṛhadāraṇyakopaniṣad Bhaṣyas*—Śaṅkara’s prose commentary clearly reflects engagement and interest in both ritual practice and aesthetic appreciation of brahman in poetic terms. This year’s paper argues that attention to the way Śaṅkara draws on both ritual and poetic imagery helps elucidate more clearly the concept of superimposition (*adhyāsa*). Several scholars have noted that *adhyāsa* is Śaṅkara’s unique contribution to Vedantic discussions of *avidyā* (absence of insight into brahman), but have stressed its logical features. By examining closely the terminology Śaṅkara uses to describe the details of contemplative worship (*upāsana*), however, I suggest that *adhyāsa* may be most clearly understood as a metaphor based on ritual practice.

In the context of this examination I will also point out that Śaṅkara trademark usage of the *adhyāsa* concept is in fact entirely absent from at least one of his upaniṣad commentaries, strongly suggesting that the latter be placed earlier in the sequence of Śaṅkara’s writings. Finally, I will also consider briefly the more general yet related application of the ritual term *tyāga* to Hindu notions of ascetic practice.

53. BOGDAN DIACONESCU, University of Lausanne

Searching God in the Vedic Sentence: Udayana on Verbal Affix and Sentence Cognition

In the brahminical debate on the status of the Vedic texts, Mīmāṃsā and Nyāya hold contrary positions: for the first school, the Veda is eternal and without an author, for the latter it is not eternal and it does have an author. Udayana (ca. 975–1050) gives in his *Nyāyakusumāñjali* the definitive proofs for God’s existence. Given that in the Nyāya epistemology, verbal testimony (including the Veda) implies an author, Udayana seeks to establish that the author of the Veda can only be Īśvara, thereby addressing Mīmāṃsā arguments on scriptural injunction. In his view, the injunctive verbal affixes denote the command of a superior being and his argumentation explores the possible answers as to where injunction inheres: it is neither in the agent, nor in the action, nor in the instrument, but in the person who enjoins. Applied to the Veda, this principle leads him to conclude that the Vedic injunctions are the expression of the will of Īśvara.

However, Udayana does not treat only the injunctive affixes, but in the course of the debate he lays the foundation for the Nyāya theory of verbal cognition. While accepting the Mīmāṃsā principle that the cognition of a sentence is organised around a principal qualificand, his concern is to establish which element is to be taken as principal. For the Mīmāṃsakas it is the meaning of the verbal affix (i.e., *bhāvanā* ‘bringing into being’), established as an “efficient force” pertaining to Vedic injunction. In utter opposition to this, Udayana claims that all the verbal affixes denote ‘volitional effort’ (*yatna*), which is different both from the meanings assigned by Pāṇini (‘agent’) or Mīmāṃsā. And since the effort expressed by the verbal affix needs a substratum, he maintains that the cognition of a sentence is organised around the nominative word expressing it. The questions raised by this position are taken up in detail by the Navya-Nyāya.

In this paper, I will argue that the Nyāya theory of sentence cognition and principal qualificand, which has so far only been considered from a linguistic point of view, has its roots in a theological debate with Mīmāṃsā. Supported by presuppositions of an ontological and epistemological nature, its validity cannot be judged independently from the system in which it has been formulated.

A. Ancient Near East III: Sumero-Babylonian History, Literature, and Religion. JACK M. SASSON, Vanderbilt University, Chair (1:30 p.m.–4:30 p.m.)
Ballroom AB

54. WILLIAM W. HALLO, Yale University

A Sumerian Apocryphon? The Royal Correspondence of Ur Reconsidered

The notion has recently been advanced that the “Royal Correspondence of Ur” does not go back to original documents of the Third Dynasty, but is rather in whole or in large part the free invention of the scribal schools of the Old Babylonian Period. This notion, based on a variety of viewpoints—linguistic, literary, historical, and prosopographic—will be examined and challenged from all these viewpoints. A strong case can be made for the authenticity of some—though not all—of the letters generally included in the corpus.

55. NICOLE BRISCH, Cornell University

The Divine Kingship of Shu-Sin of Ur

An unpublished Ur III tablet at the Kelsey Museum of Archaeology of the University of Michigan mentions an eresh-dingir priestess of king Shu-Sin of Ur (2037–2029 BCE). The text is remarkable, because it probably dates to the third year of that king’s reign, and it is the first attestation of a priestess for the cult of a living king. Together with other evidence, this may be an indication for changes in the nature of kingship in the Ur III period. This paper will attempt to explore some of these changes within the context of women’s roles in the ideology of the divine king and by additionally considering some cross-cultural comparisons.

56. TONIA SHARLACH, Harvard Divinity School

Women’s Religion at the Ur III Court?

In comparison to the enormous archives of Ur III date from sites such as Lagash or Umma, the archive of Shulgi’s last queen, Shulgi-simti, is tiny. However, its potential

to help elucidate the role of women in the religious milieu of the Ur III court is disproportionate to its size. Shulgi-simti's archive can be divided into two parts; the first half consists of records of income, animals gathered one or two at a time from courtiers, many of them female. The second half consists of records of expenditure, especially animals to be sacrificed to various deities, almost all goddesses. This paper will consider whether such evidence should suggest a separate sphere for women's involvement in the religion of the court.

57. RICHARD E. AVERBECK, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School

The Gods in Sumerian Historiography

Divine direction and intervention in the affairs of people and society is an essential element of the Sumerian historiographic tradition. This tradition, in turn, was formative for later Babylonian and Assyrian historiography. One of the features of the Sumerian texts is that they do not seem to pit the gods of opposing cities against each other in compositions that recount battles between the cities. This paper will articulate and consider the significance and ongoing influence of this and other related features of Sumerian historiography in Mesopotamia and the larger ancient Near East.

58. PIOTR MICHAŁOWSKI, University of Michigan

The Strange History of the History of the Tummal

[No Abstract]

59. FRANCESCA ROCHBERG, University of California, Riverside

Astral Deities in Ancient Mesopotamia

In the wake of early and unsubstantiated claims about "astral religion" in ancient Mesopotamia, the difficult subject of the astral aspect of Mesopotamian religion still awaits a full treatment. The conception of the celestial bodies as visible representations or manifestations of the gods to whom one prayed and made offerings is one aspect of the subject that has been elucidated by E. Reiner in her monograph *Astral Magic in Babylonia*. Evidence both for the notion of divinity in the heavens and of the celestial bodies as divine embodiments outside the magical literature raises further questions for our understanding not only of the Mesopotamian conception of the stars and planets but also of the gods. Associations between specific gods and heavenly bodies are well-known, but the existence of autonomous astral deities seems to be a rather basic question that has not yet been addressed. This paper will consider this limited question in light of selected evidence for such associations between gods and stars.

60. CLAUS WILCKE, Universität Leipzig

Epic, Play or What? Or: How was the 'Epic' of "Enmerkar and Ensuhgirana" Performed?

Performance or presentation of Sumerian narrative poetry, especially epics, was discussed ever since S. N. Kramer published his "Enmerkar and the Lord of Aratta" (1952), the first (almost) complete text of a Sumerian epic: M. Lambert, *Syria* 32 (1955) 212–221; H. Sauren, *OLP* 3 (1972) 35–47; C. Wilcke, *AS* 20 (1976) 284 note 72, also recently in: G. von Wilpert, *Lexikon der Weltliteratur, Fremdsprachige Autoren* (42004) s.v. Enmerkar-Epen, and H. Vanstiphout, *Epics of Sumerian Kings* (2004) 13–14, all leaning more or less to some kind of on stage performance, and by B. Alster,

who in the Perry-Lord tradition put forward the idea of an oral production by a ‘singer of tales’ (Dumuzi’s Dream, 1972). Both, performers of different kinds and singers, are well attested in Sumerian and Akkadian written and pictorial documentation.

The present paper attempts at approaching the problem in differentiating types of narrative poetry, by comparison with other kinds of texts suggesting performance with more than one speaker and by philological and intertextual analysis of “*Enmerkar and Ensuhgirana*”, see: A. Feigenbaum, *Enmerkar and Ensuhgirana*. Philadelphia 1979 (edition), G. Zólyomy, <http://etcsl.orinst.ox.ac.uk/section1/b1824.htm> (bibliography), also: *c1824.htm (composite text), *tr1824.htm (translation); M. P. Streck, *Die Prologe der sumerischen Epen*, in: *Orientalia* 71 (2002) 189-266 (p. 212f. composite text and translation of 11. 1–14); H. Vanstiphout (2004) composite text, annotated translation; see also W. Heimpel, in *JAOS* 101 (1981), Wilcke in E. W. Müller, ed., *Geschlechtsreife und Legitimation zur Zeugung* (Freiburg/München 1985) p. 218f. note 6.

61. ALHENA GADOTTI, The Johns Hopkins University

Gilgameš, Gudam and the Bard in Sumerian Literature

In his recent translation of the Sumerian Gilgameš stories, Douglas Frayne proposes the intriguing hypothesis that the very badly preserved “Tale of Gudam” was in fact a portion of “Gilgameš and the Bull of Heaven”, more precisely a “song about the bull [of Heaven]”, which the minstrel of Gilgameš sings to his king while the latter is banqueting (121). This idea finds its basis in that both these texts make mention of an otherwise unknown character, Lugalgabagal (var. Lugalgabagar), the **nar**. That the bards in “Gilgameš and the Bull of Heaven” and the bard in the “Tale of Gudam” have the same name had already been noted by Antoine Cavigneux and Farouk al-Rawi in their 1993 edition of GBH, although they did not pursue the issue any further.

In this paper, I will investigate the function of the bard according to the Sumerian literary texts in order to determine what role he might have played at the court of Gilgameš, King of Uruk. Evidence from the Administrative texts will be discussed when available, as well as information from later periods.

B. East Asia II: Chinese Literature and Linguistics. PAUL W. KROLL, Chair, University of Colorado, Chair (2:00 p.m.–4:00 p.m.) *Flower Room*

62. KONG XURONG, University of Wisconsin-Madison

The scope of the *wu* in *yongwu fu*

Yongwu fu (rhapsodies on objects) constitute a subgenre of *fu*. Although this subgenre has attracted the attention of scholars, just what qualifies as an object (*wu*) remains controversial. Believes living things and man-made objects, some scholars include meteorological phenomena, topographical features, and buildings, while others do not. How we understand *wu*, therefore, determines how we define the subgenre. In this paper, the views of pre-modern critics regarding the notion of *yongwu* are explored, followed by an examination of the ideas of modern scholars on the subject. The paper then argues that the scope of *wu* in *yongwu fu* should properly be limited to living things (flora and fauna) and man-made objects (excluding architecture).

63. SUJANE WU, Swarthmore College

The Final and Unique Literary Piece of Lu Yun (262–303): The “Rhapsody on the Southern Expedition” (*Nanzheng fu*)

The “Rhapsody on the Southern Expedition” (*Nanzheng fu*) is Lu Yun’s final literary piece before he and his brother Lu Ji (261–303) were executed by Sima Ying (d. 306) in the tenth month of the second year of the Tai’an reign (A.D. 303). This rhapsody is the most controversial among Lu Yun’s eight rhapsodies. This is a piece that Lu Yun wanted to present to Sima Ying to commemorate Ying’s launching of a military expedition to Luoyang to save Emperor Hui (r. 290–306) of the Jin Dynasty. This paper aims to explore Lu Yun’s writing process and his capability of composing a grand rhapsody, a task at which he himself lacked confidence, and to discuss whether the hypothesis that “*Nanzheng fu*” is not a completed piece may be established. I will also discuss if the “*Jiangwu fu*” (Rhapsody on Military Drilling) is indeed a draft of “*Nanzheng fu*” by investigating three of Yun’s letters to Lu Ji, and the text of “*Nanzheng fu*.”

64. RICHARD VANNESS SIMMONS, Rutgers University

The Delights of Dialect Fieldwork: Discoveries Made at a Taixing Memorial to a Hero of the Korean War

The northern townships of Taixing County in Jiangsu have turned the common collapse of the distinction between retroflex and dental sibilants Mandarin on its head. While most people are familiar with the common non-standard accents in Mandarin that pronounce *zhi*, *chi*, and *shi* as *zi*, *ci*, and *si*, dialects in this region do the opposite and pronounce *zi*, *ci*, and *si* as *zhi*, *chi*, and *shi*. The result is a northern twist to a widespread southern dialect trait. For example, the *zi* suffix ends up sounding like the *-er* suffix (*-zhi* often pronounced as *-ri*). This paper presents recordings that document this unusual pronunciation. The recordings were made during interviews that took place in the village of Gensi at the memorial to Yang Gensi, a hero who fought against the Americans in the Korean War, and who probably also spoke this intriguing dialect.

C. Islamic Near East V: Literature. PHILIP F. KENNEDY, New York University, Chair (2:30 p.m.–4:00 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

65. BO HOLMBERG, Lund University

‘Abd Al-Ḥamīd’s *Risāla* on the Purchase of Slave-Girls

Among the many epistles from the hand of the Umayyad secretary ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd there is a short piece of writing on the purchase of a slave girl. To a great extent the epistle consists of a list of physical and mental attributes, not always compatible with one another. In this paper it will be argued that ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd’s *risāla* on the purchase of a slave girl was used in an educational context with the view of teaching new secretaries the art of describing a woman with the appropriate attributes. In addition to this the very terse style of ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd in this *risāla* will be demonstrated.

66. JOCELYN SHARLET, University Of California, Davis

Building Descriptions in the Poetry of al-Sarī al-Raffāʿ

(A) The Arab poet al-Sarī al-Raffāʿ (d. 362 Islamic Era/972–3 Christian Era), who was born in Mawsil and made his career as a poet in Aleppo and Baghdad, is best known for his short description poems (*wasf*). His collection of poetry (*dīwān*) includes a number of poems that depict buildings in vivid detail, including houses, rooms, bath houses, palaces, and mills. (B) This presentation will examine the intersection between building description and the lyric genres of description, invitation, wine, love, panegyric, and invective poetry by al-Sarī al-Raffāʿ. The presentation will explore this poet's development of building description through the animation of inanimate objects; the relationships among perception, pleasure, and representation; the conjunctions among the spheres of nature, material culture, human bodies and emotions, and the cosmos; formal organization or structure; and the implicit representation of space and time.

(C) This project expands on the scholarship on description and related short lyric genres in studies that deal with poetry by other poets and on other themes, such as the studies about the poets Ibn Khafājah by M. M. Al-Nowaihi (1992), Kushājim by A. Giese (1981), and Abū Nuwās by Ewald Wagner (1965); studies of the themes of wine by P. Kennedy (1997), love by T. Bauer (1998), and nature by G. Schoeler (1974); and related articles on short lyric poetry by J. C. Buerger, A. Schippers, R. Jacobi, J. Meisami, and others. Scholarship on the links between poetry and the built environment by A. Schimmel (2000) and M. J. Rubiera Mata (1988) provides a context for this analysis of building descriptions. (D) This research will demonstrate how al-Sarī al-Raffāʿ uses building description in diverse genres, and how he uses building description to explore the potential of description poetry to articulate a range of ideas about human experience.

67. WOLFHART P. HEINRICHS, Harvard University

Ṣafī al-Dīn al-Ḥillī's Auto-Anthology

Ṣafī al-Dīn al-Ḥillī (d. ca. 749/1348) was the most prominent Arabic poet of his age. His *Dīwān* has been published six times, as far as I know, but even the latest edition by Muḥammad Ḥuwwar (3 parts, Beirut & Amman 2000) leaves a lot to be desired (for one thing he suppressed the chapter on *al-iḥmād* because the obscene parts offended his sensitivities). After the edition of his *Dīwān*, al-Ḥillī also published his own anthology, *Dīwān al-Mathālith wa-'l-mathānī fī 'l-ma'ālī wa-'l-ma'ānī* (ed. Muḥammad Ṭāhir al-Ḥimṣī, Damascus 1419/1998, again with suppression of the obscene chapter!). As the title indicates, the selected items are two or three lines long. Most of them are culled from the *Dīwān* without any change, which means that al-Ḥillī has an unusually large amount of short poems in his *Dīwān* (*inter alia* of the gnomic and of “poetic snapshot” variety). A fair number of snippets cannot be found in the *Dīwān*. The most interesting cases, however, are those, in which the poet had to shorten the *Dīwān* version, usually by one or two lines, in rare cases also in a more drastic way. A close study of the choices he made in these cases may give us access to his poetic “workshop,” and a selection of them will be presented in the paper.

D. Islamic Near East VI: Religion and Thought. WOLFHART P. HEINRICHS,
Harvard University, Chair (4:00 p.m.–5:30p.m.) Ballroom D

68. RACHA EL OMARI, Yale University

Abū 'l-Qāsim al-Balḥī/al-Ka'bī's Doctrine on Human Knowledge

Abū'l-Qāsim al-Balḥī/al-Ka'bī (d. 319/931) was the last major theologian of the Baḡdādī Mu'tazilī school. He studied theology (*ilm al-kalām*) under al-Ḥaiyāt (d. c. 300/912), and was at the head of a school ascribed to his name (Balḥīya/ Ka'bīya) in heresiographical and biographical sources. Along with his counterpart in the Baḡran school, Abū 'Alī aḡ-Ġubbā'ī (d. 303/915–6), he ushered the last phase in the development of Mu'tazilism that came to be described by modern scholarship as the "classical" period (Josef van Ess 1991–1997). Unlike aḡ-Ġubbā'ī, however, al-Ka'bī's theological doctrines received less attention by scholars (van Ess 1985). This is due, in part, to the loss of most of his works in general and all of his theological works in particular. This paper will focus on one aspect of al-Ka'bī's theology, his theory of human knowledge, where he stood equally apart from his two contemporaries aḡ-Ġubbā'ī and Abū'l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī (d. 324/935–6). His doctrine can be reconstructed from quotes in the works of contemporary and later theologians who disagreed with him and argued against his position. These quotes can only be justly used if the agenda of their authors are recognized, especially that we rarely find the same quote from al-Ka'bī equally or identically repeated in them. These sources belong to four theological traditions: The Aš'arī tradition in the work of al-Aš'arī himself and 'Abd al-Qāhir al-Baḡdādī (d. 429/1037), the Mātūrīdī tradition in the work of Abū'l-Mu'in an-Nasafī (d. 508/1114), the Twelver Šī'ī tradition in the work of aš-Šaiḡ al-Mufīd (d. 413/1032), and finally and most importantly the Baḡran Mu'tazilī tradition as represented in the work of Abū Rašīd an-Nīsābūrī (d. 460/1068).

69. MAURICE A. POMERANTZ, University Of Chicago

Khilāfah and *Mulk*: Political Thought in the Epistles of al-Šāhib Ismā'īl ibn 'Abbād

As vizier of the eastern half of the Buyid dynasty from 366/976 to 385/995, al-Šāhib Ismā'īl ibn 'Abbād (d. 385/995) was a dominant presence in the political life of Iran during the latter third of the fourth/tenth century. While there have been several studies of the vizier's life from the standpoint of literary history, there has been no work to date which incorporates the more than 200 hundred extant epistles authored by Ibn 'Abbaād. This *corpus* of documents, preserved in a sixth/twelfth century manuscript, represents not only an important source for the political history of the Buyid period but also provides a rich source of information concerning the practice of government in the Islamic world of the fourth/tenth century.

In this paper, I examine the collection of Ismā'īl ibn 'Abbād's epistles with regard to understanding the political conceptions of the author. Although much scholarship on the Buyids has focused on the revival of native Iranian traditions of kingship in coinage and titlature, there has been less of an attempt understand the relation of the Buyid *amīrs* to the Abbasid caliphate. It is this author's contention that chancery documents were an important space in which the *amīrs* attempted to maintain their continuity with the traditions of the caliphal authority of the past and to assert their power in the present. This fact, in addition to the revival of Persian kingship, must

be considered in any evaluation of the reigning political ideologies of the fourth/tenth century.

70. ELI ALSHECH, Princeton University

Rethinking Modesty Regulations: a New Reading of Early Islamic Law

In my previous work I have shown that early Islamic notions of privacy overlap those advanced by contemporary western scholars. The way scholars of each culture perceive physical modesty, however, appears to represent one of the major disparities between the two cultures. While modern legal scholars view contemporary western regulations limiting people's access to others' bodies as protecting people's privacy, many scholars maintain that Islamic modesty regulations serve to protect people's sexual morality. In this article I argue that explaining Islamic modesty regulations solely in terms of sexual morality is inadequate both because it provides a limited understanding of what those regulations actually achieve, and because it fails to account for their overall goal. By pointing to the discrepancy between many of the modesty regulations and their assumed purpose of maintaining sexual morality, I show that Muslim scholars were as much driven by privacy concerns when they determined the contours of these laws as they were by moral ones.

As I show elsewhere, among the prominent goals of the Islamic legal sphere of privacy is to protect men's and their families' reputations. In the current article I claim that safeguarding free women from unwanted gazes and contacts also aims at upholding their male family members' reputations. In the scholars' minds, when a free woman is improperly gazed upon or touched by a stranger, her family's reputation is at stake. The stranger's glance is likely to raise suspicion among community members that improper relations have occurred between the two unmarried parties. Once such rumors spread within the community, the family's reputation is very difficult to restore.

Moreover, I present evidence showing that modesty laws aim not only at segregating women, hiding their bodies, and diminishing their visibility, but also at keeping them away from other people's awareness and conscious. The scholars seem to have feared that a woman's reputation, and thus that of her family, could be harmed by the mere fact that her body becomes a topic of public debate. For them, the fact that intimate details about a woman are placed in the spotlight demeans her and humiliates her family. Modesty of women thus further safeguards reputations by ensuring that certain aspects of a woman's life remain not only invisible but also unknown to people outside of the household. In this respect, modesty laws can and should be viewed as an extension of the Islamic legal sphere of privacy.

71. ROBERT MORRISON, Whitman College

Responses to Ptolemy in Andalusia

In an influential article, A. I. Sabra identified an intellectual trend from twelfth and thirteenth-century Andalusia, which he described as the "Andalusian revolt against Ptolemaic astronomy". Sabra showed how al-Bitrūjī's (fl. 1200) *Kitāb al-Hay'a* (The Book of Astronomy) attempted to account for observed planetary motions in a way that met the standards of philosophers such as Ibn Rushd and Ibn Tufayl. In *Nūr al-ʿālam* (Light of the World), the subject of this study, Joseph ibn Joseph ibn Nahmias (fl. ca. 1400) endeavoured to improve upon al-Bitrūjī's models. *Nūr al-ʿālam* deserves

attention, too, because it is the first Arabic (Judeo-Arabic) text on theoretical astronomy by a Jewish author to come to light. This presentation will pay particular attention to developments of ibn Nahmias' models extant only in a Hebrew redaction.

E. South and Southeast Asia III: Religion. CHRISTOPHER Z. MINKOWSKI, Cornell University, Chair (2:00 p.m.–5:15 p.m.) *Cook Room*

72. PATRICK OLIVELLE, University of Texas at Austin

Viṣṇu-Smṛti: Explorations in a Forgotten Dharmaśāstra

The *Viṣṇu-Smṛti* was edited by Julius Jolly in 1881 with extracts from Nandapaṇḍita's commentary. Jolly also translated the text in the SBE series in 1880. The entire text with Nandapaṇḍita's commentary was freshly edited by V. Krishnamacarya and published by the Adyar Library in 1964. Yet, this is the Dharmaśāstra that has attracted least scholarly interest in modern times, as also least attention by commentators and writers of Nibandhas during medieval times.

Jolly's claim that the original sūtra was composed within the Kāṭhaka school and that the sūtra text was redacted and expanded with the additional of Vaiṣṇava material and verses at a much later date by a Vaiṣṇava author, was by and large accepted by P. V. Kane in his *History of Dharmaśāstra*. Jolly and Kane also drew attention to the fact the Viṣṇu borrows heavily from the Dharmaśāstras of Manu and Yājñavalkya.

As I prepare a fresh translation of the *Viṣṇu-Smṛti* and attempt to improve the edited text, I bring before my colleagues in this paper some observations on the position of this text within the broader history of Dharmaśāstra. Although I will raise more questions than provide satisfactory answers, I will re-assess the relationship between Manu and Viṣṇu in order to clarify the textual formation of the *Viṣṇu-Smṛti*. Was the author of this smṛti merely a redactor or editor who tried to make a received text (the hypothetical Kāṭhaka-Dharmasūtra) a Vaiṣṇava document, or was he truly an author who attempted to provide a fresh document based on older material? Further, all printed texts of the smṛti reproduce it as commented by Nandapaṇḍita around the year 1623 CE. This paper will give some early results of an attempt to find earlier textual evidence for this smṛti.

73. DONALD R. DAVIS, JR., University of Wisconsin-Madison

The Contributions of Ludo Rocher to the Study of Hindu Law

The present paper summarizes the critical introduction to a planned collection of Ludo Rocher's studies on Hindu law and Dharmaśāstra. The tradition of thought to which Rocher and his students belong is that of the great German scholars of Dharmaśāstra, especially Georg Bühler and Julius Jolly, but which has its early history in the work of H. T. Colebrooke. This "German school" views the Dharmaśāstra tradition in the first place as a paṇḍitic tradition and Bühler and Jolly were very concerned to situate Dharmaśāstra in terms of Vedic lineages and pedigrees and to show the system of scholasticism at work in the expert tradition of *dharmā*. We may contrast this school with both a "British/French school" and an "Indian school," both of which had and have heavier investments in how "real law" was to be extracted and understood from these texts and to what extent this law actually governed people prior to the colonial period and to what extent it should or could govern Hindus or even Indians under a colonial government. Of course, such labels are mere heuristic

conveniences as many scholars, including Rocher, consider issues and adopt positions beyond those expected by a single “school” of thought. The paper will use these broad categories of scholarly approaches to Hindu law to contextualize Rocher’s work, but it will also consider some of the original and lasting insights and achievements of Rocher to the field.

74. RICHARD D. MANN, McMaster University

On *Skandagraha*: The Early Cult of Skanda in Kuṣāṇa India

This paper studies the early history of the deity Skanda in North India during the epic era of Hinduism. I argue that the early understanding of this deity in Northern India was as a Graha, a deity who caused illness in pregnant women and children through possession. I will draw on evidence from the *Mahābhārata* and the *Suśrutasaṃhitā* to support this argument, as well as iconographic evidence from Kuṣāṇa Mathurā and Yaudheya coinage. Closely related to Skanda is a cult of Mātṛs, or Mothers. These Mātṛs are Graha-like beings who are connected to Skanda in the *Mahābhārata* and in iconographic sources primarily from Kuṣāṇa Mathurā. These Mātṛs are part of Skanda’s early propitiatory cult that appears to be prominent in Mathurā at this time. I will then argue that the depiction of the deity as the Surasenāpati, the general of the army of the gods, comes about, at least in part, through Kuṣāṇa interest in the deity. I will argue that the Kuṣāṇas and other groups from their culturally heterogeneous empire assimilated this deity with Parthian martial figures in Gandhāra and Hellenistic figures like Mars in Bactria. My evidence here comes primarily from Kuṣāṇa coinage, Gandhāran statuary, Bactrian seals, texts from the Upapurana tradition and the *Yavanaśākhā*. I will argue that this martial image of the deity comes to dominate his tradition in the post-Kuṣāṇa era, and transforms his cult from one oriented to propitiatory worship related to illness to a cult centred in royal agendas. Previous scholarship on this deity either assumed that the post-Kuṣāṇa characterization of the deity as the Surasenāpati was always his role, or some inauspicious roots for the deity were acknowledged, but the scope of this early cult or the mechanics of his transformation were not understood.

75. FREDERICK M. SMITH, University of Iowa

Names of *grahas* in the *Madanamahārṇava*

The *Madanamahārṇava*, among the most important works of a little-studied genre that falls between āyurveda and dharmasāstra known as *karmavipāka* or “ripening of karma,” was written by Viśveśvara Bhaṭṭa in the fourteenth century. The *karmavipāka* literature correlates diseases with actions (*karman*) performed in previous births. The remedies consist of ritual expiation (*prāyaścitta*, *daivavyapāśrayacikitsā*) rather than (or in some cases in addition to) medicinal preparations (*yuktivyapāśrayacikitsā*). The fortieth and last chapter (*taraṅga*) of this sprawling text describes symptoms of people possessed by thirty-one different *grahas* or “graspers,” all, typically, the result of ill-begotten past karma. In addition, the text gives their causes and remedies. The names of these *grahas* are unusual, such as the *pratunḍa-graha*, or “snouted grasper,” the *kālanāvaka-graha*, or “time-lord grasper,” and the *āpastamba-graha*, whose meaning remains to be determined. All of these have names are uncharacteristic within the realm of *bhūtavidyā*. They suggest, among other things, that the afflicted do not easily respond to āyurvedic treatment. As expected of a *dharmasāstra* text of this period, most of the causes are connected with lapses in morality and violation of

established social norms. In this paper I shall examine the names of these grahas and attempt to determine their social, geographical, and cultural significance.

76. VIDYUT AKLUJKAR, University of British Columbia

Is She or Is She Not Sītā? The Identity of Pārvatī and Sītā in *Ānanda-rāmāyaṇa*

My present article is the third in the series of articles on the topic of Debating Divinity in Ānanda Rāmāyaṇa (ĀR), The first article in this series was presented at the 213th meeting of the AOS in Nashville, April 2003, and the second was presented at the World Sanskrit conference in Helsinki, July 15, 2003. In this article, I shall mainly refer to two passages in ĀR Sāra kāṇḍa sarga 7, 138–150, and manohara kāṇḍa sarga 12, where there are conflicting views expressed regarding the nature of identity of Śiva's consort Pārvatī and Rāma's wife Sītā. In analysing these conflicting narrations, issues of sectarian loyalties, Supremacy of One God and Vedantic non-dualistic interpretations of conflicts will be discussed in the context of existing sectarian literature, with references especially to Śiva-purāṇa, Rāma-carita-mānasa and other texts. This discussion will bring out again the uniqueness with which ĀR tries to synthesize two conflicting sectarian traditions.

77. KENGO HARIMOTO, University of Groningen

Caṇḍeśvara and the Original *Skandapurāṇa*

It has been pointed out that Dharmanibandha authors quote from the original Skandapurāṇa, giving external testimonia for the establishment of the text of this later largely forgotten purāṇa. The latest dharmanibandha author who quotes from the Skandapurāṇa is Caṇḍeśvara from the 14th century. His works may provide insights to the development of the Skandapurāṇa if he recorded the text of it at his time. However, I have expressed reservations to consider him as an authentic witness of the purāṇa, citing the fact that all his quotations have a counterpart in his predecessors' works, mainly that of Lakṣmīdhara from the 12th century. There is a possibility that he was citing from the Skandapurāṇa only on the basis of earlier dharmanibandhas without consulting it in person. I will further examine the possibility that he had direct access to the Skandapurāṇa, focusing on quotations by Caṇḍeśvara and Lakṣmīdhara. It will be demonstrated that in many places the readings of the quotes in Caṇḍeśvara's works are closer to those in Lakṣmīdhara's works than any recensions of the Skandapurāṇa available in manuscripts. It will also be demonstrated that there are a few cases of divergence between the text quoted by Caṇḍeśvara and that quoted by Lakṣmīdhara which may have resulted from Caṇḍeśvara's consulting the Skandapurāṇa himself. As a conclusion, I propose to treat the text of the Skandapurāṇa quoted by Caṇḍeśvara and Lakṣmīdhara as one recension, rather than treating their differences in the printed editions as reflecting changes in the textual shape of the Skandapurāṇa itself. This approach helps achieve a better text of the Skandapurāṇa at the time of Lakṣmīdhara. This is useful when the edition of Lakṣmīdhara's works is unreliable. Comparison of this text with available manuscripts of the Skandapurāṇa gives us a glimpse of a possibly very complicated process of redaction and revisions that the Skandapurāṇa went through.

78. GUDRUN BÜHNEMANN, University of Wisconsin-Madison

The Identification of an Illustrated Haṭhayoga Manuscript and Its Significance for Traditions of Eighty-four Āsanas in Yoga

A hitherto unidentified illustrated Haṭhayoga manuscript is known to be preserved in the British Library, London, and a number of its drawings have been published. This manuscript is quite unique in that it contains coloured drawings of 84 *āsanas* and 24 *mudrās* by an unknown artist with accompanying text. The document was removed from the library of the Rani of Jhansi in central India in 1858 and has been kept in the British Library since 1861, where it is catalogued as manuscript Add. 24099. Losty 1985: 100 dates it to about 1830 and assigns it to the Panjab. The manuscript stands in a tradition which assumes an original corpus of 84 *āsanas*. The Gorakṣaśataka may be the oldest of the sources in this tradition which includes texts such as the Haṭhapradīpikā, Śivasamhitā and Gheraṇḍa-Saṃhitā. The number 84 continues to hold special symbolic significance for authors of ancient and modern Yoga texts. In this talk I will discuss the manuscript's significance in the context of traditions of 84 *āsanas* in Yoga and identify its text and author.

79. JUSTIN MCDANIEL, University of California, Riverside

Notes on the Teaching of Pāli Grammar in Thailand

Despite the wealth of manuscripts available there has been no major study of pedagogical methods, manuscripts, or institutions for the study and teaching of Pāli Grammar in Thailand. In this short paper I discuss the known Pāli grammatica composed or used commonly in Thailand for the last 500 years. This will be an introductory survey and some basic observations on texts and pedagogical methods distinctive in Thailand. I assert that while the works in the Indic Kaccāyana genre of Pāli grammatica are common in the Thai study of Pāli grammar, the local “*nissaya* method” is the pedagogical technique and *nissaya* manuscripts based on the Abhidhamma are some of the most common texts in the teaching of Pāli grammar historically. The *nissaya* method is an oral method which draws Pāli terms from a wide-range of texts and comments on their grammatical import in a variety of ways through a system of repetitive reinforcement of examples versus rule-based instruction. In the end I discuss the relationship between the study of the Abhidhamma, meditation, magic, and grammar in Thailand.

8:30 a.m.–11:00 a.m. Plenary Session: Scripts and Writing. PATRICK OLIVELLE, University of Texas, Chair. *Ballroom AB*

80. CHRISTOPHER WOODS, University of Chicago, Oriental Institute

Ancient Near East: On the Typology of Pristine Writing Systems

It is generally accepted that writing was invented, *ab initio*, three times in the course of civilization: in Sumer, China, and Mesoamerica, to which we may add the likely case of Egypt. These are the pristine writing systems—systems in which writing was invented without any prior exposure to writing. Yet despite the independent origins, and without discounting fundamental differences between these systems, all four share a remarkably similar structure and development, and all are based, ultimately, on the logogram. In this paper I will explore these similarities and suggest possible functional reasons for them. I will briefly discuss the social context of the development

of writing in each case and explore the possibility that certain languages, because of their structures, lend themselves more readily to pristine invention than others.

81. [No Representatives]

East Asia, Inner Asia

82. BEATRICE GRUENDLER, Yale University

Islamic Near East: Vowel versus Consonant in the Arabic Script

[No Abstract]

83. RICHARD SALOMON, University of Washington

South and Southeast Asia: On Alphabetical Order in India, and Elsewhere

The well known Indian varṇa-samāmnāya system of alphabetic ordering, which follows a logical phonetic sequence (a ā i ī u ū . . . ka kha ga gha ṇa, etc.), is generally assumed to be universal in Indian scripts. But actually, besides this ordering, which is associated from an early period with the Brāhmī script and its derivatives, it has recently become clear that the Kharoṣṭhī script, which prevailed for many centuries in the northwestern part of the Indian subcontinent, had an entirely different sequence. This order, known as Arapacana from its first five letters (a ra pa ca na la da ba ḍa ṣa, etc.), follows no obvious phonetic or other pattern, and its origin and logic remain obscure. Although the problem of the Arapacana order is unsolved and perhaps unsolvable, the issue will be discussed in the context of possible connections with other script systems of Iran and the Semitic world, and of the broader question of the source and logic of alphabetic orderings in general.

A. Ancient Near East IV: Mesopotamian Archæology and History. MARK CHAVALAS, University of Wisconsin–La Crosse, Chair (2:30 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) *Ballroom E*

84. JUDY BJORKMAN, Owego, New York

Taming the Spirits? — The Phenomenology of Closure Deposits

Many of ancient Mesopotamia’s best-known artifacts came from temple areas. Though usually broken, many retained considerable intrinsic value. Why were they left behind in the archaeological record?

Rather than imagine inefficient enemy plunderers, I propose that such artifact groups were a special type of votive deposit, viz., “closure deposits”, which I define as follows.

Closure deposits are non-utilitarian deposits found in temples. They involve the ritual “abandonment” of whole or fragmentary temple furnishings, statuary, and other paraphernalia, which were simply covered over with fill or added to the fill when that temple area was levelled up for rebuilding, repair, or deliberate abandonment.

I propose that such artifacts were left behind by cult adherents as votive deposits, marking either the renewal of a temple or its discontinuation.

I have identified over 75 closure deposits from the Middle Uruk through the Ur III periods, ranging from Sumer to Syria. Similar deposits occur in both earlier and later periods, as well as in other areas, such as Iran, Turkey, and the Levant. A few of the additional features of closure deposits are the following.

- The artifacts are not necessarily contemporaneous; some may be centuries older than their time of deposition.
- Only a fraction of any temple’s inventory was left behind in a closure deposit.
- The concept of “closure deposit” renders nearly meaningless attempts to identify a temple room’s use by the artifacts found within it.

I suggest that the deposits’ broken condition is related to the Mesopotamian view of devoted artifacts as (in some sense) living things. Thus, when their usefulness ended, it was necessary to dissipate and thus control this spiritual power by means of breakage. Examples will be presented in support of the proposed features of closure deposits.

85. SETH RICHARDSON, University of Chicago, Oriental Institute

Countrysides: Modeling a Babylonian Exurbia

Mesopotamian territorial states, characterized both by instability and resilience, have been termed “inherently decomposable” (Baines and Yoffee, 1998), assembling and re-assembling their constituent elements with remarkable facility. The composite building blocs we study, however, are visible to us not because of what they are—*e.g.*, units of institutional, ethnic, or kinship identity—but where we find them: inscribed in the documentary streams of cities. Accordingly, ex-urban spaces, though acknowledged as the chief productive zones and population catchbasins for these states, house the social units which are often neglected in studies of the state. This is in part an inevitable product of a cuneiform record which does not intend to document those non-urban concerns, but it has tended to produce monolithic schemæ in which Babylonian exurbia acts as the binary opposite to the urban state: socially dimorphic, economically two-sectored, politically passive. This paper will present a survey of multiple and heterogeneous countrysides, from different Mesopotamian historical periods, that variously treated with the state by negotiation, collaboration, and resistance. This reconnaissance of unaccounted-for exurban populations will conclude in the discussion of some specific Babylonian historical problems that are better illuminated by an understanding of composite rural constituencies as one of the major audiences for the royal ideologies that aimed to promote an imagined community of the state.

86. MAGNUS WIDELL, University of Chicago, Oriental Institute

Modeling Mesopotamia: Preliminary Findings from the Upper Khabur

In this talk, I will first discuss the Modeling Ancient Settlement Systems project, also known as MASS, of the Oriental Institute at the University of Chicago, the Argonne National Laboratory and the University of Edinburgh. We are an NSF funded project within a very broad initiative called Bio-complexity in the Environment. The aim of the project is to create a computer model that acknowledges a wide range of human factors and incorporates realistic mechanisms for subsistence provision, social

interactions, local and more wide-ranging economies, demographic factors and human contingency. The ultimate goal is to model and explain the trajectories of development and demise of the Bronze Age settlements in the rain-fed agricultural zone of northern Iraq and Syria and the irrigated alluvial plain of the Mesopotamian heartland. After this brief introduction of the project, I will continue by going through the nature and the range of the data that is being used as input in our model. Most of our work so far has been on upper Mesopotamia and the rain-fed agricultural zone, and in this paper I will demonstrate how we make use of a wide range of different sources and methodologies to reconstruct the agricultural procedures, demographics and landscape data of the area around Tell Beydar in northeastern Syria for our modeling work.

87. GLENN M. SCHWARTZ, The Johns Hopkins University

Excavations at Umm el Marra, Syria, 2002 and 2004

Excavations at Tell Umm el-Marra east of Aleppo in western Syria in 2002 and 2004 investigated a complex of monumental elite tombs dating to the mid-late third millennium BC. Located on a high point in the center of the site's acropolis, the complex included five excavated tombs in addition to Tomb 1 discovered in 2000, some with contents *in situ* and others disturbed. In addition to tombs were installations containing the remains of sacrificed equids, presumably associated with rituals honoring the high-ranking individuals interred nearby. The continuing importance of sacred space, the veneration of high-ranking ancestors, and the ritual role of equids is apparent in the history of use of the acropolis center at Umm el-Marra.

88. SALLY DUNHAM, Yale University

Status and Identity: Objects from Early Bronze Age Umm el Marra

This paper will examine in more detail some of the personal ornaments and other grave goods from the tombs and related structures presented in the paper by Glenn Schwartz, with the purpose of elucidating what they can tell about the status and identity of the interred individuals within the community of Umm el Marra and about the relation of Umm el Marra to other urban centers of Early Bronze Age Syria. In addition an attempt will be made to suggest the possible significance of the iconography of some of the grave goods.

89. JACK M. SASSON, Vanderbilt University

Zimri-Lim's Purchase of Alalḫum

[No Abstract]

90. EVA M. VON DASSOW, University of Minnesota

Archives of Alalḫ IV in Archæological Context

The excavation of the Syro-Anatolian city of Alalḫ (Tell Atchana) during the 1930s and 1940s yielded a great variety of archæological and textual material. But study of the cuneiform texts found at Alalḫ and study of the site's archæological remains have largely parted ways. The Alalḫ texts have generally been read in isolation from their archæological contexts, and even from the very artifacts on which they are written. This paper presents some results of an investigation in which the tablets from the archives of 15th-century Alalḫ Level IV are reunited with their archæological contexts. New excavations have commenced at Alalḫ, and the prospect of their producing

new knowledge about the site, including additional tablet finds, makes archaeological definition of the archives discovered in the old excavations timely.

The labor of collecting and reintegrating the archaeological contexts and the textual content of the Alalah IV archives makes it possible, first, to delineate these archives in terms of their spatial and chronological distribution, as well as in terms of prosopography and the types and subject matter of the texts. Second, this work provides the basis for describing the activities that generated the written records, that is, for reconstructing the history to which the records attest, more accurately and thoroughly than has hitherto been possible. The results of my research include not only identifying and describing distinct archives and “files” among the tablets that were preserved and found, but identifying what is missing from those archives. To explain the state of the archives as they were found requires a hypothesis that accounts for both the presence of the preserved tablets and the absence of the missing material. My observations lead me to suggest that the archives of Alalah’s government were moved elsewhere, along with the government itself, before the end of Level IV.

91. MARC VAN DE MIEROOP, Columbia University

Ancient Fakes in the Cuneiform Record

The production of fake records to claim an asset or endowment is a very common practice in world history. In ancient Mesopotamia few such fakes have been identified, however, and many of the suspect examples are often regarded as later copies of an authentic document. This paper will discuss some of the contested examples and inquire why scholars have been reluctant to accept cuneiform records as ancient fakes.

B. Ancient Near East V: Assyrian and Babylonian History and Literature.

FRANCESCA ROCHBERG, University of California, Riverside, Chair (2:30 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) *Ballroom AB*

92. HAROLD TORGER VEDELER, Yale University

The Transition of Power in the Babylon I Dynasty: Evidence from Year Names

This paper will treat the question of dynastic succession in the Babylon I dynasty by examining patterns in the adoption of year names by each of its newly crowned kings. This expands upon the work of Malcolm Horsnell by examining patterns that appear in the adoption of year names by new kings for the dynasty as a whole. Since Babylon I year names are widely attested, and because they are the primary source of information about political history from the period, they present our best opportunity for reconstructing the details of royal succession in this important dynasty.

Most important are the year names adopted by new kings during the year they actually took the throne, and the year names used during their first full regnal years. The former (defined as year name 0) do not occur in all cases and almost always follow a set formula when they do. The latter (designated as year name 1) either describe an event or are clearly purely propaganda.

The protocol of early year names in the Babylon I dynasty underwent a change under Hammurapi and Samsuiluna with the emergence of a tradition in which the new king would issue a *misharum* upon assuming power. There is some evidence that Samsuilunas accession marks a transition between the earlier and the later protocols, the latter of which clearly becomes standard beginning with Abi-eshuh.

93. RAYMOND WESTBROOK, Johns Hopkins University

What did the Poor Man of Nippur Want?

The Babylonian humorous tale of the Poor Man of Nippur describes how the hero is in a dilemma about what to do with the goat that he has just acquired in exchange for his only cloak. He cannot make a proper meal of it without beer, and his neighbors and relatives would hear of it and be angry with him. He decides instead to give it as a present to the mayor. The mayor at first mistakenly assumes that the goat is to be his honorarium for facilitating a lawsuit. The Poor Man's reply makes it clear that he has a different purpose, but instead of stating what that purpose is, he merely repeats his social dilemma. Commentators have puzzled over what he expected in return for his gift. This paper will suggest that it was not an immediate benefit, such as a shared meal or the beer to go with it. The Poor Man was suggesting in a subtle way that he sought a long-term relationship of patronage: to become the mayor's client and thus be under his protection. The mayor understood only too well what he meant and rejected the proposition with a calculated insult that plays upon the symbolism of patronage.

94. TZVI ABUSCH, Brandeis University

The Courtesan, the Wild Man, and the Hunter in the Epic of Gilgamesh

This paper examines the famous episode in the Epic of Gilgamesh that tells first of the confrontation of the wild man Enkidu and the hunter, then of the hunter's fetching of a courtesan to neutralize Enkidu, and finally of the actual encounter and love scene between the courtesan and the wild man. I shall begin the actual analysis by focusing on specific philological/exegetical difficulties at the center of the love scene itself, in the hope of making better sense of the scene. I shall then take up the question of the composition of the episode and work out a reconstruction of its development.

95. SARAH C. MELVILLE, Clarkson University

Neo-Assyrian Military Socialization

By the second half of the 8th century BCE, the Assyrian army had developed into an efficient and successful military machine, feared throughout the ancient Near East. However, the development and maintenance of a permanent fighting force posed some serious problems for the king, not the least of which was how to secure his soldiers' loyalty and willingness to risk their lives on his behalf. The size and diversity of the Assyrian army, comprised as it was of Assyrian troops, provincial levies, deportee units and foreign auxiliaries, made it absolutely necessary for the Assyrian command to create a cohesive military culture which would foster obedience, efficiency and morale. This paper explores the methods used by the Assyrians to socialize their armed forces.

96. JOHN P. NIELSEN, University of Chicago

Trading on Knowledge: The Iddin-Papsukkal Kin Group in Southern Babylonia in the 7th and 6th Centuries

The Iddin-Papsukkal kin group is most closely associated with the city of Borsippa, but individuals bearing that family name are attested in several other Babylonian cities in the middle and latter half of the first millennium BC. One branch of the Iddin-Papsukkal kin group, identified by Kümmel in *Familie, Beruf und Amt*

im spätbabylonischen Uruk, enjoyed modest status within the administration of the Eanna in Uruk in the sixth century, but the means by which they came to that position has not been examined. The paper draws upon a witness list in the unpublished tablet BM 113927 from Ur, two colophons, and several published tablets from Uruk to trace the forebears of the Iddin-Papsukkals in the Eanna. In doing so, several points become apparent: this branch brought with it an intellectual tradition that originated in Borsippa and may themselves have emigrated from northern Babylonia; at least one member of the lineage served the governor of Ur, Šin-balāssu-iqbi; and some contact was maintained with the Iddin-Papsukkal kin group in Borsippa. The paper concludes by considering the importance of the transmission of specialized knowledge within a family, the manner in which this branch of the Iddin-Papsukkal kin group penetrated the administration of the Eanna, and the impact that the arrival of kin groups like the Iddin-Papsukkals may have had on the adoption of family names in southern Babylonia.

97. EDWIN YAMAUCHI, Miami University

New Texts which Illuminate the Status of Israelite and Judean Exiles

Many extrabiblical documents have been used in the past to highlight the biblical narrative of deportations and the return from the Exile. In recent years a few striking additions to this corpus of evidence have been published.

Stephanie Dalley (2004) has recently interpreted the evidence of the names of the consorts of Tiglath-pileser III and Sargon II in association with the spectacular treasure found at Nimrud as Israelite women, a proposition questioned by J. Lawson Younger, Jr. (2002). Younger in a series of studies (1998, 2002, 2004) has reviewed Assyrian texts both from archives in Mesopotamia and the few found in Samaria to explicate both the fate of the deportees, and the nature of the gods worshipped by newcomers.

The fourth-century BCE Aramaic papyri from Wadi ed-Daliyeh studied by Frank Cross (1988) also illustrate the syncretistic nature of the religion of the Samaritans.

A fragment of the Akkadian Cyrus Cylinder, one of the great treasures of the British Museum, was identified in 1972. It had somehow found its way into the Yale Babylonian Collection. I. Eph'al (1978) and S. Timm (1995) have interpreted cuneiform documents as evidence for a repatriation of exiles back to Neirab in Syria by Darius I.

Three remarkable texts published by F. Joannès and A. Lemaire in 1989 shed light on the Jewish communities in exile in Mesopotamia.

A cuneiform text published by Matthew Stolper (1989) illuminates the administration of Tattenai over the satrapy of "Beyond-the-River." Bullae attest the names of individuals associated with Jeremiah, and also governors prior to Nehemiah. The opponents of Nehemiah (Sanballat, Tobiah, Geshem) are also attested by a variety of texts in Aramaic and Arabic

98. ALICE L. SLOTSKY, Brown University, and RONALD WALLENFELS, New York University

Late Babylonian Commodity Price Lists in the British Museum

During the 1950's, Abraham Sachs found, in the storerooms of the British Museum, a small group of commodity price lists. They intrigued him because of their likeness to

the monthly summaries of market quotations in the astronomical diaries. Although he did not know their purpose or their source, he was struck by the choice of commodities, their fixed order, and their metrology, all of which had the ring of diary reports. His preparations for the publication of the tablets were cut short by his untimely death, but in 1988, Donald Wiseman published hand copies of seven of the tablets as a tribute to his colleague. At that time, a dozen price-only tablets had been identified. Since then, the size of the corpus has been both supplemented by new finds in the British Museum's stores and shrunk by misidentifications and joins. The tablets now number eighteen, almost all of them fragmentary. We can securely date only ten, which run from SE 23 I to 209 II (289 to 103 BCE), although one undatable tablet is surely Achaemenid.

Until now, the consensus has been that these lists of prices were connected to the astronomical diaries, and, moreover, that one was the source of the other. Close work with the tablets' contents, however, have exposed dramatic differences consequential enough to call into question any such link. In fact, it turns out that the tablets cannot be directly connected to the economic summaries of the astronomical diaries because of their significant departures from diary practice. Moreover, the discrepancies demonstrate that the tablets of prices were a separate but parallel set of price records compiled independently of the diaries or any such major work and outside the main stream of the traditional organized and standardized repertoire of scribal scholarship.

99. PAUL-ALAIN BEAULIEU, Harvard University

Berosus on Late Babylonian History

Berosus is a Babylonian scholar who wrote a book in Greek at the beginning of the third century BC on the history and culture of his country for Antiochus I, the Seleucid ruler of Mesopotamia. Substantial fragments of the *Babyloniaca* have survived in the works of ancient writers, including an account of the rise and fall of the Neo-Babylonian (or Chaldean) dynasty which ruled Mesopotamia from 626 to 539 BC. In this paper I will discuss some of the probable sources which Berosus used to write his historical account of that period. On the basis of my results I will assess the strengths and limitations of his work and the significance of this assessment for our understanding of Babylonian historiography. I will finally argue that the work of Berosus is well grounded in the intellectual culture of Hellenistic Babylonia.

C. East Asia III: Translators of the Past: Changing Imperatives in Song Dynasty Constructions of the Textual Tradition. SUJANE WU, Swarthmore College, Chair (2:00 p.m.–4:00 p.m.) *Flower Room*

The Song dynasty (960–1279) witnessed the development of new paradigms for the interpretation and canonization of the written past that have fundamentally structured all subsequent approaches to China's literary heritage. The papers in this panel seek to historicize the development of these new paradigms by exploring how shifting aesthetic and intellectual concerns produced novel frameworks for reading and interpreting the textual tradition. Focusing on key periods in the reception and representation of specific authors (Su Shi, Li Shangyin) and genres (*guwen*), the papers on this panel critically relate changing economies of social, cultural, and literary values to corresponding innovations in the "translation" of the written past into a context

relevant to contemporary Song dynasty concerns. These papers' conclusions thus contextualize contemporary understanding of traditional Chinese literature and suggest critical new approaches for studying the formation of the modern canon of Tang and Song writing.

100. ALEXEI DITTER, Princeton University

Yao Xuan's (968–1020) *Essence of Tang Writing* and the Construction of “Ancient Prose”

The end of the Song dynasty witnessed the maturation of a new critical framework for the study and interpretation of writing, that of “Ancient-style prose” (*guwen*). This paper explores a critical period in the early development of that framework, the anthologization of Tang writings that took place in the early decades of the Northern Song (960–1126). It focuses in particular on the *Essence of Tang Writing* (*Tang Wen cui*), a 100 *juan* anthology of Tang prose and poetry completed by Yao Xuan (968–1020) in 1011 and first printed in 1039. Nestled in the middle of this anthology, between “deliberations” (*yi*, *juan* 39–42) and “steles” (*bei*, *juan* 50–65), is a section titled “ancient prose” (*guwen*, *juan* 43–49). This use of *guwen* as a classification on par with more typical prose genres like “deliberations” and “steles” raises interesting questions about conceptions of *guwen* in the early 11th century. Intriguingly, the contents of the *guwen* category in the *Essence of Tang Writing* were by and large included in the “miscellaneous” (*zawen* or *zazhuo*) sections of their respective authors' collected works. In the Tang, this “miscellaneous” category typically consisted of genres originating in the pre-Tang period that had by the Tang dynasty fallen out of common use. This paper investigates Yao's use of the category “*guwen*” in his anthology as an intermediate stage in a transition from *guwen* as genre to *guwen* as an overarching supra-generic category characterized by specific intellectual allegiances. It hypothesizes that Yao's anthology represents the nascency of a system of classifying writing in which moral values replaces the syntactic, semantic, or pragmatic features of the text as being of primary classificatory significance.

101. JEFFREY MOSER, Harvard University

Resuscitating the Master of Artful Strangeness: Song Dynasty Evaluations of Li Shang-yin

Long recognized as among the most ambiguous of all Chinese poets, Li Shangyin (812–858) produced a body of work both famed and decried in later eras for its hidden figurative messages. The opacity of Li's work makes it particularly relevant to the study of reading and interpretation, insofar as its ambiguity left later commentators with substantial space for the expression of their own interpretive biases. A survey of the comments written about Li Shangyin over the course of the past millennium suggests that the critical paradigms applied to his work, which informed all later readings, were largely established over the course of the Song dynasty.

By contrasting Northern and Southern Song readings of Li Shangyin, preserved for us in the writings of men like Ouyang Xiu (1007–1072), Zhang Jie (*jinshi* 1124), and Hong Mai (1123–1202), it becomes clear that between the eleventh and twelfth centuries, a substantial change took place in the critical reception of his work. Whereas commentators like Ouyang Xiu were able to grant the merit of Li's work purely on the basis of its aesthetic quality, men like Zhang Jie found the poetry's figurative meaning a more important indicator of its value. The fact that this shift in the standards

of evaluation can also be discerned in the Song's reception of other literary figures, most notably the poet Du Fu (712–770), suggests a larger paradigmatic change in the reception of China's literary past. Thus, this study of the changing reception of Li Shangyin offers an insight into the aesthetic implications of the broader transformation of Song intellectual culture.

102. BENJAMIN RIDGWAY, University of Michigan

Dynastic Restoration and Literary Aesthetics: The Reception of Su Shi's Song Lyrics by Early Southern Song Literati

Chinese literary histories have traditionally regarded Su Shi (1037–1101) as the founder of a bold new style of song lyric writing that, in the words of Hu Yin (1098–1156), “washed away the silks and perfumes” of banquet songs written in the style of the *Huajian ji* and the popular urban songs of Liu Yong (987–1053). This paper seeks to contextualize the shifting aesthetic evaluations of Su Shi's song lyrics in the political and cultural changes attendant on the collapse of the Northern Song court. Evaluations of Su Shi's song lyrics during the late 11th century, positive or negative, judged them by the criterion of musicality. Following the collapse of the Northern Song, on the other hand, literati prefaces to song lyric collections of writers like Ye Mengde (1077–1159) and Shang Ziyang (1086–1153) praised Su Shi's lyrics for their expressive capacity, suasive moral power, and ability to convey the memory of their author to future readers. The prefaces hailed these Southern Song writers as followers of Su Shi's style and posited an aesthetic transformation in their works, from musical craft to expression, which was mapped onto the political and geographic transition of the Song court from North to South. This paper examines the effects of war and political relocation on the early Southern Song cultural field, and how Su Shi's song lyrics, which are preoccupied with a philosophy of “life as a sojourn,” were appropriated and promoted by early Southern Song literati concerned with the restoration of the Song court and the recovery of the North.

D. Islamic Near East VII: History. JACOB LASSNER, Northwestern University, Chair (1:30 p.m.–3:30 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

103. BARBARA KELLNER-HEINKELE, Freie Universität, Berlin

The Rise and Fall of a Great Mufti: Seyyid Feyzullah Efendi's Recollections Viewed as an Egodocument

As a historical figure, Seyyid Feyzullah Efendi (1639–1703), one of the most well-known Ottoman Sheykhülislams or chief muftis, is fairly well studied. While his autobiographical treatise has been used as a quarry for biographical facts, the text remains to be read as an egodocument or reflection of the mufti's concept of himself.

A well educated young religious scholar from Erzurum, he made a steep career, first as the tutor of the crown prince and then through the ranks of the *ilmiye*. At the age of 49, he became *sheykhülislam* for the first time. His second time in office (1695–1703) ended with his violent death during a revolt of the *ulema*, the military and the populace who refused to accept his influence on the Sultan and his nepotism any longer.

This paper aims at presenting Seyyid Feyzullah Efendi as he saw himself or wished to be seen by his contemporaries and posterity. In a first step, it takes the text at

face value and will then try to uncover the deeper layers of the narrative by shifting the emphasis away from Feyzullah the individual, to the network of his political and social relations.

104. STEVEN JUDD, Southern Connecticut State University

Al-Walīd ibn Yazīd's Use of the Term "Naṣīḥ"

On several occasions, the Umayyad caliph al-Walīd b. Yazīd referred to himself as a *naṣīḥ*, a term used in the Qurʾān to refer to pre-Islamic prophets. I have found no other examples of Umayyad caliphs using this term of reference. This paper examines possible interpretations of the term and possible explanations for al-Walīd's use of this term instead of the more commonly used *khalīfat allāh*, which he also invoked on occasion. It considers whether the terms were simply understood to be synonymous, or whether al-Walīd was trying to assert a basis for his legitimacy that was distinct from that employed by his predecessor, Hishām b. ʿAbd al-Malik. The paper will also consider whether al-Walīd sought to associate himself with pre-Islamic prophets such as David, who remained messengers of God and divinely appointed rulers, despite their shocking moral shortcomings.

105. DAVID HOLLENBERG, Carleton College

A Consideration of Some Pre-Kirmānian Fāṭimid Neoplatonic Fragments: Greek Wisdom as Ornament in the Later Writings of the Fāṭimid Missionary Jaʿfar ibn Maṣṣūr al-Yaman

As is well known, in the middle of the tenth century Neoplatonica was a common feature of Ismāʿīlī doctrine in the dioceses of northwestern Iran. Missionaries such as Jaʿfar ibn Maṣṣūr al-Yaman (thived mid tenth century) who composed Fāṭimid *taʾwīl* in North Africa, however, are thought to have avoided such Neoplatonica and promulgated versions of "old-time" Ismāʿīlī doctrines: cyclical hiero-history, letter symbolism, typological (or "spiritual") interpretation, and a cosmology derived from Gnostic precursors. This neat doctrinal division between Fāṭimid old-time doctrine and Neoplatonic Ismāʿīlism in the Iranian dioceses is thought to have obtained until al-Ḥākim's chief-*dāʿī* al-Kirmānī incorporated elements from both in the first third of the eleventh century.

This paper will analyze Neoplatonica in two texts attributed to the Fāṭimid missionary Jaʿfar b. Maṣṣūr al-Yaman that do not fit with this historical picture. If authentic, the Neoplatonic themes in the Fāṭimid missionary Jaʿfar b. Maṣṣūr al-Yaman's *Sarāʾir al-nuṭaqāʾ* (*The Secrets of the Speaker-Prophets*) and *Kitāb al-fatarāt waʾl-qirānāt* (*The Book of Periods and Conjunctions*) suggest what has long been assumed but seldom documented: that prior to al-Kirmānī under the Caliph al-Muʿizz li-dīn Allāh, the Fāṭimids had access to and experimented with the products of the Iranian dioceses to the East. I find that while the *Sarāʾir* and the *Kitāb al-fatarāt*'s Neoplatonica do demonstrate familiarity with the writings of the near contemporary Iranian Ismāʿīlī Neoplatonists Abū Hātim al-Rāzī and Abū Yaʿqūb al-Sijistānī, pre-Kirmānian Fāṭimid Neoplatonica represent a different sort of discourse intended to achieve a very different affect. Rather than designed to debate the philosophers at court, the Fāṭimid *dāʿī*. referred to the wisdom of Plato and Aristotle to demonstrate the universal scope of their Imām's knowledge.

106. PAUL E. WALKER, University of Chicago

The Rhetoric of Fatimid *Khutbas*

Although few examples of Fatimid *khutbas* survive, we have enough to begin an analysis of the rhetoric used in them. Once literally thousands must have existed, many quite possibly in written form, but, if what was said during the *khutba* was preserved at all, the evidence about it is typically limited to a record of the allegiance it expressed. However, there was more to these *khutbas* which served, among other functions, as a public statement—a kind of reiteration—of the claim on which Fatimid rule rested. Moreover, of the dozen or so texts of such *khutbas* now available, nearly all—at least ten, perhaps more—were composed and often delivered in person by the imams.

E. Islamic Near East VIII: Religion. SHAWKAT TOORAWA, Cornell University, Chair (4:00 p.m.–6:30 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

107. GLEN M. COOPER, Brigham Young University

Medical Prognosis in Islam: Divination, Rational Inference, or Prophecy?

The 2nd Century Greek physician Galen took considerable pains to distance medical prognosis from traditional forms of divination, a fact that suggests not only that anciently medical prognosis could be confused with divination, but also that some scientists such as Galen were anxious to establish medical prognosis as a rational discipline and to avoid the negative association with diviners. Tamsyn Barton has examined this issue for the classical world in *Power and Knowledge*. In Islam, however, which has not been systematically investigated, the situation was more complex. Once Greek medical ideas were assimilated in Islam, medical prognosis was accepted only with a certain ambivalence, since God performed the healing, and only he or his prophet could know the future. In this paper, I will examine the status of medical prognosis in Islam. By examining specific authors such as Farabi, Ibn Sina, al-Ghazali, Ibn Rushd, and Maimonides who were concerned with reasoning in general and medicine in particular, as well as with theological issues, I shall demonstrate that prognosis was accepted for its great utility, in spite of its resemblance to divination, most forms of which were anathema in Islam. Prognosis was considered a kind of rational inference, though imperfect (i.e., non-deductive) because conjectural. Yet, prognosis does resemble prophecy, in that it purports to tell the future, and it would seem that if the physician were also a prophet, his prognosis would be equivalent to prophecy. A comparison will be drawn with another popular form of divination, astrology, which was almost unilaterally rejected by Islamic intellectuals. Why was prognosis acceptable, and not astrology? Astrology seems to deny human free will, one of the pillars of Islamic theology; human will, however, has nothing to do with medical prognosis.

108. MUSEGH ASATRYAN, Yale University

The Licit and the Illicit in Ibn Khaldūn's Perception of the Occult

Ibn Khaldun has dedicated several chapters of his *Muqaddima* to the description and refutation of the occult sciences. While rejecting the possibility of alchemy and astrology altogether, he acknowledges the ability of humans to exercise magic and divination. In my paper I address this hitherto insufficiently investigated topic and

offer a new explanation for the author’s classification of magic and divination into licit and illicit.

In my paper I argue that:

1. For Ibn Khaldun there are no rigid boundaries between licit and illicit magical or divinatory actions. Rather, the licit and the illicit represent two poles of a continuum with intermediate degrees between them.
2. The degree of licitness or illicitness of a certain action depends on the degree of one’s activity, while performing the action, with regard to the realm of the sacred. The more active one is, the closer his actions are to the pole of illicitness, and, conversely, the more passive one is, the closer his actions to the pole of licitness.

Thus, on the one—illicit—end of the continuum there are black magicians, who exercise active power on spiritual forces, and on the other—licit—end, the prophets, who have no active role in predicting the future or performing miracles (which, by definition, are a type of magic), but are simply led by God. Between these two poles, there are many intermediate stages of magicians and diviners, who, according to the degree of their activity or passivity, are closer to one or the other pole.

109. MOHAMMAD HASSAN KHALIL, University of Michigan

Islam, Ethics, and the Intellect’s Ability to Discern Good and Evil: Ibn Taymiyyah and the Ḥanbalites versus ‘Abdaljabbār and the Basran Muṭazilites

The business of determining what is *good* and *detestable* has consumed Muslim jurists and theologians for centuries. As A. Kevin Reinhart puts it in his monograph *Before Revelation: The Boundaries of Muslim Moral Thought*:

“Metaphysicians in particular exercised themselves with the question of *al-taḥsīn wa-l-taqbīḥ* [i.e., determining what is *good* and *detestable*]. At the first level, the problem is this: can humans use their natural faculties to determine the transcendent goodness or detestability of something.” (8)

In an article entitled “The Alchemy of Domination? Some Ash‘arite Responses to Muṭazilite Ethics,” Sherman A. Jackson notes that for a number of Ash‘arites, assessing moral values was a problem that they deemed irresolvable unless a more objective standard (i.e., Revelation) was used for that purpose. In this paper, I will examine views coming from another major theological group, the Ḥanbalites (“Traditionalists”), with special emphasis on Ibn Taymiyyah (728/1328). Furthermore, I will compare these views with those of the Basran Muṭazilites, with special emphasis on ‘Abdaljabbār (415/1025), whose arguments in this realm may seem to be relatively formidable. According to Reinhart, many of the critiques made against Muṭazilites such as ‘Abdaljabbār tended to be too simplistic and focused more on the views of the Baghdādī Muṭazilites, which tended to be less sophisticated. By examining works by Ibn Taymiyyah, I will present an example of a critique that was neither simplistic nor unable to penetrate the nuances of the Basran position. Furthermore, I will show that, in agreement with Reinhart, the Ḥanbalites were not as critical of the intellect (*‘aql*) in its ability to make moral assessments, as were the Ash‘arites. Thus, it is my position that it is actually the unlikely Ḥanbalites, and particularly Ibn Taymiyyah, who produce some of the most sophisticated arguments in this timeless debate.

110. RECEP GÜRKAN GOKTAŞ, Harvard University

Asbāb Wurūd al-Ḥadīth: A Literary Approach

Similar to the exegetic genre *asbāb al-nuzūl* that studies the occasions of Qurʾānic revelations, *asbāb wurūd al-ḥadīth*, investigates the occasions of Prophetic sayings. Identifying the occasion of a *ḥadīth* becomes extremely important especially when one intends to derive a legal ruling, or a theological or moral principle from the *ḥadīth* for the knowledge of the context may significantly change the understanding of the *ḥadīth*. Although many *ḥadīth* texts do not contain any information regarding the reasons why the Prophet said what he said, we are often informed about the occasions of his utterances either in the same report or in a variant text. However, the relationship between the Prophet's saying and the story that comes with it is not always clear and direct. Besides, variants of the *ḥadīth* might be significantly different from one another and in some cases, there might exist multiple occasions related for the same *ḥadīth*. It is my contention here that a literary approach will be very helpful in identifying some of the characteristics of these *ḥadīths* and in interpreting these phenomena. Therefore, in this study, I attempt to make a literary analysis of the relationship of the prophetic sayings (*ḥadīth*) with the stories telling their occasions (*asbāb*). I give special attention to narrative techniques and stylistic devices employed to combine *ḥadīths* and stories of their occasions. The study is based on two works of *asbāb wurūd al-ḥadīth* genre: *al-Lumʿa fī Asbāb al-Ḥadīth* of al-Suyūṭī (d. 911/1505) and *al-Bayān wa-al-Taʿrīf fī Asbāb Wurūd al-Ḥadīth* by Ibn Ḥamza al-Dimashqī (d. 1120/1708). In Western tradition, there is, to my knowledge, no specific work done on *asbāb wurūd al-ḥadīth*. In addition, modern scholars of *ḥadīth* seem not to have paid enough attention to literary aspects of *ḥadīth*. Therefore, my study will be a contribution to *ḥadīth* studies in these both aspects.

111. SULEIMAN A. MOURAD, Middlebury College

The Symbolism of Jerusalem in Early Islam

The Arabic Islamic literature dealing with the *faḍāʾil* (merits) of Jerusalem are commonly believed by modern scholars to have originated as a result of the Crusaders' capture of Jerusalem in 492/1099. This view is still persistent in modern scholarship despite the fact that the Muslim religious interest in the city is now proven to have started prior to the arrival of the First Crusade, as seen, for instance, in the works on the merits of Jerusalem by al-Wāsiṭī (d. after 410/1019) and Abū al-Maʿālī (d. ca. 450/1058). My paper will present additional evidence that the genre indeed predates the Crusades. I will examine the earliest now-lost work on the merits of Jerusalem by Abū al-ʿAbbās al-Walīd b. Ḥammād al-Ramlī al-Zayyāt (d. ca. 300/912), entitled *Faḍāʾil Bayt al-Maqdis*. Al-Ramlī lived in the town of Ramla, near Jerusalem, and spent his life between scholarship (transmission of *Ḥadīth* and historical accounts) and business (selling olive oil). His text provided the foundational material for later works on the merits of Jerusalem, particularly those of al-Wāsiṭī and Abū al-Maʿālī. Al-Ramlī collected a good number of traditions on Jerusalem's religious symbolism from scholars all over *Bilād al-Shām*. I will report on my methodology in reconstructing the lost text, its contribution to the merits of Jerusalem genre, as well as what it tells us about the way early Muslims, especially in Syria, perceived the religious symbolism of Jerusalem.

F. South and Southeast Asia IV: Literature. STANLEY INSLER, Yale University,
Chair (2:00 p.m.–5:15 p.m.) *Cook Room*

112. JOEL P. BRERETON, University of Texas at Austin

Poetics of the *Suparṇādhya*

The *Suparṇādhya* is a narrative poem that tells the story of Garuḍa and the theft of the *soma* from heaven. It likely belongs to the late Vedic period, and accordingly, various of its features show a development from the tradition of Ṛgvedic poetry to that of epic composition. One of these features is its poetics. While as a narrative poem it resembles epic, it also shows the intricate word play that characterizes Vedic poetry as well as later kāvyā. This paper will explore the poem's use of word play and some of the various ways it constitutes a transitional work in the history of Indian literature.

113. CHRISTOPHER Z. MINKOWSKI, Cornell University

What is the Most Boring Topic in *Mahābhārata* Studies?

As most scholars do when they have reached a certain age, Indologists gradually become, in practical terms, experts in boredom: in what boredom's stages and varieties are, in its costs and benefits, and in what can be done to escape from, or indulge in, it. Yet there has been little theoretical reflection on the phenomenon of boredom in our field as such. Such reflection should not be a matter simply of finding one's own research interesting and that of others boring, or for that matter, of finding things to be the other way around.

The paper will therefore have two goals: first, to decide whether there can be an objective criterion for judging that a research question is boring, and if there is, to establish what that criterion is, and furthermore, whether it includes a comparative dimension: can one question be not simply boring, but rather, more boring than some other question? The second goal will be to apply the criterion, if it can be identified, to the study of the *Mahābhārata*, that most interesting of Sanskrit texts.

Without deciding in advance that one topic must be judged the most boring, there would nevertheless appear to be suitable candidates for testing a proposed criterion. I will begin the investigation from some comments on passages of the *Mahābhārata* by the seventeenth century scholar, Nilakaṇṭha Caturdhara; in particular, the epic passages that attach an astrological significance to the epic's great battle. This will lead me to consider the use of the same passages in research programs that seek to establish the date when the battle took place. The paper will strive not to become an example of the phenomenon it studies, however, in reaching predictable conclusions through overly laborious means.

114. GARY A. TUBB, Columbia University

Abhinanda's *Rāmacarita* and the Legacy of Bāṇa

The *Rāmacarita*, a seldom-read Sanskrit *mahākāvya* by the ninth-century Pāla poet Abhinanda, has tended to be dismissed as just another epic poem "of the elaborate kind" or, contrastingly, as a throwback to the earlier and simpler style of Kālidāsa. Meanwhile the unusual attention given by Abhinanda and his associates to rustic and naturalistic themes in isolated anthology verses has received more attention, and has

sometimes been treated as a separate style of poetry indulged in alongside their more standard court poetry.

In fact the *Rāmacarita* provides extensive evidence of experiments with ways to incorporate the distinctive approaches and sensibilities shared by some of the Pāla poets into even the most prestigious and traditional genres of Sanskrit court poetry. Abhinanda's poem proves on examination to be strikingly innovative in its use of several interrelated techniques that can be traced back through the work of the Pāla poets to the influence of the poet Bāṇa, including not only the use of untypically naturalistic descriptions for some purposes, but also other forms of bold departure from the older models.

In Abhinanda's hands these tendencies were expanded to provide a completely new way of organizing both the narrative and the aesthetic structure of the poem, in which a constant attention to atmospheric conditions and other environmental details shape the treatment of the story throughout. The result is a work that uses the formal structure of the *mahākāvya* genre and focusses on emotional factors corresponding to the familiar elements of *rasa* analysis, but that subjects both form and factors to emphases and progressions that are very unlike anything in the other poems that survive from Abhinanda's time and before.

115. SHUBHA PATHAK, University of Chicago

Comparing Kāvya, Comparing Itihāsa: On Ānandavardhana's and Rājaśekhara's Poetic Roads to the *Rāmāyaṇa* and the *Mahābhārata*

Although the *Rāmāyaṇa* and the *Mahābhārata* refer to themselves by different rubrics—*kāvya* (a poem expressing emotion) and *itihāsa* (an account of the way things had been), respectively—as they relate how they themselves arose, they have both been called epics by their comparers over the past century, scholars such as E. Washburn Hopkins (1901, 1915), P. V. Kane (1966), and John Brockington (1998) who believe that the two works belong in the same genre. Yet “epic” is not the only terminological umbrella that has been opened over this pair of poems. Indeed, about a thousand years before the American classicist Hopkins classed the *Rāmāyaṇa* and *Mahābhārata* with the *Iliad* and *Odyssey* (works for which the Greek etymon of “epic” was coined), the medieval Indian exegetes Ānandavardhana and Rājaśekhara each saw in one Sanskrit poem's self-portrayal an epithet applying to the other Sanskrit poem as well. Specifically, each of these earlier critics spotlights the appellation that reflects most faithfully his conception of these poems and their relationship to the poems of his time. Ānandavardhana, in his *Dhvanyāloka*, comprehends the *Rāmāyaṇa* and *Mahābhārata* as *kāvya*s because they are redolent of the same sorts of emotional essences that flow through the similarly evocative *kāvya*s that he and his peers compose; hence he interconnects the early and later compositions by imagining them all as parts of an infinite path of poetry. But Rājaśekhara, in his *Kāvyaṃīmāṃsā*, understands the *Rāmāyaṇa* and *Mahābhārata* as *itihāsa*s that supply stories that he and his contemporaries rework in *kāvya*s of their own that evince their brilliance; consequently he locates the *Rāmāyaṇa* and *Mahābhārata* at the remote origin of an avenue of eloquence leading ultimately to later poems. Ānandavardhana and Rājaśekhara thus show all interpreters following in their footsteps that genre criticism is a firm ground for further analysis.

116. AJAY RAO, University of Chicago

The Intertextuality of Vedānta Deśika's *Hamsa-Saṃdeśa*

Vedānta Deśika's *Hamsa Sandesa*, which recounts the imaginary vignette of Rama eliciting a swan to convey a message to Sita, is a unique example of allegorical poetry that reworks a number of themes, genres, and figures from Tamil and Sanskrit literature: the identification of birds sent by heroines in the *Tiruvaymoli* with acaryas; Hanuman's conversation with Sita in the Sundarakanda, the swan as messenger in Harsa's *Naisadhiyacarita*, and, most obviously, Kalidasa's *Meghaduta* (which forms a model for the *Hamsa Sandesa* and most other sandesa kavyas). I will draw from both contemporary theories of intertextuality and analysis of the role of retellings and embedded narratives in traditional Indian storytelling to elucidate how novel renditions of canonical works represent interpretations of the antecedent literary series. The *Hamsa Sandesa* is fashioned as an allegoresis of the Ramayana, wherein Rama is the lord, Sita the soul, Lanka the body, the ocean samsara, Ravana's ten head the senses bewildering the mind, and Hanuman the acarya, as elaborated in commentaries revealing secret (rahasya) Srivaisnava readings within the conceptual framework of dhvani. The result is that a central narrative of the Ramayana becomes theologized and localized in geographical and cultural space, in an allegorical idiom foreign to the standard conventions of Sanskrit kavya.

117. DOLORES PIZARRO, University of Pennsylvania

The *Rasika*'s Reading: Interpretations of a Verse of the *Amaruśataka*

While reading a Sanskrit poem, the *rasika*, or man of taste, is supposed to be conversant with literary conventions and alert to nuances of suggestion in order to interpret correctly the flavor and emotion intended by the poet. However, in fact things are not so clear-cut. For example, the background situation of a *muktaka*, a single-verse poem, cannot always be identified unambiguously. I will demonstrate this by focusing on one of the *muktakas* from the *Amaruśataka*. In the case of this verse, two of Amaru's best-known commentators interpret the situation or story behind the poem quite differently. These two men were both undoubtedly qualified *rasikas*, so it is not easy simply to dismiss one of them as wrong.

This difference of interpretation has been mentioned by Martha Ann Selby in the introductory essays of her *Grow Long, Blessed Night*. I will expand on her observations and attempt to go further by exploring some Sanskrit treatises on literature which explain themes and tropes in poetic writing with regard to *rasa* and the different characterization of the depiction of certain figures. This material can help us to understand how Amaru's commentators reached the conclusions that they did. I hope to show that in the case of *muktaka* poetry there is not always one 'correct' reading and that even among educated connoisseurs of Sanskrit poetry there can certainly be very substantial differences of opinion.

118. GUY LEAVITT, University of Chicago

The *Nāṭyaśāstra*'s Redaction and the Śaiva Cosmos/Drama Analogy

The *Nāṭyaśāstra*, perhaps the most influential dramaturgical text in pre-modern South Asia, has posed major text-critical problems for more than a century. On one hand, most of its scholars and editors have suggested that the text survives in two recensions, but have been unable to explain the *raison d'être* or significance of the sec-

ond recension (e.g., Heymann 1874, Lévi 1890, Kavi 1926). On the other hand, at least one of the *Nāṭyaśāstra*'s more recent editors has disputed the existence of different recensions altogether (Sastri 1956), leaving contemporary scholars to shelve the problem of radical manuscript divergences in the hope of a critical edition (Rocher 1981, Bansat-Boudon 1992). While fully agreeing with the desideratum of a critical edition, I suggest that the text's sole extant commentary, Abhinavagupta's *Abhinavabhāratī*, may even now help us begin to resolve these textual problems.

The argument for two recensions is chiefly concerned with the mysterious reordering of several of the text's thirty-six chapters. My hypothesis is that the *Nāṭyaśāstra* was redacted to make these key chapters reflect, by way of their new positions, their corresponding levels of reality (*tattva*) within the thirty-sixfold Śaiva ontology. This 'reflection' of chapter and level of reality makes an analogy between the drama and the Śaiva cosmos possible and grounds it in the structure of the *Nāṭyaśāstra* itself—the director being thereby likened to Śiva, the actor to the individual soul, his character (*prakṛti*) to the soul's objective experience (*prakṛti*), and so on. Since Abhinava beautifully captures this analogy in his *śliṣṭa* benedictory verses, I analyze them in order to fill in the details of what appears to be the rationale for the *Nāṭyaśāstra*'s redaction. Such a redaction raises interesting historical questions, which are briefly stated in closing, about the role the *Nāṭyaśāstra* played in Śaiva discourse in medieval Kashmir.

119. DAVID MELLINS, Columbia University

A Heatless Fire: Jayadeva Pīyūṣavaṛṣa's Censure of Poetry Lacking Figures of Speech

This paper examines the controversy within Sanskrit literary circles concerning the requirement of figures of speech in poetry. The investigation centers around Jayadeva Pīyūṣavaṛṣa's critique in his *Candrāloka* that those who allow for poetry lacking figures of speech should also allow for fire lacking heat. While this sarcasm appears to be directed at Mammaṭa, who in his *Kāvyaṭīkā* states "speech and meaning that is flawless and possesses poetic qualities (*guṇa*) is poetry, even if it sometimes lacks figures of speech," Mammaṭa in part insulates himself from such criticism, qualifying that when poetry lacks figures of speech, the figures must still exist in an unmanifest (*asphuṭa*) state. Vaidyanātha Pāyaguṇḍa and Gāgābhaṭṭa the two most important commentators to the *Candrāloka*, present opposing interpretations. Vaidyanātha states that Jayadeva's criticism is only provisional, and that ultimately Jayadeva intends to affirm Mammaṭa's view. Gāgābhaṭṭa, on the other hand, holds Jayadeva's critique to be categorical and proceeds to refute Mammaṭa's notion that the presence of 'unmanifest' figures of speech qualifies speech and meaning as poetry. While P. V. Kane and Narayana Shastri Khiste have both identified Jayadeva's criticism of Mammaṭa, no one has investigated this controversy in the light of the commentaries to the *Candrāloka* and those to the *Kāvyaṭīkā*; nor has anyone evaluated Mammaṭa's definition of poetry according to the standards of *dhvani* formulated by Ānandavardhana in the *Dhvanyāloka*. In consideration of these sources, this study concludes that Jayadeva's critique points to Mammaṭa's deviation from Ānandavardhana's interpretation of the relationship between suggestion (*dhvani*) and figure of speech (*alaṃkāra*) in poetry.

A. Ancient Near East VI: Ancient Near Eastern History, Literature, and Religion. K. LAWSON YOUNGER, Trinity Evangelical University, Divinity School, Chair (9:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) *Ballroom AB*

120. IAN RUTHERFORD, Florida State University/University of Reading

“When You Go to the Meadow, Do Not Pull the Cord”: The Role of the Taptara-Women in the Hittite Funerary Ritual

The Hittite *sallis wastais*-Ritual (swR) was a funerary ritual for the king or queen, lasting fourteen days, beginning with the cremation of the deceased’s body and progressing into a sequence of minor rituals designed to ensure that the deceased enjoys in the afterlife items he/she possessed on earth. Texts and translations are now available in A. Kassian, A. Korolev and A. Sideltsev, *Hittite Funerary Ritual: sallis wastais* (Münster, 2002). Among the numerous ritual actors in the swR were a group of so-called taptara-women ((MUNUS.MES)taptara), whose primary activity is to lament or wail (Hittite *wiye*-). The aim of this paper is to examine the role of the taptara-women in the swR.

For most of the swR, the taptara-women play a supporting role only among the various ritual actors, but they become more central toward the end, in the context of the ritual burning of a cord on the night between Days 13 and 14, when they sing or utter (Hittite *alamniya*-) the words: “when you go to the meadow, do not pull the cord”. This utterance is addressed to the deceased and seems to signify that as he/she moves to paradise, he/she is not to hang on to the world of the living. The question arises, why do the taptara-women become more prominent in this part of the ritual?

I will argue: 1. The “burning of the cord” is a moment of critical importance in the swR, since it symbolises the point of severance between the deceased and the world of the living; and 2. The taptara-women are given a central role here because of all the ritual actors in swR they are the ones felt to be most suited to communicating with the dead.

Note on previous scholarship:

There have been many studies of the swR, and some interest in the song of the taptara-women (see e.g., V. Haas, *Geschichte der hethitische Religion* (Leiden, 1994), 228), but no previous study has addressed the issue of their role within the swR.

121. LJUBICA JOVANOVIĆ, Vanderbilt University

Joseph’s Silver Drinking Cup and Royal Gift Exchange in the Ancient Mediterranean

Gen 44:4b–5 “Why have you stolen my silver cup? Is it not from this that my lord drinks? Does he not indeed use it for divination?”

Is a new academic understanding of Genesis 44:5 possible? Scholarly treatments of this verse have focused mostly on the use of Joseph’s cup in divination, either explaining its literary context, or establishing the historical background of lecanomancy in Egypt and/or Israel.

I propose that the double designation of Joseph’s cup as a silver drinking cup and as a cup for divination (Gen 44:5), originates from two different social contexts. Their conjunction is an intentional literary device that functions as a major element in the story’s plot. I will show that drinking cups of precious metal, along with gold,

silver and fine linen, were a well-known type of gift exchange in the international politics of the ANE and Egypt. The great amount of knowledge-sharing in the ancient Mediterranean can help us recognize the significance of the attributes associated with the cup of Joseph.

122. DAN BELNAP, University of Chicago

Where is the Devourer? Another Look at the 2nd Tablet of Arslan Tash

In 1933, two limestone plaques were bought in Arslan Tash, Syria. Both of them were found to be incantations against misfortune. The smaller of the two plaques, though first seen in 1933, was not published until 1971 by André Caquot and Robert du Mesil du Buisson. Both incantation plaques have been objects of intense interest, not only for the texts on the limestone, but also for the images depicted on the plaques. In the case of the second tablet the image is one of a demonic being in the process of devouring someone; only the lower half of the body is shown on the victim. The demon is shown with scorpions for feet and what resembles a rooster's comb (and beak?) running along the head. Most conspicuous of all is the round, lidless eye prominently displayed in the demon's head. It is this feature that appears to be the focus of the plaque's text; an incantation against some form of the evil eye.

Though the subject of the incantation has been noted elsewhere, relatively little has been done comparing this evil eye incantation to other evil eye incantations found elsewhere in the ancient Near East. This paper will attempt to do so, demonstrating that ambiguities in the text may be answered in light of the comparative material elsewhere. This approach also allows for an examination of both the image on the tablet and the text, and their contribution to the efficacy of the incantation as a whole, suggesting a closer relationship between the image and the text than has previously been given.

123. JOANN SCURLOCK, Elmhurst College

Whose Truth and Whose Justice?: The Uruk Prophecy Revisited

SpTU 1.3 (generally known as the Uruk Prophecy) is a striking example of a genre of writings which bear comparison with Biblical texts. In it, a sequence of eleven kings appears, all but three of whom are specifically said to be bad. In every case, the kings in question are not named but simply described as "a king will arise". The general purpose of the text would appear to be clear: a sequence of real kings in the past is used as a sort of omen allowing the prediction of hoped for events in the future. But which of the events recounted were significant and which merely included to clue in the intended audience? And what exactly was the original prophecy predicting? To date at least six scholars have attempted to provide answers to one or all of these questions but without taking into consideration the fact that the prophecy is not concerned with truth or justice but has as its sole concern the presence or absence of the statue of a local goddess from its proper sanctuary. The most obvious referent is the goddess Nanaya who was returned to Uruk by the Assyrian king Aššurbanipal and "stolen" again by Nabopolassar, facts which goes a long way towards explaining the hostility displayed by the city of Uruk towards the rising Neo-Babylonian dynasty.

124. ANDREW D. GROSS, New York University

A Reconsideration of the Aramaic Investiture Clause

This paper reconsiders the history and function of the so-called Aramaic investiture clause. This clause occurs in the operative section of conveyances of property such as sales and gifts and delineates the new owners rights of ownership. While most aspects of the Aramaic formulary for conveyances were adapted from cuneiform antecedents, this particular clause is almost without parallel in cuneiform legal traditions.

One such cuneiform parallel occurs in some Late Babylonian pledge contracts, which include a clause restricting the ownership rights of creditors holding property in pledge. Scholars have differed as to the direction of influence here. Did Aramaic scribes adapt this negatively formulated clause restricting ownership rights to a positively formulated clause affirming ownership rights or did the Aramaic clause influence the Late Babylonian clause?

This paper argues for Aramaic priority and draws upon parallels from Ugarit to argue that this clause represents a discrete element of West Semitic legal traditions. We shall also consider what distinctive legal realities this element of the Aramaic formulary represents.

125. CINDY NIMCHUCK, University of Illinois at Springfield

A Re-assessment of the Persepolis Apadana Foundation Deposits

During the excavations of Persepolis, two foundation deposits were uncovered in the Apadana, in the northeast and southeast corners of the building. Inside a stone box in each deposit were found a silver tablet and a gold tablet, inscribed with the DPh text of Darius I (521–486 BCE); beneath each box were found four gold Cræseid coins and two silver coins of the Greek world (possibly three in the south-east deposit).

Scholarship has focused primarily on the issue of dating the Apadana deposits: the coins and the tablets have been studied in attempts to ascertain the dating of archaic Greek silver coinages, the Cræseid and Archer coinages, Darius' Thracian expedition, possible political claims to Aegean areas, and the building of the Apadana itself. Rarely has attention been given to the broader symbolic meaning of the deposits (Margaret Root 1988, 1989).

I understand the Apadana deposits to be more than a means to date coins or events. Darius expressed his world-view in carefully constructed messages to specific audiences, and clearly took great care with the materials and objects chosen for inclusion, and the messages conveyed through the inscriptions and media. Conceptually, the DPh text, the use of only gold and silver materials, and the choice of four gold coins resonate through spatial, technological, economic, political, and likely religious levels. Darius associated the Apadana with both the expanse of the empire itself and his own person; the building was spatially the embodiment of the empire, just as Darius was ultimately its core.

126. DAVID GOLDENBERG, University of Cape Town/University of Pennsylvania

Babatha, Rabbi Levi and Theodosius: “Black” Coins in Late Antiquity

Six Greek papyri dated between 110 and 130 CE and recovered from the shores of the Dead Sea use the word “blacks” as an otherwise unknown term of coinage. The consensus of opinion today is that this term refers to the pre-Roman Nabataean silver

selasim, which from 17/18 to 106 CE were made of a silver alloy with a high mixture of base metal, which would have turned the coins black. When Rome annexed Nabatæa in 106 CE (Provincia Arabia), the blackness of the Nabatæan *selasim* in comparison with Roman coinage, would have become chromatically remarkable.

This conclusion is problematic for two reasons. First, the history of Roman coinage does not support the claim that an existing chromatic contrast, based on high- and low-silver content, would necessarily be cause for chromatic designations. Secondly, it is questionable whether in fact there was such a numismatic contrast, as is generally thought, when Rome annexed Nabatæa. Roman coinage from eastern mints, as opposed to the mints in Rome, did not have a significantly higher silver content than the Nabatæan issues.

Based on a 3rd-century Rabbinic parable (*Genesis Rabbah* 36.7) and a statement attributed to the 4th-century Theodosius the Great (*Parastaseis Syntomoi Chronikai*), I suggest that the term refers not to color but rather to coins whose image had been obliterated. Both of these sources pun on the word “to blacken” in the derived sense of “to obliterate.” The pun is clear in the Greek text, in which *amauros* has this secondary meaning, and which thus explains the midrash. The two texts together provide the solution to the Nabatæan “blacks,” which, I propose, referred to the Nabatæan *selasim* that had been obliterated by Trajan’s overstriking in 106 CE. By use of the term these coins would have been distinguished from the Trajanic issues that were not struck over the Nabatæan *selasim*.

127. CALVERT WATKINS, Harvard University (Emeritus)/University of California, Los Angeles

“Hermit Crabs”: A Hidden Southeast Anatolian Borrowing in the Greek of Hellenistic Commagene

The 1st millennium Southeast, Southwest and Western Anatolian word for ‘upright pillar, stele, altar, funerary monument, memorial’—essentially the same semantic range as that of 2nd millennium Semitic *sikkānu* [M. Rutz, AOS 2004] in Syria and Hittite ^{NA4} *ḫuwāši*-stone with its pseudo-Sumerogram ^{NA4}ZI.KIN from the Semitic—is found in Hieroglyphi Luvian (*tasan[-za]*, pl. *tasa*), Lydian (*tašēv*), and Lycian (*θθē* < **t’hē* < **tesén* [H. Eichner]), with the epithet *komezijē* ‘sacred’. In Classical Cilicia the personal name *Τεδι-ννηνις* corresponds to *Τεδε-νῆ[νις]* found in Lycia, and presupposes a SE Anatolian (“Luvian”) *tede/i-* ‘father’ and *nēne/i-* ‘brother’. By the same token we may assume in this language a thematic stem **tese-*, without the specifically Lycian (A, not B) *s > h* rule and without the specifically Lycian syncope of the unstressed vowel. This word indeed exists; but in the Greek of Commagene in Southeastern Anatolia: ‘*ιερο-θέσ-ιον*, or “sacred *θεσ-*”. This word is the self-designation of the colossal sculptural and architectural complex and funerary monument of Antiochus I of Commagene (regn. c. 69–c. 36 BCE) atop Nemrud Dağı in the Anti-Taurus range, the “outstanding landmark of the upper Euphrates River valley.”

B. Islamic Near East IX: Philosophy. JOSEPH E. LOWRY, University of Pennsylvania, Chair (9:30 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) *Ballroom D*

128. HUSEYIN YILMAZ, Harvard University

Aristotle in the Ottoman Empire: the Turkish Translation of the Pseudo-Aristotelian Text *Sirr al-Asrār* and the Ottoman Reception of Ancient Ideals of Kingship

This paper examines *Ferruhname*, a Turkish translation of an Arabic pseudo-Aristotelian text *al-Siyāsa fī Tadbīr al-Riyāsa* made by Nevali Efendi (d. 1003/1594) for Grand Vizier Sokollu Mehmed Pasha in 969/1571. Better known as *Sirr al-Asrār* in Arabic and *Secretum Secretorum* in Latin, the work was one of the most popular texts on rulership in both Medieval Middle East and Europe. Nevali, who was Murad III's tutor, wrote a lengthy introduction to the text, introducing Aristotle and Alexander the Great, and Alexander the two-Horned to the reader. My paper will argue that, in his interpretive translation, Nevali Efendi presented pseudo-Aristotelian teachings as proven by experience, sanctioned by Islam, and fully compatible with the Ottoman mode of government at the time. He portrayed both Alexander and Aristotle as believers who had achieved unmatched excellence in wisdom and government, and portrayed them as role models. He further islamized the text by inserting aphorisms, prophetic traditions and Quranic verses to support Aristotle's advice to Alexander, thus integrating it into the Islamic tradition. He also used the current political and administrative terminology in translating the Arabic text. In his depiction, for example, Aristotle was a grand vizier, and Alexander was a caliph. Nevali Efendi thus eliminated historical distance and made the text a fresh product of Ottoman culture and fully relevant to current expectations in political culture and government practice.

129. KEVIN VAN BLADEL, University Of Southern California

Iranian and Sanskrit Characteristics and Forged Greek Attributions in the Arabic *Sirr al-Asrār* of Pseudo-Aristotle

The Pseudo-Aristotelian Arabic work *Sirr al-asrār* (Secret of Secrets) was one of the most popular handbooks of advice for princes throughout Europe and Asia during the Middle Ages, translated from Arabic into Latin, several Romance vernaculars, English, Hebrew, Russian, and other languages. Its mysterious origins have been the subject of many inconclusive investigations but the notion that it is at its core a translation from classical Greek has never been overturned. This presentation briefly summarizes past research on the subject and, following a previous study by Shaul Shaked, argues that its composition cannot be understood without taking into account its Iranian characteristics, which have received undue neglect but are crucial to our comprehension of the book and its place in Arabic literature. On the other hand, its alleged Greek origins seem increasingly less substantial and it should be recognized that there is no strong evidence that the work is at its basis a translation from Greek.

In one case it is even possible to show that the forger of the work put an invented Greek philosopher's name on an ancient saying translated into Arabic from Middle Persian. This Middle Persian passage is in fact a translation from Sanskrit, the original of which is extant. The forger of this pseudo-Aristotelian work is thus caught in the act.

130. JON MCGINNIS, University Of Missouri – St Louis

Avicenna’s (Modal) Metaphysics in Context

A search for *kalām* influences on Avicenna’s thought is in vogue in Avicennan studies. Commonly, one considers whether a doctrine in Avicenna’s philosophy arises from classical Greek sources and, barring such a connection, looks for theological contexts mirroring Avicenna’s philosophical problematic. Robert Wisnovsky adopts this approach in the second half of his study *Avicenna’s Metaphysics in Context*. Wisnovsky argues that Avicenna’s distinction between the necessary in itself and the necessary through another may rely on *kalām* discussions of God’s relation to His eternal attributes (*ṣifāt*). There is a symmetry, Wisnovsky notes, between the *kalām* issue that God’s attributes are eternal, though perhaps not uncaused, and the Avicennan thesis that the cosmos, though not uncaused, is eternal. Wisnovsky apparently assumes that no similar problematic exists in the classical Greek world or, if so, Avicenna did not know about it.

I suggest that Wisnovsky’s proposed *kalām* sources are not the only, not even the primary, ones influencing Avicenna’s celebrated distinction; rather, its impetus may have been Hellenistic interpretations of Plato’s *Timaeus*, particularly concerning the cosmos’ relation to the *demiurge*, and Aristotle’s subsequent critique in *De Caelo* I 10–12, all sources available to Avicenna.

Plato’s immediate successors viewed the cosmos as both causally dependent upon the *demiurge* and eternal. In *De Caelo* I 10, Aristotle criticized this view. In turn Proclus responded and argued that causal dependency need not preclude eternity. Here are classical sources, available to Avicenna, that treat an issue identical with Avicenna’s belief that the heavens are eternal though causally dependent—the case Wisnovsky uses to argue for *kalām* influences on Avicenna. Also, Aristotle’s critique focused on possibility and impossibility and distinguished impossibility on an hypothesis (*ex hupotheseōs*) and impossibility absolutely (*haplās*), i.e., impossibility in itself and impossibility through another—the mirror counterpart of Avicenna’s necessary through itself and necessary through another. Again, then, elements in Avicenna’s distinction, which Wisnovsky links to *kalām* discussions, might find their source in the Greek commentary tradition.

131. ALEXANDER TREIGER, Yale University

Fragments from Plato’s *Phædo* in Bīrūnī’s *India* and the Question of their Provenance

Fragments from Plato’s *Phædo* in Abū Rayḥān al-Bīrūnī’s *Kitāb Taḥqīq mā li-l-Hind* constitute one of at least three distinct Arabic textual traditions ultimately going back to the *Phædo*, the other two being: a passage from *Adab al-ṭabīb* of Iṣḥāq b. ‘Alī al-Ruhāwī related to a partial Persian version of the *Phædo*; and the “Death of Socrates” source preserved by Mubaššir, Ibn Abī Uṣaybi‘a and al-Qiftī, to which a fragment from *Rasā’il Iḥwān al-ṣafā* may also be related.

The question of the provenance of Bīrūnī’s fragments has not been studied. The present contribution attempts to answer this question and to characterize, on the basis of philological evidence, the fragments’ direct source. Analysis of the fragments leads to the following conclusions.

1. Bīrūnī's fragments derive from a single source, which can be called "the Phædo-source," to distinguish it from Plato's Phædo itself.
2. Introductory phrases of Bīrūnī's fragments referring to the subject of a fragment or to its context in Plato's dialogue go back as they are to the Phædo-source.
3. Therefore, the Phædo-source was neither a translation nor an epitome of the Phædo. Rather it was a collection of Socrates' sayings from the Phædo (and possibly other sources as well).
4. This collection did not follow the order of the Phædo. Most likely, it was arranged thematically.
5. It is reasonable to assume, in the absence of evidence to the contrary, that the compiler of the Phædo-source and the Arabic translator of the quotations contained therein were one and the same person.
6. The quotations were translated directly from the Greek (probably written in uncial) without a Syriac intermediary.
7. The translator was probably identical with the Arabic translator of the *Menander-sentenzen* : Ḥunayn's pupil Iṣṭifān b. Basīl.

C. South and Southeast Asia V. (9:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) *Cook Room*

1. **Interplay of History and Literature in Indo-Persian Texts.** SUNIL SHARMA, Boston University, Chair and Discussant.

With the emergence of Indo-Persian studies as an independent field of research, the question of its distinctness has usually focused on the formation of a literary canon based on thematic differences and the peculiarities of a provincial Indian Persian idiom. An understanding of the rise to prominence and transformation of a literary culture that spans a whole millennium requires a greater sensitivity to periodization and to the historical contexts that provided the need for the creation of or preference for certain literary genres and poetic forms. At various times in history, Indo-Persian texts participated in an international Persianate literary market, and at other times they were part of more local and vernacular networks. Keeping in mind that the term "Indo-Persian" itself is a historical construction, the papers in this panel will attempt to arrive at a more nuanced definition of the domain of this literature by addressing some major topics: Indo-Persian texts as the repository of Indo-Muslim cultural memory and history, as sites for the playing out of power struggles between political and spiritual authorities, as emblematic of traditional and new courtly rituals in poetry, and as self-reflexive narratives in the form of biographical dictionaries and literary histories.

132. PAUL LOSENKSY, Indiana University

Drunk Coming and Going: Migration between Persia and India in Two Cupbearer's Songs

Whether as a medium of commerce, administration, or literary culture, Persian was arguably the preeminent world language of the early modern period. Far beyond its native range in Persia and southern Central Asia, Persian provided not only a lingua franca for the trade networks of the Silk Road, Indian Ocean, and East Indies, but also a classical reference point for Ottoman Turkish belles lettres. But nowhere is the

international prominence of Persian during this period more evident than in Mughal India. Akbar's decision to adopt Persian as the official language of administration set in motion an unprecedented traffic of Persian-trained writers and bureaucrats between Iran and India. The new international scope of Persianate culture helped fuel a transformation of poetic style, and the discoveries, disorientations, and disappointments of the experience of migration opened up new thematic horizons for poets to explore.

The new genre of the *sāqi-nāma*, or cupbearer's song, was well-suited to negotiating changes in regional, political, and personal affiliation. Drawing on the long history of wine as a symbol of the loss of self-identity, the cupbearer's song typically represents the severing of old bonds and the formation of new allegiances and life continuities. This paper will examine two contrasting accounts of the experience of migration in the *sāqi-nāma*. Written in the year 1000 AH, the cupbearer's song of Muḥammad Ṣūfī of Māzandarān (d. 1625) commemorates his departure from Persia as a middle aged man; his bitterness at leaving is overshadowed by a sense of the new possibilities opened up by a new millennium and new environment. Sanjar of Kashan (d. 1612), on the other hand, wrote his *sāqi-nāma* in the last year of his life; his youthful hopes for fame and prosperity in India shattered, he turns back to Iran, desperately seeking a refuge in the Isfahan of Shah 'Abbās. The contrast between these two case studies reveals the range of individual response to both the new opportunities of the age and the flexibility of the literary tradition.

133. RAJEEV K. KINRA, University of Chicago

The Persistence of Gossip: Memory and 'Memorative Communication' in the Indo-Persian Tazkirah

It is reported that one day the celebrated Hindu poet-*munshi* Chandar Bhan 'Brahman' (d. 1662) recited a heretical Persian verse before the Mughal emperor Shah Jahan. The verse so enraged the emperor that, had a quick-witted retort from the affable minister Afzal Khan not defused the tension, Chandar Bhan faced certain punishment, even death by some accounts. The problem with this story is that, by any standard of historical evidence, both the possibility of the encounter and Chandar Bhan's authorship of the verse defy credulity—a claim for which this paper provides ample proof. But simply proving that it is a tall tale, or even that the *tazkirah*-writers who first reported the encounter barely two generations after Chandar Bhan's death should have known better, is perhaps not so remarkable. The anecdote's persistence, however, *is* remarkable—it has made its way into the collective memory of Indo-Persian literati to such a degree that, even today, it is the dominant (indeed virtually the only) thing 'remembered' about Chandar Bhan. The broader aim of this paper, therefore, is to move beyond the basic question of historical fact, toward an analysis of what this particular triumph of anecdote over facticity can tell us about the discursive mechanics of the *tazkirah* tradition generally. The goal here is to test various key versions of the story, transmitted over the course of nearly three centuries, against the concept put forward by two recent scholars of the *tazkirah* as a specifically Indo-Muslim form of 'memorative communication.' Such an analysis will yield clues not only about the context in which certain kinds of memories and literary knowledge were (and continue to be) transmitted over time, but also help us to understand more clearly the function of 'memorative communication' vis-à-vis this startling example of the persistence of what amounts, basically, to literary gossip.

134. MATHEW C. SMITH, Harvard University

Bahar and the *sabk-i hindi*

The idea that Persian poetry underwent a period of corruptive influence as it spread into India giving rise to a hyperbolic and artificial style known as the *sabk-i hindi*, or Indian style, is something of a cliché in Persian literary studies. Despite the fact that such labels are at best simplifications of complex processes, the term *sabk-i hindi* and the qualitative judgment it implies retains a certain degree of currency and is sorely in need of further investigation.

Muhammad Taqi Bahar, known as Malek al-Shu‘ara, one of the most famous Iranian poets of the early twentieth century, played a crucial role in codifying and propagating the concept of the *sabk-i hindi*. His definition of the term is inextricably intertwined with his participation in the fostering of a modern Iranian national identity. In his influential *Sabk`shinasi*, a three volume work tracing the evolution of Persian prose, he divided Persian stylistics into various *sabks*, or literary styles (primarily *khurasani*, *‘iraqi*, and *hindi*), helping to foster a nationalistic view of Iranian literature (versus the international spread of Persian literature) at a time when the country’s borders were under attack both literal and figurative and allowing the poet to trace his literary roots back to the dawn of Iranian civilization. By emphasizing distinctions between Indo-Persian and Iranian literature (such as the use of hyperbolic imagery by Indian poets, supposedly due to India’s volatile climate), Bahar was able to claim precedence for a “true” Iranian idiom based on pre-Islamic literature.

Understanding Bahar’s formulation of the *sabk-i hindi* is essential in recognizing the artificial nature of this historical construct which has colored Iranian and Western scholarship in Indo-Persian studies. Fortunately, Bahar was a prolific author and his poems and essays provide great insight into a topic that has both provoked and inhibited discussion and research.

135. MANAN AHMED, University of Chicago

Heavenly Advice: Dreams and Letters in the *Chach Nāma*

Overlooked and ignored as a literary text, the *Chach Nāma*, a thirteenth century Persian account of the Muslim conquest of India, has been unduly criticized. Historians, both Orientalist and Nationalist, have usually disregarded huge portions of the text as “fantastical”, “fraught with exaggerations”, and “false”. However, it remains an important contribution to the Indo-Persian literary culture. It uniquely draws on Sanskrit and Persianate traditions to present an ethical worldview for a conqueror, making it a rich early example of the “mirror for princes” genre.

This paper will focus on rescuing from oblivion and derision those portions of the *Chach Nāma* that elicit the most ire from the historians. These are the various dream narratives in the first half and the subsequent letters of correspondence between Ḥajjāj b. Yūsuf, the Umayyad governor of Iraq, and Muḥammad b. Qāsīm, the young general leading the campaign in India. I will analyze the dream narratives and letters to highlight the possible sources of traditions and tropes in the text. Firdausi’s *Shahnamā*, the Prophet’s letters to his commanders in the battlefield, and dream narratives in Vedic texts are all employed as models.

A close reading of the text can help us construct the world-view within which ‘Alī b. Ḥāmid b. Abī Bakr Kūfī (d. 613/1216) produced this text and help us restore it to its rightful place in the Indo-Persian literary culture.

2. Philosophy. JOEL P. BRERETON, University of Texas at Austin, Chair

136. SUCHARITA ADLURI, University of Pennsylvania

Viśiṣṭādvaita Vedānta in the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*

This paper argues for the importance of the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* for Ramanuja (1056–1137 CE) within the larger framework of Viśiṣṭādvaita Vedānta by analyzing its use in the *Vedarthasamgraha*, his primary commentary on the Upanisads. More specifically, concepts such as body-soul (*sarira-sariri bhava*), ignorance (*avidya*) as karma, nature of the individual soul (*jiva*), and Brahman as Visnu, the abode of auspicious qualities, as developed in the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* become key concepts in the formulation of Viśiṣṭādvaita Vedānta. Using examples of the relevant passages of the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*, that Ramanuja cites to articulate these concepts, this paper will analyze the significance of the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*, in identifying the Brahman of the Upanisads with the personal deity, Visnu. The integration of elements of personal devotion and Vedānta philosophy is the unique contribution of Ramanuja and the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa*'s role in this process is significant.

Scholars have largely ignored or footnoted the relevance of the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* for Ramanuja's philosophy, including van Buitenen, whose only comment is that the use of the *Viṣṇu Purāṇa* by Ramanuja is 'illustrative and corroborative'. Ramanuja's singling out of this Purāṇa for use in his Vedānta commentaries, rather than the more obvious choices such as the *Bhagavad Gita*, needs further examination, as his interpretive strategies, outlined in this paper, sheds light on the conceptual make-up of Viśiṣṭādvaita Vedānta.

137. ELLIOT M. STERN, University of Pennsylvania

Śrīdhara's Reply to the Bhāsarvajña's Rejection of Several *guṇāḥ* in the Category *guṇāḥ*

It is well known that bhāsarvajñaḥ has rejected a number of the individual *guṇāḥ* enumerated in the category *guṇāḥ* of the orthodox nyāya/vaiśeṣika system, and that later vaiśeṣika writers, including udayanaḥ and śrīvallabhācāryaḥ, have reported some of these suggestions, and argued against them. In this paper, we will see that śrīdharaḥ has also in several cases specifically cited bhāsarvajña's arguments for rejecting some of these *guṇāḥ*, and we will briefly examine how he replies that these *guṇāḥ* should be retained.

138. PRIYAWAT KUANPOONPOL, Ramkhamhaeng University

What's in a Wink, According to Geertz, Ryle, and Bhartrhari

In this paper I will compare the ways that Ryle, Geertz and Bhartrhari use a 'wink' to illustrate their ideas. Gilbert Ryle first uses it to show that one physical, visible act of winking may be the basis for many layers of kinds of actions not immediately available for public observation, which are more complex and turn out to have far-reaching, objective consequences. Geertz uses Ryle's wink to explain complicity in the construction of cultural meanings between insiders and outsiders, infinite layers of which can be captured in anthropological "thick descriptions" that penetrate the opaqueness of cultural signs and lead to meaningfulness, Bhartrhari, centuries before, also uses a wink to explain how a person uses and understands a vernacular word (*apabhrarṁśā*), where she actually intends to convey the meaning of a Sanskrit word.

A wink is an act in complicity, a sign, to convey a meaning in conventional usage. Are they talking about the same or similar things about signs and meanings, and culture? Do they reach the same conclusions?

INDEX OF ABSTRACTS

- Abusch, Tzvi, 39
Adluri, Sucharita, 61
Ahmed, Manan, 60
Aklujkar, Ashok, 10
Aklujkar, Vidyut, 33
Alshech, Eli, 30
Amitai, Reuven, 4, 5
Anderson, Gregory D. S., 4
Asatryan, Musegh, 45
Averbeck, Richard E., 25
- Bühnemann, Gudrun, 34
Bar-Asher, Elitzur Avraham, 3
Beaulieu, Paul-Alain, 41
Belnap, Dan, 53
Bhatt, Neelima Shukla, 12
Bjorkman, Judy, 35
Blankinship, Khalid Yahya, 8
Brereton, Joel P., 48, 61
Brisch, Nicole, 24
Brockopp, Jonathan E., 18
- Carter, Michael G., 8
Chapman, Ian, 16
Chavalas, Mark, 35
Cohen, Signe, 9
Cook, John A., 2
Cooper, Glen M., 45
- Daniels, Peter, 1
Davis, Jr., Donald R., 31
Diaconescu, Bogdan, 23
Ditter, Alexei, 42
Dobe, Timothy, 13
Dubois, Joël, 23
Dunham, Sally, 37
- El Omari, Racha, 29
- Fitzgerald, James L., 21
Fudge, Bruce, 7
- Gadotti, Alhena, 26
Goktaş, Recep Gürkan, 47
Goldenberg, David, 54
Gross, Andrew D., 54
Gruendler, Beatrice, 35
- Hallo, William W., 24
Harimoto, Kengo, 33
Harvey, Scott L., 22
Hasselbach, Rebecca, 1
Heinrichs, Wolfhart P., 28, 29
Hollenberg, David, 44
Holmberg, Bo, 27
Huehnergard, John, 1, 2
- Insler, Stanley, 21, 48

Jamison, Stephanie W., 9, 21
 Jinhua, Jia, [withdrawn]
 Johnson, Cale, 14
 Jovanovic, Ljubica, 52
 Judd, Steven, 44

 Karahashi, Fumi, 15
 Kaye, Alan S., 3
 Kellner-Heinkele, Barbara, 43
 Kennedy, Philip F., 27
 Khalil, Mohammad Hassan, 46
 Kinra, Rajeev K., 59
 Kobayashi, Masato, 10
 Kroll, Paul W., 26
 Kuanpoonpol, Priyawat, 61

 Lanaghan, Tamara S. J., 11, 12
 Lassner, Jacob, 43
 Leavitt, Guy, 50
 Losenksy, Paul, 58
 Lowry, Joseph E., 17, 56

 Maidman, Maynard P., 1
 Mann, Richard D., 32
 McDaniel, Justin, 34
 McGinnis, Jon, 57
 Melchert, Christopher, 18
 Mellins, David, 51
 Melville, Sarah C., 39
 Michałowski, Piotr, 25
 Minkowski, Christopher Z., 31, 48
 Morrison, Robert, 30
 Moser, Jeffrey, 42
 Mourad, Suleiman A., 47

 Nielsen, John P., 39
 Nimchuck, Cindy, 54

 Olivelle, Patrick, 31, 34

 Pankenier, David W., 16
 Pat-El, Na'ama, 1
 Pathak, Shubha, 49
 Pizarro, Dolores, 50
 Pomerantz, Maurice A., 29
 Powers, David S., 19, 20

 Rao, Ajay, 50
 Reinhart, Kevin, 19
 Reynolds, Gabriel Said, 6
 Richardson, Seth, 36
 Ridgway, Benjamin, 43
 Rochberg, Francesca, 25, 38
 Rowson, Everett K., 7, 17
 Rubio, Gonzalo, 15
 Rutherford, Ian, 52

 Salomon, Richard, 22, 35
 Sasson, Jack M., 24, 37
 Scharf, Peter, 11
 Scharfe, Hartmut, 9
 Scheible, Kristin, 12
 Schwartz, Glenn M., 37
 Scott, Sarah J., 13
 Scurlock, JoAnn, 53
 Sharlach, Tonia, 24
 Sharlet, Jocelyn, 28
 Sharma, Sunil, 58
 Simmons, Richard VanNess, 16, 27
 Sinor, Denis, 5
 Slotsky, Alice L., 40
 Smith, Frederick M., 32
 Smith, Mathew C., 60
 Spectorosky, Susan, 7, 9
 Stern, Elliot M., 61
 Stewart, Devin, 6, 20

Taskomur, Himmet, 21
Taylor, Jon, 13
Testen, David, 3
Tinney, Steve, 13
Toorawa, Shawkat, 45
Treiger, Alexander, 57
Trimble, Walker, 22
Tubb, Gary A., 48

van Bladel, Kevin, 56
Van De Mieroop, Marc, 38
Vedeler, Harold Torger, 38
Veldhuis, Niek, 14
von Dassow, Eva M., 37

Wagner, Mark, 19
Walker, Paul E., 45

Wallenfels, Ronald, 40
Watkins, Calvert, 55
Welch, Alford T., 7
Westbrook, Raymond, 39
Whitaker, Jarrod L., [withdrawn]
Widell, Magnus, 36
Wilcke, Claus, 25
Woods, Christopher, 34
Wu, Sujane, 27, 41

Xurong, Kong, 26

Yakubovich, Ilya, 5
Yamauchi, Edwin, 40
Yilmaz, Huseyin, 56
Yoshida, Yutaka, 5
Younger, K. Lawson, 52

PROGRAM OF THE 215th MEETING

CHANGES AND CORRECTIONS

(UPDATED 7 MARCH 2005)

Papers Withdrawn

36. JIA JINHUA, City University of Hong Kong
Examination of the Hongzhou-School Literature of Chinese Chan Buddhism

46. JARROD L. WHITAKER, University of Texas at Austin
Male Identity in Ancient India: *nár*, *vīrá*, and *śúra* in the Ṛgveda